

FROM STOICISM TO PLATONISM

From Stoicism to Platonism describes the change in philosophy from around 100 BCE, when monistic Stoicism was the strongest dogmatic school in philosophy, to around 100 CE, when dualistic Platonism began to gain the upper hand – with huge consequences for all later Western philosophy and for Christianity. It is distinguished by querying traditional categories like 'eclecticism' and 'harmonization' as means of describing the period. Instead, it highlights different strategies of 'appropriation' of one school's doctrines by philosophers from the other school, with all philosophers being highly conscious of their own identity. This book also sets out to break down the traditional boundaries between the study of Greco-Roman philosophy in the period and that of contemporary Hellenistic Jewish and early Christian writings with a philosophical profile. In these ways, the book opens up an immensely fruitful period in the history of philosophy.

TROELS ENGBERG-PEDERSEN is Emeritus Professor of the New Testament in the Faculty of Theology at the University of Copenhagen. He has moved freely between the disciplines of classics, ancient philosophy and Christian theology (the New Testament), and has published major monographs on Aristotle's *Ethics* (1983) Stoic ethics (1990), the Apostle Paul and Stoicism (2000 and 2010) and, most recently, the Gospel of John and philosophy (2017).



FROM STOICISM TO PLATONISM

The Development of Philosophy, 100 BCE-100 CE

EDITED BY
TROELS ENGBERG-PEDERSEN

University of Copenhagen





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316617366 10.1017/9781316694459

© Cambridge University Press 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017 First paperback edition 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data

NAMES: Engberg-Pedersen, Troels, editor.

TITLE: From Stoicism to Platonism: the development of philosophy, 100 BCE-100 CE /
[edited by] Troels Engberg-Pedersen, University of Copenhagen.

DESCRIPTION: New York: Cambridge University Press, 2017. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2016046818 | ISBN 9781107166196 SUBJECTS: LCSH: Philosophy, Ancient. | Stoics. | Platonists. CLASSIFICATION: LCC B505 .F77 2017 | DDC 180–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2016046818

> ISBN 978-1-107-16619-6 Hardback ISBN 978-1-316-61736-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List of Contributors Acknowledgements		<i>page</i> vii ix
I	Introduction: A Historiographical Essay Troels Engberg-Pedersen	I
2	Plato, Chrysippus and Posidonius' Theory of Affective Movements A. G. Long	27
3	Cicero's Plato Malcolm Schofield	47
4	Are We Nearly There Yet? Eudorus on Aristotle's <i>Categories George Boys-Stones</i>	67
5	Stoicism and Platonism in 'Arius Didymus' Myrto Hatzimichali	80
6	Oikeiōsis in Stoicism, Antiochus and Arius Didymus Christopher Gill	100
7	The Platonist Appropriation of Stoic Epistemology Mauro Bonazzi	120
8	"Becoming like God" in Platonism and Stoicism Gretchen Reydams-Schils	142
9	From Stoicism to Platonism: The Difficult Case of Philo of Alexandria's <i>De Providentia</i> I <i>David T. Runia</i>	159



vi	Contents	
Ю	From Cicero to Philo of Alexandria: Ascending and Descending Axes in the Interpretation of Platonism and Stoicism Carlos Lévy	179
II	The Love of Wisdom: Middle Platonism and Stoicism in the Wisdom of Solomon <i>Gregory E. Sterling</i>	198
12	Seneca and Epictetus on Body, Mind and Dualism A. A. Long	214
13	The Dilemma of Paul's Physics: Features Stoic-Platonist or Platonist-Stoic? Stanley Stowers	231
14	The Legacy of Musonius Rufus Brad Inwood	254
15	Stoic and Platonic Reflections on Naming in Early Christian Circles: Or, What's in a Name? Harold W. Attridge	277
16	Is Plutarch Really Hostile to the Stoics? Jan Opsomer	296
17	Peripatetic Appropriations of <i>Oikeiōsis</i> : Alexander, <i>Mantissa</i> Chapter 17 <i>Charles Brittain</i>	322
Bibliography		348
Index Locorum		373
General Index		392



Contributors

HAROLD W. ATTRIDGE Sterling Professor of Divinity, Yale University

маико вонаzzi Senior Lecturer in Ancient Philosophy, University of Milan

GEORGE BOYS-STONES Professor of Ancient Philosophy, Durham University

CHARLES BRITTAIN Professor of Classics and Philosophy, Cornell University

TROELS ENGBERG-PEDERSEN Emeritus Professor of the New Testament, University of Copenhagen

CHRISTOPHER GILL Emeritus Professor of Ancient Thought, University of Exeter

мукто натziмicнаLi Lecturer in Classics (Philosophy), University of Cambridge

BRAD INWOOD Professor of Classics and Philosophy, Yale University

CARLOS LÉVY Emeritus Professor of Roman Philosophy and Literature, Université de Paris-Sorbonne (Paris IV)

- A. A. LONG Chancellor's Professor of Classics Emeritus, and Affiliated Professor of Philosophy and Rhetoric, University of California, Berkeley
- A. G. LONG Senior Lecturer in Classics, University of St Andrews
- JAN OPSOMER Professor of Ancient Philosophy, KU Leuven (Research Fund)
- GRETCHEN REYDAMS-SCHILS Professor of Ancient Philosophy, University of Notre Dame
- DAVID T. RUNIA Master of Queen's College, University of Melbourne



More Information

viii List of contributors

MALCOLM SCHOFIELD Emeritus Professor of Ancient Philosophy, University of Cambridge

GREGORY E. STERLING Lillian Claus Professor of New Testament, Yale University

STANLEY STOWERS Emeritus Professor of Religious Studies, Brown University



Acknowledgements

In the years 2008–2013, the Faculty of Theology at the University of Copenhagen hosted a Centre of Excellence titled 'Naturalism and Christian Semantics', generously funded by the Rector of the University. The centre was led by Troels Engberg-Pedersen as principal investigator (PI) and Niels Henrik Gregersen as co-principal investigator. Where Engberg-Pedersen was in charge of the part of the centre that focused on early Christianity in its Greco-Roman context – and here specifically the philosophical one – Gregersen directed the modern, systematic theological part of the centre. During the five years of research we had innumerable meetings among all involved at the centre, as well as with scholars invited from abroad. A number of PhD and postdoc students were part of this work. Those in the ancient part of the centre were the following: Gitte Buch-Hansen, Dylan Burns, Tilde Bak Halvgaard, Stefan Nordgaard, Maria Pontoppidan and Runar Thorsteinsson.

As a result of work at the centre, a conference was organized in August 2014 at the Danish Royal Academy of Sciences in Copenhagen to investigate the relationship between Stoicism and Platonism between 100 BCE and 100 CE, in particular, and their respective influence on Hellenistic Jewish writings around the turn of the era and on early Christian writings of the first century CE. The conference had been planned well in advance, which had included a visit by Engberg-Pedersen in January 2013 at Cambridge, where he discussed the issues with David Sedley, Malcolm Schofield and Myrto Hatzimichali. The response to the invitation to participate in Copenhagen from a large number of international scholars working at the forefront of scholarship in these fields was extremely positive, as will appear from the present volume. In addition to the authors included here, the following scholars attended the conference: Richard J. Beniston (Durham), Gitte Buch-Hansen (Copenhagen), Leo Catana (Copenhagen), Riccardo Chiaradonna (Rome), Sten Ebbesen (Copenhagen), Jakob Leth Fink (Copenhagen),



Acknowledgements

Tilde Bak Halvgaard (Copenhagen), Heine Hansen (Copenhagen), Rainer Hirsch-Luipold (Berne), Niko Huttunen (Helsinki), Steffen Lund Jørgensen (Copenhagen), Ivan Miroshnikov (Helsinki), Stefan Nordgaard (Copenhagen), Anders Klostergaard Petersen (Aarhus), Tue Søvsø (Copenhagen), Runar Thorsteinsson (Reykjavík), Paolo Torri (Milan) and Patrick Ussher (Exeter).

As PI of the Centre of Excellence, I would like to thank here most warmly both the Rector of the University of Copenhagen, Ralf Hemmingsen, for funding the centre and also my co-PI, Niels Henrik Gregersen, for stimulating discussions and always wholly unproblematic co-operation in running the centre. Warm thanks are also due to the PhD and postdoc students listed earlier for the energy and curiosity with which they engaged in all the scholarly issues we discussed during those five years. As organizer of the conference and editor of this volume, I would also like to thank David Sedley, Malcolm Schofield and Myrto Hatzimichali for their willingness to engage in discussing the conference. That was in fact a great help. Thanks are also due to the Royal Academy of Sciences, who undertook its share of the funding for the conference and in whose splendid building we did all our work. All participants in the conference deserve the highest credit for making it such a lively and stimulating occasion. Last, but certainly not least, the contributors to this volume are to be thanked most warmly for their willingness to come to Copenhagen, in the first place, and then to engage in the laborious task of revising their papers and engaging with my editorial feedback. Their responses to my editorial interventions have been exemplary.¹

Troels Engberg-Pedersen

¹ A warm note of thanks must also be added to the two anonymous readers for Cambridge University Press, who made a number of very helpful suggestions for all individual chapters in the volume.