

FREE WILL AND THE REBEL ANGELS
IN MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY

In this book Tobias Hoffmann studies the medieval free will debate during its liveliest period, from the 1220s to the 1320s, and clarifies its background in Aristotle, Augustine, and earlier medieval thinkers. Among the wide range of authors he examines are not only well-known thinkers such as Thomas Aquinas, Duns Scotus, and William of Ockham, but also a number of authors who were just as important in their time and deserve to be rediscovered today. To shed further light on their theories of free will, Hoffmann also explores their competing philosophical explanations of the fall of the angels, that is, the hypothesis of an evil choice made by rational beings under optimal psychological conditions. As he shows, this test case imposed limits on tracing free choices to cognition. His book provides a comprehensive account of a debate that was central to medieval philosophy and continues to occupy philosophers today.

TOBIAS HOFFMANN is Professor of Philosophy at the Catholic University of America. He has published widely on medieval thinkers including Albert the Great, Thomas Aquinas, Henry of Ghent, and Duns Scotus, and he is the editor of *Weakness of Will from Plato to the Present* (2008), *A Companion to Angels in Medieval Philosophy* (2012), and co-editor (with Jörn Müller and Matthias Perkams) of *Aquinas and the Nicomachean Ethics* (Cambridge University Press, 2013).

FREE WILL AND THE REBEL ANGELS IN MEDIEVAL PHILOSOPHY

TOBIAS HOFFMANN

The Catholic University of America



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-316-60883-8 — Free Will and the Rebel Angels in Medieval Philosophy
Tobias Hoffmann
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316608838
DOI: 10.1017/9781316652886

© Tobias Hoffmann 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021
First paperback edition 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-107-15538-1 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-316-60883-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or
accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in
this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is,
or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-316-60883-8 — Free Will and the Rebel Angels in Medieval Philosophy

Tobias Hoffmann

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

For Bonnie Kent

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page</i> x
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xi
<i>Citation Method</i>	xiv
Introduction	I
The Scope of This Study	1
Free Will in a Broad and in a Narrow Sense	4
Intellectualism and Voluntarism	5
The Narrative of Angelic Sin	6
PART I FREE WILL	
1 Free Will with and without Aristotle	13
1.1 Anselm of Canterbury	13
1.2 Bernard of Clairvaux	18
1.3 Peter Lombard	20
1.4 Aristotle as a Game Changer	22
2 The Psychological Turn and the Rise of Intellectualism	31
2.1 William of Auxerre	32
2.2 Philip the Chancellor	33
2.3 The <i>Summa Halensis</i> , Albert the Great, and Bonaventure	35
2.4 Thomas Aquinas	40
2.5 Siger of Brabant	54
3 Voluntarism and the Condemnation of Intellectualism	58
3.1 The 1270 and 1277 Censures	59
3.2 Henry of Ghent	63
3.3 Peter Olivi	84
3.4 Other Franciscans and the <i>Correctorium</i> of Brother Thomas	91
4 Intermediary Theories and Strict Intellectualism	93
4.1 Giles of Rome	94

4.2	John of Morrovalle	103
4.3	Godfrey of Fontaines	105
5	Refinements and Radicalizations	119
5.1	John Duns Scotus	119
5.2	John of Pouilly	133
5.3	Hervaeus Natalis and Durand of St. Pourçain	143
5.4	Peter Auriol	146
5.5	William of Ockham	151
PART II WHENCE EVIL?		
6	Does Evil Have a Cause?	163
6.1	Augustine	163
6.2	Pseudo-Dionysius	171
7	The Will as the Cause of Evil	174
7.1	Anselm of Canterbury	175
7.2	Peter Lombard	175
7.3	William of Auxerre	176
7.4	Albert the Great and Bonaventure	178
7.5	Thomas Aquinas	182
7.6	Henry of Ghent	187
7.7	Richard of Menneville (Mediavilla)	188
7.8	John Duns Scotus	190
7.9	John of Pouilly	193
PART III ANGELIC SIN		
8	Intellectualist Accounts of the Angelic Fall	199
8.1	Philip the Chancellor	200
8.2	Albert the Great	201
8.3	Thomas Aquinas	204
8.4	Godfrey of Fontaines	214
8.5	John of Pouilly	216
9	Voluntarist and Intermediary Accounts of the Angelic Fall	219
9.1	Bonaventure	219
9.2	John Pecham	221
9.3	Henry of Ghent	222
9.4	Peter Olivi	225
9.5	John Duns Scotus	230
9.6	Giles of Rome	235
9.7	Peter Auriol	238

	<i>Contents</i>	ix
10	Necessary (and Free?) Obstinacy	243
10.1	Thomas Aquinas	244
10.2	Peter Olivi	249
10.3	Henry of Ghent	250
10.4	John Duns Scotus	252
10.5	Durand of St. Pourçain	255
10.6	Peter Auriol	257
10.7	William of Ockham	259
	Conclusion	263
	<i>Bibliography</i>	267
	<i>Index of Manuscripts</i>	287
	<i>Index</i>	288

Acknowledgments

Numerous people helped me in writing this book; while I wish to express my deep gratitude to all of them, I can mention only a few by name. While planning the book, I benefited from conversations with Bonnie Kent during my time as a visiting scholar at the University of California at Irvine in 2012–13. Hilary Gaskin encouraged me to pursue the project with Cambridge University Press and gave me precious advice about the scope of the book. An anonymous reader provided invaluable comments on the whole manuscript, and two readers did so for early drafts of some chapters; the book has gained much from their suggestions. While a visiting scholar at the University of Macerata in 2017–18, I greatly profited from the generous hospitality of the Philosophy Department and especially from conversations with Guido Alliney. I had an analogous experience at the University of Würzburg, where Jörn Müller hosted me during the summer of 2018. Throughout the entire process, Stephen Dumont, Timothy Noone, Riccardo Saccenti, Chris Schabel, and Kevin White provided precious advice and shared reproductions of manuscripts or unpublished papers of theirs. Thomas Jeschke graciously shared a draft of a critical edition. Olivier Boulnois provided the opportunity to test the core of the book by inviting me to teach a course on the same topic at the École Pratique des Hautes Études in Paris in May 2019. I received useful comments on earlier partial or complete drafts of the manuscript from Francis and Sophia Feingold, Peter Furlong, Herb Hartmann, and Logan Weir. It was a pleasure to work with Anjana Karikal Cholan and her team, who very competently produced the typescript. The Alexander von Humboldt Foundation supported the project with an alumni research grant.

I wish to dedicate the book to Bonnie Kent, in gratitude for her innovative work in medieval theories of moral psychology and ethics and for the selfless support she has given me since I have come to North America.

Abbreviations

Book Series and Editions

CCCM	Corpus Christianorum Continuatio Mediaevalis
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum Series Latina
CSEL	Corpus Scriptorum Ecclesiasticorum Latinorum
NR	John Duns Scotus (2007), <i>Quodlibet</i> q. 16, ed. Noone and Roberts
OPh	Opera philosophica (of Duns Scotus or William of Ockham)
OTh	Opera theologica (of William of Ockham)
PhB	Les Philosophes Belges
PL	Patrologia Latina
Viv.	Vivès edition (of Duns Scotus)
WB	John Duns Scotus (2004–8), <i>Reportatio</i> I-A, ed. Wolter and Bychkov

Aristotle

<i>An.</i>	<i>De anima</i>
<i>EN</i>	<i>Ethica Nicomachea</i>
<i>GC</i>	<i>De generatione et corruptione</i>
<i>Int.</i>	<i>De interpretatione</i>
<i>Met.</i>	<i>Metaphysica</i>
<i>Phys.</i>	<i>Physica</i>

Augustine

<i>ciu.</i>	<i>De ciuitate Dei</i>
<i>conf.</i>	<i>Confessiones</i>
<i>corrupt.</i>	<i>De correptione et gratia</i>
<i>c. Iul.</i>	<i>Contra Iulianum</i>

List of Abbreviations

<i>c. Iul. imp.</i>	<i>Contra Iulianum opus imperfectum</i>
<i>ench.</i>	<i>Enchiridion ad Laurentium de fide spe et caritate</i>
<i>en. Ps.</i>	<i>Enarrationes in Psalmos</i>
<i>Gn. litt.</i>	<i>De Genesi ad litteram</i>
<i>lib. arb.</i>	<i>De libero arbitrio</i>
<i>mor.</i>	<i>De moribus ecclesiae catholicae et de moribus Manichaeorum</i>
<i>nat. b.</i>	<i>De natura boni</i>
<i>nupt. et conc.</i>	<i>De nuptiis et concupiscentia</i>
<i>perf. iust.</i>	<i>De perfectione iustitiae hominis</i>
<i>retr.</i>	<i>Retractationes</i>
<i>uera rel.</i>	<i>De uera religione</i>

Works by Other Authors

<i>DCD</i>	<i>De casu diaboli</i>
<i>DDN</i>	<i>De divinis nominibus</i>
<i>DM</i>	<i>Quaestiones disputatae de malo</i>
<i>DNCC</i>	<i>De necessitate et contingentia causarum</i>
<i>DSS</i>	<i>De substantiis separatis</i>
<i>DV</i>	<i>Quaestiones disputatae de veritate</i>
<i>Expos. . . .</i>	<i>Expositio . . . (e.g., in libros Physicorum Aristotelis)</i>
<i>In . . .</i>	<i>Commentary on . . . (e.g., In DDN, In Sent., In Met.)</i>
<i>Lect.</i>	<i>Lectura</i>
<i>Ord.</i>	<i>Ordinatio</i>
<i>Praedest.</i>	<i>Tractatus de praedestinatione et de praescientia divina</i>
<i>QD</i>	<i>Quaestio(nes) disputata(e)</i>
<i>QO</i>	<i>Quaestiones ordinariae</i>
<i>QV</i>	<i>Quaestiones variae</i>
<i>Q. . .</i>	<i>Quaestiones in . . . (e.g., QMet, Quaestiones in Metaphysicam Aristotelis)</i>
<i>Quodl.</i>	<i>Quodlibet</i>
<i>Rep.</i>	<i>Reportatio</i>
<i>SA</i>	<i>Summa aurea</i>
<i>SCG</i>	<i>Summa contra Gentiles</i>
<i>Sent.</i>	<i>Sententiae</i>
<i>ST</i>	<i>Summa theologiae</i>
<i>I-II</i>	<i>Prima secundae</i> (First part of the Second part)
<i>II-II</i>	<i>Secunda secundae</i> (Second part of the Second part)

List of Abbreviations

xiii

Other Abbreviations

a.	articulus
arg. (in opp.)	argumentum (in oppositum)
c.	corpus articuli (e.g., 6.7c.)
concl.	conclusio
intr.	introductio
q.	quaestio
qc.	quaestiuncula
s.c.	sed contra
sol.	solutio

Manuscripts

<i>A</i>	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, lat. 14565
<i>Fb</i>	Firenze, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, Conv. Soppr. A.III.120
<i>N</i>	Nürnberg, Stadtbibliothek, Cent. III, 75
<i>P</i>	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, lat. 15372

Citation Method

Ancient and medieval texts are cited according to their internal divisions (such as Book–Chapter, or Book–Distinction–Question–Article), marking the subdivisions by periods. When useful, references to printed editions (which are listed in the Bibliography) are given by volume numbers (in Roman numerals), page numbers, and line numbers. For example, Bonaventure, *In Sent.* II.3.2.1.2 ad 2, II: 117a refers to Book II of his *Sentences* commentary, Distinction 3, Part 2, Article 1, Question 2, response to the second opening argument, *Opera omnia*, volume II, page 117, left column. When not otherwise specified, Albert the Great is cited according to the Editio Coloniensis (1951–), Thomas Aquinas according to the Editio Leonina (1882–), Henry of Ghent according to the *Opera omnia* (1979–), and Duns Scotus according to the Editio Vaticana (1950–). *Quodlibeta* by Henry of Ghent cited without Roman numerals are cited according to the edition by Badius, 1518.

When multiple references are indicated, they are listed in chronological order. Because of space constraints, quotations in the footnotes had to be kept to a minimum.

All translations are my own.