

INDEX

absolute core rights, 92, 130-40 criticism of, 110 Existenzminimum and, 203-4 formal structure of, 110-11 in FCC case law, 134 Law of Competing Principles and, theories on, 133-6 109 - 10Wesensgehaltsgarantie and, 133-6, 203 positive socio-economic rights and, absolute theories, 133-6 226 - 7absolute-absolute core rights, 200-4 right to social security and, ECtHR and, 216 278-90 absolute-relative core rights, 204-6, Bundesverfassungsgericht (German Federal Constitutional Court 225 - 6adjudication, of fundamental rights, 12, (FCC)) 32 - 9, 118absolute core rights and, 134 in ECtHR cases, 95 Asylum Seekers Benefits Act 1993 intensity of review in, 113-17 and, 172-3 balancing by, 110 limitations of, 95 Existenzminimum and, 171-6 scope of, 95 under South African Constitution, of proportionality test and, 4 socio-economic rights, 150-6, subsistence minimum, procedural 167 - 8determination of, 229 stages of, 88-117, 160 capabilities theory, 74-5 supranational, 113-14 Article 1, ECHR, 55-7 categorical review, 111-13 Article 2, ECHR, 47-9 levels of intensity in, 115-16 Article 3, ECHR, 49–52 limitations of, 112 Article 6, ECHR, 43-4 proportionality and, 112-13 Article 8, ECHR, 52-4 CESCR. See Committee on Economic, Article 14, ECHR, 42, 44-6 Social and Cultural Rights Asylum Seekers Benefits Act (1993), Charter of Fundamental Rights of the Germany, 172-3 European Union (CFR), 11 autonomous interpretation core rights under, 125 defined, 66 indivisibility thesis and, 71 ECHR and, 66-7 social security rights under, 282 by ECtHR, 97 children's rights, under South African autonomy, personal, 65 Constitution, 153 civil and political interests, 60-1 balancing, 109-11 civil rights obligations, 43 Bundesverfassungsgericht and, 110 CoE. See Council of Europe



320 INDEX

Committee on Economic, Social and ICESCR and, 125-6, 209 Cultural Rights (CESCR), 157, indeterminable, 208-10 indicators of, 219-31 core rights and, 125-6, 180-2, 209 socio-economic scope and, 219–25 housing rights and, 184-7 individual protections of, 135 non-discrimination and, 223 indivisibility of, 259 at international level, 125-6 right to health and, 187-90 right to social security and, 190-2 intrinsic, 178-81 comparative interpretation, of justification of, 179-80 fundamental rights, 97 perspective of, 123-6, 176, 211-12 compliance progressive realization principle and, with minimum core obligations, 157 125, 169 ICESCR and, 147-9 proportionality and, 136-40, 219-31 with minimum subsistence rights, protection of by ECtHR, 2-9, 32-9, 136 174 objective, 130-3 consensus approach, 181-4 constitutional rights subjective, 130-3 culture of justification and, 99-100 purposes of, 209-10 global model of, 99-100, 213, 296, 298 reasonableness and, 150-70 in South Africa, 165-70 positive obligations as part of, 4–5 constitutionalization of society, 101 relative, 123, 130-40 absolute, 205-6, 216-17 core rights, 200-12. See also minimum core obligations; relative, 206-8 Wesensgehaltsgarantie relative theories for, 138-40, 205-6 absolute, 92, 130-40 rights inflation and, 213 absolute, 200-4, 216 rights proliferation and, 213 Existenzminimum and, 203-4 socio-economic rights and, 11–12 in FCC case law, 134 protection of, 294-5 in South Africa, 150-70 relative, 204-5, 225-6 theories on, 133-6 Constitutional Court responses to, Wesensgehaltsgarantie and, 133-6, 201 - 2reasonableness approach to, CESCR and, 125-6, 180-2, 209 165 - 70as theory and practice, 201, 292 under CFR, 125 courts and, 210-12 traditional development of, 123-6 constraints of judicial power, 212 core socio-economic content, 184-96 categories of, 192-5 defined, 15 determination of, 178-84 non-discrimination, 194 procedural minimum cores, 194-5 through consensus approach, 181 - 4protection of disadvantaged and expert information and, 181-4 marginalized groups, 194 foundational principles as strategic minimum cores, 194-5 influence on, 178-9 tripartite typology and, 192-3 through normative essence as fixed, 192 approach, 179 overlaps within, 193–4 ECHR guarantees of, 121-2, 135-6 right to adequate housing, 184-7 under German Basic Law, 122, right to health, 187-90 129 - 30right to social security, 190–2



INDEX 321

subsistence minimums and, 195–6
Council of Europe (CoE), 33
courts. See also specific courts
core rights and, 210–12
constraints of judicial power, 212
cultural rights, socio-economic rights
and, 14–15
culture of justification, 99–100

deference, 113
margin of appreciation and, 115
degrading treatment. See inhuman and
degrading treatment

margin of appreciation and, 115 degrading treatment. See inhuman a degrading treatment democratic values, 65 derogable fundamental rights, 92–3 dialogue argument, minimum core obligations and, 163–4 directive principles, socio-economic rights and, 6 disadvantaged and marginalized

individuals and groups,

protections of, 195–6 definitions of, 225 Roma people, 242–8 discrimination. *See also* nondiscrimination as first-rank socio-economic

concern, 223 prohibition of, 130 right to social security and, 271

ECHR. See European Convention on Human Rights EComHR. See European Commission of Human Rights

economic rights. See socio-economic rights
ECSR. See European Committee on

Social Rights
ECtHR. See European Court of Human

Rights
education, right to
minimum levels of, fulfillment of,

under South African Constitution, 153

effectiveness thesis, 62–8, 291–2 defined, 63–4

2.21 - 3

indivisibility thesis and, 69 interpretative techniques and, 64 (meta-)teleological interpretation and, 64–5

environmental health, 260, 262–8 ECHR provisions and, 262 in ECtHR cases, 262–8 indivisibility and, 263–4 threshold requirements and,

environmental pollution, 49 equality rights, 130 ESC. See European Social Charter essence criterion, for social security rights, 286

ethical pluralism, 180 EU. See European Union European Commission of Human

Rights (EComHR), 2
European Committee on Social Rights

(ECSR), 31–2, 184 indivisibility and, 76–7

European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR). See also socioeconomic rights

Article 1, 55–7 Article 2, 47–9 Article 3, 49–52 Article 6, 43–4

Article 8, 52–4 Article 14, 42, 44–6

autonomous interpretation under, 66–7

as civil and political rights treaty, 26–32

core rights guaranteed under, 121–2, 135–6

democratic values and, 65 disadvantaged and marginalized

individuals and group protections under, 225 docket crisis and, 8

institutional response to, 8 EComHR and, 2

effectiveness thesis and, 62–8 defined, 63–4 interpretative techniques and,

64



322 INDEX

European Convention on Human European Court of Human Rights Rights (ECHR). (cont.) (ECtHR). See also sociometa-teleological interpretation economic rights absolute-absolute core rights and, and, 64-5 teleological interpretation and, autonomous interpretation by, 97 64 - 5caseload issues for, 38-9 enforcement mechanisms for, 32-3 environmental health in, 262 CoE and, 33 ESC and, 31-2 constitutional role of freedom of assembly and association limitations of, 34 under, 90-1 positive obligations and, 4-5 function and purpose of, 25 core rights protections by, 2-9, 32-9, historical development of, 26-9 housing rights under, for Roma developments in fundamental rights people, 243 protection by, 2–9 future of, 295-6 human dignity protected under, 65 different roles of, 32-9, 95 as living instrument, 66-7, 291 criticism of judgments and, 35-6 minimum core socio-economic protections under, 213-20 environmental health and, 262-8 minimum protections of housing function and purpose of, 101-2, rights under, 235-6 59-62 non-discrimination principle in, 42, housing rights cases, Roma people 44-6, 80, 223-4 and, 243-8 indivisibility thesis and, 1-2, 73-7 personal autonomy protected by, indivisible rights and, 1-2 65 pluralism and, 65 intensity of review by, 116–17 positive obligations and, 40-1, 48 margin of appreciation and, 84-5, prohibition of torture under, 49-52 116-17, 39, 214 protection of property under, 55-7 minimum protections of housing protocols to, institutional changes rights under, 236-42 through, 30-1 positive obligations doctrine, 4–5, 79-80, 129-30 purpose and function of, 29 right to fair trial under, 43-4 procedural protection and, 230-1 procedural review by, 117, 229-30, right to health under, 51-2 right to life under, 47-9 294 - 5environmental responsibilities as proportionality review and, 3-4 purpose and function of, 214-15 part of, 49 scope of rights under, 29-30, 47-57 social security rights cases and, 270-2, 279-90 social security rights under, 269-72 socio-economic rights protections socialization through, 42-6, 68 socio-economic rights protected by, 214–19 under, 121-2 absolute-absolute core rights, 216 future of, 293-4 absolute-relative core rights, subsistence minimum and, 65 213 - 19UDHR and, 27 through consensus, 218-19 VCLT and, 63 determination of content, 217-18 welfare rights under, 39-40 future of, 295



INDEX 323

relative-absolute core rights, 216 - 17relative-relative core rights, 217 subsidiarity and, 39 supranational role of, 2-3, 7-8, 32-9 European Social Charter (ESC), 31-2 indivisibility thesis and, 75-6 European Union (EU). See also specific conventions and treaties CFR, 11 core rights under, 125 indivisibility thesis and, 71 evictions, 186-7 evolutive interpretation by ECHR, 67-8 of fundamental rights, 97 Existenzminimum, 171-2. See also subsistence minimum absolute core rights and, 203-4 in FCC, 171-6 expertise, socio-economic rights and, 25-6fair trial, right to, 43-4 family life. See private and family life FCC. See Bundesverfassungsgericht first generation norms, 60 food, right to, 221-3 freedom, law and, 139 freedom of assembly and association, 90 - 1freedom of speech, 102 fundamental rights. See also adjudication; Wesensgehaltsgarantie core rights and, 11-12, 124 defined, 14 derogable, 92-3 under ECHR, 1 ECtHR protections of, 2-9, 32-9 criticism of judgments and, 35-6 future of, 295-6 individual and general, 36-7 multidimensionality of, 37-8 hermeneutical perspective to, 10 human rights compared to, 14 as individual rights, 135

indivisibility thesis and, 71-2 interpretation of comparative, 97 evolutive, 97 purposive, 96-7 textual, 95-8 limitations of, 90-2, 95, 137 negative obligations and, 98-104 positive obligations and, 98-104 prism character of, 79 purpose of, 105-6, 183 social security rights and, 269-70 socio-economic, 5-8 structure of, 89-95 trump character of, 93 German Federal Constitutional Court (FCC). See Bundesverfassungsgericht Germany. See also Wesensgehaltsgarantie Asylum Seekers Benefits Act 1993, 172 - 3Basic Law in, 122, 129-30 Existenzminimum under, 171-2 minimum subsistence rights in, 170-6, 195-6 absolute-relative protection of, 173 - 4calculation of, 175 compliance with, 174 procedural protection of, 229 value-based balancing in, 111 global model of constitutional rights, 99-100, 213, 296, 298 guarantee of the essence of rights. See Wesensgehaltsgarantie

health and health care, rights to, 51–2,
251–68. See also environmental
health
under CESCR, 187–90
core of, 251–62
ECHR provisions and, 251–2
under ICESCR, 147–8,
187–90
indivisibility of, 259



324 INDEX

health and health care, rights to (cont.) minimum levels of, fulfillment of, 221 - 3respect for private and family life and, 260 in South African Constitution, 153 housing rights, 57, 234-51 discrimination in, 80 evictions and, 186-7 under ICESCR, 184-7 legal security of tenure and, 186 minimum protection and, 234-42 under ECHR, 235-6 in ECtHR cases, 236-42 non-discrimination in, 248-51 for Roma people, 242-8 under ECHR, 243 in ECtHR cases, 243-8 non-discrimination principles and, 250-1 under South African Constitution, 153 human dignity, 65 Wesensgehaltsgarantie and, 135 human rights. See also rights fundamental rights compared to, 14 ICCPR. See International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights ICESCR. See International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights ILO. See International Labor Organisation immediate minimum core obligations, 146 - 50indeterminable core rights, 208-10 individual liberty, 123 individual protection of core rights, 135 under ECtHR, 36-7 fundamental rights and, 135 Wesensgehaltsgarantie and, 135 indivisibility thesis, 69-77, 291-2 CFR and, 71 for core rights, 259 development of, 69-71 ECSR and, 76-7

ECtHR and, 1-2, 73-7 effectiveness and, 69 environmental health and, 263-4 ESC and, 75-6 fundamental rights and, 69-73 philosophical accounts of, 71-2 ICESCR and, 70-1 Limburg Principles and, 71 UDHR and, 70-1 Vienna Declaration and, 71, 77 inflation of rights, 213 inhuman and degrading treatment, prohibition of, 228 intensity of review, 113-17 categorical review and, 115-16 deference and, 113, 115 by ECtHR, 116-17 standards of review, 115-16 interests, norms and, 59 civil and political, 60-1 classical, 61 socio-economic, 60-1 international bill of rights, 27, 143. See also Universal Declaration of Human Rights International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), 28, International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR), 12 core rights and, 125-6, 209 implementation of, 146 indivisibility thesis and, 70-1 Limburg Principles and, 146-7 minimum core rights and, 125-6 immediate, 146-50 Proclamation of Teheran and, 70 - 1right to health under, 147-8 right to housing under, 184-7 right to social security under, 147-8, 190 - 2rights perspective under, 28 international human rights movement, 28. See also specific conventions International Labor Organisation (ILO), 75-6



INDEX 325

interpretation of fundamental rights,	CESCR and, 157, 168
95–8	criticism of, 149-50, 163-4
autonomous	debates about, 156-65
defined, 66	defined, 142
by ECtHR, 66-7, 97-8	dialogue argument and, 163-4
comparative, 97	under ECHR, 213–20
effectiveness thesis and, 64	ICESCR and, 143-50
evolutive, 67–8, 97	progressive realization and, 143-6
purposive, 96–7	identification of, 164-5
of social security benefits, 269	immediate, 146-50
(meta-)teleological, 64-5, 97	reasonableness approach to, 157,
textual, 95-8	159–60
intrinsic core rights, 178-81	resources and, 162
· ·	scepticism towards, 164-5
judicial power, 212	separation of powers and, 163-4
judicial reasoning, 298	South African Constitution and,
in socio-economic cases, 225-6	rejection of, 162-3
juridification of society, 101	weighed priority of, 169
	minimum levels, of socio-economic
law	rights, 221–3. See also
freedom and, 139	minimum core obligations
as relational, 140	prima facie protection of, 221-3
Law of Competing Principles, 109-10	minimum protections, of housing
legal security of tenure, 186	rights, 234–42
legitimacy, socio-economic rights and,	
25–6	negative obligations, fundamental
life. See right to life	rights and, 98–104
Limburg Principles, 71	negative rights, 108
limitations of fundamental rights, 90–2, 95	non-discrimination principles CESCR and, 223
justification of, 104-6	core socio-economic content and,
review of, 104–17	194
balancing in, 109-11	in ECHR, 42, 44-6, 80, 223-4
categorical, 111–13	in housing rights, for Roma people,
proportionality in, 106-9	250–1
	property rights and, 215
margin of appreciation	in right to social security, 272-8
deference and, 115	normative essence approach, 179
ECtHR and, 39, 84-5, 116-17, 214	norms, of rights, 59-60
structural, 117	autonomous interpretation and,
substantive, 117	97-8
width of, 117	first generation, 60
marginalized individuals and groups.	interests as distinct from, 61-2
See disadvantaged and	socio-economic, 60-1
marginalized individuals and	
groups	obligations. See also minimum core
meta-teleological interpretation, 64-5	obligations
minimum core obligations, 125-6	negative, 98–104



> 326 INDEX obligations. (cont.) categorical review and, 112-13 core rights and, 136-40, 219-31 positive constitutional rights and, 4-5 as moral doctrine, 110 ECHR and, 40-1 procedural protection and, 225-31 ECtHR recognition of, 4-5, 79-80, procedural review and, 230 review of, 3-4, 106-9, 219 129 - 30fundamental rights and, 98-104 core rights and, 231 reasonableness and, 106-7 pluralism social security rights and, 279 ECHR and, 65 sub-principles of, 107 ethical, 180 purposive interpretation, of fundamental rights, 96-7 positive obligations constitutional rights and, 4-5 ECHR and, 40-1, 48 reasonableness, 106-7 ECtHR and, 79-80, 129-30 core rights and, 150-70 recognition of, 4-5 in South Africa, 165-70 fundamental rights and, 98-104 minimum core obligations and, 157, possessions, social security rights and, 159 - 60278 - 90reasoning. See judicial reasoning power. See judicial power relative core rights, 123, 130-40 absolute, 205-6 prima facie rights, 64, 83, 94 relative, 206-8 comparative interpretation for, 97 Wesensgehaltsgarantie and, 139 relative-absolute, 205-6 prism character, of fundamental rights, relative theories on core rights, 138-40, 205-6 private and family life, respect for, on prima facie rights, 139 52-4,83on Wesensgehaltsgarantie, 138-40 right to health and, 260 for core rights, 205-6 relative-absolute core rights, 205-6 procedural protection ECtHR and, 216-17 ECtHR and, 230-1 proportionality and, 225-31 relative-relative core rights, 206-8 RESC. See Revised European Social Roma cases and, 242-8 procedural requirements, 195-6 Charter respect for private life. See private and procedural review by ECtHR, 117, 229-30, 294-5 family life proportionality and, 230 Revised European Social Charter proceduralization, 229-30 (RESC). See European Social Proclamation of Teheran, 70-1 Charter right to education. See education, progressive realization, 125, 169 requirements of, 143-6 rights to property, protection of, 55-7 right to fair trial. See fair trial property rights right to food. See food under ECHR, 55, 80 right to health. See health and health non-discrimination principles and, right to housing. See housing rights 215 social security rights and, 215, 272-8 right to life, 47-9 environmental responsibilities as proportionality Bundesverfassungsgericht and, 4 part of, 49



INDEX 327

rights. See also core rights; equality	scope of rights
rights; fundamental rights;	determination of, 95–117
housing rights	through broad definition, 99
for children, 153	negative obligations and, 98-104
defined, 59	positive obligations and, 98–104
to education, 153	narrow, 102
equality and, 130	under UDHR, 143-4
to food, 221–3	wide, 102
to health, 51-2	separation of powers, and minimum
under CESCR, 187-90	core obligations, 163-4
under ICESCR, 147-8, 187-90	social rights. See socio-economic rights
under South African Constitution,	social security, right to, 56, 269-90
153	under CFR, 282
inflation of, 213	core rights perspective for, 278-90
interests and, 59, 61-2	under ECHR, 269–72
interpretation of, 95–8	in ECtHR cases, 270-2, 279-90
to life, 47–9	equality issues in, 283-4
limitations of	essence criterion for, 286
justification of, 104–6	fair balance in, 278-90
review of, 104–17	fundamental individual interests
minimum levels of, fulfillment of,	and, 269–70
221–3	under ICESCR, 147-8, 190-2
to minimum subsistence, 65	minimum levels of, fulfillment of,
negative, 108	221–3
non-discrimination as, 223–4	non-discrimination principle and,
prima facie, 64, 83, 94	272-8
comparative interpretation of, 97	possessions and, 278-90
relative theories on, 139	prohibition of discrimination in, 271
Wesensgehaltsgarantie and, 139	property rights and, 215, 269, 272–90
to respect for private and family life,	proportionality and, 279
52-4, 83	under South African Constitution,
right to health and, 260	153
scope of, under ECHR, 29–30, 47–57	socialization of ECHR rights, 42-6, 68
to social security, 56	socio-economic norms, 60–1
under CESCR, 190-2	socio-economic rights
under ICESCR, 147–8, 187–90	adjudication of, 41
minimum levels of, fulfillment of,	balancing of, 226–7
221–3	core rights and, 11–12
under South African Constitution,	protection of, 294–5
153	cultural rights and, 14–15
rights inflation. See inflation of rights	defined, 14–15
rights proliferation, 213	directive principles and, 6
Roma people	ECHR protections of, 121–2, 214–19
housing rights for, 242–8	future of, 293–4
under ECHR, 243	ECtHR practices and, criticism of,
in ECtHR cases, 243–8	81–6
non-discrimination principles	ECtHR protections of, 214–19
and, 250–1	absolute-absolute core rights, 216
,	



INDEX

328

socio-economic rights (cont.) absolute-relative core rights, 213 - 19consensus and, 218-19 determination of core content, 215 - 18future of, 295 goals of, 215 relative-absolute core rights, 216 - 17relative-relative core rights, 217 expertise and, 25-6 future of, 291-8 to health, 51-2 legitimacy and, 25-6 minimum levels of, 221-3. See also minimum core obligations prohibition of torture and, 49-52 protection of, 1, 9-15 protection of property and, 55-7 respect for private and family life and, 52-4 right to social security, 56 under South African Constitution, 152 - 4adjudication of, 150-6, 167-8 South African Constitutional Court and, 155-6 subsidiarity and, 25-6 South Africa, core rights in, 150–70 Constitutional Court responses to, 201 - 2reasonableness approach to, 165-70 South African Constitution, 151-4 children's rights under, 153 educational rights under, 153 goal of, 168-9 health rights under, 153 housing rights under, 153 limitation clauses in, 154 minimum core obligations rejected under, 162-3 right to health under, 153 social security rights under, 153 socio-economic rights under, 152-4 adjudication of, 150-6, 167-8 transformative character of, 154-5

South African Constitutional Court, 151, 211 rejection of core rights, 201-2 socio-economic rights and, violations of, 155-6 speech. See freedom of speech stages, of rights adjudication, 88-117, Strasbourg Court. See European Court of Human Rights strategic requirements, 194-5 structural margin of appreciation, 117 subsidiarity ECtHR and, 39 socio-economic rights and, 25-6 subsistence minimum, right to, 65 core socio-economic content and, 195-6 in Germany, 170-6, 195-6 Bundesverfassungsgericht, 229 calculation of, 175 compliance with, 174 protection of, 173-4 substantive margin of appreciation, 117 supranational courts. See specific courts supranational protection adjudication of fundamental rights and, 113-14 ECtHR and, 2-3, 7-8, 297

teleological interpretation, of fundamental rights, 64–5, 97 textual interpretation, of fundamental rights, 96 torture, prohibition of, 49–52 trumps, rights as, 93

UDHR. See Universal Declaration of Human Rights Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR), 27 indivisibility thesis and, 70–1 scope of rights under, 143–4

Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties (VCLT) ECHR and, 63, 77



INDEX 329

vulnerable individuals, 225. See also disadvantaged and marginalized individuals and groups Roma people as, 242–8

Wesensgehaltsgarantie (guarantee of the essence of rights), 126–30.

See also minimum core obligations
absolute core rights and, 133–6, 203 applicability of, scope of, 129–30 defined, 122 drafting of, 123–5

human dignity and, 135
individual liberty and, 123
legislative and other powers and,
127–8
objective protections under, 130–3
prima facie rights and, 139
redundancy of, 137
relative core rights and, 123
relative theories on, 138–40,
205–6
subjective protections under, 130–3
World Health Organization (WHO),
181