Professional Ethics in Obstetrics and Gynecology
Professional Ethics in Obstetrics and Gynecology

Laurence B. McCullough, PhD
Donald and Barbara Zucker School of Medicine at Hofstra/Northwell
and Lenox Hill Hospital

John H. Coverdale, MD, MEd
Baylor College of Medicine

Frank A. Chervenak, MD, MMM
Donald and Barbara Zucker School of Medicine at Hofstra/Northwell
and Lenox Hill Hospital
For our patients, medical students, residents, fellows, and clinical colleagues
And for our mentors
# Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preface</th>
<th>xxi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgments</td>
<td>xxiii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Section 1 Professional Ethics in Obstetrics and Gynecology

1 Professional Ethics in Medicine  
1.1 Professional Ethics in Medicine and Professional Ethics in Obstetrics and Gynecology 3  
1.2 Ethics and Ethical Reasoning 3  
1.2.1 Ethics 3  
1.2.2 Ethical Reasoning 4  
1.2.2.1 Clinical Judgment 4  
1.2.2.2 Ethical Judgment 4  
1.2.2.3 Two Components of Ethical Reasoning 4  
1.2.2.4 Preventing Common Errors in Ethical Reasoning 5  
1.2.3 The Discipline of Ethical Reasoning 6  
1.2.4 Critical Appraisal of Argument-Based Ethical Reasoning 6  
1.2.5 Two Approaches to Ethical Reasoning: The Quest for Certainty and the Quest for Reliability 6  
1.2.5.1 The Quest for Certainty 7  
1.2.5.2 The Quest for Reliability 7  
1.2.5.3 Professional Ethics in Medicine Is the Quest for Reliability 7  
1.3 Medical Ethics and Bioethics 7  
1.3.1 Medical Ethics 7  
1.3.1.1 Philosophical Medical Ethics 7  
1.3.1.2 Limitations of Medical Ethics 8  
1.3.2 Bioethics 8  
1.3.2.1 Limitations of Bioethics 9  
1.4 Ethical Principles and Virtues in Medical Ethics and Bioethics 9  

| 1.4.1 The Four Ethical Principles in Medical Ethics and Bioethics | 9 |
| 1.4.1.1 The Ethical Principle of Beneﬁcence in Medical Ethics and Bioethics | 9 |
| 1.4.1.2 The Ethical Principle of Nonmaleﬁcence in Medical Ethics and Bioethics | 10 |
| 1.4.1.3 Beneﬁcence and Nonmaleﬁcence in the History of Medical Ethics | 10 |
| 1.4.1.4 The Ethical Principle of Respect for Autonomy in Medical Ethics and Bioethics | 10 |
| 1.4.1.5 The Ethical Principle of Justice in Medical Ethics and Bioethics | 10 |
| 1.4.1.6 Putting Ethical Principles into Practice | 11 |
| 1.5 Professional Ethics in Medicine | 11 |
| 1.5.1 The Invention of Professional Ethics in Medicine | 11 |
| 1.5.1.1 Hippocratic Medical Ethics | 11 |
| 1.5.1.2 Friedrich Hoffmann on the Politic Physician | 12 |
| 1.5.1.3 John Gregory and Thomas Percival on Professional Ethics in Medicine | 13 |
| 1.5.1.4 Gregory’s Professional Ethics in Medicine | 13 |
| 1.5.1.5 Percival’s Professional Ethics in Medicine | 14 |
| 1.5.1.6 The Ethical Concept of Medicine as a Profession | 14 |
| 1.6 Professional Virtues and Ethical Principles in Professional Ethics in Medicine | 15 |
| 1.6.1 The Five Professional Virtues | 15 |
| 1.6.1.1 The Professional Virtue of Integrity | 15 |
1.6.1.2 The Professional Virtue of Humility 16
1.6.1.3 The Professional Virtue of Compassion 16
1.6.1.4 The Professional Virtue of Self-Effacement 16
1.6.1.5 The Professional Virtue of Self-Sacrifice 17
1.6.2 The Four Ethical Principles in Professional Ethics in Medicine 17
1.6.2.1 The Ethical Principle of Beneficence in Professional Ethics in Medicine 17
1.6.2.2 The Concept of a Medically Reasonable Alternative 17
1.6.2.3 The Ethical Principle of Nonmaleficence in Professional Ethics in Medicine 18
1.6.2.4 The Ethical Principle of Respect for Autonomy in Professional Ethics in Medicine 18
1.6.2.5 The Ethical Principle of Healthcare Justice in Professional Ethics in Medicine 18
1.7 Advantages of Professional Ethics in Medicine 19
1.8 Why Should Physicians Commit to the Ethical Concept of Medicine as a Profession? 19
References 22

2 Professional Ethics in Obstetrics and Gynecology 24
Goal 24
Objectives 24
Topics 24
Key Concepts 25
2.1 Professional Ethics in Obstetrics and Gynecology 26
2.2 Professional Virtues and Ethical Principles in Professional Ethics in Gynecology 26
2.2.1 The Female Patient 26
2.2.1.1 Gregory on Ethical Obligations to the Female Patient 27
2.2.2 The Five Professional Virtues in Professional Ethics in Gynecology 27
2.2.2.1 The Professional Virtue of Integrity in Professional Ethics in Gynecology 27

2.2.2.2 The Professional Virtue of Humility in Professional Ethics in Gynecology 27
2.2.2.3 The Professional Virtue of Compassion in Professional Ethics in Gynecology 27
2.2.2.4 The Professional Virtue of Self-Effacement in Professional Ethics in Gynecology 28
2.2.2.5 The Professional Virtue of Self-Sacrifice in Professional Ethics in Gynecology 28
2.2.3 Ethical Principles in Professional Ethics in Gynecology 29
2.2.3.1 The Ethical Principle of Beneficence in Professional Ethics in Gynecology 29
2.2.3.2 The Concept of a Medically Reasonable Alternative 29
2.2.3.3 The Ethical Principle of Nonmaleficence in Professional Ethics in Gynecology 29
2.2.3.4 The Ethical Principle of Respect for Autonomy in Professional Ethics in Gynecology 29
2.2.3.5 The Ethical Principle of Healthcare Justice in Professional Ethics in Gynecology 29
2.3 Professional Virtues and Ethical Principles in Professional Ethics in Obstetrics 30
2.3.1 The Five Professional Virtues in Professional Ethics in Obstetrics 30
2.3.1.1 The Professional Virtue of Integrity in Professional Ethics in Obstetrics 30
2.3.1.2 The Professional Virtue of Humility in Professional Ethics in Obstetrics 30
2.3.1.3 The Professional Virtue of Compassion in Professional Ethics in Obstetrics 30
2.3.1.4 The Professional Virtue of Self-Effacement in Professional Ethics in Obstetrics 31
2.3.1.5 The Professional Virtue of Self-Sacrifice in Professional Ethics in Obstetrics 31
2.3.2 Ethical Principles in Professional Ethics in Obstetrics 32
2.3.2.1 The Ethical Principle of Beneficence in Professional Ethics in Obstetrics 32
2.3.2.2 The Concept of a Medically Reasonable Alternative 32
2.3.2.3 The Ethical Principle of Nonmaleficence in Professional Ethics in Obstetrics 32
2.3.2.4 The Ethical Principle of Respect for Autonomy in Professional Ethics in Obstetrics 32
2.3.2.5 The Ethical Principle of Healthcare Justice in Professional Ethics in Obstetrics 32

2.4 The Ethical Concept of the Fetus as a Patient 33
2.4.1 Five Decades of the Discourse of the Fetus as a Patient 33
2.4.2 A Preliminary: The Ethical Concept of Moral Status 34
2.4.2.1 Dominance of Independent Moral Status in Medical Ethics and Bioethics 34
2.4.2.2 Problems with the Concept of Independent Moral Status 35
2.4.3 The Ethical Concept of the Fetus as a Patient 35
2.4.3.1 The Viable Fetus as a Patient 36
2.4.3.2 The Perivable Fetus as a Patient 36
2.4.3.3 The Previable Fetus as a Patient 36
2.4.3.4 The Obstetrician’s Prima Facie Beneficence-Based Obligations to the Fetal Patient 36
2.4.3.5 Limits on Prima Facie Beneficence-Based Obligations to the Pregnant Patient 37
2.4.3.6 Enforcement of Prima Facie Beneficence-Based Ethical Obligations to the Fetal Patient 37

2.5 Advantages of the Ethical Concept of the Fetus as a Patient 38
2.5.1 The Ethical Concept of the Fetus as a Patient Avoids the Philosophical and Clinical Paralysis of “Right to Life” 38
2.5.2 The Ethical Concept of the Fetus as a Patient Avoids Reducing Moral Status to Independent Moral Status 38
2.5.3 The Ethical Concept of the Fetus as a Patient Avoids Rights-Based Absolutism 39
2.5.4 The Fetus Is a Separate Patient: A Failed Critique of the Ethical Concept of the Fetus as a Patient 40

2.6 Delivery Makes a Difference: Professional Ethics in Perinatal Medicine 41

References 42

3 Decision Making By, With, and For Patients 45

Goal 45
Objectives 45
Topics 45
Key Concepts 47

3.1 Decision Making By, With, and For Patients 47

3.2 A Decision Made By and With the Patient: Simple and Informed Consent 47
3.2.1 The Presumption of Decision-Making Capacity in Adult Patients 47
3.2.2 The Presumption of Decision-Making Capacity in Minors with Legal Authority over Themselves 47
3.2.3 “Competence” and “Capacity”: Two Names for the Same Clinical Phenomenon 48
3.2.4 Seven Components of Decision-Making Capacity 48
3.2.5 Consent: Simple and Informed 49
3.2.5.1 Simple Consent 49
3.2.5.2 Informed Consent Process 51

3.3 Informed Refusal: A Strict Legal Obligation with a Preventive Ethics Component 55
3.3.1 The Strict Legal Obligation 55
3.3.2 The Preventive Ethics Component 56

3.4 How Attitudes Can Distort Clinical Judgment 56

3.5 Who Should Obtain Simple Consent? 57

3.6 Who Should Lead the Informed Consent Process? 57

3.7 Projecting Decision Making into the Future: Advance Directives 57
### 3.8 A Decision By the Patient With the Obstetrician-Gynecologist and Others Who Assist in the Decision-Making Process: Assisted Decision Making

- **3.8.1 Assessment of Decision-Making Capacity**: 58
- **3.8.2 Risk-Adjusted Assessment of Decision-Making Capacity: Proceed with Great Caution**: 58
- **3.8.3 Decision-Making Capacity Is Task Specific and Time Specific**: 58
  - **3.8.3.1 Task-Specific Decision-Making Capacity**: 58
  - **3.8.3.2 Time-Specific Decision-Making Capacity**: 59
  - **3.8.3.3 Ulysses Contract**: 59
- **3.8.4 When One or More Components of Decision-Making Capacity Are Diminished**: 59

### 3.9 A Decision By Others but With the Patient: Pediatric and Geriatric Assent

### 3.10 A Decision By Others For the Patient but Not With the Patient: Surrogate Decision Making

- **3.10.1 Two Standards for Surrogate Decision Making**: 61
  - **3.10.1.1 Substituted Judgment Standard**: 61
  - **3.10.1.2 The Best Interests Standard**: 62
- **3.11 Clinical Ethical Topics in Decision Making for Patients**: 62
  - **3.11.1 Variants of Impaired Autonomy**: 62
    - **3.11.1.1 Chronic and Variable Impairment of Autonomy**: 62
    - **3.11.1.2 Chronic and Invariable Impairment of Autonomy**: 63
    - **3.11.1.3 Chronic and Progressive Impairment of Autonomy**: 63
    - **3.11.1.4 Chronic and Decreasing Impairment of Autonomy**: 63

### 3.12 Surrogate Decision Making about Termination of Pregnancy

### 3.13 Surrogate Decision Making about Prevention of Pregnancy

### 3.14 Managing Doubts about the Reliability of a Surrogate Decision Maker

### 3.15 Managing Refusal of a Family Member to Accept the Legally Designated Surrogate

### 3.16 Medical Emergencies

### 4 Confidentiality

- **4.1 Confidentiality in Professional Ethics in Obstetrics and Gynecology**: 69
  - **4.1.2 History of the Obligation**: 69
    - **4.1.2.1 The Hippocratic Oath**: 69
    - **4.1.2.2 Friedrich Hoffmann on the Politic Physician as Taciturn**: 69
    - **4.1.2.3 John Gregory on Keeping Patients’ Secrets**: 70
    - **4.1.2.4 Thomas Percival on Keeping Patients’ Secrets**: 71
    - **4.1.2.5 The Shift from an Absolute to Prima Facie Ethical Obligation**: 71
  - **4.1.2.6 Confidentiality: A Prima Facie Ethical Obligation**: 72
- **4.2 Setting Ethically Justified Limits on the Prima Facie Ethical Obligation of Confidentiality in Obstetrics and Gynecology**: 72
- **4.3 Ethical Challenges to Filling the Prima Facie Ethical Obligation of Confidentiality**: 73
  - **4.3.1 Emergency Medical Care**: 73
  - **4.3.2 Disclosure to Family Members during and after Procedures Requiring Sedation or Anesthesia**: 73
  - **4.3.3 Inquiries by the Patient’s Employer**: 74
  - **4.3.4 Insurance Claims**: 74
  - **4.3.5 Electronic Medical Record**: 75
5 Conflicts of Interest and Conflicts of Commitment 79

5.1 Conflicts of Interest and Conflicts of Commitment in Historical Perspective 80
5.2 Conflicts of Interest 80
5.2.1 Entrepreneurial versus Professional Relationships 80
5.2.2 Conflict of Interest Defined 81
5.2.3 John Gregory on Conflicts of Interest 81
5.2.4 Thomas Percival on Conflicts of Interest 82
5.2.5 Conceptual Confusion about Conflicts of Interest 83
5.2.6 Professionally Responsible Management of Conflicts of Interest 83
5.2.6.1 Use of Imaging 83
5.2.6.2 Payment for Clinical Practice 83
5.2.6.3 Cosmetic Procedures 84
5.2.6.4 Research 84

5.3 Conflicts of Commitment 85
5.3.1 Conflict of Commitment Defined 85
5.3.2 Percival on Conflicts of Commitment 85
5.3.3 Professionally Responsible Management of Conflicts of Commitment 85

6 Teaching Professional Ethics in Obstetrics and Gynecology 93
6.1 Teaching the Basics of Professional Ethics in Obstetrics and Gynecology 94
6.2 Teaching the Discipline of Ethical Reasoning 95
6.2.1 Precision of Thought and Speech 95
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.2.2 Going Where Arguments Take One and Nowhere Else</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3 Pedagogical Tools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.1 Formal Assessment Tool for the Normative Ethics Literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.1.1 Does the Article Address a Focused Ethics Question?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.1.2 Are the Results of the Article Valid?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.1.3 What Are the Results?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.1.4 Will the Results Help Me in Clinical Practice? In Innovation and Research? In Organizational Culture? In Health Policy and Advocacy?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2 Structured Reviews of the Normative Ethics Literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 Pedagogical Methods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.1 Case-Based Teaching Using an Ethics Workup</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2 &quot;Fast Ethics&quot;: Teaching Ethics on Rounds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.3 Preparing a Grand Rounds Presentation on Professional Ethics in Obstetrics and Gynecology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.4 What Makes a Great Teacher of Professional Ethics in Obstetrics and Gynecology?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5 A Distinctive Challenge in Graduate Medical Education: Preventing Drift Away from Professionalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.1 The Commitment to the Ethical Concept of Medicine as a Profession</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2 Drift Away from an Organizational Culture of Professionalism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2.1 Restricted Duty Hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2.2 Supervision by Attending Physicians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.5.2.3 Compounding Factors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6 A Preventive Ethics Response to Reduced Accountability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.1 Performing a Critical Appraisal of the Organizational Culture of the Residency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.2 Defining Components of Professional Accountability in Milestones</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.3 Mastering the Skillset of Patient Safety and Quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.6.4 Enhancing the Role of ACGME</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>References</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Section 3 Professionally Responsible Clinical Practice

### 7 Prevention of Pregnancy | 107 |
| Goal | 107 |
| Objectives | 107 |
| Topics | 107 |
| Key Concepts | 108 |
| 7.1 The Biopsychosocial Concept of Fertility | 108 |
| 7.1.1 The Role of the Biologic Concept of Sex in the Biopsychosocial Concept of Fertility | 108 |
| 7.1.2 The Biologic Concept of Fertility: A Clinical Condition with Two Meanings | 108 |
| 7.1.3 The Biopsychosocial Concept of Fertility | 108 |
| 7.2 Medically Reasonable Alternatives for the Prevention of Pregnancy | 109 |
| 7.2.1 Four Groups of Methods to Prevent Pregnancy | 109 |
| 7.3 Decision Making about the Management of Fertility | 109 |
| 7.3.1 Beneficence-Based Deliberative Clinical Judgment | 109 |
| 7.3.2 Autonomy-Based Clinical Judgment | 109 |
| 7.3.3 The Role of Directive Counseling | 109 |
| 7.3.4 The Role of Shared Decision Making | 110 |
| 7.3.5 Impermissible Scope of Beneficence-Based Deliberative Clinical Judgment | 110 |
| 7.4 Assisted Decision Making | 111 |
| 7.4.1 Assisted Decision Making with Patients with Major Mental Disorders | 111 |
| 7.5 Pediatric Assent | 112 |
| 7.6 Surrogate Decision Making | 112 |
| 7.7 Organizational Policy | 113 |
| 7.8 Healthcare-Justice-Based Deliberative Clinical Judgment and Advocacy | 113 |
7.8.1 Access to Clinical Management of Fertility 113
7.8.2 Court-Ordered Clinical Management of Fertility 113
References 114

8 Initiation of Pregnancy 115
Goal 115
Objectives 115
Topics 115
Key Concepts 116
8.1 Two Roles of the Obstetrician-Gynecologist in the Initiation of Pregnancy 116
8.1.1 Assisted Reproduction 116
8.1.2 Preconception Counseling 116
8.2 Precision of Thought and Speech 117
8.2.1 The In Vitro Meaning of “Embryo” in Reproductive Medicine 117
8.2.2 The In Vivo Meaning of “Embryo” in Reproductive Medicine 117
8.3 In Vitro Assisted Reproduction 117
8.3.1 The Ethical Concept of Moral Status 117
8.3.1.1 Does an Embryo Have Independent Moral Status? 117
8.3.1.2 Does an Embryo Have Dependent Moral Status? 118
8.3.1.3 How Many Embryos Should Be Transferred? 118
8.3.1.4 Preimplantation Analysis of the In Vitro Embryo 119
8.3.1.5 Responding to Requests for a High Number of Embryos to Be Transferred 120
8.3.1.6 Seamless Patient Care 120
8.4 Manipulation of the In Vitro Embryo: Clinical Innovation and Research 120
8.5 Preconception Counseling 120
8.5.1 Anticipating Moral Risk 121
8.5.2 Counseling about Obstetric Management 121
References 121

9 Induced Abortion and Feticide 123
Goal 123
Objectives 123
Topics 123
Key Concepts 124
9.1 Ethical Challenges of Counseling Pregnant Women about Induced Abortion and Feticide 124
9.2 Precision of Thought and Speech 124
9.3 Induced Abortion and Feticide before Viability in Professional Ethics of Obstetrics 125
9.4 Offering Induced Abortion and Feticide 125
9.4.1 After Viability 125
9.4.2 Before Viability: Beneficence-Based Justifications 126
9.4.2.1 When Pregnancy Poses a Threat to the Health or Life of the Pregnant Patient 126
9.4.2.2 When Pregnancy Poses a Threat to the Life or Health of the Coexistent Fetus(es) 126
9.4.3 Before Viability: Autonomy-Based Justifications 126
9.5 Recommending Induced Abortion or Feticide 127
9.5.1 Risk to the Health or Life of the Pregnant Woman 127
9.5.2 Increased Risk to the Health or Life of the Fetus(es) 127
9.5.3 Diagnosis of a Serious Fetal Anomaly 128
9.5.4 Complications that Threaten the Health or Life of the Pregnant Woman and Fetal Salvage Is Hopeless 128
9.5.5 Ethical Justifications 128
9.6 Decision Making With, By, and For Patients with Depression and Psychoses 128
9.7 Conscientious Objection to Offering or Recommending Induced Abortion or Feticide 129
9.8 Performing Induced Abortion and Feticide 129
9.9 Invoking Conscientious Objection to Performing Induced Abortion or Feticide 130
9.10 Confidentiality 131
9.11 Referring for Induced Abortion and Feticide 131
9.11.1 Direct Referral 131
9.11.2 Indirect Referral 131
References 131
Contents

10 Fetal Analysis 133
  Goal 133
  Objectives 133
  Topics 133
  Key Concepts 134
  10.1 Fetal Analysis and Decision Making about Obstetric Management 134
  10.2 Providing Clinical Information about Options for Fetal Analysis Using Precise Nomenclature 134
     10.2.1 Deceptively Imprecise Current Nomenclature 134
     10.2.2 Replacement Nomenclature: Noninvasive Fetal Analysis or Invasive Fetal Analysis 135
        10.2.2.1 Fetal Analysis 135
        10.2.2.2 Noninvasive or Invasive Method 135
        10.2.2.3 New Nomenclature 135
  10.3 Nondirective Counseling or Shared Decision Making 136
  10.4 How Pregnant Women Will Respond to an Offer of Fetal Analysis 136
     10.4.1 Refusal of All Forms of Fetal Analysis 137
     10.4.2 Election of Invasive Fetal Analysis 137
     10.4.3 Election of Noninvasive Fetal Analysis 137
        10.4.3.1 Free Fetal DNA Analysis 137
  10.5 Use of Results from Fetal Analysis 138
  References 138

11 Periviability 139
  Goal 139
  Objectives 139
  Topics 139
  Key Concepts 140
  11.1 Viability 140
  11.2 Perivable Birth 140
  11.3 Professional Ethics in Perinatal Medicine 140
  11.3.1 The Obstetric Component of Professional Ethics in Perinatal Medicine 141
  11.3.2 The Pediatric Component of Professional Ethics in Perinatal Medicine 141
  11.4 The Continuum of Deliberative Clinical Judgment about the Clinical Management of Periviability 142
     11.4.1 Intrapartum Management 142
        11.4.1.1 Consensus Statement from the American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists and the Society for Maternal–Fetal Medicine 142
        11.4.1.2 Limits of Deliberative Clinical Obstetric Judgment 143
     11.4.2 Evaluation of the Neonatal Patient for Clinical Application of Specified Concepts of Futility 143
     11.4.3 Resuscitation as a Trial of Intervention 143
     11.4.4 Neonatal Critical Care as a Trial of Intervention 143
  11.5 A Multidisciplinary Team Approach to Counseling before Delivery 143
  11.5.1 Clarifying Who Is the Decision Maker with the Perinatal Team 143
  11.5.2 A Multidisciplinary Approach 144
  11.6 Responding to Requests to “Do Everything” 144
     11.6.1 A Preventive Ethics Approach 144
     11.6.2 Addressing Incomplete or Inaccurate Information 144
     11.6.3 Moral Theological Considerations 145
     11.6.4 Hope and Coping with Loss 145
  References 145

12 Intrapartum Management 147
  Goal 147
  Objectives 147
  Topics 147
  Key Concepts 148
12.1 The Continuum of Vaginal Delivery and Cesarean Delivery 149

12.2 Preventive Ethics for Cesarean Delivery 149
12.2.1 Preventive Ethics 149
12.2.2 The Goal of Preventive Ethics 149
12.2.3 The Informed Consent Process as Preventive Ethics 150
12.2.4 The Role of Recommendations 150
12.2.5 When Both Vaginal and Cesarean Delivery Are Medically Reasonable 150

12.3 Cephalocentesis 151
12.3.1 Isolated Fetal Hydrocephalus 151
12.3.2 Hydrocephalus with Severe Associated Abnormalities 151
12.3.3 Hydrocephalus with Other Associated Anomalies 152

12.4 Refusal of Cesarean Delivery 152
12.4.1 Refusal of Cesarean Delivery and Termination of Relationship with the Obstetrician 152
12.4.2 Refusal of Cesarean Delivery and Election of the Medically Reasonable Alternative of Vaginal Delivery 152
12.4.3 Refusal of Cesarean Delivery When It Is the Only Medically Reasonable Alternative: A Negative Right Coupled to a Positive Right 152
12.4.3.1 The Role of the Professional Virtue of Integrity in Professional Ethics in Obstetrics and Gynecology 152

12.4.4 Antepartum Refusal 153
12.4.5 Intrapartum Refusal 153
12.4.5.1 Refusal of Cesarean Delivery for Well-Documented, Intrapartum, Complete Placenta Previa and for Severe Placental Abruption 153
12.4.5.2 Refusal of Cesarean Delivery for Severe Fetal Distress and Prolapsed Umbilical Cord 154

12.4.6 Court Orders for Forced Cesarean Delivery 154

12.5 Decision Making With, By, and For Pregnant Patients with Mental Disorders and Illnesses 154
12.5.1 Managing Powerful Responses 154
12.5.2 Informed Consent, Assisted Consent, and Surrogate Decision Making 155
12.5.2.1 Assessment of Decision-Making Capacity 155
12.5.2.2 The Informed Consent Process 155
12.5.2.3 Assisted Decision Making 155
12.5.2.4 Surrogate Decision Making 155
12.5.3 Treatment Is Accepted by the Patient 155
12.5.4 Treatment Is Not Accepted by the Patient 157
12.5.4.1 Attempt Assent 157
12.5.4.2 When Beneficence-Based Ethical Obligations Should Guide Clinical Management 157

12.6 Continuing a Pregnancy in a Patient in a Permanent Vegetative State and in a Cadaver 157
12.6.1 Continuing Pregnancy Is an Experiment 157

12.7 Responding to Requests for Cesarean Delivery 158
12.7.1 Preventing Involuntary Requests 158

12.8 Planned Home Birth 158
12.8.1 Planned Home Birth Is Inconsistent with Patient Safety 158
12.8.2 Implications for Counseling Women Who Express an Interest in a Planned Home Birth 159
12.8.2.1 The Role of Recommendations 159
12.8.2.2 Making Recommendations Supports, Not Impairs, Patient Autonomy 160

References 160
Contents

13 The Perfect Baby 163
  Goal 163
  Objectives 163
  Topics 163
  Key Concepts 164
  13.1 The Perilous Logic of the Belief that Medicine Can Control Human Biology 164
     13.1.1 The Quest for Control over Human Biology 164
     13.1.2 A Perilous Logic 164
  13.2 Creative Literature in Ethical Reasoning 164
  13.3 The Perils of Belief in Control and Expectation of Perfection: A Cautionary Tale from American Literature 164
     13.3.1 Nathaniel Hawthorne’s “The Birth-Mark” 165
  13.4 The Perils of the Logic of Belief in Control and Pursuit of Perfection 165
     13.4.1 An Antidote: Preventive Ethics 165
     13.4.2 The Interaction of Clinical and Social Conditions that Promote the Concept of the Perfect Baby 165
        13.4.2.1 Fetal Imaging 165
        13.4.2.2 Baby Pictures 165
        13.4.2.3 Belief in Control over Human Biology 165
        13.4.2.4 Consumer Rights Movement 166
  13.5 Fashioning the Informed Consent Process to Defuse the Expectation That Medicine Can Control Human Reproductive Biology 166
     13.5.1 No Guarantee of a Perfect Baby 167
     13.5.2 What Obstetricians Should Know 167
     13.5.3 What Patients Need to Know 167
     13.5.4 Limits of Fetal Diagnosis 168
     13.5.5 Experimental Maternal–Fetal Intervention 169
  13.6 Perfection in Pregnancy Is Not Attainable 169

References 170

14 Cancer and Pregnancy 171
  Goal 171
  Objectives 171
  Topics 171

Key Concepts 172

14.1 Ethical Challenges of Cancer and Pregnancy 172

14.2 Congruent and Noncongruent Beneficence-Based Ethical Obligations of the Obstetrician 172
  14.2.1 Congruent Beneficence-Based Ethical Obligations to the Pregnant and the Fetal Patient 172
  14.2.2 Noncongruent Beneficence-Based Ethical Obligations to the Pregnant and the Fetal Patient 172

14.3 The Informed Consent Process 173
  14.3.1 The Informed Consent Process When the Fetus Is Preivable 173
  14.3.2 The Informed Consent Process When the Fetus Is Viable 173
        14.3.2.1 Congruent Beneficence-Based Obligations to the Pregnant and the Fetal Patient 174
        14.3.2.2 Noncongruent Beneficence-Based Obligations to the Pregnant Patient 174
        14.3.2.3 Noncongruent Beneficence-Based Obligations to the Pregnant Patient and the Fetal Patient 174

14.4 Advance Directives 176

References 176

15 Setting Ethically Justified Limits on Life-Sustaining Treatment 177
  Goal 177
  Objectives 177
  Topics 177
  Key Concepts 178

15.1 Two Goals of Life-Sustaining Treatment 178

15.2 Beneficence-Based and Autonomy-Based Limits of Life-Sustaining Treatment 178

15.3 Historical Perspective 179
  15.3.1 The Hippocratic Tradition of Declaring Gravely Ill Patients Incurable and Abandoning Them 179
  15.3.2 John Gregory’s Reversal of the Hippocratic Tradition of Abandoning Dying Patients 179
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section 4 Professionally Responsible Leadership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16 Leadership 189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal 189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives 189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Topics 189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Key Concepts 190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.1 Ethical Challenges in Organizational Leadership 190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3 Gregory and Percival on Organizational Culture 192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3.1 Professional Treatment of Colleagues 192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3.2 Professional Resource Management 193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3.2.1 The Perils of a Utilitarian Organizational Culture 193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3.2.2 The Perils of a Libertarian Organizational Culture 193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3.3.2 Monopoly Power and Monopsony Power 193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3.4.1 Machiavellian Organizational Culture 194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3.4.3 A Wonderland Organizational Culture 194</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
16.3.4.5 A Postmodern Organizational Culture 194
16.3.4.6 Common Signs of Progressive Organizational Dysfunction 195

16.4 Managing Guild Interests 195
16.4.1 Guild Interests: An Insidious Threat to a Professional Organizational Culture 195
16.4.2 Two Potentially Insidious Incentives 196
16.4.2.1 Productivity Incentives 196
16.4.2.2 Regulatory and Compliance Demands 196
16.4.3 A Powerful Antidote: An Organizational Culture that Subordinates Guild Interests to Professionalism 196
16.4.3.1 Setting Reasonable Limits on Self-Sacrifice 197
16.4.3.2 Preventing Incremental Subordination of Professionalism to Guild Self-Interest 197

16.5 Navigating the Perilous Waters of Scylla and Charybdis 197

References 198

Section 5 Professionally Responsible Innovation and Research

17 Clinical Innovation and Research in Obstetrics and Gynecology 201
Goal 201
Objectives 201
Topics 201
Key Concepts 202
17.1 Clinical Innovation and Research 202
17.2 Maternal–Fetal Intervention 202
17.2.1 The Role of Animal Models 203
17.2.2 Prospective Oversight of Maternal–Fetal Innovation: The Perinatal Innovation Review Committee 203
17.2.3 Prospective Oversight of Maternal–Fetal Research by the Institutional Review Board 203
17.2.4 Professionally Responsible Transition to Clinical Practice 205
17.3 The MOMS Clinical Trial: A Model for Maternal–Fetal Research 205
17.4 Minimizing Risk to the Fetal Patient of Maternal–Fetal Research for Fetal Benefit 205
17.5 The Transition into Clinical Practice 206
17.6 Ethically Justified Criteria for Maternal–Fetal Innovation and Research and for the Transition to Clinical Practice 206
17.6.1 Ethically Justified Criteria for Maternal–Fetal Innovation and Early-Phase Maternal–Fetal Clinical Research for Efficacy and Safety for Fetal Benefit 206
17.6.2 Ethically Justified Criteria for Randomized Controlled Trials for Fetal Benefit 206
17.6.3 Ethically Justified Criteria for the Professionally Responsible Transition to Clinical Practice 207
17.6.4 The Informed Consent Process 207
17.7 Research with Pregnant Patients with Mental Illnesses and Disorders 207
17.7.1 Guidance from the Council for International Organizations of Medical Societies 208
17.7.1.1 Balance of Benefits and Risks to the Pregnant Patient 208
17.7.1.2 Balance of Benefits and Risks to the Fetal Patient 208
17.7.1.3 Balance of Benefits and Risks to the Neonatal and the Pediatric Patient 209
17.7.1.4 Overall Ethical Evaluation 209
17.7.2 Ethically Justified Study Design 210
17.7.2.1 Phase of Study 210
17.7.2.2 The Informed Consent Process 210
References 212
Section 6 Professionally Responsible

Health Policy and Advocacy

18 Health Policy and Advocacy  215
Goal  215
Objectives  215
Topics  215
Key Concepts  216
18.1 Healthcare Justice, Health Policy, and Advocacy  216
18.2 Advocacy: Women and Children First  217
18.2.1 Healthcare-Justice–Based Ethical Framework  217
18.2.2 Challenges to Justice in the Allocation of Healthcare Resources to Women and Children  218
18.2.2.1 Challenges to Substantive Justice  218
18.2.2.2 Challenges to Procedural Justice  220
18.3 Antidote to Cynicism about the Ethical Principle of Healthcare Justice  221
18.3.1 Identifying and Addressing Social Conditions that Impede Healthcare Justice  221
18.3.2 The Impact of Climate Change on the Life and Health of Female, Pregnant, and Neonatal Patients  222
18.4 “Women and Children First – or Last?” The New York Declaration of the International Academy of Perinatal Medicine  222
References  223

Glossary of Key Concepts  225
Index  235
Preface

This is the first book on professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology. Its origins, however, are in eighteenth-century Britain, where professional ethics in medicine was invented by two extraordinary physician-ethicists, John Gregory (1724–1773) of Scotland and Thomas Percival (1740–1804) of England. They invented the ethical concept of medicine as a profession, which they intended to be trans-cultural, transnational, and transreligious. Their goal has been realized in professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology, as this book attests.

Chapter 1 shows that professional ethics in medicine is based on Gregory and Percival’s ethical concept of medicine as a profession, marking a strong and distinctive contrast between professional ethics in medicine, on the one hand, and contemporary medical ethics and bioethics, on the other hand. Chapter 2 shows that professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology, in turn, is based on professional ethics in medicine and the ethical concepts of the female patient, pregnant patient, fetal patient, and (in perinatal medicine) neonatal patient. These ethical concepts play an essential role in professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology, marking another important contrast with contemporary medical ethics and bioethics.

After this historical, philosophical, and clinical introduction to professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology, Section 1 goes on to examine three dimensions of professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology that permeate clinical practice, organizational cultures and their leadership, clinical innovation and research, and healthcare advocacy and policy for female, pregnant, fetal, and neonatal patients: decision making by, with, and for patients; confidentiality; and management of conflicts of interest and conflicts of commitment. A unique feature of this book is its sustained exploration of professional ethics in the intersection of obstetrics and gynecology, on the one hand, and psychiatry, on the other. Chapter 3 initiates this exploration with its emphasis on a continuum of decision making by, with, and for patients – simple consent, informed consent, assisted decision making, assent, and surrogate decision making. This exploration continues in subsequent chapters.

Undergraduate medical education introduces medical students to obstetrics and gynecology as an essential component of the general education of a professional physician and also to set the stage for specialty training for medical students who elect this professional pathway. As every experienced medical educator knows, much of clinical teaching comprises teaching the basics again and again to each successive generation of learners. We have therefore included a chapter, in Section 2, on teaching the basics of professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology. Professionalism is a core competency in graduate medical education. Chapter 6 addresses the ethical obligation of faculty to prevent drift by residents away from professionalism.

To support teaching the material in the other chapters of this book, each chapter starts with a goal and objectives, a topics list, and a list of key concepts that shape the ethical reasoning in each chapter. A comprehensive Glossary of Key Concepts, with definitions, appears at the end of the book.

The clinical practice of obstetrics and gynecology affects the entire human life cycle – from conception, pregnancy, and birth, through adolescence to adulthood, to chronic conditions and end-of-life care. Professional ethics in the clinical practice of obstetrics and gynecology is addressed in Section 3. These chapters describe ethical frameworks, based on professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology, that provide ethically justified, clinically grounded, and practical guidance on prevention of pregnancy, initiation of pregnancy, induced abortion and feticide, fetal analysis (a new phrase used in a proposed new nomenclature), perinatal medicine (neonatal patient).
management, the perfect baby, cancer and pregnancy, and setting ethically justified limits on clinical management of patients’ conditions and diagnosis, especially at the end of their lives.

Gregory and Percival added to their history-of-medicine-changing creation of the ethical concept of medicine as a profession the profound insight that the commitment to this ethical concept by obstetrician-gynecologists and other physicians does not succeed in isolation. Organizational cultures have become essential for obstetrician-gynecologists to make and sustain their commitment to the ethical concept of medicine over a lifetime of clinical practice. Professionally responsible leadership by obstetrician-gynecologists in healthcare organizations has therefore become an essential dimension of professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology and is addressed in Section 4.

Section 5 addresses professionally responsible clinical innovation and research, which play an indispensible role in improving the quality and safety of patient care in maternal–fetal intervention for maternal or fetal benefit. Professional ethics in obstetrics provides the basis for an ethical framework to guide clinical innovation and research on maternal–fetal interventions for fetal or maternal benefit. The ethical concept of the fetus as a patient constitutes a unique component of this ethical framework, adding to it a set of ethical and clinical considerations not found in US federal human subjects research regulations or elsewhere. This ethical framework is deployed to address the ethical challenges of clinical innovation and research for fetal and maternal benefit in the case of pregnant women with mental illnesses and disorders.

The ethical principle of healthcare justice expands the scope of professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology to include the clinical needs of populations of female, pregnant, fetal, and neonatal patients. This ethical principle requires that allocation of resources be guided by the ethical obligation created by the ethical principle of healthcare justice in professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology: to see to it that all female, pregnant, fetal, and neonatal patients have access to and receive medically reasonable clinical management of their conditions and diagnoses. Health policy and advocacy for “Women and Children First” is addressed in Section 6.

To aid readers and teachers – of this book, we have provided multiple points of access to its content. The topics lists in the Contents and at the beginning of each chapter guide the reader to text that he or she might need to responsibly manage, or teach, a specific topic in professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology. To ensure that each topic and subtopic is self-sufficient for the reader’s or teacher’s purposes, there is deliberate repetition within and across chapters. Our goal in taking this approach has been to minimize the need for the reader, teacher, or learner to flip back and forth among topics and subtopics. The Glossary of Key Concepts at the end of the book contains all key concepts from the chapters and succinct definitions, creating a unique resource for progressing to mastery of the conceptual vocabulary of professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology. The content of the book can also be accessed from the the comprehensive Index that appears after the Glossary of Key Concepts at the end of the book.

Two of us (LBM and FAC) have collaborated on professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology for 36 years. Dr. Coverdale joined this collaboration 30 years ago, bringing a sustained focus on the intersection of obstetrics, gynecology, and psychiatry. We collaboratively developed the ethical reasoning that we then presented in our scholarship (portions of which have been included or adapted in 11 of the chapters that follow and as documented in the Acknowledgments section). This scholarship became the basis for our clinical teaching of medical students, residents, fellows, and clinical colleagues, and the results of this teaching were fed back into our scholarship. We set our results before readers, teachers, and learners in the chapters that follow.

Without the commitment of our learners to professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology, we could not have created and benefited from this wonderful synergy of clinical teaching and scholarship. Without the commitment of our learners to professional ethics in obstetrics and gynecology, this book would not exist. In response to their intellectual generosity, we dedicate this book to our patients and learners who, in the ancient tradition of medical education, became our teachers. We are also indebted – beyond what words can express – to our mentors, sine quibus non.
Acknowledgments

Parts of the following chapters include or adapt portions of the listed articles with permission:

Chapter 5: Conflicts of Interest and Conflicts of Commitment

Chapter 6: Teaching Professional Ethics in Obstetrics and Gynecology

Chapter 9: Induced Abortion and Feticide

Chapter 10: Fetal Analysis

Chapter 12: Intrapartum Management
Acknowledgments

Chapter 13: The Perfect Baby

Chapter 14: Cancer and Pregnancy

Chapter 15: Setting Ethically Justified Limits on Life-Sustaining Treatment

Chapter 16: Leadership

Chapter 17: Clinical Innovation and Research in Obstetrics and Gynecology

Chapter 18: Health Policy and Advocacy
The text of “Women and Children First or Last?” of the International Academy of Perinatal Medicine is included in its entirety in Chapter 18 and is used with permission.