

The Bronze Horseman of Justinian in Constantinople

Justinian's triumphal column was the tallest freestanding column of the premodern world and was crowned with arguably the largest metal equestrian sculpture created anywhere in the world before 1699. The Byzantine empire's bronze horseman towered over the heart of Constantinople, assumed new identities, spawned conflicting narratives, and acquired widespread international acclaim. Because all traces of Justinian's column were erased from the urban fabric of Istanbul in the sixteenth century, scholars have undervalued its astonishing agency and remarkable longevity. Its impact in visual and verbal culture was arguably among the most extensive of any Mediterranean monument. This book analyzes Byzantine, Islamic, Slavic, Crusader, and Renaissance historical accounts; medieval pilgrimages; geographic, apocalyptic, and apocryphal narratives; vernacular poetry; Byzantine, Bulgarian, Italian, French, Latin, and Ottoman illustrated manuscripts; Florentine wedding chests; Venetian paintings; and Russian icons to provide an engrossing and pioneering biography of a contested medieval monument during the millennium of its life.

ELENA N. BOECK is Professor of History of Art and Architecture at DePaul University. Her publications explore intellectual exchange in the Mediterranean and unconventional, fascinating forms of engagement with Byzantium's legacy. She is the author of *Imagining the Byzantine Past: The Perception of History in the Illustrated Manuscripts of Skylitzes and Manasses* (Cambridge University Press, 2015). She held appointments as the Excellence Initiative Professor at Radboud University, and Director of Byzantine Studies at Dumbarton Oaks.



The Bronze Horseman of Justinian in Constantinople

The Cross-Cultural Biography of a Mediterranean Monument

ELENA N. BOECK
DePaul University, Chicago





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316647646

DOI: 10.1017/9781108178341

© Elena N. Boeck 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021 First paperback edition 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-19727-5 Hardback ISBN 978-1-316-64764-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of Figures and Maps [page ix]
List of Tables [xvi]
Acknowledgements [xvii]
List of Abbreviations [xx]
Note on Transliteration and Naming Conventions [xxiii]
Selected Timeline of the Triumphal Column of Justinian and Its
International Reverberations [xxiv]
Map of Constantinople [xxvii]

Introduction [1]

- I.1 The Horseman and His Global Reach [4]
- I.2 A Singular Biography [7]
- I.3 From Identity to Agency [10]
- 1. Justinian's Entry into Constantinople: He Came, He Saw,

He Conquered [13]

- 1.1 The Court and Its Politics [14]
- 1.2 The Constantinople that Justinian Inherited [15]
- 1.3 Attaining the Throne [24]
- 1.4 Justinian's Public Projections of Power [28]
- 1.5 Justinian as a Highly Competitive Patron [33]
- 1.6 Conclusion [37]
- 2. The Making of Justinian's Forum [38]
 - 2.1 Not Letting the Crisis of 532 Go to Waste [39]
 - 2.2 The Augoustaion Becomes Justinian's Forum [42]
 - 2.3 Hagia Sophia [47]
 - 2.4 Construction of the Tallest Column [53]
 - 2.5 Laying Claim to a Colossal Bronze Horseman [57]
 - 2.6 Imaging Imperial Power on a Colossal Scale [63]
 - 2.7 An Equestrian Monument on the Move [65]
 - 2.8 Conclusion [70]
- 3. Defying a Defining Witness: the Bronze Horseman and the *Buildings (De Aedificiis)* of Prokopios [72]
 - 3.1 Buildings and Its Academic Reception [73]
 - 3.2 Figured Speech, Art of Safe Criticism, and Buildings [75]

v



vi Contents

| nts | | | | | | |
|--------------------------------------|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| | | | | | | |
| | 3.3 | The Bronze Horseman and the Narrative Order of | | | | |
| | | Constantinople's Monuments [79] | | | | |
| | 3.4 | Ekphrasis [82] | | | | |
| | | Ekphrasis or Its Antithesis or Both? [84] | | | | |
| | 3.6 | Ordering the Triumphal Column in Relation to the | | | | |
| | 27 | Monuments of Constantinople [94] Justinian's Demise [96] | | | | |
| | 3.7 | Justinian's Dennise [90] | | | | |
| 4. | The | Horseman of Baghdad Responds to the Horseman | | | | |
| | of C | Constantinople [98] | | | | |
| | 4.1 | Abbasid-Byzantine Encounters [99] | | | | |
| | 4.2 | In Pursuit of Perfection: the Creation of Baghdad [101] | | | | |
| | 4.3 | 8 1 1 | | | | |
| | 4.4 | · | | | | |
| | | Described [114] | | | | |
| | | The End of the Abbasid Rider [120] | | | | |
| | 4.6 | Conclusion [121] | | | | |
| 5. | Soothing Imperial Anxieties: Theophilos and the | | | | | |
| Restoration of Justinian's Crown [12 | | toration of Justinian's Crown [122] | | | | |
| | 5.1 | The Logothete and a Restoration Feat [123] | | | | |
| | 5.2 | The Iconoclast Rumor Mill and the Restoration [125] | | | | |
| | 5.3 | 0 / | | | | |
| | 5.4 | Conclusion [135] | | | | |
| 6. Debating | | ating Justinian's Merits in the Tenth Century [137] | | | | |
| | | The Greatest Wonder of Constantinople [137] | | | | |
| | 6.2 | | | | | |
| | 6.3 | A Lofty Tomb [147] | | | | |
| | 6.4 | Confronting Justinian's Hubris: the Narrative on the | | | | |
| | | Construction of Hagia Sophia [149] | | | | |
| | 6.5 | Conclusion [154] | | | | |
| 7. | The | Bronze Horseman and a Dark Hour for | | | | |
| | Hur | Humanity [155] | | | | |
| | 7.1 | Biblical Job and the Byzantine Job [156] | | | | |
| | 7.2 | The Horseman in the Vatican Manuscript [158] | | | | |
| | 7.3 | Decoding the Message [162] | | | | |
| | 7.4 | Conclusion [168] | | | | |
| 8. | The | Horseman Becomes Heraclius: crusading Narratives | | | | |
| | | ne Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries [169] | | | | |
| | 8.1 | Molding the Memory of Heraclius in the West [169] | | | | |
| | 8.2 | Metamorphosis of the Bronze Horseman: from Justinian to | | | | |

8.4 Redirecting the Horseman towards Jerusalem [184]



Contents vii

| 8.5 | Crusader | Vision: from | Justinian to | Heraclius | [187] |
|-----|----------|--------------|--------------|-----------|-------|
| | | | , | | [] |

- 8.6 Crusader Gaze: Equestrian Monument and the Fourth Crusade [191]
- 8.7 Conclusion [195]

9. From Exile in Nicaea to Restoration of

Constantinople [196]

- 9.1 Constantinople imaginaire [197]
- 9.2 Constantinople and Michael VIII [201]
- 9.3 A Nodal Space in Coronation [208]
- 9.4 Of Second Constantines and Secondary Columns [212]

10. A Learned Dialogue across the Ages: Pachymeres

Confronts Prokopios [216]

- 10.1 Rediscovering Prokopios [216]
- 10.2 The Monument in Time: Pachymeres Outperforms Prokopios [218]
- 10.3 An Exemplary Ekphrasis [230]
- 10.4 Conclusion [232]

11. Orb-Session: Constantinople's Future in the Bronze

Horseman's Hand [233]

- 11.1 The Falling Orb and Bronze Corrosion: a Case for Scientific Causation [234]
- 11.2 Gregoras on the Restorations [236]
- 11.3 Assessing the Palaiologan Emergency Restoration [240]
- 11.4 Much Ado about the Orb: from a Middle Bulgarian Translation to a Plagiarized German Friar [245]
- 11.5 Travelers and the Orb [254]
- 11.6 A New Shift in the Bronze Horseman's Identity? [260]

12. Justinian's Column and the Antiquarian Gaze: a

Centuries-Old "Secret" Exposed [263]

- 12.1 Byzantium's Contribution to Renaissance Antiquarian Pursuits [263]
- 12.2 Cyriac of Ancona: the Father of Archaeology Meets the Bronze Horseman [267]
- 12.3 Geographical Knowledge and Gathering of Strategic Intelligence [274]
- 12.4 Constantinople as Alternate Rome: the *Notitia Dignitatum* [281]
- 12.5 The Budapest Drawing [286]
- 12.6 Conclusion [291]

13. A Timeless Ideal: Constantinople in Slavonic

Imagination of the Fourteenth-Fifteenth

Centuries [293]



viii Contents

| Contents | | | | | | | |
|--|--|---|--|--|--|------|--|
| | 13.1 | | | | | | |
| | 13.2 | Constantinople [294] Conceptualizing Empire in the Mind's Eye: the Mid- | | | | | |
| | 13.2 | Fourteenth-Century Bulgarian Moment [296] | | | | | |
| | 13.3 | | | | | | |
| | | of a Dream [304] | | | | | |
| | 13.4 | More than Orb-Session: Russian Pilgrims Wander and Wonder [305] | | | | | |
| | 13.5 | From Iconic Monuments to Icon: a Tale of Two Constantinoples [311] | | | | | |
| | 13.6 | Word Becomes Image [314] | | | | | |
| 14 | The | Horseman Meets Its End [317] | | | | | |
| 11. | | The Bronze Horseman and the Head of the Last | | | | | |
| | | Emperor [317] | | | | | |
| | 14.2 | _ | | | | | |
| | 14.3 | Cultural Appropriation: Mehmed II and Hagia Sophia [325] | | | | | |
| | 14.4 | • | | | | | |
| | | Conclusion [334] | | | | | |
| 15 | Horse as <i>Historia</i> , Byzantium as Allegory [335] | | | | | | |
| 10. | | Two Weddings in Florence [335] | | | | | |
| | 15.2 | | | | | | |
| | 15.3 | Conclusion [365] | | | | | |
| 16. | 6. Shadowy Past and Menacing Future [366] | | | | | | |
| | | Al-Bistami and Apocalyptic Anxieties [368] | | | | | |
| | | A Display of a Complicated Past [373] | | | | | |
| | | The Permutations and Bifurcations [379] | | | | | |
| | 16.4 | Conclusion [382] | | | | | |
| 17. After the Fall: the Bronze Horseman and the <i>Eternal Tsar'grad</i> [383] | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | 17.1 | Intercession of the Virgin and Spiritual Geography [383] |
| | 17.2 | A Russian Feast of the <i>Intercession</i> [387] | | | | | |
| | 17.3 | Iconography of the Eternal Tsar'grad [392] | | | | | |
| | 17.4 | A Multivalent Emperor and His Visionary Constantinople [398] | | | | | |
| | 17.5 | Coping with the Byzantine Betrayal of Orthodoxy [402] | | | | | |
| | 17.6 | Envisioning a Timeless Tsar'grad [405] | | | | | |
| | 17.7 | Conclusion [408] | | | | | |
| | Post | script: the Horseman's Debut in Print [409] | | | | | |
| .S. | elect I | Bibliography [422] | | | | | |
| | ndex | [442] | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | |



Figures and Maps

- 0.1 Map of Constantinople [page xxvii]
- I.1 Modern artistic representation of the bronze horseman, based on Fig. 12.5, by Rob Hassan [3]
- 1.1 Map of Constantinople in the fifth century [17]
- 1.2 Column capital from the forum of Theodosios.

 Reproduced from Second Report upon the Excavations

 Carried Out In and Near the Hippodrome of

 Constantinople in 1928 on Behalf of the British Academy

 (London: Oxford University Press, 1929) [22]
- 1.3 (a, b) Solidus of Justin I and Justinian I (527), BZC.1960.92 © Dumbarton Oaks, Byzantine Collection, Washington, DC [29]
- 1.4 (a, b) Solidus of Anastasios I (r. 491–518), BZC.1948.17.1268 © Dumbarton Oaks, Byzantine Collection, Washington, DC [30]
- 1.5 (a, b) Solidus of Justinian I, BZC.1956.6.61 ©Dumbarton Oaks, Byzantine Collection, Washington,DC [32]
- Justinian's bronze horseman and Hagia Sophia, modern artistic representation by Rob Hassan [43]
- 2.2 (a) Center of Constantinople (b) Justinian's interventions in the center of Constantinople, around the Augoustaion [47]
- 2.3 (a) Germain Boffrand, Description de ce qui a été pratiqué pour fondre en bronze d'un seul jet la figure equestre de Louis XIV: elevée par la ville de Paris dans la place de Louis le Grand en mil six cents quatre-vingt-dixneuf (1743), planche XI. Photo courtesy Houghton Library, Harvard University (b) Germain Boffrand, Description de ce qui a été pratiqué pour fondre en bronze d'un seul jet la figure equestre de Louis XIV: elevée par la ville de Paris dans la place de Louis le Grand

ix



x List of Figures and Maps

- en mil six cents quatre-vingt-dix-neuf (1743), planche X. Photo courtesy Houghton Library, Harvard University [62]
- 2.4 (a) Barletta colossus. Outside of Chiesa di Santo Sepolcro, Barletta. Photo by the author. (b) Head of the Barletta colossus. Outside of Chiesa di Santo Sepolcro, Barletta. Photo by the author [64]
- 2.5 The process of erecting the obelisk of Theodosios.Base of the obelisk of Theodosios, ca. 392 CE. Photo by the author [69]
- 2.6 Re-erection of the Vatican obelisk by Domenico Fontana in 1586. Niccola Zabaglia, Castelli, e ponti di Maestro Niccola Zabaglia (1743). Photo courtesy Harvard Fine Arts Library [70]
- 3.1 (a, b) Torso of the bronze equestrian statue of Augustus, ca. 10 BCE. Views from different angles. Athens, Archaeological Museum. Photo by the author [91]
- 4.1 Hypothetical reconstruction of Baghdad's Green Dome (after Herzfeld). Drawing by Brian Boeck [108]
- 4.2 Ctesiphon, iwan arch, ca. mid-sixth century CE. LC-DIG-matpc-13136 (digital file from original photo). Library of Congress Prints and Photographs Division Washington, DC [110]
- 4.3 Drinking fountain, "The Arbiter." Ibn al-Razzaz al-Jazari, *The Book of Knowledge of Ingenious Mechanical Devices.* Bodleian Library, Ms. Greaves 27, fol. 55 v (late fifteenth century). Photo courtesy Bodleian Library [116]
- 4.4 (a, b) Coin of Al-Muqtadir Billah (r. 908–32 CE),
 Baghdad. Photo courtesy Bibliothèque Nationale de France [119]
- 5.1 Bronze coin (*follis*) of triumphant Theophilos wearing *toupha*, BZC.1948.17.2665 © Dumbarton Oaks, Byzantine Collection, Washington, DC [131]
- 5.2 A personification offering a *toupha* to a triumphant emperor. "Gunthertuch," tenth- or eleventh-century Byzantine imperial silk (detail). Photo credit: Scala/Art Resource, NY [133]



List of Figures and Maps

хi

- 5.3 Emperor wearing a *toupha* during an imperial *adventus*. The Homilies of Gregory of Nazianzus.
 Bibliothèque Nationale de France, Ms. Grec. 510, fol. 409 v (detail). Photo courtesy Bibliothèque Nationale de France [134]
- 6.1 Justinian and Constantine flanking the Mother of God and Christ Child. Mosaic in the south–west vestibule, Hagia Sophia, Istanbul. Photo by the author [146]
- 6.2 Narthex lunette mosaic, Hagia Sophia, Istanbul. Photo by the author [147]
- 7.1 Job gazes upon his former city while seated on a pile of dung. Book of Job, late twelfth–early thirteenth century (Vat. Gr. 751, fol. 26 r) © 2020 Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana. Reproduced by permission of Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, with all rights reserved [156]
- 7.2 Byzantine representation of Constantinople, second half of the twelfth century (Vat. Gr. 1851, fol. 2 r) © 2020 Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana. Reproduced by permission of Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, with all rights reserved [162]
- 7.3 Book of Job, late twelfth–early thirteenth century. (Vat. Gr. 751, fol. 154 r) © 2020 Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana. Reproduced by permission of Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, with all rights reserved [165]
- 8.1 Heraclius prays in the Holy Sepulchre and rides into Jerusalem. *L'Estoire d'Eracles* (Paris, BnF, Ms. Fr. 2628, fol. 1 r). Photo courtesy Bibliothèque Nationale de France [176]
- 8.2 Penitent Heraclius at a gate of Jerusalem. William of Tyre, *Historia rerum in partibus transmarinis gestarum* (Bruges, ca. 1479–80; The British Library, Royal 15 E. I, fol. 16 r) © The British Library Board [177]
- 8.3 Great Feast in commemoration of the conquest of Jerusalem in 1099. *Grandes Chroniques de France* (Paris, BnF, Ms. Fr. 2813, fol. 473 v). Photo courtesy Bibliothèque Nationale de France [181]
- 8.4 Venice, façade of San Marco, with the four bronze horses over the central entrance. LC-DIG-ppmsca-52687 (digital file from original item). Library of Congress Prints and Photographs Division [183]



xii List of Figures and Maps

- 9.1 View of Constantinople. Cristoforo Buondelmonti, Liber Insularum Archipelagi (Ms. Rossiano 702, Vatican, fol. 32 v) © 2020 Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana. Reproduced by permission of Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, with all rights reserved [215]
- 11.1 The statue of Justinian literally drops the ball (it is visible by the right knee of the horse). The caption reads: "An ymage of Justinyan emperour." *The Travels of John Mandeville*, English manuscript, ca. 1410–20 (London, BL, Royal 17 C XXXVIII, fol. 8 v)

 © The British Library Board [234]
- 11.2 The Equestrian monument of Marcus Aurelius. Anonymous drawing of the Renaissance period. Inv. Sc B 878 r. Civico Gabinetto dei Disegni, Castello Sforzesco, Milano [243]
- 11.3 Corrosion layer on the statue of Marcus Aurelius, before the recent restorations. P116.41. Photo courtesy Archivio fotografico documentazione restauri, Istituto Superiore per la Conservazione ed il Restauro, Rome [244]
- 11.4 "Constantinople" with the "bronze" statue of Justinian in the foreground; the orb is on the base of the column. *The Travels of John Mandeville*, first quarter fifteenth century (London, BL Add. 24189, fol. 9 v) © The British Library Board [249]
- 11.5 Constantinople with horseman atop a large column (on the right). The horseman looks back at the city as if he is about to ride away; no ball is visible. The caption states "Constantinople." *The Travels of John Mandeville*, second quarter fifteenth century (London, BL Harley 3954 fol. 3 r) © The British Library Board [252]
- 12.1 Renaissance transcription of the inscription on the Constantinopolitan Bronze Horseman. Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale, Ms. Conv. Sopp. I.IX.30. Photo by the author [270]
- 12.2 View of Constantinople. Cristoforo Buondelmonti, Liber Insularum Archipelagi (Ms. 4 collection Boies-Penrose). Photo © Christie's Images/Bridgeman Images [280]



List of Figures and Maps

xiii

- 12.3 Péronet Lamy, Constantinople (*Urbs constantinopolitana nova Roma*), *Notitia Dignitatum*,
 1436 (Oxford, Bodleian Library, Ms. Canon. Misc.
 378). Photo courtesy Bodleian Library [284]
- 12.4 Constantinople (*Urbs constantinopolitana nova Roma*), *Notitia Dignitatum* (Matritensis Reserva 36, fol. 84 r) © Biblioteca Nacional de España [285]
- 12.5 A Renaissance drawing of the Constantinopolitan bronze horseman, fifteenth century. Cod. Ital. 3, fol.
 144 v, University Library and Archives, Eötvös Loránd University, Budapest [288]
- (a) The emperor Justinian, Hagia Sophia, Ignatios, and the horseman. Vatican Manasses Manuscript (Vat. Slav. 2, fol. 109 v). Reproduced from Filov, *Les Miniatures*.
 (b) Interpretive representation of Fig. 13.1 a by Rob Hassan [299]
- 14.1 (a) View of Constantinople. Cristoforo Buondelmonti, Liber Insularum Archipelagi (Düsseldorf, Universitätsund Landesbibliothek, Ms G 13, fol. 54 r); (b) Justinian's horseman atop its column next to Hagia Sophia, which has a cross at the top of the dome, and its first stone minaret. Detail from the view of Constantinople in Cristoforo Buondelmonti's Liber Insularum Archipelagi, ca. 1481 (Düsseldorf, Universitäts- und Landesbibliothek, Ms G 13, fol. 54 r) [328]
- 15.1 Apollonio di Giovanni. Xerxes' Invasion of Greece.
 Cassone panel, 1461. Oberlin, Allen Memorial
 Museum. Photo courtesy Allen Memorial
 Museum [337]
- 15.2 Xerxes and horseman, detail of Fig.15.1. Photo by the author [338]
- 15.3 Xerxes on the pontoon bridge, juxtaposed with triangular-shaped city dominated by a colossal column, detail of Fig. 15.1. Photo by the author [340]
- 15.4 Apollonio di Giovanni and Marco del Buono Giamberti. Cassone with the conquest of Trebizond, after ca. 1461. Metropolitan Museum of Art, 14.39. Image in public domain [343]



xiv List of Figures and Maps

- 15.5 View of Constantinople. Detail of Fig. 15.4. Photo by the author [345]
- 15.6 Andrea Mantegna, *Agony in the Garden*, ca. 1450s. London, The National Gallery. Photo credit: Bridgeman Images [350]
- 15.7 A heavily gilded equestrian monument, detail of Fig. 15.6 [351]
- 15.8 Christ in prayer against the backdrop of "Jerusalem," detail of Fig. 15.6 [353]
- 15.9 Vittore Carpaccio, *Presentation of the Virgin at the Temple*, ca. 1510–20. Milan, Pinacoteca di Brera. Photo by the author [358]
- 15.10 Triumphal column crowned by a gilded equestrian monument, detail of Fig. 15.9 [359]
- 15.11 Andrea Mantegna, *Triumphs of Caesar*, canvas VI. Hampton Court. Photo credit: Bridgeman Images [362]
- 15.12 Triumph of Augustus, *Historia Romana* (second half fifteenth century). Paris, Bibliotheque de l'Arsenal, ms. 667, fol. 182 r. Photo courtesy Bibliothèque Nationale de France [364]
 - 16.1 Justinian's bronze horseman in sixteenth-century
 Ottoman memory. Al-Bistami, *Translation of the key to the comprehensive prognostication (Tercüme-i Cifru'l-Cami*), late sixteenth-century Ottoman manuscript.
 Istanbul University Ms. TY 6624, fol. 92 v (detail). Photo courtesy Istanbul University Library [367]
 - 16.2 Hagia Sophia, bronze horseman, obelisk of Theodosios, serpent column, and masonry obelisk. Al-Bistami, *Translation of the key to the* comprehensive prognostication (*Tercüme-i Cifru'l-Cami*), late sixteenth-century Ottoman manuscript. Istanbul University Ms. TY6624, fol. 92 v. Photo courtesy Istanbul University Library [369]
 - 16.3 Justinian's bronze horseman as a sixteenth-century Ottoman memory in the sister manuscript of Al-Bistami's, *Translation of the key to the comprehensive prognostication (Tercüme-i Cifru'l-Cami)*. Drawing by Brian Boeck after late sixteenth-century Ottoman manuscript. Istanbul, TKS Bağdat 373, fol. 255 a [378]



List of Figures and Maps

XV

- 17.1 Eternal Tsar'Grad [conventional designation The Intercession of the Mother of God]. Russian icon, sixteenth century. The Russian Museum (117.7x68.7 cm, inv. num. ДРЖ 2142). Photo courtesy the Russian Museum [385]
- 17.2 Intercession of the Mother of God, Novgorod fourteenth century (ca. 1399). Photo credit:
 Bridgeman Images [393]
- 17.3 All Creation rejoices in thee. Russian icon, sixteenth century. The Russian Museum (инв. ДРЖ 2137; sixteenth century; 143.2x106.2 cm). Photo courtesy the Russian Museum [395]
- 17.4 Justinian's horseman, detail of Fig. 17.1. Photo by the author [406]
- PS.1 (a) View of Constantinople in the World Chronicle of Hartmann Schedel (1493). Das Buch der Chroniken und Geschichten, fol. 274 r. Photo credit: Private Collection, the Stapleton Collection/Bridgeman Images. (b) View of Constantinople in the World Chronicle of Hartmann Schedel (1493). Das Buch der Chroniken und Geschichten, fol. 129 v–130 r. Photo courtesy Newberry Library [410]
- PS.2 View of Babylon in the *World Chronicle* of Hartmann Schedel (1493). *Das Buch der Chroniken und Geschichten*, fol. 24 v. Photo courtesy Newberry Library [412]
- PS.3 View of Constantinople in the *World Chronicle* of Hartmann Schedel (1493). *Das Buch der Chroniken und Geschichten*, fol. 257 r. Photo courtesy Newberry Library [413]
- PS.4 Constantinople in the Augsburg version of *World Chronicle* (1500), fol. 146 r. Photo courtesy Newberry

 Library [416]
- PS.5 View of Constantinople. Cristoforo Buondelmonti, Liber Insularum Archipelagi (Paris, BnF, Ms. Lat. 4825, fol. 37). Photo courtesy Bibliothèque Nationale de France [417]
- PS.6 View of Constantinople in Du Cange, *Historia Byzantina* (1680). Photo by the author [419]
- PS.7 The column of Justinian in Du Cange, detail of Fig. PS.6 [420]



Tables

- 11.1 Greek/Slavonic Logothete [page 246]
- 11.2 The Bronze Horseman: comparison of Mandeville and Related Texts [250]
- 13.1 Russian Anonymous and Zosima: the Bronze Horseman [307]
- 13.2 Russian Anonymous and Zosima: Pagan Emperors [308]

xvi



Acknowledgements

This book began as a small quest to answer a deceptively simple question: why is Justinian's column represented in a fourteenth-century Bulgarian manuscript? The bronze horseman curiously appears in an illustration in the Vatican Manasses. While that text says a lot about Justinian, it never mentions the column. To answer that original question, I had to solve dozens of new puzzles. This project has been an extraordinarily enjoyable experience and a rewarding intellectual journey into many fields.

In this ever-expanding quest I have benefitted from the advice, assistance, and generosity of many people. Cornell Fleischer imparted his extraordinary knowledge of Al-Bistami and Ottoman history. He generously translated a passage from an Ottoman text into English, checked readings from the original manuscript, and shared photographs of unpublished illustrations from Al-Bistami's Ottoman manuscripts. Jaroslav Folda graciously offered his observations about certain Crusader illuminated manuscripts and representations of Heraclius in Crusader histories. Anthony Kaldellis shared his remarkable knowledge of Byzantine texts. Stefania Gereveni provided insights into the intellectual culture of fourteenthcentury Venice. Mihail Mitrea brought to my attention a passage by the patriarch Philotheos Kokkinos about the horseman. Anna Leone discussed colossal Roman images. Marco Aimone shared his knowledge of lateantique metal work. Andrei Timotin offered helpful insights into post-Byzantine prophecies. Claudia Bolgia shared her knowledge of thirteenth- and fourteenth-century Rome. Michalis Kappas introduced me to a spectacular Archangel, shared "his" monuments in Messenia, and transformed the beholding of architecture into a poetic experience. Glenn Peers and Benjamin Anderson read early drafts of Chapter 4. Hendrik Dey provided insightful criticism of a chapter which is no longer part of this book, but which has become the foundation of a new book project devoted to how Troy was imagined in the medieval world. To my former colleagues at Dumbarton Oaks I extend my gratitude for conversations in the garden and valuable lessons about figured speech, strategic silence, and the art of safe criticism.

xvii



xviii Acknowledgements

Drafts of early chapters were written while I held an Excellence Initiative Professorship at Radboud University, Nijmegen, the Netherlands, in Spring 2018. I am most grateful to Olivier Hekster and Daniëlle Slootjes for their hospitality. They, their colleagues, and students created a scintillating environment for working through questions of late antiquity. Intellectual pursuits balanced blissfully with bike rides and excellent beer. I am also grateful to Daniëlle for her helpful comments and suggestions on the first half of the book. We were fortunate to meet at the excellent conference "Byzantine Studies Alive!" that she co-organized with Mariëtte Verhoeven. It is a rare conference that produces a lasting friendship.

I enjoyed talking about this book with Dimitris Hatzilazarou on Naxos, Ingela Nilsson in Istanbul, Luca Zavagno in Ankara, and Karen Manchester in Chicago. Pamela Patton helped me to think about my material in a new way through the lens of the conference she organized on "Art, Power, and Resistance in the Middle Ages." The dynamic duo of Alice Isabella Sullivan and Alessia Rossi provided intellectual engagement through their conference "Eclecticism at the Edges." Nathanael Aschenbrenner and Jake Ransohoff were congenial organizers of "Invention of Byzantine Studies," and careful editors of the resulting volume.

Sections and chapters of the book were presented in various venues. I benefitted from questions and comments from audiences at the Art Institute of Chicago, Bilkent University, Bocconi University, Byzantine Studies Conferences, University of Cologne, Harvard University, Princeton University, Radboud University, Swedish Research Institute in Istanbul, Skopje symposium "Days of Justinian I," Leeds International Medieval Congress, and Twelfth Congress of the Association Internationale d'Etudes du Sud-Est Européen (Bucharest).

I am grateful to numerous institutions, which facilitated the study and publication of images from their collections: the Vatican Library, the British Library, the Bodleian Library, Bibliothèque Nationale de France, Biblioteca Nacional de España, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale (Florence), University Library and Archives, Eötvös Loránd University (Budapest), Dumbarton Oaks, Universitäts- und Landesbibliothek in Düsseldorf, Istanbul University Library, Allen Memorial Museum (Oberlin), the Library of Congress, Irina Shalina at the Russian Museum, and Andras Németh at the Vatican Library. At DePaul University I express my appreciation to associate provost Lucy Rinehart, dean Guillermo Vasquez de Velasco, and to former provost Marten denBoer for facilitating time away to work on this project. A Competitive Research Grant from



Acknowledgements

xix

DePaul University enabled me to acquire images and permissions for publication.

Michael Sharp is ever the model editor. He was patient with the manuscript's increasing word count and expanding scope. His sense of humor and good advice on all matters ranging from this book to travel destinations and good chocolates have been most helpful. Anonymous reviewers provided valuable feedback and suggestions. At Cambridge University Press Sarah Starkey shepherded the book through the publication process.

In the course of completing this project I was very fortunate to get to know Michael Maas. His intellectual generosity, good humor, and friendship have been truly enriching. I gratefully acknowledge his prescient comments and helpful critiques which have greatly improved all aspects of this book. A few days before hurricane Harvey hit Houston we shared a most memorable dinner and reminisced like two grizzled veterans swapping war stories. We laughed so hard that we cried. It was a cathartic experience and I will always remember that day very fondly.

This book would not exist without Brian Boeck. He has been a sagely supporter of this project from the very beginning. He spotted a small announcement for a conference in Skopje devoted to Justinian, he masterminded the lunch that turned a frustratingly long article into this book, and he planned travels to the *corazón de Andalucía* for contemplation and consolation. He patiently read multiple drafts, made wise suggestions, posed difficult questions, and corrected what seems like an infinite number of definite articles. He is my inspiration. This book is dedicated him.



Abbreviations

AB Analecta Bollandiana

Acta AartHist Acta ad archaeologiam et atrium histor-

iam pertinentia

Acta Orientalia Academiae Scientiarum

Hungaricae

AI Ars islamica

AJA American Journal of Archaeology AJP American Journal of Philology

Al-Masaq Al-Masaq: Journal of the Medieval Mediterranean

AnTard Antiquité tardive

APB Acta Patristica et Byzantina

ArtB Art Bulletin

Bildlexicon zur Topographie Istanbuls,

Wolfgang Müeller-Wiener (Verlag Ernst

Wasmuth: Tübingen, 1977)

BMGS Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies

Byzantion Byzantion: Revue internationale des études

byzantines

BZ Byzantinische Zeitschrift
CahArch Cahiers archéologiques
ClAnt Classical Antiquity
CQ Classical Quarterly

CRAI Comptes rendus des séances de

l'Académie des Inscriptions et Belles-

Lettres

Diēgēsis peri tēs Hagias Sophias Narrative on the Construction of Hagia

Sophia

DOP Dumbarton Oaks Papers

GRBS Greek, Roman and Byzantine Studies

HUS Harvard Ukrainian Studies

IJMES International Journal of Middle East

Studies

XX



List of Abbreviations

xxi

JAIC Journal of the American Institute for

Conservation

JEMS Journal of Medieval and Early Modern

Studies

JHS Journal of Hellenic Studies
JLA Journal of Late Antiquity
JÖB Jahrbuch der Österreichischen

Byzantinistik

JRA Journal of Roman Archaeology JRAS Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society

JRS Journal of Roman Studies

JSAH Journal of the Society of Architectural

Historians

IThS Journal of Theological Studies

JWarb Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld

Institutes

MÉFRA Mélanges de l'école française de Rome.

Antiquité

MLQ Modern Language Quarterly

NC The Numismatic Chronicle [and Journal

of the Royal Numismatic Society]

ODB Oxford Dictionary of Byzantium (eds.)

A. Kazhdan, A.-M. Talbot, A. Cutler, T. Gregory, and N. Ševčenko (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991)

RBK Reallexikon zur byzantinischen Kunst

REArm Revue des études arméniennes REB Revue des études byzantines

RESEE Revue des études sud-est européennes
RHR Revue de l'histoire des religions
RSBN Rivista di studi bizantini e neoellenici
RSBS Rivista di studi bizantini e slavi
SBN Studi bizantini e neoellenici

SI Studia Islamica SymbOslo Symbolae Osloenses

TAPhA Transactions and Proceedings of the

American Philological Association

TM Travaux et Mémoires



xxii List of Abbreviations

TODRL Trudy otdela drevnerusskoi literatury

Instituta russkoi literatury Akademii

nauk SSSR

VV Vizantiiskii Vremennik

ZRVI Zbornik radova Vizantološkog instituta

ZKunstg Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte
ZPE Zeitschrift für Papyrologie



Note on Transliteration and Naming Conventions

Transliteration is as much a pragmatic decision as it is an act of ideological valuation. Historical spelling conventions in English often Latinize names and places in Byzantium. I strove to create a balance between widely established conventions in English and fidelity to context. In this book I usually transliterate names and places from Greek rather than settle for their Latinized equivalents, hence Augoustaion rather than Augusteum, Prokopios rather than Procopius. In certain instances, Latinized spelling was deployed in order to reflect a specific cultural context or power relationship, such as the memory of Byzantine historical figures in the medieval Latin cultural imagination, hence Heraclius rather than Herakleios. The same applies to Greek names within a Russian cultural context, hence Epifanii not Epiphanios. For names which have a widely familiar or conventional English form, I consistently used that spelling, hence Constantinople, Constantine, Alexander. I have transliterated Greek and Cyrillic terms and phrases using conventions of what the Library of Congress ironically calls "romanization."

xxiii



Selected Timeline of the Triumphal Column of Justinian and Its International Reverberations

542/3 -An equestrian monument from the forum of Theodosios is moved to the Augoustaion and placed at the top of a colossal column, completing Justinian's forum. Ca. mid-550s -Prokopios creates the foundational description of the monument in the Buildings. Ca. 762 -Abbasid caliph Abu Ja'far al-Mansur places an equestrian statue at the tallest, most central point of his new capital Baghdad. 839/40 -The horseman's grand headgear (toupha) falls, greatly distressing the emperor Theophilos. The toupha is acrobatically reinstalled. Ca. 915-40 -The column is celebrated as the greatest, foremost wonder of Constantinople by Constantine of Rhodes. Ca. 1170s. -The triumphal column is commemorated in the French romance Eracle by Gautier d'Arras as the funerary monument of the emperor Heraclius. Ca. 1200s -The horseman is illustrated in a Byzantine Book of Job as the centerpiece of Job's beloved city during the time of Job's greatest agony. A member of the Fourth Crusade, 1204 -Robert de Clari identifies the horse-

man as Heraclius.

xxiv



Timeline of the Triumphal Column of Justinian

xxv

| 1204-61 - | The monument is preserved in the |
|-----------|----------------------------------|
| 1201-01- | The monument is preserved in the |

Latin empire of Constantinople, but all bronze cladding is removed from the

column.

Ca. 1280s – First Palaiologan description of the

monument. George Pachymeres responds to Prokopios. Two bronze "feathers" fall from the *toupha*. They are placed in the treasury of Hagia

Sophia.

1317 – Emergency restoration of the monu-

ment by Andronikos II after the cross fell off the orb. The horseman is secured, new supports created, and the *toupha* and the orb are regilded.

Ca. 1345 – The horseman is represented for Ivan

Alexander of Bulgaria.

After 1360s – Emendations and variant readings in

manuscripts of *The Travels of Sir John Mandeville* focus on futile attempts to secure the orb in the horseman's

hand.

Late fourteenth century – An illustration of the horseman and of

Hagia Sophia is commissioned by Epifanii the Wise in Moscow.

Before 1403 – The equestrian sculpture is fastened

to its base with chains.

Ca. 1420s – Cristoforo Buondelmonti represents

the column in his image of

Constantinople.

1420s – The orb falls again.

Ca. 1420s–40s – Cyriac of Ancona reports the

Theodosian inscription on the monument. Some Buondelmonti manuscripts are corrected to account

for this discovery.

Ca. 1430–5 – The orb is once again placed in the

rider's hand.



xxvi Timeline of the Triumphal Column of Justinian

1453 -A report claims that the head of Constantine XI is nailed to the column of Justinian by the Ottomans. 1453-5 -Mehmed the Conqueror has the equestrian monument removed from the column. Ca. 1450-1500 -Artists in Italy reimagine the monument. 1490 -Hartmann Schedel claims that the horseman perished in a foreboding meteorological event. Ca. 1520 -The column is demolished by the Ottomans. Ca. 1550 -Pierre Gilles sees and measures remaining fragments of the sculpture before their destruction. Sixteenth-seventeenth centuries -Icon painters in Russian lands represent the column and the equestrian monument. Late sixteenth century -The equestrian monument is represented in apocalyptic manuscripts at

the Ottoman court.

drawing of the monument (now in Budapest) is rediscovered and published. Revival of interest in the visual appearance of the horseman ensues.

1860s -