

## Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>page</i> xi
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	xiii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xx
<b>General Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>1 Old Fictions</b>	<b>5</b>
1.1 Introduction	5
1.2 The Procedural Framework of the Old System	7
1.2.1 The Writ System	7
1.2.2 Civil Juries and Formal Pleading	9
1.2.3 Procedural Framework: An Epilogue	14
1.3 Old Fictions Examined	15
1.3.1 <i>Dominus Remisit Curiam</i>	15
1.3.2 <i>Vi et Armis</i>	16
1.3.3 Geographical Fictions	18
1.3.4 Bill of Middlesex	21
1.3.5 Writ of <i>Quominus</i>	23
1.3.6 Benefit of Clergy	25
1.3.7 Pleading the Belly	28
1.3.8 Common Recovery	30
1.3.9 Trover	33
1.3.10 Ejectment	36
1.3.11 Quasi-contract	40
1.4 Conclusion	44

<b>2 New Fictions Defined</b>	48
2.1 Introduction	48
2.2 The Problem: A Loose Concept	50
2.3 The Solution: Hard and Soft Fictions	53
2.4 Do Legal Fictions Exist?	53
2.4.1 Vaihinger's Assault	54
2.4.2 Repelling Vaihinger's Assault	56
2.4.3 Kelsen's Assault	57
2.4.4 Repelling Kelsen's Assault	57
2.4.5 The Linguistic Problem	59
2.4.6 The Solution to the Linguistic Problem	60
2.4.7 Fictions and Rules	61
2.4.8 Fictions and Counterfactuals	67
2.4.9 Conclusion	68
2.5 Overview of Existing Definitions	68
2.5.1 Plain and Ordinary Meaning	68
2.5.2 Academic Definitions	70
2.6 A Proposed Definition of Hard Fiction	87
2.6.1 What Do We Know So Far?	88
2.6.2 The Basis of Hard Fiction: Fact or Law?	88
2.6.3 The Basis of Hard Fiction: Statement, Assumption or Issue?	89
2.6.4 A Definition of Hard Fiction	90
2.7 A Proposed Definition of Soft Fiction	91
2.8 Case Studies	94
2.8.1 First Case Study: The Reasonable Man	94
2.8.2 Second Case Study: <i>Volenti non fit Injuria</i>	101
2.9 Conclusion	110
<b>3 New Fictions Explored</b>	111
3.1 Introduction	111
3.2 A Common Misunderstanding Concerning the Evaluation of Fictions	112
3.3 Classifications of Fictions	113
3.4 Equity Treats as Done That Which Ought to Be Done	114
3.4.1 Description	114
3.4.2 Is the Maxim a Hard Fiction?	118
3.4.3 Effect Classification of the Maxim	120
3.4.4 Difficulties in Application	120
3.4.5 Evaluation	126

*Contents*

ix

3.5	Estoppel	130
3.5.1	Description	130
3.5.2	Applications	132
3.5.3	Is Estoppel a Hard Fiction?	133
3.5.4	Reality Check	135
3.5.5	Effect Classification of Estoppel	136
3.5.6	Evaluation	137
3.6	<i>Volenti non fit Injuria</i>	139
3.6.1	Effect Classification	139
3.6.2	Evaluation	140
3.7	The Single Meaning Rule	141
3.7.1	Description	141
3.7.2	Is the Rule a Hard Fiction?	144
3.7.3	Effect Classification of the Single Meaning Rule	148
3.7.4	Evaluation	148
3.8	Common Intention Constructive Trust	158
3.8.1	Description	158
3.8.2	Is the Common Intention Constructive Trust a Fiction?	160
3.8.3	Evaluation	163
3.9	Remoteness in Negligence	164
3.9.1	Description	164
3.9.2	Is Remoteness in Negligence a Fiction?	168
3.9.3	Effect Classification	169
3.9.4	Evaluation	170
3.10	Reading Down Exclusion Clauses	171
3.11	Summary of Findings	173
3.12	Conclusion	173
4	An Acceptance Test for Fictions	175
4.1	Introduction	175
4.2	The Nature of the Test: The Degree of Discretion	176
4.2.1	Tests and Discretion	176
4.2.2	Choosing the Width of the Discretion	180
4.3	The Nature of the Test: The General Approach	180
4.3.1	The Possible Approaches	180
4.3.2	The Champions of the Various Approaches	181
4.3.3	Choosing an Approach	185
4.4	Motives for Fictions	187
4.4.1	Motives in Context	187

4.4.2	Motives in the Literature	188
4.4.3	Motives and the Acceptance Test	198
4.5	Analysis of Previous Results	201
4.5.1	The Correlation between Nature and Recommendation	201
4.5.2	The Correlation between Age and Recommendation	205
4.5.3	The Correlation between Effect and Recommendation	205
4.5.4	The Role of Justice in the Acceptance Test	206
4.5.5	The Role of the Conservative Argument in the Acceptance Test	211
4.6	The Retention Test	213
4.7	The Creation Test	213
4.7.1	Background and Statement	213
4.7.2	The Application of the Creation Test	215
4.8	The Acceptance Test	219
4.9	Hard Cases	220
4.10	Conclusion	222
	<b>General Conclusion</b>	223
	<i>Bibliography</i>	226
	<i>Index</i>	233