Cambridge University Press 978-1-316-63124-9 — Maimonides and Contemporary Tort Theory Yuval Sinai , Benjamin Shmueli Index More Information

Index

Abraham, Kenneth, 201–2 Aharonim, 161, 169-70, 187, 229 Albeck, Shalom, 42, 65, 67 General Principles of Law of Tort in THE TALMUD, 42 laws of damages to neighbors, 125-26 Peshiah, 41, 63, 65, 71, 306 Al-Farabi, 130 animals killing an animal with which a human being has lain carnally, 224, 231-32 killing animals if they cause damage, 191, 205, 287, 305-7 rearing of small cattle in the Land of Israel, 71, 306-7 tam and mu'ad, 101-2, 304 Aristotle, 30, 384 corrective justice, 15, 36, 134, 192, 194, 198, 201, 203-4, 208-11 distributive justice, 15, 36, 134, 198, 207 equality, 209 and Jewish rabbis, 36, 134, 202 and Maimonides, 36, 134, 203-4, 207-9, 211 NICOMACHEAN ETHICS, 36, 134 assumption of risk, 258, 260, 294, 374 atonement fine (kofer), 96 Aumann, Robert, 36 Austin, John, 163 Avraham, Michael, 59-60 Bar-Niv, Moshe, 245, 247-49 Beccaria, Cesare Bonesana, 269 Becker, Gary, 269, 386 Bentham, Jeremy, 238, 269

Calabresi, 25, 252, 255-61, 263, 265, 278-79, 291-95, 297-301, 304, 314, 322, 375-76, 382, 394 and cheapest cost avoider test, 255-58 and Maimonides, 256-61, 265, 278-79, 291-95, 297-301, 304, 314, 322, 375, 382 and strict liability, 256-57, 260-61, 263 Bible, 31, 34, 97, 120-23, 169-70, 173-74, 181, 361, 364 an eye for an eye, 112, 152-53, 330 exempts the elder from loading or unloading, 155-56 exempts the finder of lost property from returning the item to its owner, 156 fine, 239 innocent ox (tam), 236 payments of a thief as opposed to a robber, 242, 245 prevalence of sheep and cattle stealing, 246, 248, 250 prohibition against causing damage, 165-66, 168-69, 171, 190 property theft, 241, 243 sanctity of human life, 142 stealing from a Gentile, 148-49 stoning the ox that killed a person, 232 system of organization, 98 various categories of damages, 97 Bickel, Alex, 374 bodily integrity Maimonidean approach, 210 Weinribian-Kantian approach, 210 Book of Acquisition (Sefer Kinyan), 81, 84, 86-87, 07 in the Code, 9, 74, 123 distributive justice, 131, 134, 136, 351

best decision maker

Cambridge University Press 978-1-316-63124-9 — Maimonides and Contemporary Tort Theory Yuval Sinai, Benjamin Shmueli Index More Information

398

Index

Book of Acquisition (Sefer Kinyan) (cont.) Laws of Neighbors, 83, 124-26, 128, 135 rationale, 131, 134 Book of Civil Law (Sefer Mishpatim), 81, 84, 86-87 in the Code, 74 damage caused by watchman, 83 Book of Commandments compensation for wounding, 112 prohibition against cursing another person, 143-45 prohibition against stealing, 145 Book of Judges (Sefer Shoftim) damages caused by plotting witnesses, 83 Book of Torts (Sefer Nezikin), 143 and the Bible, 82, 94, 97, 103, 105, 285 classical laws of torts, 81, 97 classification, 9, 16, 29, 32, 81-84, 87, 94, 96, 142, 331 compensation, 127 conceptualizations, 15 corrective justice, 12, 205 criminal law, 81, 323 difficulties, 62 Genizah, 74 and the Guide, 33, 285-86 law of the pursuer, 174, 183 and Laws of Damages to Neighbors, 124, 126 laws of murderer and preservation of life, 142, 323 laws of property damages, 98, 142 laws of robbery, 142 laws of theft, 142, 323, 360, 385 laws of wounding, 142 mass and serial torts, 335 masters and slaves, 335, 374 and the Mishnah, 83, 123 objectives of tort laws, 132 opening of the book, 39, 43, 49, 54, 61, 72, 75-76, 78, 101, 103, 289, 303, 308 peshiah and ownership, 62, 64 and private civil law, 84 process of formation, 74 prohibitions, 163-65 psychological damage, 130 and rationale of prevention of damage, 141 and regulation, 335 relate to a traditional agrarian society, 335, 337, religious component, 159, 163-64, 184, 285, 287 religious-prohibitive dimension, 171 sanctity of human life, 143 social-consequentialist dimension, 226, 285-89, 306 standard of care for each type of damage, 268 system of organization, 98

and the Talmud, 62, 66, 82-83, 94, 285-86, 316, 325, 328, 334-35 theology of sin and atonement, 171 topics included, 29, 81, 83-86, 93, 171, 323 and Twersky's book, 32 unique characteristics, 16 Book of Women (Sefer Nashim) damages caused by rape, seduction, and slander, 83 Brand, Itzhak, 98 burden of proof balance of probability, 90, 369 in criminal law, 90, 369 preponderance of the evidence, 90, 369 in tort law, 90, 369 Burton, Steven, 20, 31 Calabresi, Guido, 3, 24-25, 35, 38, 194, 368 American context, 375, 378 best briber liability, 380 best decision maker, 25, 252, 255-61, 263, 265, 278-79, 291-95, 297-301, 304, 314, 322, 375-76, 382, 394 cheapest cost avoider, 25, 252-58, 260, 263, 284, 290-91, 297, 340, 344, 355, 370, 375-76, 394 collective liability, 380 considerations of efficiency, 213-15, 217, 219-20, 252-53, 378-79, 386 considerations of justice, 213, 215-17, 219, 377, 379 and contemporary tort law and economics, 31, 252, 254 contract law and tort law, 89 corrective justice, 216-17 Costs of Accidents, The (1970), 253, 379 criminal law and tort law, 89 deontological considerations, 213-15, 217, 377-78, 383 distributive considerations, 214, 216-17, 258-59 empirical differences in time, 374-75, 377, 382, 393, 395 federal judgment, 388 Future of Law and Economics, The, 389 general deterrence, 253 and Hand formula, 355, 370 information, 258, 291, 297, 381 insurance, 258-59, 375, 394 liability of the debtor in bankruptcy, 381 and Maimonides, 31, 89, 213, 217, 219-20, 251-54, 256-60, 263, 265, 267-68, 293, 301, 314, 352, 370, 374-76, 378, 380, 395

and Maimonides' test for tort liability, 251–54, 260

as monist, 213, 215, 345 optimal deterrence, 213, 215, 217, 252-54, 345, 352, 355 and Posner, 261, 263, 355, 370-71 punitive damages, 31 beyond reasonable doubt, 90, 369 reducing the costs of accidents, 215, 252-55 reflections on Maimonides' tort theory, 373-75, 378, 380, 382-83, 385, 387, 391-95 regulation, 258 socially compensatory damages, 273 splitting the liability, 235-36, 260, 267, 284, 301, 375-76, 394 strict liability theory, 25, 27, 252-53, 260-61, 263, 292, 314, 330, 336, 370, 375 tort law as an alternative to criminal law, 369 Toward a Unified Theory of Torts, 377 Calabresi, Guido and Melamed, Douglas inalienability, 129, 213-14, 218-19 and Maimonides, 162 property rules, liability rules, and inalienability, 126, 128–29, 162, 214, 288 Rule 2, 288 categories in tort, 2, 7-8, 27, 81 damage caused by animals, 102 damage caused by the person himself, 9, 29, 45, 76, 81, 96-97, 103, 107, 111, 229-30, 290, 310-11, 328, 333, 353 damages caused by a person's actions, 29, 102-3 damages caused by property, 2, 7, 9, 12, 29-30, 73, 76, 81, 102-4, 107, 230-31, 291, 310-11, 328, 333, 335-36, 353-54 damages that are not discernible, 94-95 emotional damage, 390-91 murder, 30 nuisance and damage caused by neighbors, 9, 29, 81, 97 objectives of tort in different categories, 9, 29, 80-81, 96 a person damaging the property of another, 2, 7, 9, 29-30, 68-69, 81, 84, 93-94, 231, 328, 336, 352, 354, 359 a person injuring his fellow, 2, 7, 9, 29-30, 81, 94, 111, 231, 328-30, 336, 352-53 and standard of care, 27 standard tort law, 9, 29, 81 visual trespass, 185-86 causation, 21 between the breach of duty and the damage, 354 and corrective justice, 196, 199, 211, 343 indirect damages (grama), 211, 287 method of causation of the damage, 44 prohibition against causing damage, 211, 287

Index

399

statistical cause, 376 uncertain causation, 97, 110, 356 cheapest cost avoider Calabresi, 25, 252-58, 260, 263, 284, 290-91, 297, 340, 344, 355, 370, 375-76, 394 Maimonides, 252-54, 256-58, 260, 290-91, 297, 340, 355, 370, 375 Coase, Ronald H., 24, 38, 368 Code of Hammurabi, 381 Cohn, Haim, 364 Israeli Supreme Court Justice, 364 Colby, Tom, 387-89, 391-92 Coleman, Jules, 194, 198 corrective justice, 198, 200, 344 ethical compensation, 200 ethical retribution, 200 commandment to restore lost property source for the prohibition against causing harm, 169-70 Commentary to the Mishnah, 29, 76, 80, 140, 149, 151, 157, 191, 207, 299 corrections, 74 common law, 41 action in case, 384-85 action in trespass, 384-85 all or nothing, 375 contributory negligence, 265 four- and five-fold payments, 270 intentional torts, 271-72, 333, 357, 368, 384-85 and Maimonides, 270, 297, 384-85 modified comparative negligence, 261, 266 negligence, 41, 56 punishment, 89 strict liability, 44 tort law, 87 US jurisdictions, 261 communitarian approaches, 201 and Maimonides, 211, 287 society, 201 comparative negligence, 261-62 comparative responsibility, 376 and contributory negligence, 261-62, 376 modified comparative negligence, 261, 266 pure comparative negligence, 261, 266, 279 splitting according to comparative nonfault, 376 compensation, 85 assessment of the damage, 207 awards for medical malpractice, 115, 347 from the best of the tortfeasor's property, 140 from their best property, 208 between fire and animal or pit, 107

400

Index

compensation (cont.) bodily injury, 27, 94, 108-9, 111-14, 116-18, 208, 210, 316–18, 330–32, 356, 359 and corrective justice, 20, 22, 205, 342, 345, 348 common law, 384 and criminal law, 89, 111-13, 385 for damages caused by animals, 206 damages not discernible, 95 damaging, 111 deep pocket, 22, 89, 207 distributive considerations, 221 ethical compensation, 200 fire, 106-7, 127 as form of religious atonement, 160 full damages, 67–68, 101, 109, 190, 205, 208, 218, 236-38, 259-60, 285-86, 301-2, 304, 312 half damages, 66-67, 101-2, 190, 205, 236-37, 259, 267, 301-2 humiliation, 209-10, 316-20, 328, 332, 357, 359 indirect damages (grama), 211 medical treatment, 209-10 partial compensation in situations of uncertain causation, 110, 356 payments of a thief as opposed to a robber, 241-42, 245 pit, 106 and the prohibitive dimension, 161, 167-68 property damages, 108-9, 111, 172, 205, 331, 356 as a punishment or a fine, 6, 8, 80, 94-95, 112, 123, 204-5, 208, 318, 356-57, 369, 385 punitive aspects, 93, 331 ransom, 85, 142, 331 and the rationale of prevention of damage, 140 as restitution for the damage caused, 6, 22, 93, 109, 160, 172-73, 288, 331 retribution, 200 right the wrong, 11 scope, 104 standard laws of tort, 126 the civil basis, 165 for a victim of crime, 28, 88 for a woman who was raped, 239 for a woman who was seduced, 239 consequentialist approach, 2, 13-14, 38, 123 consequentialist offences, 305 considerations, 28 and contemporary tort law and economics, 35, 222-23, 227 deterrence, 269, 274-76, 278, 280, 286, 288, 302, 305, 341 ethical system, 34 incentives for future behavior, 225, 229, 232, 238 and Maimonides, 30, 222-25, 227, 232-33, 238-39, 241, 243-44, 246, 249-52, 280-81,

284-86, 288-90, 293, 295, 301-2, 306-8, 311, 322-23, 329, 340, 350-52, 367-68, 377 meaning, 222, 224 and morality, 367-68 normative (or welfare) economics, 225 Paley, 270 prevention of damages, 132, 136, 138, 188, 192, 217, 220, 225, 228–29, 231 and the prohibition against causing harm, 164 contemporary tort theories, 2, 31 bridging between contemporary approaches, 355, 367, 370-71 business risk theory, 58 civil recourse approach, 202, 212 cognitive rationality, 224 and Common law, 40 communitarian approaches, 201, 211 compensation 22 corrective justice, 21, 31, 192, 194, 200 between criminal law and civil law, 238 distributive justice, 22 goals of tort law, 19-20 insurance, 334-35, 375 law and economics, 15, 24, 26, 28, 30-31, 192, 251, 211 between laws applying to robbery and to theft, 118-23, 359-60 laws of intellectual property, 76 lessons from Maimonides tort theory, 19, 30-31, 111, 184, 338, 341, 353-57, 359-60, 366, 370, 372 liability of risk creators, 192 liberal approaches, 201 and Maimonides, 18, 30, 32, 35, 37, 78, 114-15, 131, 136, 138, 145, 192, 194, 223, 229, 251, 268, 277-78, 280, 288, 301, 309, 332-34, 336-40, 352-54, 359-60, 367, 369, 371-73, 385, 387, 391-93, 395 and Maimonides' differential model, 333 mass torts, 334, 353, 355 monism and pluralism, 136, 338-39 monistic approaches, 131, 338, 340 normative approach, 37, 339-40 operate in an industrial environment, 333, 335, 353, 355 operate within a reality of state regulation, 334-35, 354 optimal deterrence, 24, 189 and the ownership theory, 56 partial compensation in cases of uncertain causation, 111, 356 pluralistic approaches, 26, 338-41, 350 restorative justice programs, 114

and Roman law, 40

Cambridge University Press 978-1-316-63124-9 — Maimonides and Contemporary Tort Theory Yuval Sinai , Benjamin Shmueli Index More Information

Index

401

secular law, 217, 220, 353, 360 serial torts, 334 strict liability, 294 and talmudic tort law, 65 theories of welfare, 225 between torts, criminal law and contract law, 87, 89, 91-93 utilitarian approaches, 201 vicarious liability, 334-35, 354 contract law compensation, 90 enforcement, 90 negotiation, 90 strict liability, 90 contract law and tort law, 87, 89-92 in Maimonides, 92 contributory negligence, 45, 258, 260-62 common law, 265 comparative negligence, 261-62, 376 different understandings, 265 and Jewish law, 265 and Maimonides, 265-68, 278-79, 300, 370 modified comparative negligence, 261, 266 punitive damages, 388 Cooper, Jeff, 394 Cooter, Robert, 278 corrective justice, 15, 20, 71, 192 Aristotelian-Weinribian approach, 203-5, 208-10 and the civil recourse approach, 202, 212 and civil redress, 202 and communitarian approaches, 201, 211 correlativity, 21, 193–98, 200, 204, 211, 220 culpability, 196 and deterrence, 344, 348 different theories, 21, 192, 194, 200, 203–4, 208, 211, 220 distinction between wounding and damaging, 12 and distributive justice, 36, 134, 193, 196, 198, 204-6, 217, 342-45 and economic analysis of law, 25 Englard, 36 equality, 193-94, 198, 209 fairness, 199 harmony with distributive justice, 342-45, 350 between knas (fine) and mammon (monetary obligation), 203-5 level of compensation, 205 and Maimonides, 194, 202-4, 206, 208, 211, 228, 251-52, 263-64, 293, 305, 337, 340, 350-52 and negligence, 21, 199 and Posner, 262

property damages, 132 proportionality, 205 punishment and retribution, 200, 204, 208, 211-12, 342 and risk causing behavior, 188 Weinrib, 3, 21, 30, 38, 368 Weinribian-Kantian approach, 211-12 criminal law actus reus, 357 burden of proof, 90, 369 the consent of the individual to the injury, 116, 218 criminal sanctions, 90, 238, 240 deterrence, 226 forgiveness, 114 general deterrence, 238 laws of murderers, 93 laws of theft and robbery, 93 laws of wounding, 93-94, 110, 132, 173 liability of an inadvertent blameless transgressor, 326-27 and Maimonides, 269, 305 mens rea, 90, 95, 117, 123, 318-19, 331-32, 357 penology, 238 person who commits an offence through negligence, 326 policy of penal considerations, 93 restorative justice, 114, 356 social-utilitarian reason, 226 specific deterrence, 238 criminal law and tort law, 2, 8, 18, 20, 28-30, 80, 82, 84, 86-87, 89, 91-93, 98, 123, 171, 212, 330, 369 burden of proof, 90, 369 contemporary tort law, 369, 385 deterrence, 89 in Maimonides, 92–94, 319, 332, 368–69, 385 procedural differences, 90 prohibitive dimension, 163 standard of care, 90 criminal sanctions, 13, 30, 88, 90, 123, 225 act may be done secretly, 240, 379 amount of temptation, 240-41, 379-80 civil-criminal sanctions, 92, 369 deterrence, 241, 244, 253 frequency of the crime, 240-41, 379 four parameters of Maimonides, 240-41, 268, 371, 378-79, 381, 392, 395 policy, 93 and punitive damages, 272, 280, 351 severity of the crime, 240, 242, 371, 379, 388 cursing another person prohibition against, 144-45, 204

402

Index

damage that involves a criminal law element murder, 323, 351 robbery, 9, 81, 385 theft, 9, 81, 173, 323, 351, 385 wounding, 9, 81, 93-94, 173, 213, 323, 330-33, 351, 356 damages caused by foot, 66-67 damages caused by horn, 66 damages caused by a person strict liability, 45 damages caused by tooth, 66-67 Daube, David, 236 deep pocket, 23, 89, 217, 359 insurance, 334, 353-54, 357 mass tortfeasors, 334 deontological, 8 Calabresi, 213-15, 217 constraints, 28 corrective justice, 11 elements of Maimonides' tort theory, 138, 213, 222, 228, 241, 243, 251-52, 285, 288, 293, 305-6, 311, 328, 330, 340, 350-51, 367, 377, 383 deterrence, 13-14, 123, 213 on basis of risk creating behavior, 192 compensation, 89, 195, 208 criminal law and tort law, 89, 385 general deterrence, 238, 253 as major goal of punitive damages, 238, 241-42, 245, 247-50, 253 punishment, 89 of risk causing behavior, 70, 187-88 specific deterrence, 238 take care of animals, 190 differential model, 14-15, 27, 29-30, 96-97, 281, 292, 310-11, 317, 336, 339 and the Bible, 97 and the cheapest cost avoider/best decisionmaker doctrines, 375 historical background, 328, 333, 336 between Maimonides and contemporary theories, 340, 375 rationale, 328 scheme, 328-29, 337 differential-pluralistic model, 2, 27-28, 30 a different standard of care for each category, 27 of Maimonides, 136, 338-41, 350, 352-53 in modern tort law, 353, 367–68, 370, 372 distributive justice, 15 Book of Acquisition, 134, 136, 351 deterrence, 342-43 in different times, 375 harmony with corrective justice, 342-45, 350 and human rights approaches, 26 insurance, 334

level of activity, 336 loss distribution, 342-43 Maimonides, 31, 220, 228, 337, 340, 351–52 nuisance, 131-32 optimal deterrence, 24, 217 Dobbs, Dan B., 90 duty to rescue, 85, 173-74, 181, 361, 364 American law, 178-81, 183, 365 application where it involves some danger to the rescuer, 181 common law, 176-77, 179-80, 212, 361 and corrective justice, 212 duty of the doctor, 174 enforcement criterion, 176-77, 180-81, 183-84, 261-66 English law, 177-82 European legal systems, 176, 180-81, 365 France, 176 Germany, 176 and Good Samaritan Law, 177, 179, 365 hiring others to rescue him, 174 Israeli law, 184, 361-65 between Jewish law and common law, 175, 180, 212 and law of the pursuer, 174, 183 legal obligation or a moral duty, 173, 175, 180-84, 361, 364-65 modern legal systems, 176 normative criterion, 175, 180-84, 361, 364-66 person's property, 174 religious implications, 183-84, 361, 364-66 rescuer's immunity, 179, 183-84, 362 rescuer's right to indemnification, 181-83, 362, 365 Russian Criminal Code, 176 spending money, 182-83 scope, 173-75, 180-82, 212, 361-62, 365-66 suing the rescuer, 179 Talmud, 175, 181-83 Weinribian-Kantian approach, 212 economic analysis of law, 3, 11-12, 217 aggregate welfare, 22, 24, 135, 217, 235, 253, 273, 351 Calabresi, 3, 24, 31, 35, 38, 213, 215, 252, 254, 263, 280, 293, 345, 368, 370-71, 377 Coase, 24, 38, 368 consequentialist approach, 11, 13, 222-23, 227-29 cost vs. benefit, 11

deep pockets, 11, 217, 334 do not incorporate religious norms, 12

cumulative welfare, 11

instrumental approach, 11

leaders, 24, 38, 213, 251, 273, 280, 368, 370–71

Index

403

Learned Hand formula, 25, 27, 252, 260-62, 264-65, 278, 284, 293, 300, 321, 323, 333, 337, 370, 379, 390 liability of risk creators, 192 and Maimonides, 12, 59, 132, 138, 221-22, 225, 227, 229, 233, 251, 254, 263-64, 268-69, 280-81, 288-89, 306, 322, 328, 367, 370, 372-73, 377, 379, 383, 395 multiplier approach, 31, 268, 270, 272-73, 275-78, 371, 386-88, 395 optimal deterrence, 24, 213, 215, 217, 237, 248, 252-54, 269, 322, 329, 334, 340, 343, 345, 352, 355, 371, 381-82 Posner, 24, 35, 38, 252, 263, 280, 293, 368, 370-71 prevention of damages, 229 punitive damages, 243 recent approaches, 252 risk management, 58, 334-35 economics, 2, 6-7, 11, 17-18, 23-24, 30-31, 33-34, 38, 59, 88, 90, 101, 113, 132, 162, 194, 196, 209, 213-15, 217, 220, 223, 227-28, 234, 237, 239, 243, 246, 248-50, 262, 269, 272, 274, 279, 285, 288-90, 311, 318, 329-30, 334, 336, 343-44, 360-61, 365, 368, 371, 377-78, 386 and morality, 367-68, 372 Edrei, Arye, 326-27 Englard, Izhak, 31, 37, 197, 202, 315 and Calabresi, 374 complementarity, 193 Corrective and Distributive Justice: FROM ARISTOTLE TO MODERN TIMES, 36-37, 134, 193 criticism on the peshiah theory, 42 Enker, Aharon, 325, 327 Epstein, Richard, 194, 211 corrective justice, 199 strict liability theory, 199 feminism, 26 fire articles that were buried in a grain heap, 298-99, 201 and the Bible, 105-6 camel that is loaded with flax passes through the public domain, 300 essential characteristics, 105-6 his arrows, 105 his property, 105 scope of the payments, 107 in Talmud, 104-5 five effects [heads] of injury, 108-9, 112, 172 damages (nezek), 108, 112, 203, 208, 316-20, 328, 331-33, 357-59

humiliation, 108-9, 113, 117, 203, 208-10, 316-20, 328, 332, 357, 359 intention, 117 knas (fine) and mammon (monetary obligation), 203 loss of employment, 108-9, 113, 203, 208, 317-20, 328, 331-32, 357, 359 medical treatment, 108-9, 113, 203, 208-10, 317-20, 328, 331-32, 357, 359 pain, 108, 112, 203, 208, 210, 317-20, 328, 331-32, 357, 359 standard of care, 316-20, 330, 332-33, 340, 352, 357, 359 as type of atonement fine, 152-53 Fletcher, George, 194, 206, 326-27 reciprocal and nonreciprocal risks, 197 forgiveness and atonement, 113, 160, 172-73 and compensation, 114, 116 in criminal process, 114 in Laws of Wounding, 113, 115, 172-73, 352 in medical malpractice, 114 in modern law, 114-15, 173 in property damages, 172-73 and restorative justice, 114 in tortious actions, 114, 173 and Williams, 211 foundations of the Maimonidean theory conceptualization of distinct categories of damage, 96 connection to criminal law, 29, 80, 82, 86, 93-94, 220, 319, 332 consequentialist elements, 222-23, 227, 229, 232, 238, 240-41, 243-44, 250-52 corrective justice, 220, 222, 228, 251 deontological elements, 138, 220, 222, 228, 241, 251 deterrence, 226 different goals for different categories of damage, 29, 96, 131, 339, 352-53 differential standard of care, 308, 310-11, 317, 328, 333, 336, 339-40, 352-53, 355, 359, 375 educational elements, 143, 220, 222 laws of damages to neighbors and standard laws of torts, 124 laws of property damages and laws of wounding and damaging, 108, 323, 329-30, 355 laws of wounding and laws of damaging, 111, 113, 115, 331 Maimonides as a Pluralistic-Differential Scholar, 136, 338-41, 350, 352, 367-68, 370, 372 prohibition against causing harm, 161-65, 168 rationality, 185, 224, 228, 293 reading all his works, 29, 80 religious elements, 159, 161, 184, 220

404

Index

foundations of the Maimonidean theory (cont.) some objectives are more dominant, 29, 80, 132, 331, 340, 351-52 philosophical elements, 220 religious elements, 138, 171, 220, 222, 228, 251, 287 scope of tort law, 29, 80 various objectives work together, 29, 80, 132, 331, 383 four heads of damage and damage to neighbors, 125-26 Friedell, Steven, 236 criticism on the peshiah theory, 42, 67, 69 Geistfeld, Mark, 31 the most moral resolution should be selected from several efficient outcomes, 346, 350 Geonic, 1 Gilead, Israel, 189 Goldberg, John, 31, 202, 212, 341, 383, 387 Greco-Arab, 15, 30, 139, 223 Guide of the Perplexed, The, 2, 31, 138-41, 143, 152 Aristotle, 134 Bible, 98, 103-4, 222-23 cases of exemption from liability, 233-34 the Code, 10, 30, 33-34, 102-3, 223, 244, 284-86, 288-90, 293, 300-5, 308, 322 consequentialist considerations, 13, 30, 131-32, 136, 138, 140, 143, 162, 165, 222-23, 225-27, 229, 231-33, 238-39, 243-44, 246, 249-52, 280-81, 284-86, 288-90, 293, 295, 301-2, 306-8, 311, 323, 340, 380-84 corrective justice, 37, 134 criminal law and tort law, 93, 223, 225 criminal sanctions and punitive damages, 13, 93 damages caused by a person's property and damages caused as a result of his actions, 230, 290, 310, 328-30, 333, 353 damages caused to property and bodily injury, 230, 331 deterrence, 240-41, 244, 248-50, 253-55 distributive justice, 9, 37, 81, 131, 134-35, 206 explanatory approach, 37, 87, 339 an eye for an eye, 112 goals of the Book of Acquisition, 9, 81 innocent ox (tam), 236-37 jurisprudence of the Torah, 86 mitzvah of returning lost property, 154 model of punishment, 38 objectives of punishment, 240 ownership, 230 parameters for criminal sanctions and punitive damages, 240-42 policy of penal considerations, 93 preservation of the family unit, 227

prevention of damages, 13, 102-3, 131-33, 136, 140, 143, 162, 165, 206, 217, 225-29, 231-33, 235, 237-38, 246, 250, 252, 254-57, 264, 278, 280-81, 285, 289, 302, 305-6, 322, 340, 350-52, 384 punishment for a person who strikes and curses his father and mother, 276 rationale of laws of property, 134 rationale of laws of watchmen, 135 rationale of limitations of profits, 135 rationale of the laws pertaining to the breaking of the neck of the heifer, 226, 380 rationality, 37, 61, 339 reasons for commandments, 133 reasons for laws pertaining to property, 224, 226 reasons for tort law, 60, 223, 225-28 religious component, 159 removal of wrong, 9, 13, 81, 131-32, 134, 136, 140, 143, 203, 206, 211, 220, 228, 340, 350-52, 384 socially oriented explanations, 225-27, 240, 244, 276, 285 between the stealing of sheep and cattle, 241, 246-48, 382 stoning the ox that killed a person, 60, 96, 231-32 and the Talmud, 244 theft (genevah) and robbery(gezelah), 123, 245-46, 270, 274-75, 277, 280, 360, 381, 385 tort law objectives, 2, 9-10, 13-14, 30, 81, 131-32, 134, 140, 143, 206, 250, 280-81, 308, 340, 350, 352 yeshiva world, 10, 34, 223, 284 Gulak, Asher, 41, 163 Habba, Yaacov, 320, 325 Halbertal, Moshe, 5 Code and Philosophy, The, 33 Code and The Talmud, The, 33 Jurisprudence, 33 Maimonides, Life and Thought, 32-33, 133, 333 Hand, Learned, 25, 27, 252 and Maimonides, 260-61 Hart, H.L.A., 326-27 Haut, Irwin H., 15, 44-45 heads of damage, 83 and the Bible, 82, 97-98, 103 the common denominator, 99-100 damages that are caused by animals, 76, 98-101 extent of liability, 100 fire, 82, 98-99, 102, 105-6, 127, 299-300

- foot, 66–67, 98, 100, 102, 230, 233–35, 237–38, 255, 257, 259–60, 263–65, 292, 298–301, 303
- horn, 66, 100, 102, 230, 232, 235, 237, 257–58, 264–65, 298
- in the public domain, 100
- ox, 82, 98–100, 102, 104–5, 286, 292, 297–99, 304, 334

Index

ox, pit, and fire, 12 pit, 82, 98-99, 102, 104-5, 291 pit and fire, 29, 55, 76, 102-5, 230-31, 290, 298, 320 psychological damage, 130 tooth, 66-67, 82, 98, 100, 102, 230, 232-35, 237-38, 255, 257, 259-60, 263-65, 292, 298-301, 303 Hendel, Neal Israeli Supreme Court Justice, 363-64 Hirschoff, Jon, 217, 255, 258, 263, 278-80, 291, 394 Ibn Rushd, 139 inalienability, 213-14, 218-19, 351 bodily harm, 129 instrumentalist, 20, 23-25 insurance, 80 contemporary torts, 334-35, 375 and deep pockets, 334, 353-54, 357 differential, 259 and distributive justice, 334 employers carry mandatory insurance, 335 and loss distribution, 334 and Maimonides, 335-36, 353-54, 370, 375 medical insurance, 336 and optimal deterrence, 334 and regulation, 258-59, 334 Islamic law blood money, 143 and Jewish law, 285-86 liability for damages caused by animals, 190-91, 285-86 Israeli law, 361-66 duty to rescue, 184, 361-65 and Jewish religious law, 184, 361, 364-66 Justice Eliezer Rivlin, 362 Justice Haim Cohn, 364 Justice Neal Hendel, 363–64 Liability for Defective Products Law, 262 requirement of, 357, 369 Unjust Enrichment Law, 362 Jackson, S. Bernard, 103 Mishpatim portion of Exodus, 97 tam and mu'ad, 66, 101, 303-4

James, Fleming Jr., 31, 347, 349-50, 359, 374 Iewish law of torts and criminal law, 28 and the doctrine of peshiah, 41, 50 fault-based theory, 44 general, 6 laws of fines (dine kenasot), 238 and Maimonides, 253 and modern intellectual property law, 57 modern theories, 29, 40-41, 50, 93, 175, 180

405

part of civil law, 6, 8, 93 prohibitive dimension, 161, 163-64, 171 promotion of communality, 164 religious dimension, 159-60, 171, 184 Judaism and economics general, 34 Levine, Aaron, 34-35 Liebermann, Yehoshua, 34 Judeo-Islamic world, 15 Kant, Immanuel, 210-11 Karo, Yosef, 156 Kave, Judith Chief Judge of New York, 376 Kelsen, Hans, 163-64 Kirschenbaum, Aaron, 180-81, 239, 250 Law and History, 395 Law and Humanities, 395 Law and Literature, 395 Laws of Damages to Neighbors, 124-26 and the Book of Torts, 124 distributive considerations, 135 injunctions, 126-27, 130 and modern tort law, 124 the nature, 124-25 payments, 126, 130 psychological damage, 130 rationale, 131 remedies, 126-27 right to cause damage, 128-29 and standard laws of torts, 124-30 in the Talmud, 124-25 Laws of Damaging, 84, 94, 330 civil in nature, 116 damages that are not discernible, 94-95 and laws of neighbors, 129 and laws of wounding, 111, 116 mens rea, 95 payments, 116 punitive aspects, 94-95 right to cause damage, 129 Laws of Lost Property acquisition of moral qualities, 140, 154-55, 157 commandments relevant to the return of lost property, 171, 226 doing that which is upright and good and return the object, 154-57 the obligation to prevent financial loss, 170 social-consequentialist explanation, 226 Laws of Murder and Preservation of Life, 73, 83-85, 87, 93 accepting ransom from a murderer, 141

406

Index

Laws of Murder and Preservation of Life (cont.) control over feelings of hatred and anger, 150 exempts the elder from loading or unloading, 155 helping another person load up his animal or unload it, 149-50 factual basis (actus reus), 324, 359 five different degrees of mens rea, 324-25 general conceptions of degrees of inadvertency, 324-25 intentional killer, 324-25, 328 mens rea of fault, 324, 332, 352 obligation to build a rail around the roof, 85 person's obligation to preserve his own life, 85 prohibition against eating food that is dangerous to one's health, 85 prohibition against murder, 163, 171 prohibition against suicide, 220 punishment, 324 sanctity of human life, 141-43 scheme of liability regimes, 323-25 shedding of blood, 142-43 slays inadvertently, 324-26 three types of inadvertent killers, 320, 324-26 Laws of Property Damages (nizkei mamon), 73-77, 79, 81, 83-84, 87, 96-97, 108 animals and pit and fire, 97, 102-4, 290 atonement, 172 cases in which it is permissible causing damage, 162 common denominator, 99-100 connection to civil-private law, 109 corrective justice, 132 criterion for liability in tort, 167-68 Genizah, 76-77 Gentile whose oxen gored the ox of an Israelite, 141, 190, 285-87, 302 innovation, 165 internal distinctions, 98, 100, 102 and laws of neighbors, 125, 128, 130 nature of commandments, 166 order, 102-3 payment for half the innocent horn damages constitute a fine, 237 pit and fire, 105 prohibition against animals wondering in the fields, 141, 164, 188 prohibition against causing damage, 161-62, 164-66, 168-72, 188, 190, 286-87, 306-7, 351 prohibition against raising domestic animals in the Land of Israel, 164, 168-69, 287, 307 psychological damage, 130 punitive aspects, 95 and R. Shimon Shkop, 167-68

self-help, 305 and the Talmud, 98, 100 Laws of Property Damages and Laws of Wounding and Damaging, 108-9, 111, 173, 323, 329-31, 333, 355-56 awarding damages in cases of uncertain causation, 110-11, 356 in the Bible, 108 payments, 356 in the Talmud, 108 Laws of Repentance atonement, 113, 172 forgiveness, 172 robber should repent and return the stolen property, 157-58 Laws of Restoration of Lost Property, 83, 93 Laws of Robbery (gezelah), 73, 83-84, 93, 97, 191, 360, 385 acquisition of good qualities, 146, 148 coveting and desiring, 147-48 one does not accept the object from the robbers, 158 payments, 160 prohibition against encouraging robbery, 146 prohibition against robbery, 161, 163, 171 rehabilitation of the robber, 158 repent and return the stolen property, 157-58 robbing a Gentile, 148-49 Laws of Robbery (gezelah) and the Return of Lost Property, 87 and the Bible, 121, 124 intention, 122 and laws of theft, 118-21 main characteristic of the robber, 120-21, 124 robbery and return of lost property, 119, 123-24 Laws of Theft (genevah), 73, 83-84, 86-87, 93, 97 and the Bible, 120-23 buying from a thief, 146 double-fold payments, 122, 213, 239, 241-44, 249, 277-78, 360, 371, 382 five-fold payments, 119, 213, 239, 241-44, 246-47, 249-50, 270, 360, 371, 382, 394 four-fold payments, 122, 213, 239, 241-44, 246, 249-50, 270, 360, 371, 382, 394 intention, 122, 332, 360 and laws of robbery, 118-23 main characteristic of the thief, 120-22 payments (fines), 121-23, 160 prohibition against theft, 161, 163 societal aspects relating to the payments of the

thief, 244

Index

407

two-fold payments, 205 weights and measures, 151 Laws of Wounding, 84, 93, 330 atonement, 113, 172 bodily integrity, 210 and criminal law, 89, 93-94, 108 education of the injurer, 152-53, 157 an eve for an eye, 152, 330 forgiveness, 113-16, 154, 172-73, 352, 356 intention, 117-18, 317-20, 328, 331-32, 357, 359, 260 between knas (fine) and mammon (monetary obligation), 203 and laws of damaging, 111, 115-16 mens rea, 117, 317-19, 321, 331, 357, 359 payments, 93, 111-14, 116-18, 160, 172, 208, 316-18, 330-32, 356, 359 payments as a type of atonement fine, 153 payments for injuries caused with the consent of the victim, 115-16, 218-19 prohibition against causing injury, 116-17, 161, 163, 171-72, 218-20, 357 punitive dimension, 112-13, 116-18, 172, 220, 317, 319, 330-33, 350-51, 356 Laws of Wounding and Damaging (hovel umazik), 73-76, 79, 81, 83-84, 87, 95-96, 108 in the Bible, 94 an eve for an eve, 112 five effects of injury, 112 and laws of neighbors, 125, 128-29 payments for damages caused with the consent of the victim, 115-16, 219 psychological damage, 130 right to cause damage, 128-29 in the Talmud, 94 victim allows the damager to cause him damage or injury, 97 between wounding and damaging, 73, 84, 94, 97, 111, 113, 115-16, 172, 316, 355 Learned Hand formula and contributory negligence, 262, 279, 300, 370 and Maimonides, 260-61, 264-65, 278, 293, 300, 321, 323, 333, 337, 370, 379 Posner's improvement, 25, 27, 252, 260-62, 264-65, 278, 284, 293, 300, 321, 323, 333, 337, 370 Levinas, Emmanuel, 153, 331 Levine, Aaron Economic, Morality, and Jewish Law, 34 Judaism and economics, 34-35 The Oxford Handbook of Judaism and ECONOMICS, 34 Levinger, Yaacov, 75 liability of a person for damages he caused, 68

basis for the obligation, 165, 167-68 civil, 165, 168 and corrective justice, 165 obligation of the debtor to repay his loan, 165, 168 obligation to pay for property damages, 165 Lieberman, Yehoshua Judaism and economics, 34 Lorberbaum, Yair, 219 Loss distribution as a form of self-insurance, 23 meaning, 23 Maimonides' response, 29, 47-48, 63-64, 80, 122, 182, 186-87, 191, 332 Mann, Kenneth, 92, 369 medicine, 1 Maimonides, 133 preventive medicine, 133 Medina, Barak, 38, 368 mens rea robber, 122 thief. 122 wounding, 117, 317–19, 321, 331, 357, 359 Method of the Book, The 31 between the Code and the Guide, 33, 223, 284, 208 comparative law, 31 comparing Maimonides times to the modern period, 35 economic analysis of law, 31, 35 economics and Jewish Law, 35 interdisciplinary character, 31, 35 Judaic studies, 31 law and religion, 31, 35 legal history, 31 legal theory, 31 midreshei hamekhiltot, 99 Mill, John Stuart On Liberty, 145 Mishnah Bava Kamma, 82, 99, 101-2, 125 four heads of damage (avot), 82-83, 99-100, 102, 125 person who causes damage to the property of another, 312 Mishneh Torah: Code of Maimonides, 31 and the Bible, 34, 97 Book of Acquisition (Sefer Kinyan), 74 Book of Civil Law (Sefer Mishpatim), 74 Briskers commentary, 52 classical commentaries, 53, 72 classification, 32, 72-73, 93

408

Index

Mishneh Torah: Code of Maimonides (cont.) consequentialist considerations, 224 and contemporary tort theory, 284, 288 corrections, 74 general, 5, 16 Genizah, 73 and the Guide, 10, 29-30, 32-33, 80, 140, 223-24, 284-86, 288-90, 293, 300-5, 308, 322 jurisprudence, 32 manuscripts, 48, 191 method of codification, 16 opening rulings of the Books, 75 religious aspects, 131, 184 structure, method, and classification, 32 and the Talmud, 16-17, 33-34, 65, 185-86, 223, 302-3 theology of sin and atonement, 171, 173 titles of the books, 75 Twersky's book, 32 unique characteristics, 16 using a consequentialist rationalization, 284-86, 288–89, 293, 301–2, 305–8, 311, 322–23, 329, 340, 352 yeshivah world, 10 monistic approaches, 26, 31, 37, 53, 131 ancient legal systems, 339 Calabresi, 213, 215, 345 contemporary tort theories, 131, 338, 340 corrective justice, 25 Fleming, James, Jr., 347 and Maimonides, 28, 131, 136, 338, 340, 352 optimal deterrence, 25 and social-economic considerations, 26 unified-monistic theory, 25, 345, 347, 349-50 morality, 2 deontological, 2, 11, 13, 21, 34-35, 38, 64, 89, 113, 115, 132, 136, 138–40, 144–45, 149, 151–52, 154, 156, 159, 161-65, 181, 182-84, 189, 192, 195, 198-99, 202, 211, 213-15, 217, 220, 226, 228, 242, 247, 249, 262, 280, 287, 306, 326, 329-30, 337, 340, 342-46, 351, 361, 364-65, 367-68, 371 and economics, 367-68 Muslim (shari'a), 15 negligence and culpability, 27 economic approach, 27 nuisance, 97 distributive justice, 131-32, 135 laws of damages to neighbors, 124 who must desist from causing a nuisance, 25, 125 objectives of punishment atonement, 240

deter people from engaging in crime, 238 deterrence, 240-41, 244, 253-54 Maimonides, 239 rehabilitation, 240 retribution, 240-41, 249 utilitarian penology, 238, 241 objectives of tort law, 19, 73, 79 Book of Acquisition, 131 Book of Torts, 132 Code, 133 compensation, 22 consequentialist, 9, 26, 30, 81 corrective justice, 2-3, 7, 9, 13, 19-20, 26, 81, 131-32, 136, 138, 192, 194, 196, 281, 340-43, 350-52, 366-67, 383 a criminal rationale, 131 damage caused by a person, 131 deontological, 9, 30, 136, 138 deterrence, 20, 26, 213, 343, 366-67, 379, 381, 384 and distributing loss, 23 distributive justice, 9, 13, 19-20, 22, 81, 131, 134, 136, 207, 343, 366-67, 370, 379 in the Guide, 131-32, 134, 140, 143, 250, 280-81, 308, 340, 350, 352 instrumental, 23 loss distribution, 23 Maimonides' various books, 131 monistic approach, 19, 131, 136, 338 murder, 131 nuisance, 132 optimal deterrence, 19, 24, 88, 131, 189, 192-93 pluralistic approach, 19, 131, 136, 338, 352 preventing damages, 2, 9, 13, 71, 81, 131-33, 136, 138, 140, 143, 162, 165, 188-90, 217, 226-29, 231-32, 238, 246, 250, 252, 254-55, 263-64, 277-78, 280-81, 286, 288, 302, 305-6, 308, 314, 322-23, 329, 332-34, 340, 350-52, 355, 366-67, 384 property damages, 131-32 religious, 136, 138 removal of wrong, 2, 13, 131-32, 134, 136, 138, 140, 143, 281, 340, 350, 366-67, 384 restoring the status quo ante, 22 retribution, 200 robbery, 131 social, 11, 20, 23 some objectives are more dominant, 9, 29, 80-81, 331, 340, 351-52 various objectives work together, 9, 29, 80-81, 331 wounding, 131-32 optimal deterrence, Calabresi, 213, 215, 217, 252-54, 345, 352, 355

Index

409

as a instrumental goal, 24 and insurance, 334 law and economics, 193 and Maimonides, 38, 165, 237, 248, 254, 322, 329, 340, 352, 382 as a primary monistic goal, 25 punitive damages, 273-75, 351, 371, 381 ownership and strict liability theory, 48-49, 51, 53-56, 61, 63-65, 291, 293 business risk theory, 58-59 and the Code, 53 difficulties, 40, 42, 53-54, 56, 58, 67, 69-70, 78, 289, 295 versus fault-based theory (peshiah), 42 new creation or invention, 55, 57 rationale, 56, 58 ox and Calabresi's best decision maker. 260 mu'ad, 66, 101-2, 190, 236, 259, 267-68, 285, 300-4 Paley, William, 269 parameters for criminal sanctions and punitive damages, 268–69, 371, 379, 381, 389, 395 Parker, Matthew, 272 pedagogical elements of Maimonides' tort theory, 138, 143 acquisition of moral qualities, 140-41, 143-46, 148-52, 154, 288, 293 control over feelings of hatred and anger, 150 education of the injurer, 152-53, 157-58, 204, 211. 217 prohibition against cursing another person, 144-45 prohibition against stealing from a Gentile, 149 social-educational, 140, 143, 152, 204, 220, 223 penal laws, 14 peshiah (negligence/fault) theory, 45, 47, 49, 53, 56, 61, 63-65, 71-72, 75, 258, 260-61, 264-65, 285, 293, 300 in the Code, 293, 297, 300-1, 311, 322, 373, 375 difficulties, 40, 42-43, 67, 69-70, 295 elements of negligence and foreseeability, 42 foreseeability, 65, 67, 69-70, 292, 299-300, 304, 314, 358-59 as a uniform principle of tort liability, 40, 42-43, 45, 61, 78, 229, 281, 310-11, 336 in the Talmud, 43 versus the theory of ownership, 42 Philo of Alexandria, 243-44 philosophical elements of Maimonides' tort theory, 138–41, 143, 152, 157, 217, 220, 222, 225, 228, 339

the promotion of communality, 164 rationale for punitive damages, 243 sanctity of human life, 141-43 philosophy, 1 pit and the Bible, 104-6 essential characteristics, 104-5 owned by partners, 291 owner, 105-6, 291 in the Talmud, 104 pluralistic approaches, 26-27, 31, 37 Aristotle, 204 balance between the consequentialist and the moral dimensions, 346 Burton, Steven, 31 Calabresi, Guido, 215, 217 casuistic approach, 347-50 combine different goals in particular cases, 342 current mixed pluralistic theories, 341-42, 345, 350, 368, 370-71, 383 current theories, 339-41 Englard, Izhak, 31, 342–46, 349–50, 359 Geistfeld, Mark, 31, 346, 350, 359 Goldberg, John, 31 James, Fleming Jr., 31, 347, 349-50, 359 and Maimonides, 28, 131, 136, 204, 338-41, 349-50, 352, 359, 367, 383 nature, 136 Robinette, Christopher, 31, 347-49 Schwartz, Gary, 31, 343-46, 349-50, 359 Williams, Glanville, 31 Zipursky, Benjamin, 31 Polinsky and Shavell, 273, 275, 371 Porat, Ariel, 206 Porat, Hanan, 361 Posner, Richard A., 24, 35, 38, 194, 251, 260, 368 contributory negligence, 263, 267-68, 278-79, 300, 370 economic approach to negligence, 27, 252, 255, 262-63, 265, 267, 293, 300, 321, 333, 370 fault-based regime, 263 and Learned Hand formula, 25, 27, 252, 260-62, 264 and Maimonides, 251, 260, 263-64, 267-68, 293, 323, 333, 383 products liability, 27 property damages, 14 damage caused by animals, 54-55, 66-67, 100-1, 104, 190–91, **23**0 different types, 54 removal of the potentially damaging element, 191

strict liability, 45

in the Guide, 222-23

410

Index

property rule and liability rule, 214 in Maimonides, 128-29 punishment common law, 89 level of punishment, 38 for negligence, 89 for theft, 89, 122-23 for torts, 89 punitive damages, 28, 86, 88, 93, 200, 213 act may be done secretly, 269, 274 amount of temptation, 274 circumstances for recognition, 270 combination of goals and reasons, 388-89, 391-93 contemporary theories, 227, 243, 270-71, 277, 279-80, 318, 360, 368-69, 371 and corrective justice, 213 between criminal law and civil law, 238, 385-86, 388 and criminal sanctions, 240, 268-69 deontological explanations, 274 deterrence, 225, 238, 241-42, 245, 247-50, 253 economic approaches, 271-73, 278, 371 enforcement, 274 England, 390-91 Europe, 386, 391 four parameters of Maimonides, 240-42, 268-70, 274, 276, 371, 378-79, 381, 387-88, 391-95 frequency of the act, 247-49, 269, 274 hybrid sanctions, 238 incentivizing the injured party to take precautions, 277-80, 393-94 Jewish law, 239 Maimonides consequentialist analysis, 238-39, 241, 243-44, 246, 249-50, 268-69, 274-80, 371, 379, 381-83 modern approaches in the American literature, 270, 379, 386-87, 391-92 multiplier approach, 31, 246, 268, 270, 272-73, 275-78, 371, 386-89, 391, 393-95 objectives, 271 optimal deterrence, 273-75, 351, 371, 381 possibility of reducing punitive damages, 393-94 punitive approach, 386-88 redress, 272 religious reasons, 243, 249 revenge and the dignity of the victim, 271 severity of the crime, 276 societal approaches, 271-72, 371 Societal Redress Extra-Compensatory Damages, 268, 270-72, 274-78, 280, 371, 388-89, 391-92, 394-95 theft payments, 93, 160 theological reasons, 243, 245 traditional approaches, 271

US Federal courts, 273, 371 US Supreme Court, 273, 275, 371 Ra'abad, 188, 205 in his criticism of Maimonides' ruling, 70, 297, 312-14 Rabinovitch, Nachum, 42, 165, 169, 234, 237, 260, 298, 307, 314 Radin, Margaret Jane, 272 Rashi, 174-75 religious, 26 atonement, 173 awareness as a religious duty, 327 duties and prohibitions, 159 elements of Maimonides' tort theory, 138, 184, 217, 220, 222, 228, 251-52, 276, 285, 287, 305, 338-40, 350-53, 367, 370, 372, 383 injury to the human body is perceived as an injury to, 330 moral, 220 mystical, 184 nature of religious obligation, 163, 181 obligation to preserve the body and life, 160, 163 obligation to preserve the property, 160, 163 payments as a form of religious atonement, 160 prohibition against causing damage, 9, 82, 131, 160, 166-68, 189-90, 220, 251, 286-87, 302 prohibition against causing damage to life, 160 prohibition against causing injury, 2, 7, 116-17, 160, 218-20, 357 prohibition against looking into the domain of another, 186-87 prohibition against purchasing from the tortfeasor who stole, 251 prohibition against self-harm, 11, 160-65, 169, 171-72, 351 prohibition against stealing from a Gentile, 149 ransoming captives, 182 and secular law, 162, 184, 353, 360, 364-67 sins against one's fellow man vis-à-vis sins against God, 151 theological aspects, 171-73 Rishonim, 161, 169, 182 risk-causing behavior and corrective justice, 188 deontological and utilitarian considerations, 187, 189 not causing actual damage, 70, 187, 305-7 and prevention of harm, 188-89 Rivlin, Eliezer Deputy President of the Israeli Supreme Court, 362

robbery characteristics, 242, 245, 360

Robinette, Christopher, 31, 92, 347-49

Index

411

Roman law, 41 culpability (culpa), 41 Sa'adia Gaon, 243-44 and Maimonides, 243 Sages of Lunel (Provence), 47-48 Saladin the Great, 133 sanction a central element in the definition of law, 163 and legal obligation, 164, 181 the role of the sanction, 163 violation of prohibition, 163 Schereschewsky, Benzion criticism on the peshiah theory, 42 Schwartz, Gary, 31 optimal deterrence as the dominant goal, 343-46, 350 protective justice, 344 scope of tort law between civil law and criminal law, 8, 29, 80, 82, 84, 86-87, 89, 93, 171, 323, 331, 352, 368-69, 385 between contract law and criminal law, 87, 89 secular. 2 application of religious laws in secular law, 184, 353, 360, 364-67 Calabresi, 220 modern theoreticians of secular law, 217 Sefer Hahinukh, 144 Sela, Ilan, 94, 113, 118, 219 serial negligent, 71 Sharkey, Catherine, 272, 371, 387-89, 392, 394 Shkop, Shimon, 55-57, 166 commandments, prohibitions and obligations, 166-68 private monetary norms, 166-68 Shmueli, Benjamin, 389 Shulhan Arukh, 16, 18 Silberg, Moshe, 159 slave, 77, 288, 290 social, 2 economic, 38 prohibition against causing damage, 189 promotion of communality, 164 solidarity, 164 standard of care, 2, 26, 28 absolute liability, 27-28, 44, 68-69, 110, 131, 263, 311, 314, 321, 332, 336, 352, 354–55, 357–59, 395 almost strict liability, 321, 328, 330, 332-33, 352 automobile accidents, 339 close to negligence, 354 damages caused by a person to property, 110 damages caused by a person to the property of another, 68-69, 268, 316-17, 332-33, 336, 355-56 damages caused by property, 45, 312, 321-22, 328-29, 356-57 between damages caused by property and damages caused by a person, 231, 355-56 damages to neighbors, 131 different categories of damage, 15, 30, 310-11, 317-19, 323, 328, 330, 332, 336-37, 339-40, 352-55, 359, 375 differential liability regime, 15, 97, 310 each category, 27 effective damage avoider, 14 fault, 27, 30, 109, 323, 328-29, 334, 337, 352 fault-based liability theory, 39, 252-53, 255, 263, 291, 294, 310, 322, 352 gross negligence, 318, 321, 328, 331-33, 357, 359 Guide, 268 hierarchy of liability regimes, 312, 328 humiliation, 319-20, 328, 332, 357, 359 inadvertently (shogeg), 312 intentionally, 68, 312 intermediate standards, 27 between laws of damages to neighbors and standard laws of torts, 130 medical malpractice, 357, 359, 375 minimal mens rea, 110 more than negligence, 117, 260 mu'ad ox, 267-68, 300 murder, 312, 323, 328, 332, 352 negligence, 2, 7, 11, 15, 27-28, 30, 41, 68-69, 90, 109, 117, 131, 255, 267–68, 292, 300, 310–12, 315, 317, 319, 321-22, 328-29, 331, 333-34, 336, 339, 352, 354-55, 357-59, 370, 375, 385, 390 ownership and strict liability theory, 39, 42 person who has caused damage to the property of another, 312-13, 315-16, 318-19, 328, 330-32 peshiah, 7, 29, 45, 69 property damages, 117, 131, 267-68, 323, 336, 340 between property damages and wounding and damaging, 109, 355-58 robber, 122 scale, 27 strict liability, 2, 14-15, 27-28, 30, 44-46, 68, 199, 236, 252-53, 256-57, 260-63, 267-68, 292, 294, 302, 310, 312-19, 321-22, 328-29, 331, 333-37, 340, 352, 354-55, 357, 359, 370, 375-76, 387, 390, 394 strict liability and exemption in cases of force majeure, 312-15, 318, 332 between a tam ox and a mu'ad ox, 303 tam ox, 267-68 theft, 122, 332

412

Index

standard of care (cont.) unavoidable mishap (ones), 60, 68-69, 237, 295, 312-14, 316-18 wounding, 117, 268, 312, 316-18, 320, 328-33, 340, 352, 357, 359 between wounding and damaging, 316-17 Statman, Daniel, 364 stoning the ox that killed a person, 96, 231-32 strict liability, 28 in the Talmud, 49 strict liability theory, 72 applies to all types of tortfeasors, 45-46 Calabresi, Guido, 25, 252-53, 260-61, 263, 292 and Posner, 262-63 Talmud, 31 casuistic, 13 degree of inadvertency of various cases of unintentional homicide, 324 exceptional cases, 65 exempts the finder of lost property from returning the item to its owner, 154 helping another person load up his animal or unload it, 149 law of pursuer, 174 liability of animals, 59 obligation to prevent financial loss, 170 one does not accept the object from the robbers, 158 repent and return the stolen property, 157-58 sanctity of human life, 142 second chapter of Bava Batra, 124-25 stealing from a Gentile, 148 stoning the ox that killed a person, 60 tort liability on animals, 60 talmudic laws of tort, 17, 65 Bava Kamma, 82 and the Bible, 66, 103 cases of exemption from liability, 232 categories of damage, 66, 76 compensation in situations of uncertain causation, 110, 356 between damages caused by property and damages caused by a person, 103, 230 an eye for an eye, 112 four heads of damage, 100 harm caused by individuals to other individuals, 334-35 innocent ox (tam), 236-37 liability of person for damages he caused, 68 limited scope of liability, 65 list of damagers, 82-83 meta principle for obligations in tort, 99

payment for half the innocent horn damages constitute a fine, 237, 267, 301-2 person who causes damage to others by means of unwelcome viewing (ayin hara), 185-86 person who causes damage to the property of another, 312 prohibition against causing harm, 165, 288 standard of care of the tam ox, 267-68 system of organization, 98 between theft (genevah) and robbery(gezelah), 119-20, 123, 242-45, 247 theft of cattle, 241-42, 246-48, 250, 382-83, 393 characteristics, 242, 245-46, 360 five-fold payments, 93, 119 four-fold payments, 93, 119 payments, 93 professional thief, 249-50 of sheep, 239, 241-42, 246-50, 382-83, 393 two-fold payments, 93, 119 tort liability animal that kills a person, 96 animals, 59 assumption of risk, 258, 260, 294, 374 bodily injury, 318 brigands breached the fence, 62, 122, 332 burden of proof, 90, 369 cases of exemption from liability, 232-34, 237, 255, 258, 260, 263, 265, 267, 284, 292–94, 298-300, 313, 321-22 in the Code, 39 comparative negligence, 261-62, 376 contributory negligence, 45, 258, 260-62 control, 311, 328, 332-33, 354-55, 359, 370 correlativity, 212 damage caused by animals, 54-55, 62, 66, 73, 78, 84, 101, 103, 122, 230, 285, 290, 292, 295-98, 300, 302, 304, 322, 329, 333, 336-37, 355-56 damage caused by the person himself, 45, 50, 73, 77, 82, 84, 104 damages that a worker caused to others, 58 definition of the act (actus reus), 320-21 effective ability to control test, 2, 14, 167-68, 227, 230-31, 233, 235, 252-54, 260, 267, 281, 284, 289-90, 292-93, 295, 298, 300, 308, 310-11, 315, 328, 352, 354, 359, 370 effective avoider of damage, 2, 14, 167, 231-37, 254-57, 267, 281, 289-90, 292, 295-98, 300-1, 306, 309, 311, 313, 315, 318, 321-22, 328, 332-33, 335-36 English law, 380-81 in exceptional cases, 65-67 fault, 11, 51-52, 57, 90, 322

fault-based liability theory, 39, 44, 78, 252-53, 255, 263, 291, 294, 310, 322, 352, 373, 376 fire, 55-56, 78 general rule of liability, 229, 268 in the Guide, 14, 251, 254-56, 260, 266 on the injured party, 292-95, 300, 322 imposition of, 15 incentive to prevent tortious events, 230 inciting another's dog, 64-65, 292-94 information, 291-92, 294, 297, 381 limited scope of liability, 65 litigation, 90 master, 54 modified comparative negligence, 261, 266 negligence, 51 of the owner of an innocent ox, 237 ownership, 14, 44, 46–47, 49, 53, 59, 64 ownership and strict liability, 29, 45 ox, 55, 59 person's intention to cause damage, 62-63, 122 person's intention to steal, 63, 123 peshiah, 7, 11-12, 14, 29, 40, 43, 45, 47, 49, 51-53, 56-57, 64 between peshiah and ownership, 76, 78 pit, 55-56, 78, 106, 291 prohibition against causing damage, 165 prohibition against causing injury, 8 property damages, 44-46, 60-61, 104, 106, 230, 322, 329, 359 psychological damage, 130 pure comparative negligence, 261, 266, 279 risk causing behavior, 70, 187, 189, 191, 305 robbery, 310 slave, 54, 288, 290 splitting the liability, 235-36, 260, 267, 284, 301, 375-76, 394 strict liability, 45-46, 49, 253, 256-57, 260-63 strike from heaven, 69, 313-15, 332, 374 in the Talmud, 13, 16-17 theft, 310, 328 visual trespass, 185-86 watchman, 46-49, 92, 295-98, 321 wounding, 310 yeshiva reading, 52 Tosafists, 175 Tur, 18, 160 Twersky, Isadore, 10 classification of the Code, 75 between the Code of Maimonides and the Guide, 33, 223 INTRODUCTION TO THE CODE OF MAIMONIDES, 32

Index

413

socially oriented explanations in Maimonides' works, 223, 225 the study of Maimonides, 39 visual trespass, 185 legal parameters, 186 on a neighboring plot, 186 prohibition against looking into the domain of another, 186-87 violation of property rights, 187 Warhaftig, Itamar, 187 Warhaftig, Zerah, 15 business risk theory, 58-59 criticism on the peshiah theory, 42 ownership and strict liability theory, 14, 42, 44-51, 53, 58-59, 61, 289, 293, 310-11 peshiah vs. ownership, 44-45, 47, 51, 68 and the yeshiva reading, 45 Weinberg, Yehiel Yaakov, 42, 58-59 Weinrib, Ernest, 3, 181, 194 compensation, 200 corrective justice, 194-96, 198, 200-1, 203-4, 206, 208–11, 344, 368 duty to rescue, 212 and Kant, 210, 212 and Maimonides, 203-4, 209-11 private law, 341 welfare economics, 34 Westreich, Avishalom, 233 Williams, Glanville, 31 corrective justice, 200, 211-12 and Maimonides, 211-12 wounding, 111, 230 actus reus, 117-18, 357, 359 and the Bible, 117 in the course of a quarrel (derekh nitzaion), 117-18, 357, 359, 369 and damaging, 111, 113, 115 payments, 109 request for forgiveness, 97, 154 Wozner, Shai R. Shimon Shkop, 166-67 Ya'akov, ben Asher Arba'a Turim, 160 Yaron, Reuven, 236 yeshiva reading, 53 abstract, analytical, and conceptual thinking, Brisker/Soloveitchik school, 52-53 common interpretation, 39, 43, 46, 73, 288, 290, 310, 336

414

Index

yeshiva reading (cont.) difficulties, 29, 39, 46, 51, 57, 288, 310, 336 *hakira*, 53, 57 ownership and strict liability theory, 10, 14, 29, 43–44, 48–49, 53, 68, 73, 289, 293, 308 *peshiah* and ownership, 43, 46, 51, 53, 57, 72, 311 R. Shimon Shkop, 55–57 rationale, 59–60

Zamir, Eyal, 38, 368 Zipursky, Benjamin, 31, 202, 212, 383–85, 387, 393 Zuri, Yaakov Shmuel, 41