

THE ANCIENT AESTHETICS OF DECEPTION

The concept of *mimēsis* has dominated reflection on the nature and role of representation in Greek literature. Jonas Grethlein, in his ambitious new book, takes this reflection a step further. He argues that, beyond *mimēsis*, there was an important but unacknowledged strand of reflection focused instead on the nuanced idea of *apatē* (often translated into English as 'deceit'), oscillating between notions of 'deception' and 'aesthetic illusion'. Many authors from Gorgias and Plato to Philo, Plutarch and Clement of Alexandria used this key concept to entwine aesthetics with ethics. In creatively exploring the various reconfigurations of *apatē*, and placing these in their sociohistorical contexts, the book offers a bold new history of ancient aesthetics. It also explores the present significance of the aesthetics of deception, unlocking the potential of ancient reflection for current debates on the ethical dimension of representation. It will appeal to scholars in classics and literary theory alike.

JONAS GRETHLEIN is Professor of Greek in the Seminar für Klassische Philologie at Ruprecht-Karls-Universität Heidelberg. His publications include *The Greeks and their Past: Poetry, Oratory and History in the Fifth Century* BCE (Cambridge, 2010), *Experience and Teleology in Ancient Historiography: Futures Past from Herodotus to Augustine* (Cambridge, 2013) and *Aesthetic Experiences and Classical Antiquity: The Significance of Form in Narratives and Pictures* (Cambridge, 2017).



THE ANCIENT AESTHETICS OF DECEPTION

The Ethics of Enchantment from Gorgias to Heliodorus

JONAS GRETHLEIN

Ruprecht-Karls-Universität Heidelberg, Germany





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316518816 DOI: 10.1017/9781009003513

© Cambridge University Press 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Books Limited, Padstow Cornwall A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-316-51881-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

| List | of Figures | <i>page</i> vi |
|--|---|-------------------|
| Ackr | nowledgements | vii |
| I | Gorgias and the Justice of Tragic Apatē | I |
| 2 | The Circulation and Significance of Apatē in the Classical Era | 33 |
| 3 | The Dramatic Entanglement of Aesthetic Illusion with Deceit in Sophocles' <i>Electra</i> | 51 |
| 4 | Immersion and Corruption in Plato's Republic | 75 |
| 5 | The Void of Hellenistic Criticism | 107 |
| 6 | The Appeal and Challenge of <i>Apatē</i> in Imperial Criticism: Plutarch's <i>De audiendis poetis</i> | 137 |
| 7 | Lucian and the Spell of Philosophy | 166 |
| 8 | How to Read Ekphrasis: The Tabula Cebetis | 199 |
| 9 | Christian Polemics against Idolatry: Clement of Alexandria's <i>Protrepticus</i> | 213 |
| 10 | The Aesthetics of Deception Reconfigured in Heliodorus' <i>Ethiopica</i> | 232 |
| ΙΙ | From Deepfake to Psychotherapy: The Aesthetics of Deception Today | 257 |
| Bibliography Index Locorum General Index | | 283 308 316 |



List of Figures

| | Sverdlov Square, Moscow, 5 May 1920. Photograph taken | | |
|---|--|------|-----|
| | by Grigori Goldstein. | page | 269 |
| 2 | Anamorphotic portrait of Charles I. The skull indicates | | |
| | where a cylindrical image should be placed to view the image | | |
| | correctly. From E. von Philippovich (1966) | | |
| | Kuriositäten/Antiquitäten, Braunschweig. | | 271 |
| 3 | Anamorphotic image from What Will Come (has already come) |), | |
| | William Kentridge (2007). Courtesy of William Kentridge, | | |
| | Marian Goodman Gallery, New York and Paris, Goodman | | |
| | Gallery, Johannesburg and Annandale Galleries, Sydney. | | 273 |

1 Vladimir Lenin speaking at an Assembly of Red Army troops,



Acknowledgements

Tragedy is 'a deception, in which the one who deceives is more just than the one who does not deceive, and the one who is deceived is more intelligent than the one who is not deceived'. This assertion of Gorgias fr. 23 DK did not fail to puzzle me when I first encountered it as an undergraduate, and it has become an obsession of mine since then. It took me a long time to get the feeling that I understood it, and there are still moments when its meaning seems to evade me. For several years, I have been thinking about the entwinement of aesthetics and ethics, trying to explore its significance in antiquity and today. During this time, I have incurred many debts, and the impossibility of listing all my intellectual benefactors should not prevent me from thanking at least some of those who patiently listened to my half-baked ideas and generously enlightened me with their comments and suggestions: Joshua Billings, Eva von Contzen, Casper de Jonge, Monika Fludernik, Bill Furley, Renaud Gagné, Simon Goldhill, Stephen Halliwell, Henry Keazor, Matthias Konradt, Thomas Kuhn-Treichel, Winfried Löhr, Natasha Peponi, Jim Porter, Martin Revermann, Kurt Sier, Michael Squire, Tim Whitmarsh and Katrin Winter.

For reading parts of the book at various stages, I wish to thank Benjamin Allgaier, Felix Budelmann, Chrysanthos Chrysanthou, Luuk Huitink, Richard Hunter, Larry Kim, Benedek Kruchió, Peter von Möllendorff, John Morgan, Ineke Sluiter and Athanassios Vergados. The ERC starting grant 'Experience and Teleology' (AncNar, n. 312321) reduced my teaching load from 2013 until 2018 and permitted me to write the first chapters of the book. In 2018/19, a fellowship at the Marsilius-Kolleg, the Heidelberg institute for advanced studies, brought me into contact with scholars of various disciplines. In particular, I learnt much about neurophysiology from Katja Bertsch and Falk Kiefer.

At Heidelberg University, Isabel Caspar, Sophie Neuhierl, Christina Schulz, Christian Stülpnagel and Abigail Worgul helped me prepare the



viii

Acknowledgements

manuscript. Heartfelt thanks go to Sabine Hug, who has been making sure with great diligence for more than a decade that my academic life with its various duties runs as smoothly as it can. It has again been a pleasure and privilege to work with Michael Sharp, who took an interest in this book from its inception and has unfailingly supported it at all of its stages. I am grateful to the two referees for their engaged and engaging reports; their comments and suggestions showed me where to clarify and round up the argument.

I have used, with modifications, the following translations: Babbitt, F. C. (1927) Plutarchus. Moralia. I. Cambridge, MA; Butterworth, G. W. (1919) Clement of Alexandria. The Exhortation to the Greeks, The Rich Man's Salvation and the Fragment of an Address Entitled To the Newly Baptized. Cambridge, MA; Colson, F. H. and Whitaker, G. H. (1929) Philo. I—X. Cambridge MA; Fitzgerald, J. T. and White, L. M. (1983) The Tabula of Cebes. Chico; Grube, G. M. A. (1992) Plato. The Republic, rev. C. D. C. Reeve. Indianapolis; Harmon, A. M. (1913) Lucian. I—VIII. Cambridge, MA; Laks, A. and Most, G. W. (2016) Early Greek Philosophy. Cambridge, MA; March, J. (2001) Sophocles. Electra. Warminster; Morgan, J. R. (1989) 'Heliodorus. An Ethiopian story', in Collected Ancient Greek Novels, ed. B. P. Reardon. Oakland: 407–686; Sommerstein, A. (1996) Aristophanes. Frogs. Warminster; and Usher, S. (1974/1985) Dionysius of Halicarnassus. The Critical Essays. I—II. Cambridge, MA.

The abbreviations of journals follow *L'Année philologique*, those of ancient authors the *Oxford Classical Dictionary*. I have used Latinized forms for Greek names, except where familiarity dictates otherwise.

The last few years have not been an easy time. I am most thankful that Beate Hannig-Grethlein, Christian Grethlein, Hannah Grethlein, Tobias Janowitz, Nikolaus Graf von Esterházy and Andreas Hierholzer were there for me when it was difficult for me to concentrate on work. The most significant presence in my life is my daughters Antonia and Klara, both full of life, intense in every regard, loud and tender, serious and playful, taking and giving without measure. It is to them that I lovingly dedicate this book.