CLIMATE CHANGE AND MARITIME BOUNDARIES

Coastal States exercise sovereignty and sovereign rights in maritime zones, measured from their coasts. The limits to these maritime zones are bound to recede as sea levels rise and coastlines are eroded. Furthermore, ocean acidification and ocean warming are increasingly threatening coastal ecosystems, which States are obligated to protect and manage sustainably. These changes, accelerating as the planet heats, prompt an urgent need to clarify and update the international law of maritime zones. This book explains how bilateral maritime boundaries are established, and how coastal instability and vulnerable ecosystems can affect the delimitation process through bilateral negotiations or judicial settlement. Árnadóttir engages with core concepts within public international law to address emerging issues, such as diminishing territory and changing boundaries. She proposes viable ways of addressing future challenges and sets out how fundamental changes to the marine environment can justify termination or revision of settled maritime boundaries and related agreements.

Snjólaug Árnadóttir is a Lecturer at Reykjavik University and member of the International Law Association Committee on International Law and Sea Level Rise.
Climate Change and Maritime Boundaries

LEGAL CONSEQUENCES OF SEA LEVEL RISE

SNJÓLAUG ÁRNADÓTTIR
Reykjavik University
## Contents

| Acknowledgements                          | page viii |
| Table of Cases                           | x         |
| Table of Treaties and Legislation        | xiv       |
| List of Abbreviations                    | xix       |

### Introduction

1. **Law of the Sea and the Changing Marine Environment**
   1.1 International Law of the Sea: A Historical Overview
   1.2 Delineation and Delimitation of Maritime Entitlements
   1.3 Changes to the Marine Environment
   1.4 Relevance of Environmental Changes for Maritime Limits, Maritime Delimitation and Settled Maritime Boundaries

2. **Unilaterally Declared Maritime Limits**
   2.1 Introduction
   2.2 Maritime Delineation
      2.2.1 Baselines
      2.2.2 Outer Maritime Limits
   2.3 Theory of Ambulatory Baselines
      2.3.1 Ambulatory Baselines
      2.3.2 Provisional Stability of Straight Baselines at Highly Unstable Coastlines
   2.4 Ambulatory Limits in Practice
      2.4.1 Challenges and Judicial Review
      2.4.2 Identifying the Legal Baseline and Derived Limits
      2.4.3 Opposability of Permanently Described Continental Shelf Limits

© in this web service Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org
Contents

2.4.4 Man-Made Changes to Coastal Geography 53

2.5 Proposals to Stabilize Maritime Limits 61
  2.5.1 Feasibility of Freezing Maritime Limits 61
  2.5.2 Freezing of Baselines or Outer Maritime Limits 65
  2.5.3 Changing the Applicable Law to Stabilize Maritime Limits 66
  2.5.4 Extent to Which Existing Rules Can Be Altered through Subsequent Practice 78

2.6 Summary 81

3 Maritime Delimitation and Coastal Instability 83
  3.1 Introduction 85
  3.2 Maritime Delimitation 84
    3.2.1 Delimitation of the Territorial Sea: The Equidistance Method 86
    3.2.2 Delimitation of the Exclusive Economic Zone and the Continental Shelf 88
  3.3 Relevant Circumstances: Coastal Geography 99
    3.3.1 Relevance of Coastal Instability 101
    3.3.2 Evidence of Foreseeable Changes to Coastal Geography 107
  3.4 Achieving an Equitable Solution with Due Regard for Coastal Instability 114
    3.4.1 Selection of Base Points 114
    3.4.2 Adjustment of a Provisional Boundary 116
    3.4.3 The Angle-Bisector Method as a Response to Coastal Instability 119
    3.4.4 Fluctuating Boundaries 123
  3.5 Summary 130

4 Maritime Delimitation and the Marine Environment 132
  4.1 Introduction 132
  4.2 Protection and Management of Areas within National Jurisdiction 135
    4.2.1 Ecosystem Approach to Ocean Governance 137
    4.2.2 Obligations to Protect and Manage Living Resources and the Environment 140
  4.3 Environmental Considerations in the Delimitation Process 143
    4.3.1 Ecosystems and the Sectoral Approach 144
    4.3.2 Relevance of Environmental Circumstances 145
    4.3.3 Identification of Relevant Environmental Circumstances 151
  4.4 Achieving an Equitable Solution with Due Regard for Environmental Circumstances 155
    4.4.1 Fixed Boundaries 155
    4.4.2 Fluctuating Boundaries 159
Contents

4.4.3 Alternative Arrangements 161
4.5 Summary 166

5 Fundamental Change of Circumstances 168
5.1 Introduction 168
5.2 Origin of VCLT Article 62 170
  5.2.1 Rebus Sic Stantibus 171
  5.2.2 Draft Articles 174
5.3 Analysis of VCLT Article 62 191
  5.3.1 A Fundamental Change of Circumstances 192
  5.3.2 Foreseeability 193
  5.3.3 Essential Basis of the Treaty 194
  5.3.4 Radical Transformation of Ongoing Obligations 195
  5.3.5 Treaty Establishing a Boundary 196
  5.3.6 Not a Change Resulting From a Breach of the Party Invoking It 206
  5.3.7 Procedural Requirements 207
5.4 VCLT Article 62 and Maritime Boundaries 208
  5.4.1 Treaties Establishing Non-Territorial Maritime Boundaries or Alternative Arrangements 209
  5.4.2 Treaties Establishing Territorial Maritime Boundaries 215
5.5 Summary 218

Conclusion 220

Bibliography 226
Index 239
Acknowledgements

This book is the culmination of a project spanning the past seven years. It began when I studied coastal instability at the Rhodes Academy of Oceans Law and Policy and enrolled, shortly thereafter, as a doctoral candidate at the University of Edinburgh. I had the good fortune of being supervised by Professor Alan Boyle, and he has been my greatest source of inspiration throughout this journey. I graduated from the University of Edinburgh in 2018 and have since taught public international law, international environmental law, law of the sea and a preparatory course for the Philip C Jessup Moot Competition at the University of Iceland and Reykjavik University. I have been a visiting scholar at the Netherlands Institute for the Law of the Sea and at the University of British Columbia. I am currently a postdoctoral fellow and lecturer at Reykjavik University and a member of the International Law Association Committee on International Law and Sea Level Rise.

I am in constant awe of the ocean. I have lived in close proximity to it my whole life and, every day, I see the surging waves of the Atlantic Ocean from my home office. The idea to write a book about sea level rise actually arose when I lived (as an exchange student) in a cabin at the seafront of the small island Styrso, Sweden, where I often felt that the waves were too imposing. The other thing that piqued my interest was a sentence in a law of the sea textbook indicating that the consequences of sea level rise for maritime boundaries were unknown. This book aims to shed light on some of those consequences.

I am particularly grateful to Professor Alan Boyle for his uniquely thought-provoking input and the wealth of scholarly work and case law he contributed to and which informed my research. I have also enjoyed discussions with other wonderful scholars, and I am deeply grateful to all of them. I would particularly like to mention the following, who gave me insightful comments at various stages and helped me approach the issues from new perspectives. In alphabetical order: Professor Michael Byers, Professor Robin Churchill, Professor Alex Oude Elferink, Professor James Harrison, Judge Tómas Heiðar, Dr Massimo Lando, Professor Bjarni Már Magnússon, Dr Kasey McCall-Smith, Dr Andreas Østhagen, Professor
Acknowledgements

Clive Schofield, Professor Alfred Soons, Professor Davor Vidas and Dr Aron Westholm. I also want to thank all the esteemed members of the ILA Committee on International Law and Sea Level Rise for intriguing discussions.

Many others have supported and inspired me while I have worked on this project. The friends I made in Edinburgh had a profound impact on me and some will have a place in my heart forever more. My family has also been incredibly supportive. My partner (the artist), my mother (the French horn player) and my father (the Director of the Office of the President of Iceland) have diligently read my work and are now well-versed in public international law! Thank you all from the bottom of my heart.
Table of Cases

(in reverse chronological order by jurisdiction)

**INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE**


Questions of the Delimitation of the Continental Shelf between Nicaragua and Colombia beyond 200 Nautical Miles from the Nicaraguan Coast (*Nicaragua v. Colombia*) (Preliminary Objections) [2016] ICJ Rep 1.


Sovereignty over Pedra Branca/Pulau Batu Puteh, Middle Rocks and South Ledge (*Malaysia/Singapore*) (Judgment) [2008] ICJ Rep 12.


Table of cases


Maritime Delimitation and Territorial Questions between Qatar and Bahrain (Qatar v. Bahrain) (Merits) [2001] ICJ Rep 40.


Frontier Dispute (Burkina Faso/Republic of Mali) (Judgment) [1986] ICJ Rep 554.

Continental Shelf (Libyan Arab Jamahiriya/Malta) (Judgment) [1985] ICJ Rep 13.

Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary in the Gulf of Maine Area (Canada/United States) (Judgment) [1984] ICJ Rep 246.

Continental Shelf (Tunisia/Libyan Arab Jamahiriya) (Judgment) [1982] ICJ Rep 18.

Aegean Sea Continental Shelf (Greece v. Turkey) (Jurisdiction) [1978] ICJ Rep 3.


Right of Passage over Indian Territory (Portugal v. India) (Merits) [1960] ICJ Rep 6.

Sovereignty over Certain Frontier Land (Belgium/Netherlands) (Judgment) [1959] ICJ Rep 209.

xii

Table of cases

Asylum (Colombia v. Peru) (Judgment) [1950] ICJ Rep 266.

PERMANENT COURT OF INTERNATIONAL JUSTICE

Case of the Free Zones of Upper Savoy and the District of Gex (Switzerland v. France) (Judgment) (1929) PCIJ Series A No 22.
Nationality Decrees Issued in Tunis and Morocco (French Zone) (Great Britain v. France) (Advisory Opinion) (1923) PCIJ Series C No 2: Speeches made and documents read before the court.

INTERNATIONAL TRIBUNAL FOR THE LAW OF THE SEA

Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Bangladesh and Myanmar in the Bay of Bengal (Bangladesh/Myanmar) (Judgment) [2012] ITLOS, 51 ILM 844.
MOX Plant (Ireland v. United Kingdom) (Provisional Measures) [2001] ITLOS, 41 ILM 405.

ARBITRAL TRIBUNALS

Bay of Bengal Maritime Boundary (Bangladesh v. India) (2014) 167 ILR 1.
The Indus Waters Kishenganga Arbitration (Pakistan v. India) (2013) 150 ILR 311.
Delimitation of the Exclusive Economic Zone and the Continental Shelf (Barbados v. Trinidad and Tobago) (2006) XXVII RIAA 147.
Award in the Arbitration Regarding the Iron Rhine (‘Ijzeren Rijn’) Railway (Kingdom of Belgium/Kingdom of the Netherlands) (2005) XXVII RIAA 35.
Second Stage of the Proceedings between Eritrea and Yemen (Maritime Delimitation) (Eritrea/Yemen) (1999) XXII RIAA 335.
Table of cases

Delimitation of the Maritime Boundary between Guinea and Guinea-Bissau (Guinea/Guinea-Bissau) (1985) XIX RIAA 149.
Anglo-French Continental Shelf (United Kingdom/France) (1977) XVIII RIAA 3.
Trail Smelter Arbitration (United States/Canada) (1941) III RIAA 1905.
Island of Palmas Case (Netherlands/USA) (1928) II RIAA 829.
Bremen v. Prussia (29 June 1925) German Staatsgerichtshof, Annual Digest of Public International Law Cases, 1925–1926, case no 266.

WTO APPELLATE BODY


EUROPEAN COURT OF JUSTICE


NATIONAL COURTS

The State of New Mexico v. The State of Texas (United States Supreme Court 1927) United States Reports, CCLXXV.
Table of Treaties and Legislation

MULTILATERAL TREATIES

(in chronological order by date of adoption)


### Table of treaties and legislation


### Bilateral Treaties (in chronological order by date of conclusion)


Agreement between Norway and Denmark Concerning the Delimitation of the Continental Shelf in the Area between Jan Meyen and Greenland and Concerning the Boundary between the Fishery Zones in the Area (adopted 18 December 1995, entered into force 18 December 1995) 1903 UNTS 171.


Treaty between Australia and the Independent State of Papua New Guinea Concerning Sovereignty and Maritime Boundaries in the Area between the Two Countries, including the Area known as Torres Strait, and Related Matters (adopted 18 December 1978, entered into force 15 February 1985) 1429 UNTS 207.


Agreement between Canada and Denmark Relating to the Delimitation of the Continental Shelf between Greenland and Canada (adopted 17 December 1973, entered into force 13 March 1974) 950 UNTS 147.


Great Britain/Russia: Limits of their Respective Possessions on the North-West Coast of America and the Navigation of the Pacific Ocean (adopted 16 February 1825) 75 Consolidated Treaty Series 95.

LAW OF THE SEA BULLETIN


Table of treaties and legislation


DOALOS, ‘Council of Minister’s Decision No (5) 2009 in Respect of the Application of the Straight Baselines System to a Part of the Coast of the United Arab Emirates’ LOS Bulletin 69, 78.

Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABLOS</td>
<td>Advisory Board on the Law of the Sea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BBNJ</td>
<td>Biological diversity of areas beyond national jurisdiction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOALOS</td>
<td>Division for Ocean Affairs and the Law of the Sea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAOFA</td>
<td>Agreement to Prevent Unregulated High Seas Fisheries in the Central Arctic Ocean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBD</td>
<td>Convention on Biological Diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCAMLR</td>
<td>Convention on the Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLCS</td>
<td>Commission on the Limits of the Continental Shelf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COP</td>
<td>Conference of the Parties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAO</td>
<td>Food and Agriculture Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GAOR</td>
<td>General Assembly Official Records</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICJ</td>
<td>International Court of Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILA</td>
<td>International Law Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILC</td>
<td>International Law Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILM</td>
<td>International Legal Materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILR</td>
<td>International Law Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPCC</td>
<td>Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITLOS</td>
<td>International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPA</td>
<td>Marine Protected Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCA</td>
<td>Permanent Court of Arbitration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PCIJ</td>
<td>Permanent Court of International Justice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RIAA</td>
<td>Reports of International Arbitral Awards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNESCO</td>
<td>United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Abbreviations

UNFCCC  United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNGA    United Nations General Assembly
UNSG    United Nations Secretary-General
UNTS    United Nations Treaty Series
VCLT    Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
WTO     World Trade Organization