

THE COGNITIVE SCIENCE OF BELIEF

Beliefs play a central role in our lives. They lie at the heart of what makes us human, they shape the organization and functioning of our minds, they define the boundaries of our culture, and they guide our motivation and behavior. Given their central importance, researchers across a number of disciplines have studied beliefs, leading to results and literatures that do not always interact. *The Cognitive Science of Belief* aims to integrate these disconnected lines of research to start a broader dialogue on the nature, role, and consequences of beliefs. It tackles timeless questions, as well as applications of beliefs that speak to current social issues. This multidisciplinary approach to beliefs will benefit graduate students and researchers in cognitive science, psychology, philosophy, political science, economics, and religious studies.

Julien Musolino holds a dual appointment in the psychology department at Rutgers University and at the Rutgers Center for Cognitive Science. He is a cognitive scientist, public speaker, award-winning teacher, and author. He has appeared on national television, participated in public debates, and is a frequent guest on radio and podcast programs.

Joseph Sommer is a postdoctoral associate at the Rutgers Center for Cognitive Science. His research takes an interdisciplinary approach to understanding the cognitive mechanisms underlying belief formation and belief revision.

Pernille Hemmer is Associate Professor at Rutgers University. She is affiliated with the Rutgers Center for Cognitive Science and the Institute for Health, Health Care Policy, and Aging Research. Her research has been funded by the National Science Foundation (NSF) since 2015, including the prestigious NSF CAREER award.

THE COGNITIVE SCIENCE OF BELIEF

A Multidisciplinary Approach

EDITED BY

JULIEN MUSOLINO

Rutgers University, New Jersey

JOSEPH SOMMER

Rutgers University, New Jersey

PERNILLE HEMMER

Rutgers University, New Jersey



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-316-51864-9 — The Cognitive Science of Belief: A Multidisciplinary Approach
Edited by Julien Musolino, Joseph Sommer, Pernille Hemmer
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316518649

DOI: 10.1017/9781009001021

© Cambridge University Press & Assessment 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-316-51864-9 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-009-00985-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures and Tables</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>List of Contributors</i>	ix
1 Introduction: Toward A Cognitive Science of Belief <i>Joseph Sommer, Julien Musolino, and Pernille Hemmer</i>	1
PART I: UNDERSTANDING BELIEF	29
PHILOSOPHICAL AND LINGUISTIC APPROACHES TO BELIEFS	31
2 The Cognitive Science of ‘Belief’ (The Word) <i>Ray Jackendoff</i>	33
3 The Science of Belief: A Progress Report <i>Nicolas Porot and Eric Mandelbaum</i>	55
4 The Role of Context in Belief Evaluation: Costs and Benefits of Irrational Beliefs <i>Elly Vintiadis and Lisa Bortolotti</i>	92
MODELS OF OPTIMAL BELIEFS	111
5 How and Why Does Schematic Knowledge Affect Memory? <i>Qiong Zhang</i>	113
6 Probability, Belief, and the Richness of Cognition <i>Steve Piantadosi</i>	135
IMPLICIT VS EXPLICIT BELIEFS	151
7 Intuitive and Reflective Beliefs <i>Dan Sperber</i>	153
8 Intuitive and Reflective Beliefs in a Modern World <i>Bastien Trémolière and Florence Lespiau</i>	172

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
	EVOLUTIONARY PSYCHOLOGY OF BELIEFS	191
9	Do Cultural Misbeliefs Cause Costly Behavior? <i>Hugo Mercier and Sacha Altay</i>	193
10	Cultural Evolutionary Psychology of Belief <i>Theiss Bendixen and Benjamin Grant Purzycki</i>	209
	PART II: DOMAINS OF BELIEFS	231
	RELIGION AND MORALITY	233
11	Religious Beliefs <i>Pascal Boyer</i>	235
12	Essentialist Views of Criminal Behavior Predict Increased Punitiveness <i>Justin W. Martin, Sophie Charles, and Larisa Heiphetz</i>	254
	ECONOMICS AND POLITICS	277
13	Political Belief Formation: Individual Differences and Situational Factors <i>Lala Muradova and Kevin Arceneaux</i>	279
14	Americans' Lack of Political Beliefs and the Consequences for Democracy <i>Yalidy Matos and Katherine McCabe</i>	298
15	Thoughts and Players: An Introduction to Old and New Economic Perspectives on Beliefs <i>Andras Molnar and George Loewenstein</i>	321
	SCIENCE AND RACE	351
16	How Intuitive Beliefs Inoculate Us against Scientific Ones <i>Andrew Shtulman</i>	353
17	COVID-19: Conspiracies and Collateral Damage vs Constructive Critique <i>Stephan Lewandowsky, Konstantinos Armaos, Hendrik Bruns, Philipp Schmid, Dawn Liu Holford, Ulrike Hahn, Ahmed Al-Rawi, Sunita Sah, John Cook, Marie Juanchich, and James Ladyman</i>	374
18	Believing in Race vs Knowing Ourselves <i>Guy P. Harrison</i>	398

	<i>Contents</i>	vii
	PART III: VARIATION IN BELIEFS	417
	PATHOLOGICAL BELIEFS	419
19	Delusions <i>Philip R. Corlett</i>	421
20	Delusions and Beliefs as a Symptom of Illness <i>Eisuke Sakakibara</i>	440
	INDIVIDUAL DIFFERENCES IN BELIEFS	463
21	The Elusive Search for Individual Differences in Myside Thinking <i>Keith E. Stanovich and Maggie E. Toplak</i>	465
22	Modeling Individual Differences in Beliefs and Opinions Using Thurstonian Models <i>Michael D. Lee and Michelle Y. Ke</i>	488
	ENVIRONMENTAL EFFECTS ON BELIEFS	513
23	Belief in Human Rights: An Opportunity for Cross-Cultural Cognitive Science <i>Jordan Kiper</i>	515
24	The Belief–Action Gap in Environmental Psychology: How Wide? How Irrational? <i>Aurore Grandin, Mélusine Boon-Falleur, and Coralie Chevallier</i>	536
	TOWARD BETTER BELIEFS	555
25	Training Can Improve Decision Making <i>Irene Scopelliti</i>	557
26	Building Better Beliefs through Actively Open-Minded Thinking <i>Emlen Metz</i>	574
	<i>Index</i>	592

Figures and Tables

Figures

3.1	Mentalistic titles only surpassed non-mentalistic titles in number in three leading comparative psychology journals starting in the early 2000s. Reproduced from Whissel et al., 2013	<i>page 65</i>
6.1	Participant drawings of beliefs about the placement of internal organs heart, stomach, intestines, lungs, and kidneys	139
6.2	People's judgments (y-axis) of which other numbers are in the set (x-axis) for each example set shown (facets). For example, when told that 10, 80 are in the set, people naturally generalize to other multiples of ten	141
9.1	Non-exhaustive map of the variety of anti-vaccine misbeliefs throughout the world	200
12.1	Correlation between essentialism and punitiveness, Study 1	260
12.2	Mediation model tested in Study 2	263
17.1	Conceptual overview of the rhetorical landscape concerning COVID-19	383
22.1	The classic Thurstonian model and its extensions to subgroups and polarization	495
22.2	Results from the classic Thurstonian model, its extension to allow subgroups, and its extension to include polarization	497
24.1	The belief–action gap in environmental psychology	545

Tables

13.1	Sampling of the individual differences in reflective political reasoning	<i>page 283</i>
20.1	Various themes of delusions	442

Contributors

- Julien Musolino** Department of Psychology and Rutgers University
Center for Cognitive Science, Rutgers University,
New Brunswick
- Joseph Sommer** Department of Psychology, Rutgers University,
New Brunswick
- Pernille Hemmer** Department of Psychology and Rutgers University
Center for Cognitive Science Rutgers University,
New Brunswick
- Ahmed Al-Rawi** School of Communication, Simon Fraser University
- Sacha Altay** Jean Nicod Institute, Department of Cognitive
Studies, ENS, EHESS, PSL University, CNRS
- Kevin Arceneaux** The Center for Political Research, SciencesPo, Paris
- Konstantinos
Armaos** Faculty of Business and Economics, University of
Lausanne
- Theiss Bendixen** Department of the Study of Religion, Aarhus
University, DK
- Mélusine
Boon-Falleur** Jean Nicod Institute, Department of Cognitive
Studies, ENS, PSL University, CNRS
- Lisa Bortolotti** Philosophy Department and Institute for Mental
Health, University of Birmingham
- Pascal Boyer** Department of Anthropology, Washington
University in St. Louis
- Hendrik Bruns** European Commission Joint Research Centre (JRC)
- Sophie Charles** Department of Psychology, Columbia University
- Coralie Chevallier** Laboratory of Cognitive Neuroscience and
Computational Studies, Department of Cognitive
Studies, ENS, PSL University
- John Cook** Communications & Media Studies, University
Monash

- Philip R. Corlett** Department of Psychiatry, Yale University
Aurore Grandin Laboratory of Cognitive Neuroscience and Computational Studies, Department of Cognitive Studies, ENS, PSL University
- Ulrike Hahn** Department of Psychological Sciences, Birkbeck College, University of London
- Guy P. Harrison** Author
Larisa Heiphetz Department of Psychology, Columbia University
Dawn Liu Department of Psychology, University of Essex
Holford
- Ray Jackendoff** Center for Cognitive Studies, Tufts University and MIT
- Marie Juanchich** Department of Psychology, University of Essex
Michelle Y. Ke Department of Cognitive Sciences, University of California, Irvine
- Jordan Kiper** Department of Anthropology, The University of Alabama at Birmingham
- James Ladyman** Department of Philosophy, University of Bristol
Michael D. Lee Department of Cognitive Sciences, University of California, Irvine
- Florence Lespiau** APSY-V, University of Nîmes, Nîmes, France
Stephan School of Psychological Science, University of Bristol
Lewandowsky
- George** Social and Decision Sciences, Carnegie Mellon University
Loewenstein
- Eric Mandelbaum** Philosophy, Baruch College and the Graduate Center, CUNY
- Justin W. Martin** Department of Psychology and Neuroscience, Boston College
- Yalidy Matos** Political Science and Latino and Caribbean Studies, Rutgers University, New Brunswick
- Katherine** Political Science, Rutgers University, New Brunswick
McCabe
- Hugo Mercier** Jean Nicod Institute, Department of Cognitive Studies, ENS, EHESS, PSL University, CNRS
- Emlen Metz** Department of Physics, University of California, Berkeley
- Andras Molnar** Center for Decision Research, University of Chicago Booth School of Business

List of Contributors

xi

- Lala Muradova** Department of Political and Social Sciences,
 Univesitat Pompeu Fabra (Barcelona), Spain
- Steve Piantadosi** Psychology, University of California, Berkeley
- Nicolas Porot** Africa Institute for Research in Economics and
 Social Sciences
- Benjamin Grant** Department of the Study of Religion, Aarhus
Purzycki University, DK
- Sunita Sah** SC Johnson Graduate School of Management,
 College of Business, Cornell University
- Eisuke Sakakibara** Department of Neuropsychiatry, The University
 of Tokyo
- Irene Scopelliti** Bayes Business School (formerly Cass), City
 University of London
- Philipp Schmid** Media and Communication Science, University of
 Erfurt
- Andrew Shtulman** Department of Psychology, Occidental College
- Dan Sperber** Institut Jean Nicod, Département d'études
 cognitives, ENS, EHESS, Université PSL, CNRS
- Keith E.** Department of Applied Psychology and Human
Stanovich Development, University of Toronto
- Maggie E. Toplak** Department of Psychology, York University
- Bastien** APSY-V, University of Nîmes, Nîmes, France
- Trémolière**
- Elly Vintiadis** Department of History, Philosophy and the Ancient
 World, Deree – The American College of Greece
- Qiong Zhang** Department of Psychology and Rutgers University
 Center for Cognitive Science, Rutgers University,
 New Brunswick