

Social Rights and the Politics of Obligation in History

This pioneering volume explores the long-neglected history of social rights, from the Middle Ages to the present. It debunks the myth that social rights are 'second-generation rights' that appeared after the Second World War as additions to a rights corpus stretching back to the Enlightenment. Not only do social rights extend that far back; they arguably predate the Enlightenment. In tracing their long history across various global contexts, this volume reveals how debates over social rights have often turned on deeper struggles over social obligation – over determining who owes what to whom, morally and legally. In the modern period, these struggles have been intertwined with questions of freedom, democracy, equality and dignity. Many factors have shaped the history of social rights, from class, gender and race to religion, empire and capitalism. With incomparable chronological depth, geographical breadth and conceptual nuance, *Social Rights and the Politics of Obligation in History* sets an agenda for future histories of human rights.

Steven L. B. Jensen is a senior researcher at the Danish Institute for Human Rights. He is author of the multiple prize-winning book *The Making of International Human Rights: The 1960s, Decolonization and the Reconstruction of Global Values* (2016) and co-editor of *Histories of Global Inequality: New Perspectives* (2019). He has worked previously for UNAIDS and the Danish Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Charles Walton is a reader in history at the University of Warwick. He is author of the prize-winning *Policing Public Opinion in the French Revolution: The Culture of Calumny and the Problem of Free Speech* (2009) and editor of *Into Print: Limits and Legacies of the Enlightenment* (2012) and a special issue on social rights in *French History* (2019). He has taught previously at Sciences Po and Yale University.



Human Rights in History

Edited by Stefan-Ludwig Hoffmann, University of California, Berkeley Samuel Moyn, Yale University

This series showcases new scholarship exploring the backgrounds of human rights today. With an open-ended chronology and international perspective, the series seeks works attentive to the surprises and contingencies in the historical origins and legacies of human rights ideals and interventions. Books in the series will focus not only on the intellectual antecedents and foundations of human rights, but also on the incorporation of the concept by movements, nation-states, international governance, and transnational law.

A full list of titles in the series can be found at: www.cambridge.org/human-rights-history



Social Rights and the Politics of Obligation in History

Edited by

Steven L. B. Jensen

The Danish Institute for Human Rights

Charles Walton

University of Warwick





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316519233 DOI: 10.1017/9781009008686

© Cambridge University Press 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Jensen, Steven L. B., 1973- editor. | Walton, G. Charles (George Charles), 1966- editor.

Title: Social rights and the politics of obligation in history / edited by Steven L.B. Jensen, The Danish Institute for Human Rights, Charles Walton, University of Warwick.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2022. | Series: Human rights in history | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021038274 (print) | LCCN 2021038275 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316519233 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009005111 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009008686 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Social rights – History. | Human rights – History. | BISAC: HISTORY / Europe / Renaissance

Classification: LCC HM671 .S6745 2022 (print) | LCC HM671 (ebook) | DDC 303.3/72–dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021038274

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021038275

ISBN 978-1-316-51923-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

	List of Contributors Acknowledgements	page vii ix
1	Not 'Second-Generation Rights': Rethinking the History of Social Rights STEVEN L. B. JENSEN AND CHARLES WALTON	. 1
Part	I Religion, Markets, States: Sources of Social Right before the Twentieth Century	ts
2	The Rights of the Poor: Taking the Long View JULIA MCCLURE	29
3	Public Welfare and the Natural Order: On the Theologica and Free-Market Sources of Socio-economic Rights DAN EDELSTEIN	al 47
4	Who Pays? Social Rights and the French Revolution CHARLES WALTON	63
5	The Haitian Revolution and Socio-economic Rights PHILIP KAISARY	82
6	Of Rights and Regulation: Technologies of Socio-economic Governance in a Revolutionary Age STEPHEN W. SAWYER AND WILLIAM J. NOVAK	99
7	Socio-economic Rights before the Welfare State: Labour Movements and Economic Emancipation in Nineteenth-Century Europe	121

V



vi Contents

Part II	Race, Gender, Class: Social Rights and the Paradoxes of Difference	
8	The Soviet Social: Rights and Welfare Reimagined SCOTT NEWTON	141
9	The Japanese 'Welfare Society': Social Rights in Action and the Seeds of the Precariat? BERNARD THOMANN	164
10	Liberation Theology, Social Rights and Indigenous Rights in Mexico (c.1965–2000) ROSIE DOYLE	184
11	The Unhappy Marriage of Gender and Socio-economic Rights in France LAURA L. FRADER	203
Part III	Social Rights in the Age of Internationalism: The Politics of State Obligations	
12	The Spirit of Social Rights SAMUEL MOYN	225
13	From Human Welfare to Human Rights: Considering Socio-economic Rights through the 1947–1948 UNESCO Human Rights Survey MARK GOODALE	243
14	Claiming Land, Claiming Rights in Africa's Internationally Supervised Territories MEREDITH TERRETTA	264
15	The Road from 1966: Social and Economic Rights after the International Covenant Christian Olaf Christiansen and Steven L. B. JENSEN	287
16	The Past and Future of Social Rights PHILIP ALSTON	308
	Index	327



Contributors

PHILIP ALSTON is the John Norton Pomeroy Professor of Law and Director and Chair of the Center for Human Rights and Global Justice at the NYU School of Law.

CHRISTIAN OLAF CHRISTIANSEN is an associate professor in the history of ideas at Aarhus University.

NICOLAS DELALANDE is an associate professor of history at Sciences Po, Paris.

ROSIE DOYLE is a senior teaching fellow in Latin American history at the University of Warwick.

DAN EDELSTEIN is the William H. Bonsall Professor in French at Stanford University.

LAURA L. FRADER is a professor emerita of history at Northeastern University.

MARK GOODALE is a professor of cultural and social anthropology and holds a chair at the University of Lausanne.

STEVEN L. B. JENSEN is a senior researcher at the Danish Institute for Human Rights.

PHILIP KAISARY is an associate professor in the Department of Law and Legal Studies at Carleton University.

JULIA MCCLURE is a lecturer in late medieval and early modern global history at the University of Glasgow.

SAMUEL MOYN is the Henry R. Luce Professor of Jurisprudence and a professor of history at Yale University.

SCOTT NEWTON is a reader in the laws of Central Asia, SOAS University of London.

vii



viii List of Contributors

WILLIAM J. NOVAK is the Charles F. and Edith J. Clyne Professor of Law at the University of Michigan Law School.

STEPHEN W. SAWYER is the Ballantine-Leavitt Professor of History at the American University of Paris.

MEREDITH TERRETTA is a professor of history at the University of Ottawa.

BERNARD THOMANN is a professor at INALCO (Paris) and the director of the Institut français de recherche sur le Japon à la Maison franco-japonaise (MEAE/CNRS) in Tokyo.

CHARLES WALTON is a reader in history and director of the Early Modern and Eighteenth-Century Centre at the University of Warwick.



Acknowledgements

The story behind this volume starts with a workshop on 'Writing the History of Socioeconomic Rights', which was held at the University of Warwick in May 2015 and which focused on establishing a research network to examine the long history of economic and social rights. Soon after, the Leverhulme Trust awarded Charles Walton a multi-year International Network Grant to develop a *Socioeconomic Rights in History Network*. Between 2015 and 2018, six workshops were held in collaboration with partner institutions in four countries (France, Germany, Switzerland and the United States). These efforts form the basis for the history of social rights presented in this volume. Its two editors met at Warwick for the first time and eventually joined forces to prepare this volume.

Our aim has been to nurture a currently underdeveloped historiography on economic and social rights.

We do, however, come to this project from two different scholarly perspectives. Charles Walton approached it as a historian of the French Revolution. He noticed that the recent historiography on this event, and especially on French Revolutionary rights, had neglected debates over social rights, which were discussed as early as 1789 and included in the Jacobin Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen of 1793. He sought to revise a chronology, common in much human rights scholarship, that tended to locate the origins of social rights in the twentieth century. Steven L. B. Jensen came to this project having written a book on the history of human rights after 1945 that emphasised the important role played by a group of countries from the Global South. During the 2010s, international scholarship on the evolution of post-war human rights was rapidly expanding, but the history of economic and social rights remained a blind spot. With his professional background also in working with health and human rights, Jensen saw clearly that this was a major omission that needed to be remedied for human rights historiography to fully mature. At the time of the Warwick workshop, he was embarking on a research

ix



x Acknowledgements

project on the history of social and economic rights funded by the Independent Danish Research Council.

We would like to thank the many individuals and institutions that have supported and participated in the project. Lynn Hunt and Samuel Moyn lent their support in its application phase. At the University of Warwick, Claudia Stein, Mark Philp, Giorgio Riello and James Harrison provided generous advice on the grant application and the network in its early phases. Claudia Stein was deeply involved in the application process and many of the meetings.

We would also like to extend special thanks to those participants and contributors who hosted network meetings: Nicolas Delalande and Paul-André Rosental (Sciences Po, Paris); Fabian Klose (Leibniz Institute of European History, Mainz); Samuel Moyn (Harvard Law School); Dieter Gosewinkel (Berlin Social Science Centre); and Mark Goodale (University of Lausanne). Charles Walton would like to thank the Institute for Advanced Studies (Paris) and especially the director and the assistant director, Gretty Mirdal and Simon Luck, respectively, for hosting the organisational meeting while Walton was a fellow there in 2015–16.

Thanks are also due to the University of Warwick's History Department, Humanities Research Centre, Institute for Advanced Study, and Global History and Culture Centre for providing early funding for this project and for making its palazzo in Venice available for one of the two publication colloquia. Amy Evans oversaw the administration of network activities from Warwick, and we are grateful for her time and efforts. We are especially thankful for the vital support provided by the Leverhulme Trust. Their funding has been the backbone which enabled the network's activities. Funding also came from the Danish Research Council – including co-funding for one of the above-mentioned workshops – for which we are also grateful. The Danish Institute for Human Rights has supported our efforts in getting the volume ready for publication.

In addition to the contributors of this volume, we would also like to thank all those who participated at the network meetings: Keith Michael Baker, Radhika Balakrishnan, Michael Barnett, Laura Belmonte, Alexandre Boza, Hannah Calloway, Edward Castleton, Margaret Charleroy, Christoph Conrad, Frederick Cooper, Catherine Cox, Marco Duranti, Eberhard Eichenhofer, Jan Eckel, Gregor Feindt, Alessandro Ferrari, Johanna Folland, Laurence Fontaine, Michèle Grenot, Amy Hinterberger, Stephen Hopgood, Marion Hulverscheidt, Romain Huret, Simon Jackson, Andrew Jones, Alice Kessler-Harris, Jennifer Klein, Martin Lengwiler, Philip Lepenies, Hilary Marland,



Acknowledgements

хi

Daniel Maul, Darrin McMahon, Andrew Mendelsohn, Julia Moses, Sybilla Nikolow, Maguelone Nouvel-Kirschleger, Aoife Nolan, Tonia Novitz, Paul O'Connell, Kevin O'Sullivan, Johannes Paulmann, Elena Serrano, Paul-André Rosental, Andrea Rusnock, Silvia Salvatici, Alessandro Santagata, Dana Simmons, Benjamin Smith, Katharina Stornig, Bertand Taithe, Mirjam Thulin, Cornelius Torp, Sridhar Venkatapuram, Valentine Zuber and Olivier Zunz.

Charles Walton would like to thank those who participated in the network but contributed to a different publication, a special issue of *French History* (December 2019) on social rights: Katie Jarvis, Stéphanie Roza, Mark Philp, Thomas Bouchet and Marie-Emanuelle Chessel. Preliminary ideas for this project were developed in the course of teaching an undergraduate research seminar on the history of human rights at Yale University in 2011–12 and an MA seminar on the topic at the University of Warwick in 2014 and again in 2015. He extends thanks to the many students who thought deeply about social rights and the prospects of writing their long history.

Steven L. B. Jensen would like to thank David Petrasek, Mark Heywood, Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo, José Pedro Monteiro as well as Christian Olaf Christiansen and all the contributors to our co-edited *Histories of Global Inequality: New Perspectives* book from 2019, which also emanated from the 2015 Warwick workshop, for stimulating conversations and collaborations. He would like to thank Catherine O'Regan and the Bonavero Institute of Human Rights at the University of Oxford for hosting him as a visiting researcher in the autumn of 2019. He would like to thank Hans-Otto Sano, former research director at the Danish Institute for Human Rights, for valuable funding support in the preparation of this volume, and Karen Lønne Christensen for help with the index.

Last, but by no means least, we would like to thank Executive Publisher Michael Watson from Cambridge University Press, the CUP Human Rights History series editors Stefan-Ludwig Hoffmann and Samuel Moyn as well as the two anonymous peer reviewers for committing to this book project and helping us advance the volume to the publication stage. We are grateful to Heidi Betts for her splendid editing work that helped us get the volume ready for final submission. Finally, we are grateful to Philip Alston, former UN special rapporteur on extreme poverty and human rights, for having committed to writing the epilogue, which puts social rights and the histories of them advanced in this volume into a larger perspective.

