

Classical Literature on Screen

Martin M. Winkler argues for a new approach to various creative affinities between ancient verbal and modern visual narratives. He examines screen adaptations of classical epic, tragedy, comedy, myth, and history, exploring, for example, how ancient rhetorical principles regarding the emotions apply to moving images and how Aristotle's perspective on thrilling plot-turns can recur on screen. He also interprets several popular films, such as *300* and *Nero*, and analyzes works by international directors, among them Pier Paolo Pasolini (*Oedipus Rex*, *Medea*), Jean Cocteau (*The Testament of Orpheus*), Mai Zetterling (*The Girls*), Lars von Trier (*Medea*), Arturo Ripstein (*Such Is Life*), John Ford (Westerns), Alfred Hitchcock (*Psycho*), and Spike Lee (*Chi-Raq*). This book demonstrates the undiminished vitality of classical myth and literature in our visual media, as with screen portrayals of Helen of Troy. It is important for all classicists and for scholars and students of film, literature, and history.

MARTIN M. WINKLER is University Professor and Professor of Classics at George Mason University. His most recent books are *Cinema and Classical Texts: Apollo's New Light* (Cambridge, 2009), *The Roman Salute: Cinema, History, Ideology* (2009), and *Arminius the Liberator: Myth and Ideology* (2015). He has also published numerous articles, book chapters, and reviews, and edited several essay collections on classical antiquity and film.

Classical Literature on Screen

Affinities of Imagination

MARTIN M. WINKLER



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316641873

DOI: 10.1017/9781108123358

© Martin M. Winkler 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

First paperback edition 2019

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

Names: Winkler, Martin M., author.

Title: Classical literature on screen : affinities of imagination / Martin M. Winkler.

Description: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2017. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017026504 | ISBN 9781107191280

Subjects: LCSH: Classical literature – History and criticism. | Motion pictures and literature.

Classification: LCC PA3009 .W56 2017 | DDC 880.09–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017026504>

ISBN 978-1-107-19128-0 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-316-64187-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

List of Illustrations [page viii]
Acknowledgments [xi]

Introduction [1]
1 Narrative from Text to Image [1]
2 Tiresias’ Memory: From Homer to Film Studies [4]
3 Chapter Sequence [12]
4 Ancients and Moderns: Author’s Confession [17]

PART I CREATIVE AFFINITIES:
ANCIENT TEXTS AND MODERN IMAGES [19]

1 The Classical Sense of Cinema and the Cinema’s Sense of Antiquity [21]
1 Quintilian on Emotions: Rhetoric and Imagination [21]
2 Visualization: *Enargeia* and *Phantasia* [25]
3 In the Beginning, Homer [29]
4 From Homer to Cinema [33]
2 Pasolini’s and Cocteau’s Oedipus: No Quarrel of the Ancients and the Moderns in the Cinema Age [41]
1 Horace on the Ancients and the Moderns [42]
2 Charles Perrault against Antiquity [44]
3 Oedipus from Sophocles to Pasolini [46]
4 Cocteau’s Orphic Oedipus [51]
5 From Horace and Perrault to Cinema [54]

PART II ELECTIVE AFFINITIES:
TRAGEDY AND COMEDY [57]

3 Medea’s Infanticide: How to Present the Unimaginable [59]
1 Pier Paolo Pasolini’s *Medea* [62]
2 Arturo Ripstein’s *Such Is Life* [65]
3 Jocy de Oliveira’s *Kseni* [67]
4 Jules Dassin’s *A Dream of Passion* [68]
5 Satoshi Miyagi’s *Medea* [74]

- 6 Lars von Trier's *Medea* [77]
- 7 Natalia Kuznetsova's *Medea* [82]
- 8 Post-Classical Medeas [84]
- 9 Medea's Children [89]
- 10 Happy Ending? [94]
- 11 Endings: Possible and Impossible [98]
- 4 Striking Beauties: Aristophanes' *Lysistrata* [99]
 - 1 Comedy and Theory: No Funny Business [100]
 - 2 Battleground of Emotions [103]
 - 3 Lysistrata in the Silent and Early Sound Eras [110]
 - 4 Triumphs of Love [113]
 - 5 Ridin' High; or, How the West Was Fun [119]
 - 6 (Trans-)Mission Accomplished? [131]
 - 7 Lysistrata the Feminist: Zetterling and Her Girls [140]
 - 8 The Beeb Lurking in Pompeii [149]
 - 9 Lysistrata Defies Greek Dictators and Helps Bring About Gay Lib [153]
 - 10 *Katabasis*: Lysistrata in the Lower Depths [158]
 - 11 Lysistrata Flips the Script in the 'Hood and Moves into the House of Babes [160]
 - 12 *Lysistrata* Goes Global [163]
 - 13 A Chicago Tail: *Chi-Raq* [169]
 - 14 *To kinēma Aristophanikon* [176]
 - 15 Coda: Tail End [179]

PART III NON-ELECTIVE AFFINITIES:

PLOT AND THEME [181]

- 5 "More Striking": Aristotelian Poetics in Achilles Tatius, Heliodorus, and Alfred Hitchcock [183]
 - 1 Aristotle and Mystery Plots [184]
 - 2 Achilles Tatius: Sudden Deaths [191]
 - 3 Heliodorus: Death in a Cave [197]
 - 4 Hitchcock: Sudden Death in the Shower [202]
 - 5 Aristotle Vindicated [211]
- 6 John Ford, America's Virgil [214]
 - 1 The Courses of Empire [214]
 - 2 Frontiers [216]
 - 3 Ford's Cavalry Trilogy [220]
 - 4 Ambiguity and the Price of Empire [225]
 - 5 Darkness Visible [233]
 - 6 History and Epic [240]
 - 7 Remembrance of Things Past [245]

PART IV COUNTER-AFFINITIES:
 IDEOLOGICAL AND NARRATIVE
 DISTORTIONS OF HISTORY [247]

- 7 Fascinating Ur-Fascism: The Case of *300* [249]
 - 1 Leonidas at Stalingrad but Not at Kolberg [250]
 - 2 Sparta and Nazism [256]
 - 3 The Body: Beauty, Heroism, Kitsch [263]
 - 4 *300*: An American *Bergfilm*? [268]
 - 5 The Fascist Nebula [270]
 - 6 CGI Modernity and Fascist Traditionalism in *300* [273]
 - 7 Contemporary Rhetoric [279]
 - 8 Political Paranoia and Ordinary American Fascism [282]
 - 9 Ideological Myopia [287]
 - 10 Return of the Fuzzy [291]
- 8 Good Nero; or, The Best Intentions [297]
 - 1 In Praise of Nero [298]
 - 2 Good Boy! [300]
 - 3 Not Wisely and Not Too Well [302]
 - 4 Christian Forgiveness [310]

PART V AESTHETIC AFFINITIES:
 PORTRAITS OF LADIES [313]

- 9 Regal Beauties in Franco Rossi’s Films of the *Odyssey*
 and *Aeneid* [315]
 - 1 Romantic Nausicaa [317]
 - 2 Baleful Helen [321]
 - 3 Proud Penelope [323]
 - 4 Doomed Dido [332]
- 10 Helen of Troy: Is This the Face That Launched a Thousand
 Films? [341]
 - 1 Art, Beauty, and a Little Sex [342]
 - 2 Fade-In: From Mythical to Real Beauty [343]
 - 3 Beauty Parade: The Main Attractions [344]
 - 4 Fade-Out: Hedy’s Helen and the Eternal Woman [363]

Bibliography [366]
Index [405]

List of Illustrations

Images are either screenshots, in the public domain, or from the William Knight Zewadski Collection, the Jerry Murbach Collection, and the author's collection. High-resolution reproductions of all illustrations, many in color, may be found under the Resources tab at <http://www.cambridge.org/9781107191280>.

- 2.1 A strange Sphinx in Pier Paolo Pasolini's *Oedipus Rex*. [page 49]
- 2.2 Poet and Sphinx in Jean Cocteau's *The Testament of Orpheus*. [52]
- 2.3 The Poet before a painting of Oedipus in Jean Cocteau's *The Testament of Orpheus*. [53]
- 3.1 Medea before her infanticides in Pier Paolo Pasolini's *Medea*. [63]
- 3.2 Poster for Jules Dassin's *A Dream of Passion*. [69]
- 3.3 The infanticide in Satoshi Miyagi's *Medea*. [77]
- 3.4 Medea and her dead children in Jacques Lasalle's stage production of *Medea*. [91]
- 3.5 Dead Alcimenes in *Olympus*. [93]
- 4.1 Aristophanes as spectator in Edward Dmytryk's *Mirage*. [107]
- 4.2 American lobby card for Alfred Stöger's *Triumph der Liebe*. [114]
- 4.3 Lysistrata and Agathos in Alfred Stöger's *Triumph der Liebe*. [115]
- 4.4 Belgian poster for *Destinées*. [116]
- 4.5 The assemblywomen about to strike in George Marshall's *The Second Greatest Sex*. [123]
- 4.6 Liza (l.) and Birdie (ctr.) in George Marshall's *The Second Greatest Sex*. [127]
- 4.7 The two stories of Fritz Kortner's *Die Sendung der Lysistrata. Illustrierte Film-Bühne*. [133]
- 4.8 Harriet Andersson (l.), Bibi Andersson (ctr.), and Gunnel Lindblom (r.) in Mai Zetterling's *The Girls*. [143]

- 4.9 Lysistrata and Lampito on the Acropolis in Francesc Bellmunt's *Lisistrata*. [158]
- 4.10 Alicia Strada (ctr.) and rival gang bosses (extr. l. and r.) negotiating for peace in Melvin James's *A Miami Tail*. [162]
- 6.1 Cochise and the dust of doom in John Ford's *Fort Apache*. [224]
- 6.2 The harmonious symmetry of nature and civilization in John Ford's *My Darling Clementine*. [227]
- 6.3 The accused in John Ford's *The Prisoner of Shark Island*. [230]
- 6.4 The dark side of the antihero in John Ford's *The Searchers*. [234]
- 6.5 The poetic ending of John Ford's *The Searchers*. [234]
- 6.6 The hero as social outcast in John Ford's *The Man Who Shot Liberty Valance*. [235]
- 6.7 The *chiaroscuro* effect in John Ford's *The Man Who Shot Liberty Valance*. [236]
- 6.8 A summation of American culture in John Ford's *The Man Who Shot Liberty Valance*. [240]
- 7.1 The title page of *Völkischer Beobachter* announcing the defeat at Stalingrad. [253]
- 7.2 The head of Arno Breker's *Bereitschaft* in the short film *Arno Breker*. [265]
- 7.3 Leonidas and the nocturnal landscape in Zack Snyder's *300*. [269]
- 7.4 Leonidas' dead body in Zack Snyder's *300*. [278]
- 8.1 Nero and Agrippina in Paul Marcus's *Nero*. [306]
- 8.2 Mother and son in John Frankenheimer's *The Manchurian Candidate*. [306]
- 8.3 Mother and son in Jonathan Demme's *The Manchurian Candidate*. [307]
- 9.1 Odysseus and a romantically spellbound Nausicaa in Franco Rossi's *Odissea*. [320]
- 9.2 Helen in Franco Rossi's *Odissea*. [323]
- 9.3 A probing Penelope in Franco Rossi's *Odissea*. [327]
- 9.4 Odysseus and Penelope's reunion in Franco Rossi's *Odissea*. [331]
- 9.5 Dido in Franco Rossi's *Eneide*. [336]
- 9.6 Dido, doomed and defeated, in Franco Rossi's *Eneide*. [339]

- 10.1 Detail of Helen and Paris in Giovanni Pastrone and Luigi Romano Borgnetto's *La caduta di Troia*. [345]
- 10.2 Helen in Manfred Noa's *Helena: Der Untergang Trojas*. [346]
- 10.3 Helen in Alexander Korda's *The Private Life of Helen of Troy*. [348]
- 10.4 Swedish poster for Gustav Edgren's *Sköna Helena*. [349]
- 10.5 Studio publicity for George Cukor's *Heller in Pink Tights*. [350]
- 10.6 Studio publicity of Helen for Robert Wise's *Helen of Troy*. [351]
- 10.7 Lobby card of Helen in Giorgio Ferroni's *La guerra di Troia*. [352]
- 10.8 Helen (l.) and her Egyptian rival in Giorgio Ferroni's *The Lion of Thebes*. [353]
- 10.9 Studio publicity of Helen in Richard Burton and Neve Coghill's *Doctor Faustus*. [354]
- 10.10 Helen, once more, in Franco Rossi's *Odissea*. [356]
- 10.11 Menelaus (l.), Helen (ctr.), and Hecuba (r.) in Michael Cacoyannis's *The Trojan Women*. [357]
- 10.12 Tyndareus and Helen in John Kent Harrison's *Helen of Troy*. [359]
- 10.13 Helen in Wolfgang Petersen's *Troy*. [360]
- 10.14 Helen in Frédéric Azémar and Stéphane Giusti's *Odysseus*. [362]
- 10.15 Detail of Italian poster for Marc Allegret's *Loves of Three Queens*. [364]

Acknowledgments

I am primarily indebted to Maria Cecília de Miranda Nogueira Coelho, who has been most helpful and supportive in various ways, not least through her friendship and hospitality. Frederick Ahl, Josef Früchtel, Sue Matheson, Mae Smethurst, and Alejandro Valverde García alerted me to certain important details or provided valuable advice. Wolfgang Haase originally granted me the equally pleasing and necessary leeway to be extensively Aristophanic. The Japanese Ku Na'uka Theatre Company furnished me with digital versions of their productions of Greek drama. Jocy de Oliveira supplied me with answers, via e-mail, to specific questions about *Kseni*. With his customary generosity, William Knight Zewadski granted me access to his unique collection of film stills. I am also grateful to Jerry Murbach for permission to use images from his collection of stills. At the press, Michael Sharp once again provided editorial expertise and support. In Washington, DC, the aptly named and extraordinarily secret (*scire nefas*) League of Extraordinary Gentlemen has for many years supplied me with intellectual and other nourishment (*vina liques*) through Thomas Mann, its founder, convener, and genial host.

Preliminary versions of four chapters were published in disparate international venues and have been revised and brought up to date here.¹ The present book is a companion to *Cinema and Classical Texts: Apollo's New Light*, which had been dedicated to the god of light and enlightenment.² Apollo was also the leader of the nine Muses, the Greek and Roman patron goddesses of arts and sciences, hence of all creative and intellectual endeavors. Poet and filmmaker Jean Cocteau on several occasions referred to the cinema as the tenth Muse.³ It is therefore appropriate that I should pay homage to the classical ladies in this “sequel” to the Apollo book. I list, however, not nine but eighteen of their most remarkable

¹ Chapter 4: Winkler 2014b; Chapter 5: Winkler 2014a; Chapter 9: Winkler 2013; Chapter 10: Winkler 2016. – I cite secondary works in my notes by author's or editor's last name and date of publication. Full references are in my Bibliography. In cases when a last name can refer to more than one person, I include the first name in my note references to avoid ambiguity. However, I refer to my own publications by last name only, as here.

² Winkler 2009a. ³ References in Winkler 2009a: 41 note 53.

screen incarnations by combining their Greek and Italic ancestries: the Olympian Muses of Hesiod and the *Camenae* of Livius Andronicus. Horace provides me with a precedent for doing so.⁴ In naming my eighteen, I am being entirely subjective. All affinities of passion are.

⁴ Hesiod, *Theogony* 75–79; Livius Andronicus, *Odusia* 1.1; Horace, *Odes* 2.16.38. On the *Camenae* see now Alex Hardie 2016.

ΤΑΙΣ ΤΟΥ ΜΑΡΤΙΝΟΥ ΜΟΥΣΑΙΣ ΚΙΝΗΜΑΤΟΓΡΑΦΙΚΑΙΣ
ΤΑΙΣ ΝΥΝ ΟΛΥΜΠΙΑΙΣ
ΑΙ ΕΙΣΙΝ

ΜΑΡΓΑΡΙΤΗΣ ΧΟΡΤΑΞΙΑ – ΝΕΑ ΤΕΡΨΙΧΟΡΗ

ΒΟΔΙΑ ΚΙΗΡ – ΝΕΑ ΠΟΛΥΜΝΙΑ

ΚΛΑΥΔΕΤΤΗ ΚΟΛΒΗΡ – ΝΕΑ ΚΛΕΙΩ

ΛΟΥΙΣΑ ΜΙΚΡΟΠΟΤΑΜΟΙ – ΝΕΑ ΕΡΑΤΩ

ΦΡΑΝΣΟΑΣΗ ΔΟΡΛΗΑΚΗ – ΝΕΑ ΟΥΡΑΝΙΑ

ΧΑΡΙΣ ΚΕΛΛΙΑ – ΝΕΑ ΕΥΤΕΡΠΗ

ΣΙΜΩΝΗ ΣΙΜΩΝ – ΝΕΑ ΘΑΛΕΙΑ

ΚΑΠΥΣΙΝΗ – ΝΕΑ ΚΑΛΛΙΟΠΗ

ΑΥΔΡΙΑ ΕΠΚΑΙΟΥΣΑ – ΝΕΑ ΜΕΛΠΟΜΕΝΗ

ΙΕΡΑ ΗΔΕ Η ΒΙΒΛΟΣ

CAMENIS MARTINI CINEMATOGRAPHICIS

NOSTRI AEVI

QVAE SVNT

DANIELA DARIOEA

MARGARITA GARBO

LILIANA GIS

IOANNA HARLO

VERONICA LACVS

CAROLA LONGOBARDA

LORETTA NOVELLA

SILVIA SIDNIA

NORMA TONSTRIX

SACER HIC LIBER