CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51812-0 — Gerrymandering the States
Alex Keena , Michael Latner , Anthony J. McGann McGann , Charles Anthony Smith
Frontmatter
More Information

Gerrymandering the States

State legislatures are tasked with drawing state and federal districts and administering election law, among many other responsibilities. Yet state legislatures are themselves gerrymandered. This book examines how, why, and with what consequences, drawing on an original dataset of ninety-five state legislative maps from before and after 2011 redistricting. Identifying the institutional, political, and geographic determinants of gerrymandering, the authors find that Republican gerrymandering increased dramatically after the 2011 redistricting and bias was most extreme in states with racial segregation where Republicans drew the maps. This bias has had long-term consequences. For instance, states with the most extreme Republican gerrymandering were more likely to pass laws that restricted voting rights and undermined public health, and they were less likely to respond to COVID-19. The authors examine the implications for American democracy and for the balance of power between federal and state governments; they also offer empirically grounded recommendations for reform.

Alex Keena is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Virginia Commonwealth University.

Michael Latner is Professor of Political Science at Cal Poly San Luis Obispo, and Senior Fellow at the Union of Concerned Scientists' Center for Science and Democracy in Washington, DC.

Anthony J. McGann is Professor of Government and Public Policy at the University of Strathclyde, Glasgow.

Charles Anthony Smith is Professor in Political Science and Law at the University of California, Irvine.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51812-0 — Gerrymandering the States
Alex Keena , Michael Latner , Anthony J. McGann McGann , Charles Anthony Smith
Frontmatter
More Information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51812-0 — Gerrymandering the States
Alex Keena , Michael Latner , Anthony J. McGann McGann , Charles Anthony Smith
Frontmatter
More Information

Gerrymandering the States

Partisanship, Race, and the Transformation of American Federalism

ALEX KEENA
Virginia Commonwealth University

MICHAEL LATNER
California Polytechnic State University

ANTHONY J. MCGANN
University of Strathclyde

CHARLES ANTHONY SMITH
University of California, Irvine

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316518120
DOI: 10.1017/9781108995849

© James Alexander Keena, Michael Steven Latner, Anthony J. McGann and Charles Anthony Smith 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-316-51812-0 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-108-99545-0 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51812-0 — Gerrymandering the States
Alex Keena , Michael Latner , Anthony J. McGann McGann , Charles Anthony Smith
Frontmatter
More Information

Contents

List of Figures *page* ix
List of Tables xi
Acknowledgments xiii

1 Redistricting Wars in the US States 1
1.1 Opening the Redistricting "Blackbox" 2
1.2 The "Great Gerrymander of 2012" 3
1.3 A Study of State Legislative Redistricting 8
1.4 Objectives of the Book 9
1.5 Key Findings 11
1.6 The Plan of the Book 12

2 What Happened in 2011? The Other "Great Gerrymander" 14
2.1 What Is "Gerrymandering"? 16
2.2 Measuring Partisan Gerrymandering 20
2.3 How We Collected Our Data 43
2.4 Findings 45
2.5 Conclusion 48

3 When Politicians Draw the Maps 50
3.1 How the States Delegate Redistricting Authority 52
3.2 Who Actually Drew the Maps? 56
3.3 Does Institutional Control Matter? 58
3.4 How Politics Shapes Redistricting Outcomes 59
3.5 How Politicians Draw Plans When One Party Has Control 61
3.6 Motive, Opportunity, and Bias 65
3.7 How Politicians Draw Plans When Two Parties Share Power 67

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51812-0 — Gerrymandering the States
Alex Keena , Michael Latner , Anthony J. McGann McGann , Charles Anthony Smith
Frontmatter
More Information

3.8 Bipartisan Redistricting, Competition, and Responsiveness 71
3.9 How the Status Quo Shapes Redistricting Outcomes 73
3.10 Conclusion 76

4 How Political Geography Affects Bias 79
4.1 Is Districting Bias "Unintentional"? 80
4.2 Geography Cannot *Explain Away* Districting Bias 82
4.3 Districting Is a Political Choice, but Geography Constrains Outcomes 86
4.4 What District Shapes Can Explain about Gerrymandering 89
4.5 The Trade-Off Between Bias and Compactness 92
4.6 Conclusion 94

5 Racial Geography, the Voting Rights Act, and Bias 96
5.1 The Voting Rights Act and Majority-Minority Districting 97
5.2 Does Minority Districting Cause Republican Bias? 100
5.3 The Decline of Multimember Districts 110
5.4 Conclusion 115

6 The Policy and Social Consequences of State Legislative Gerrymandering 117
6.1 What Did Voters Want in 2010? 118
6.2 Partisan Bias and Polarization of the Cost of Voting 119
6.3 Partisan Bias and Health Outcomes 123
6.4 State Response to the COVID-19 Pandemic 129
6.5 Conclusion 133

7 The Democratic Harms of Gerrymandering 135
7.1 Rolling Back the Voting Rights Revolution 135
7.2 The Harm of Gerrymandering at the State Level 138
7.3 Who Is Harmed? The Entire People 142
7.4 Gerrymandering and the Crisis of Democracy 145

8 When the Courts Redistrict 148
8.1 Racial Gerrymandering and the Federal Courts 149
8.2 State Courts and Incrementalism in Redistricting 153
8.3 When State Courts Redistrict as Contingency Authorities 158
8.4 Conclusion 161

9 How to Design Effective Anti-gerrymandering Reforms 163
9.1 Redistricting Reforms: Rules vs. Processes 166
9.2 Do Redistricting Criteria Work? 168
9.3 Procedural Reforms: The Promise of Citizen Commissions 175
9.4 Conclusion 183

Conclusion 185
Evaluating Reforms in Virginia 188

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51812-0 — Gerrymandering the States
Alex Keena , Michael Latner , Anthony J. McGann McGann , Charles Anthony Smith
Frontmatter
More Information

Appendix 191
A.1 State House Symmetry 2012 191
A.2 State House Symmetry 2016 192
A.3 State Senate Symmetry 2012–14 194
A.4 State Senate Symmetry 2014–16 195
A.5 State House Responsiveness 2012 (see A.1 for details) 197
A.6 State House Responsiveness 2016 (see A.2 for details) 198
A.7 State Senate Responsiveness 2012–14 (see A.3 for details) 199
A.8 State Senate Responsiveness 2014–16 (see A.4 for details) 200
A.9 State House Symmetry, Remedial Maps 202
A.10 State Senate Symmetry, Remedial Maps 202
A.11 State House Responsiveness, Remedial Maps 202
A.12 State Senate Responsiveness, Remedial Maps 202
A.13 State House Symmetry 2008 202
A.14 State Senate Symmetry 2008–10 204
A.15 State House Responsiveness 2008 (see A.13 for details) 205
A.16 State Senate Responsiveness 2008 (see A.14 for details) 206
References 209
Index 227

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51812-0 — Gerrymandering the States
Alex Keena , Michael Latner , Anthony J. McGann McGann , Charles Anthony Smith
Frontmatter
More Information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51812-0 — Gerrymandering the States
Alex Keena , Michael Latner , Anthony J. McGann McGann , Charles Anthony Smith
Frontmatter
More Information

Figures

2.1 How gerrymandering is achieved through district shapes *page* 18
2.2 A symmetric distribution of districts 22
2.3 A symmetric distribution of districts where Party A is dominant 23
2.4 Symmetric distribution of districts with very high and very low responsiveness 24
2.5 Distribution of districts that produce result that is proportional, as well as symmetric 25
2.6 An asymmetric, biased distribution of districts 26
2.7 A very modestly asymmetric distribution of districts 26
2.8 Distribution of districts in the US House of Representative for Pennsylvania 2012 27
2.9 Calculating partisan symmetry from seats–votes function 29
2.10 Calculating simple symmetry measure from histogram 32
2.11 How efficiency gap applied to Maryland US House districts 2018 35
2.12 How efficiency gap finds bias in three completely unbiased districting plans 36
2.13 Distribution of symmetry scores, before and after 2011 redistricting 46
3.1 Partisan control and change in partisan symmetry after redistricting 75
4.1 Geography helps Republicans draw bias 90
4.2 How Democratic clustering impacts bias and compactness 93
5.1 Black, Latinx populations, and bias 102
5.2 Hypothetical distribution of Black and white voters 104

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51812-0 — Gerrymandering the States
Alex Keena , Michael Latner , Anthony J. McGann McGann , Charles Anthony Smith
Frontmatter
More Information

5.3	Marginal effects of racial segregation on districting bias	109
5.4	How the average district magnitude (*M*) affects the potential for redistricting bias	112
6.1	Partisan symmetry and change in cost of voting 2008–16	121
6.2	Republican gerrymandering and public health policy	125
6.3	Republican gerrymandering and infant mortality	127
6.4	Republican gerrymandering and health response to COVID-19	130
6.5	Republican gerrymandering and ballot access during COVID-19 pandemic	132
9.1(A)	Bias when courts and commissions redistrict	180
9.1(B)	Responsiveness when courts and commissions redistrict	181

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51812-0 — Gerrymandering the States
Alex Keena , Michael Latner , Anthony J. McGann McGann , Charles Anthony Smith
Frontmatter
More Information

Tables

2.1 2011 state legislative redistricting plans with extreme partisan bias (+/–10%) *page* 47
3.1 State legislative districting authorities (2011 cycle) 53
3.2 Who drew the plans? How redistricting institutions shaped outcomes 58
3.3 Who actually drew the maps? 60
3.4 Motive, opportunity, and partisan bias 67
3.5 Mean responsiveness in state legislative plans adopted after 2011 72
4.1 Predicting the effects of political geography on bias after redistricting 89
5.1 The dive "dimensions" of segregation, according to Massey and Denton (1988) 104
5.2 Predicting asymmetry in newly enacted plans 113
8.1 When courts redressed racial gerrymandering 152
8.2 Court-mandated redistricting in Alaska and Florida 157
8.3 When courts controlled redistricting 159
9.1 Citizen commissions, state legislative redistricting, 2011 178

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51812-0 — Gerrymandering the States
Alex Keena , Michael Latner , Anthony J. McGann McGann , Charles Anthony Smith
Frontmatter
More Information

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51812-0 — Gerrymandering the States
Alex Keena , Michael Latner , Anthony J. McGann McGann , Charles Anthony Smith
Frontmatter
More Information

Acknowledgments

The authors are grateful to many people and organizations for input and advice, not only for this project but also for our earlier book on gerrymandering. We all owe an enormous debt to Rein Taagepera for shaping how each of us thinks about politics. He has had a profound influence on each of us and we are grateful for the opportunity to have learned from him. We also are thankful to Bernie Grofman for his insight and guidance, on redistricting and many other topics and problems. We are fortunate to have had terrific discussants and co-panelists at many conferences, including the Midwest Political Science Association, American Political Science Association, and Southern Political Science Association, among others. We are grateful for the advice and support of Jack Santucci and for the data and research projects of Carl Klarner, Justin Levitt, Stephen Wolf, and others whose work we rely on.

The team at Cambridge University Press and the anonymous reviewers have improved the manuscript in both large and small ways. We concluded that the reviews were likely the most constructive any of us had ever seen, and we are very thankful for the careful, thoughtful, and thorough approach taken by the anonymous reviewers. We are also grateful to Common Cause for the input we received at their 2016 redistricting conference and to Emmett Bondurant, who shared terrific insights and fascinating war stories.

We also want to make individual acknowledgments to others who helped us.

Alex Keena: Thank you to my wife, Jessie, and daughters, Marlowe and Jolene, for their never-ending support and patience; my grandmother, Janet Keena; Brad, Heather, Larry, Shirley, and Renee (my parents);

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51812-0 — Gerrymandering the States
Alex Keena , Michael Latner , Anthony J. McGann McGann , Charles Anthony Smith
Frontmatter
More Information

Mike, Tony, and Tony; my research assistants, Taieba Kohistany, Capriana Phillips, and Adam Santiago. Special thanks are owed to Knight-Finley; Dierdre Condit, Judy Twigg, and Ravi Perry for helpful comments; to the discussants and co-panelists at SPSA 2019; to John Curiel and Tyler Steelman; to Elliot Fullmer, Hank Chambers, Nicholas Goedert, Rebecca Green, Michael D. Gilbert, Deborah Hellman, and A. E. Dick Howard; to Nakeina E. Douglas-Genn, and the Minority Political Leadership Institute at VCU; and to Brian Cannon.

Michael Latner: In addition to this amazing team, I wish to thank Frank, Shirley, and Brian, for early investment; Christina and my kids Violet and Chase, for all the love they bring; my best friend Sean Sanner, for saving my life; Russ Dalton and Pedro Hernandez for countless hours of advice and expertise; and the team at the Union of Concerned Scientists' Center for Science and Democracy, who supported this work through a Kendall Science Fellowship and many lasting friendships.

Anthony J. McGann: I would like to thank Jack Nagle and Rogers Smith for organizing a conference at University of Pennsylvania back in 2008 that turned out to be instrumental in getting this project going. I would like to thank so many people who have provided inspiration and support, including John Nagle, Keith Forsyth, Don Saari, and Bill Batchelder. And, in this uncertain hour, I would particularly like to thank the people who campaign for fair elections at Union of Concerned Scientists, Common Cause, and Fair Districts PA, and many other organizations.

Charles A. Smith: I am grateful to my husband, Julio Rodriguez. His insight, humor, and tenacity have made my life wonderful and have also made my work better. I'm also grateful for his tolerance of the very weird world of the academy! I also owe my coauthors on this and other projects an enormous debt. I am lucky to work with so many amazing scholars.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org