

## THE ATTENDING MIND

An ancient metaphor likens attention to an archer pulling her bow - the self directing her mind through attention. Yet both the existence of such a self, and the impact of attention on the mind, have been debated for millennia. Advancements in science mean that we now have a better understanding of what attention is and how it works, but philosophers and scientists remain divided as to its impact on the mind. This book takes a strong stance: attention is the key to the self, consciousness, perception, action, and knowledge. While it claims that we cannot perceive novel stimuli without attention, it argues that we can act on and experience the world without attention. It thus provides a new way of thinking about the mind - as something that can either shape itself through attention or engage with the world as it is given, relying on its habits and skills.

CAROLYN DICEY JENNINGS is Associate Professor of Philosophy and Cognitive Science at the University of California, Merced.

# THE ATTENDING MIND

CAROLYN DICEY JENNINGS

*University of California, Merced*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 978-1-316-64689-2 — The Attending Mind  
 Carolyn Dicey Jennings  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India  
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.  
 It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of  
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
 Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781316646892](http://www.cambridge.org/9781316646892)  
 DOI: 10.1017/9781108164238

© Carolyn Dicey Jennings 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020  
 First paperback edition 2021

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

NAMES: Dicey Jennings, Carolyn, author.

TITLE: The attending mind / Carolyn Dicey Jennings.

DESCRIPTION: 1. | New York : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Includes  
 bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2019038864 (print) | LCCN 2019038865 (ebook) |  
 ISBN 9781107195608 (hardback) | ISBN 9781316646892 (paperback) |

ISBN 9781108164238 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Philosophy of mind. | Attention.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC BD418.3 .D53 2020 (print) | LCC BD418.3 (ebook) |  
 DDC 128/.2—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019038864>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2019038865>

ISBN 978-1-107-19560-8 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-316-64689-2 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or  
 accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in  
 this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,  
 or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## *Contents*

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page vii</i>
1 Introduction	I
2 The Philosophical Landscape on Attention	6
2.1 Historical Engagement	10
2.2 Phenomenology	18
2.3 Skeptical Approaches	21
2.4 Attention, Perception, and Knowledge	24
2.5 Attention and Consciousness	26
2.6 Attention and Action	28
2.7 Attention and the Self	30
3 Attention, Mental Causation, and the Self	35
3.1 The Apparent Causal Power of Attention	38
3.2 Top-Down Attention	42
3.3 The Link to Mental Causation	51
3.4 From Weak to Strong Emergence	58
3.5 Some Objections	71
3.6 Summary	74
4 Attention, Perception, and Knowledge	75
4.1 Background and Motivation	77
4.2 Object Perception and Binding	82
4.3 An Objective Spatial Framework	88
4.4 Demonstrative Reference and Knowledge	97
4.5 Information and Meaning	102
4.6 Summary	115
5 Attention, Consciousness, and Habitual Behavior	117
5.1 Background and Motivation	118
5.2 Linking Attention to Consciousness	123
5.3 Countervailing Evidence	130
5.4 Conscious Entrainment	144

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
5.5	Consciousness as Interface	155
5.6	Summary	160
6	Attention, Action, and Responsibility	162
6.1	Motivation and Purpose	163
6.2	Concepts and Background	167
6.3	The Problem of Skilled Behavior	172
6.4	The Hierarchical Control Theory	187
6.5	Responsibility and Special Cases	193
6.6	Summary	197
7	Conclusion	199
	<i>Appendix A Mental Causation and Its Problems</i>	204
	<i>Appendix B The Conceptual History of Top-Down Attention</i>	209
	<i>Appendix C Top-Down Attention and the Brain</i>	212
	<i>Appendix D Working Memory and Attention</i>	214
	<i>References</i>	218
	<i>Index</i>	247

## *Acknowledgments*

This book project began in 2015 with a suggestion from Hilary Gaskin, who helped to shepherd it these last few years. I am very grateful for her stewardship. Two unofficial reviewers, Myrto Mylopoulos and Sebastian Watzl, and two official reviewers for Cambridge University Press, including Nico Silins, offered insights where I most needed them. The mentorship of Teenie Matlock, Eric Schwitzgebel, and Jeff Yoshimi helped me to balance this project with other goals I had as an untenured professor. Key to the project was institutional support from University of California, Merced, including a sabbatical leave that I used to complete the manuscript and a grant from the Center for the Humanities that funded reviewers and the creation of an index, by Alex Dayer. Beyond this core support for the project, numerous philosophers and cognitive scientists have provided valuable help and feedback, but I am especially grateful to Lawrence Berger, Luis Cayetano Simmari, Justin D'Ambrosio, Daniel Dahlstrom, David Danks, Heather Demarest, Bronwyn Finnigan, Jonardon Ganeri, Paul Griffiths, Julia Haas, Grace Helton, Jakob Hohwy, Justin Jungé, Christopher Kello, Daniel Kilov, Colin Klein, Joseph Levine, Carlos Montemayor, Bence Nanay, Alyssa Ney, Nico Orlandi, Adriana Renero, Daniel Schloesser, Daniel Stoljar, Shadab Tabatabaieian, and Wayne Wu. Members of the audience for talks at the Agency and Causation Workshop in Ghent; Association for the Scientific Study of Consciousness Conference in Buenos Aires; Australian National University; Eastern Division Meeting of the APA in Baltimore; European Congress of Analytic Philosophy in Munich; Monash University; Philosophy of Science Association Meeting in Atlanta; San Francisco State University; University of California, Davis; University of California, Irvine; University of Nevada, Reno; University of Sydney; Victoria University of Wellington; and Virtues of Attention Workshop at New York University have offered suggestions for different

parts of the book, no doubt improving it. I have long admired my father's painting, *Binding Oats*, which he kindly allowed me to use as the cover. Finally, the support of my family and friends, and especially David Jennings, allowed me to find my way in the more difficult periods. Thank you to all of those who have lent a hand to this project – I could not have done it without you.