

AFTER SCIENCE AND RELIGION

The popular field of ‘science and religion’ is a lively and well-established area. It is, however, a domain which has long been characterised by certain traits. On one common model it tends towards an adversarial dialectic in which the separate disciplines, now conjoined, are forever locked in a kind of mortal combat. On a second, ‘science and religion’ move towards disentanglement, where ‘science’ does one sort of thing and ‘religion’ another. On a third, the duo are frequently pushed towards some sort of attempted synthesis, wherein their aims either coincide or are brought more closely together. In attempting something fresh and different, this volume tries to move beyond tried and tested tropes. Bringing philosophy and theology to the fore in a way rarely attempted before, the book shows how fruitful new conversations between science and religion can at last move beyond the increasingly tired options of either conflict or dialogue.

PETER HARRISON is Director of the Institute for Advanced Studies in the Humanities at the University of Queensland. He was formerly Andreas Idreos Professor of Science and Religion at the University of Oxford. His books include *The Bible, Protestantism and the Rise of Natural Science* (Cambridge University Press, 1998) and *The Territories of Science and Religion*. In addition, he edited *The Cambridge Companion to Science and Religion* (Cambridge University Press, 2010).

JOHN MILBANK is Emeritus Professor of Theology and Religious Studies at the University of Nottingham, where he is President of the Centre of Theology and Philosophy. His influential publications include *Theology and Social Theory* (1990) and *Radical Orthodoxy* (1999).

Praise for *After Science and Religion*

‘This volume offers a set of historical studies that challenge naïve disciplinary distinctions between science and religion, combined with Anglo-Saxon theological and philosophical speculation. It’s a book that can be expected to engage fans and critics alike of those who – as many in this book do – look back to pre-modern ways of wrestling with some vital issues.’

– *Willem B Drees, Professor of the Philosophy of the Humanities, Tilburg University*

‘The starting point of this excellent volume could sound familiar: all sciences have built in theologies. If that is right, what then should come next in the study of science and religion? Harrison and Milbank have assembled a broad array of answers to that question, united as these are by an approach that might be characterised as *theology-engaged science*. It’s a perspective that interrogates and deconstructs the basic categories of science and religion, telling the stories behind those terms by recounting moments at which the boundaries of each were in flux. This book offers a fresh and promising way of using history to challenge modernity’s disciplinary boundaries by showing that scientific theories are already engaged in metaphysical and theological debates.’

– *John Perry, Senior Lecturer in Theological Ethics, University of St Andrews*

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51792-5 — After Science and Religion
Edited by Peter Harrison , John Milbank
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

AFTER SCIENCE AND RELIGION

Fresh Perspectives from Philosophy and Theology

EDITED BY
PETER HARRISON

University of Queensland

JOHN MILBANK

University of Nottingham

with the assistance of
PAUL TYSON

University of Queensland



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-316-51792-5 — After Science and Religion
 Edited by Peter Harrison, John Milbank
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
 It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
 education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316517925
 DOI: 10.1017/9781009047968

© Cambridge University Press 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Harrison, Peter, 1955- editor. | Milbank, John, editor.

TITLE: After science and religion : fresh perspectives from philosophy and theology / edited by Peter
 Harrison, University of Queensland, John Milbank, University of Nottingham.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA : Cambridge University Press,
 2022. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021044486 (print) | LCCN 2021044487 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316517925
 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009048651 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009047968 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Religion and science.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC BL241 .A49 2022 (print) | LCC BL241 (ebook) | DDC 215-dc23/eng/20211102
 LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021044486>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021044487>

ISBN 978-1-316-51792-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy
 of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication
 and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
 accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	page vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
Introduction: After Science and Religion? <i>Paul Tyson</i>	I
PART I MODERN HISTORIANS ON ‘SCIENCE’ AND ‘RELIGION’	
1 Science and Religion as Historical Traditions <i>Peter Harrison</i>	15
2 The Nineteenth-Century Origins of the Problem: Naturalistic Metaphysics and the Dead Ends of Victorian Theology <i>Bernard Lightman</i>	35
PART II BEYOND ‘SCIENCE AND RELIGION’	
3 Science and Theology: Where the Consonance Really Lies <i>David Bentley Hart</i>	61
4 Religion, Science and Magic: Rewriting the Agenda <i>John Milbank</i>	75
5 Science, Beauty and the Creative Word <i>Janet Soskice</i>	144
6 Questioning the Science and Religion Question <i>Michael Hanby</i>	155

vi	<i>Contents</i>	
7	Truth, Science and Re-enchantment <i>Catherine Pickstock</i>	171
8	Understanding Our Knowing: The Culture of Representation <i>Rowan Williams</i>	201
PART III PHILOSOPHICAL PROBLEMS WITH ‘SCIENCE’ AND ‘RELIGION’		
9	Consciousness, Intention, and Final Causation <i>Simon Oliver</i>	219
10	The Problem of the Problem of Scientism: On Expanding the Scope of Scientific Inquiry <i>D. C. Schindler</i>	232
PART IV BEFORE SCIENCE AND RELIGION		
11	Lessons in the Distant Mirror of Medieval Physics <i>Tom McLeish</i>	259
12	Physics as Spiritual Exercise <i>Pui Him Ip</i>	282
13	Making Art: Meaningful Materials and Methods <i>Spike Bucklow</i>	299
	Conclusion <i>Peter Harrison</i>	316
	<i>References</i>	325
	<i>Index</i>	348

Contributors

SPIKE BUCKLOW is Professor of Material Culture at the Hamilton Kerr Institute, University of Cambridge. Bucklow's research interests fall into two broad categories: visual perception and artists' techniques. Research into visual perception includes work on formal connoisseurship of paintings to the classification of technical imagery. Research into artists' techniques includes theoretical and practical work on pigment recipes. Bucklow has a keen interest in the way in which material practices, science, art, and culturally situated meaning continually interact with each other. Some of his recent books are *The Alchemy of Paint* (2009), *The Riddle of the Image* (2014), and *The Anatomy of Riches* (2018).

MICHAEL HANBY is Associate Professor of Religion and Philosophy of Science, Pontifical John Paul II Institute, Washington, DC. Hanby is author of *No God, No Science?* (2013), which reassesses the relationship between the doctrine of creation, Darwinian evolutionary biology, and science more generally. He is also author of *Augustine and Modernity* (2003), which is simultaneously a re-reading of Augustine's Trinitarian theology and a protest against the contemporary argument for continuity between Augustine and Descartes.

PETER HARRISON is Director of the Institute for Advanced Studies of the Humanities, University of Queensland. An Australian Laureate Fellow who has published extensively in the field of intellectual history, Harrison is a Fellow of the Australian Academy of the Humanities and a corresponding member of the International Academy for the History of Science. His six books include *The Bible, Protestantism, and the Rise of Natural Science* (Cambridge University Press, 1998) and *The Territories of Science and Religion* (Cambridge University Press, 2015), based on his 2011 Gifford Lectures and winner of the Aldersgate Prize.

DAVID BENTLEY HART has most recently been a fellow of the Notre Dame Institute for Advanced Studies. Hart's specialties are philosophical theology, systematics, patristics, classical and continental philosophy, and Asian religion. His most recent work has concerned the genealogy of classical and Christian metaphysics, ontology, the metaphysics of the soul, and the philosophy of mind. Hart is a prolific author of articles and books, the latter including *Theological Territories* (2020), *The Experience of God* (2013), and *The Beauty of the Infinite* (2003).

PUI HIM IP is Tutor and Research Fellow at the Faraday Institute for Science and Religion and Affiliated Lecturer at the Faculty of Divinity, University of Cambridge. His research focuses on philosophical theology and Greek Patristics, currently centred on the works and reception of Origen of Alexandria. His book *Origen of Alexandria and the Emergence of Divine Simplicity before Nicaea* (forthcoming) offers the first genealogy of the doctrine of divine simplicity in early Christian thought. He is currently working on a second book on early Christian natural philosophy in the Origenian tradition. Ip has a MSc in Theoretical Physics.

BERNARD LIGHTMAN is Distinguished Research Professor of Humanities and Science and Technology Studies at York University, Canada. He is a Fellow of the Royal Society of Canada and past president of the History of Science Society. Lightman's research interests include nineteenth-century popular science and Victorian scientific naturalism. Among his most recent publications are the edited collections *Rethinking History, Science, and Religion* (2019), *Science Periodicals in Nineteenth Century Britain* (2020); and *Identity in a Secular World* (2020).

TOM MCLEISH is Professor of Natural Philosophy in the Department of Physics at the University of York. In 2011 he was elected a Fellow of the Royal Society where he has served as Chair of Education. McLeish's research interests are strongly interdisciplinary and include soft matter and biological physics, and issues of theology, ethics, and history of science, especially medieval science. He has published over 200 scientific articles and is regularly involved in science communication in writing and radio. Recent books include *Faith and Wisdom in Science* (2014), *The Poetry and Music of Science* (2019), and *Soft Matter – A Very Short Introduction* (2020). He was the 2021 Boyle Lecturer on Science and Religion.

JOHN MILBANK is President of the Centre of Theology and Philosophy at the University of Nottingham. He is a prolific author and wide-ranging

List of Contributors

ix

thinker who has endeavoured to re-think the social theory, ethics, aesthetics, and politics of secular modernity with a sensitivity to its foundational assumptions, which he argues are problematically theological. He is best known for the classic *Theology and Social Theory* (1990, 2006), and more recent publications include *The Suspended Middle* (2005) and *Beyond Secular Order* (2013).

SIMON OLIVER is the Van Mildert Professor of Divinity at Durham University. Oliver's work centres on Christian theology and metaphysics, particularly the doctrine of creation within the Western history of ideas. He is particularly interested by the transition from a deeply teleological view of the cosmos and the associated doctrine of God up to the fourteenth century, to early modern natural philosophy and the alleged rejection of final causes. This was explored in his *Philosophy, God and Motion* (2005, 2013) and the Stanton Lectures at the University of Cambridge, delivered in 2017, to be developed as his next book entitled *Creation's Ends: Teleology, Ethics and the Natural*. He is the author of *Creation: A Guide for the Perplexed* (2017).

CATHERINE PICKSTOCK is the Norris-Hulse Professor of Divinity at the University of Cambridge. Pickstock is a philosophical theologian concerned with the application of linguistics to theories of religious language, analogy, and liturgy. Her work is critically engaged with postmodern philosophy in relation to the reinterpretation of premodern theology. Her current research centres on a reconsideration of the Platonic tradition in interaction with the biblically based faiths, in particular, the question of theurgy and understandings of the soul. She is well known for her 1997 book *After Writing*.

D. C. SCHINDLER is Professor of Metaphysics and Anthropology at the Pontifical John Paul II Institute, Washington, DC. He is currently working on a multi-volume critique of the modern concept of freedom as the power to choose in light of a metaphysics of freedom based on actuality. Schindler is a translator of French and German and has served as an editor of *Communio: International Catholic Review* since 2002. Among his acclaimed publications are *The Perfection of Freedom* (2012), *Plato's Critique of Impure Reason* (2008), and *Hans Urs von Balthasar and the Dramatic Structure of Truth* (2004).

JANET SOSKICE is Professor of Philosophical Theology, Emerita at the Jesus College, University of Cambridge, and the William K. Warren Distinguished Research Professor of Catholic Theology at Duke

List of Contributors

Divinity School. Her book *Metaphor and Religious Language* (1984) was a pioneering work on models and metaphors in science and religion. She has been involved in four science and religion conferences at the Vatican Observatory and initiated their conference on creation ex nihilo, which resulted in the volume *Creation and the God of Abraham* (2010), a collection which examines the doctrine of creation from nothing in Jewish, Christian, and Muslim thought.

PAUL TYSON is a Senior Research Fellow at the Institute for Advanced Studies in the Humanities at the University of Queensland. Tyson's scholarship works across the sociology of knowledge and philosophical theology with a particular interest in applied theological metaphysics and applied theological epistemology in a contemporary Christian Neoplatonist register. His five books include *Returning to Reality* (2014), *Defragmenting Modernity* (2017), and *Seven Brief Lessons on Magic* (2019).

ROWAN WILLIAMS (Lord Williams of Oystermouth) was the Archbishop of Canterbury from 2002 to 2012, and Master of Magdalene College, University of Cambridge, from 2013 to 2020. In 1990, he was elected a Fellow of the British Academy. Williams is a noted linguist, poet, and translator of poetry, and has a particular interest in Eastern Orthodox theology. Questions concerning the relation of the Church to contemporary secular society, and the distinctive epistemic, metaphysical and pragmatic assumptions of its master knowledge discourse – modern science – are among the many matters to which he has given careful thought. Some of his recent books are *Faith in the Public Square* (2012), *Wrestling with Angels* (2007), and *Grace and Necessity* (2005).

Acknowledgements

The original idea for this volume came from Paul Tyson, who also recruited the participants and assisted with the planning for our meetings and discussions. We are deeply grateful for his formative contributions, without which this collection would not have happened. We received vital financial support from the Templeton World Charity Foundation and the Issachar Fund for which we also are most grateful. Special thanks to Pete Jordan and Andrew Briggs at the TWCF for their assistance and guidance, and to Kurt Berends and his support staff at Issachar. Thanks also to Karl Wiethoff and Jonathan Horton, who provided generous financial support that helped facilitate our gatherings. We were fortunate in being able to convene in Cambridge on two occasions and wish to express our gratitude to Catherine Pickstock and Andrew Davison for hosting us, respectively, at Emmanuel and Corpus Christi Colleges. Also participating in the project, but not represented in this volume, were Knut Alfsvåg, Andrew Davison, William Desmond, Keith Fox, Simone Kotva, Nathan Lyons, Sotiris Mitralaxis, Michael Northcott, Charles Taylor, and David Wilkinson. We are grateful for their thoughtful commentary and critique. While not formally part of the project, John Perry, Michael Burdett, Mike Hamilton, and Jeff Bishop also attended our meetings, providing valuable input and advice. The fourth principal investigator on the TWCF grant, along with Peter Harrison, John Milbank, and Paul Tyson, was Tom McLeish, who from the beginning has been an inspiring and energetic presence, and we owe him a debt of gratitude for his participation. Mention should also be made of the administrative team at the University of Queensland's Institute for Advanced Studies in the Humanities – Narelle Jones, Lisa Gunders, Olivia Formby, and Beck Hurst, who provided their characteristically professional support for the project. Cambridge University Press

kindly allowed us to publish, in revised form, material from Catherine Pickstock's *Aspects of Truth: A New Religious Metaphysics* (2020). Finally, we are most grateful to Katie Idle and the production team at Cambridge University Press, along with the Cambridge readers of the manuscript, with special thanks to Alex Wright for his support and sage advice.