

#### Words on Fire

Why is political rhetoric broken – and how can it be fixed? Words on Fire returns to the origins of rhetoric to recover the central place of eloquence in political thought. Eloquence, for the orators of classical antiquity, emerged from rhetorical relationships that exposed both speaker and audience to risk. Through close readings of Cicero – and his predecessors, rivals, and successors – political theorist and former speechwriter Rob Goodman tracks the development of this ideal, in which speech is both spontaneous and stylized, and in which the pursuit of eloquence mitigates political inequalities. He goes on to trace the fierce disputes over Ciceronian speech in the modern world through the work of such figures as Burke, Macaulay, Tocqueville, and Schmitt, explaining how rhetorical risk-sharing has broken down. Words on Fire offers a powerful critique of today's political language – and shows how the struggle over the meaning of eloquence has shaped our world.

ROB GOODMAN is Assistant Professor of Politics and Public Administration at Ryerson University and a former US House and Senate speechwriter.





### Words on Fire

## Eloquence and Its Conditions

**ROB GOODMAN** 

Ryerson University





# CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316517659

DOI: 10.1017/9781009042840

© Rob Goodman 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Goodman, Rob, author.

TITLE: Words on fire: eloquence and its conditions / Rob Goodman, Ryerson Polytechnic University, Toronto.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Includes index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021037862 (print) | LCCN 2021037863 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316517659

(hardback) | ISBN 9781009045773 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009042840 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Communication in politics. | Rhetoric-Political aspects. | Eloquence. |

Political science–Philosophy. | BISAC: POLITICAL SCIENCE / History & Theory

CLASSIFICATION: LCC JA85.G67 2021 (print) | LCC JA85 (ebook) | DDC 320.01/4-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021037862

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021037863

ISBN 978-1-316-51765-9 Hardback ISBN 978-1-009-04577-3 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For my parents



Lords and serfs are seldom good speakers.

— Carl Gustav Jochmann



### Contents

Acknowleagments		page 1x	
	Introduction: "Just Words"	I	
PA	RT I ELOQUENCE AND THE ANCIENTS		
I	"I Tremble with My Whole Heart": Cicero on the Anxieties		
	of Eloquence	23	
	1.1 Reconceiving Oratorical Virtus	27	
	1.2 Uncertainties of Language in Cicero's De oratore	31	
	1.3 A "Rational Criterion" for Speech: Caesar's De analogia	41	
	1.4 Eloquence and Audience Autonomy	45	
2	The Parthenon and the Outhouse: Cicero's Demosthenes and the U	Jses	
	of Style	51	
	2.1 Demosthenes and the Three Styles	53	
	2.2 The Weight of Decorum	62	
	2.3 Eloquent Frankness	70	
	Postscript: Quintilian, Tacitus, and the Problem of Large-Scale		
	Decorum	78	
PA	RT II ELOQUENCE AND THE MODERNS		
3	Edmund Burke and the Deliberative Sublime	87	
	3.1 Civility against Eloquence	90	
	3.2 Burke's Rhetoric and Its Reception	97	
	3.3 Language and Sublimity in Burke's Enquiry	104	
	3.4 Defective Deliberation and Imaginative Judgment	109	
4	Debatable Land: Macaulay, Tocqueville, and the Art of Judgment	118	
•	4.1 Historiography as a Branch of Rhetoric	123	

vii



viii	Contents
4.2 History and Reform: A Judgment-Oriented Politics	126
4.3 Glamorizing Judgment: Macaulay's History of England	134
4.4 Tocqueville against Rhetoric: The Ancien Régime	147
5 Speaking "As If": Carl Schmitt and Rhetoric as Ritual 5.1 "The Background of an Imposing Authority": Rhetoric	158
and Representation	160
5.2 Ritual as Subjunctive Action	167
5.3 Rhetoric through the Lens of Ritual	169
5.4 "Again and Again and Again": Ritual and Tragedy	176
Conclusion: On Not Listening	184
Bibliography	195
Index	215



#### Acknowledgments

Writing a book feels like a solitary endeavor; finishing a book in the midst of a pandemic, even more so. But as I reflect on the dozens of people who have encouraged me, supported me, and generously criticized me, I know that this book has been shaped from start to finish by a community of colleagues, mentors, and friends. This book is theirs, too.

First, I am grateful to the teachers who advised me on this project from its earliest stages as a dissertation at Columbia University. I am grateful to my graduate advisor, David Johnston, for his guidance, encouragement, and thoughtfulness. I'm grateful, as well, to the members of my dissertation committee whose help and support went above and beyond what was required: Simone Chambers, Jon Elster, Melissa Schwartzberg, and Nadia Urbinati. I'm also fortunate for the comments and support offered by Elizabeth Blackmar, Philip Bobbitt, Kathy Eden, Ayten Gundogdu, Philip Hamburger, Joseph Howley, Turkuler Isiksel, Jessica Kimpell, Jennifer London, Mark Mazower, and James Zetzel. All of these scholars set an example of generosity that I hope to live up to in my turn. I also want to thank my graduate worker colleagues at Columbia for their intellectual companionship, including Ashraf Ahmed, Andreas Avgousti, Kevin Elliott, Katharine Jackson, Benjamin Mueser, Ben Mylius, Nathaniel Mull, Guido Parietti, and Camila Vergara. I was proud to stand with many of these colleagues on the picket line for the graduate workers' union at Columbia, and I won't soon forget their example of solidarity.

I'm also grateful for the support I received from the Heyman Center for the Humanities Fellowship and the Columbia University–University of Glasgow Research Exchange Fellowship. As a result of the latter, some of this book was drafted at the University of Glasgow during the summer and fall of 2016. Thanks to the scholars there – and throughout the UK Network for Oratory and Politics – who welcomed me and offered feedback on my work, including

ix



Acknowledgments

Christopher Berry, Alan Finlayson, Carl Knight, Catherine Steel, and Henriette

Through the support of an Andrew W. Mellon Postdoctoral Fellowship, I was able to make considerable progress toward finishing this book at McGill University in 2018–19. I'm grateful to Arash Abizadeh for supervising my work there. I'm grateful, as well, to the members of McGill's Research Group on Constitutional Studies, and of the Groupe de Recherche Interuniversitaire en Philosophie Politique de Montréal, for a great deal of advice and many thoughtful comments: thanks to Jacob T. Levy, Catherine Lu, Victor Muñiz-Fraticelli, Will Roberts, Christa Scholtz, Daniel Weinstock, and Yves Winter. Samuel Bagg, my postdoctoral colleague at McGill, had to put up with sharing an office with me for the year; in return for my toleration of his exceptionally noisy keyboard, he offered insightful and generous comments on nearly the entire book, which I consider to be a fair trade. The finishing touches were put on this book at Ryerson University, and I'm thankful to all my colleagues in the Department of Politics and Public Administration for offering such a welcoming academic home. Portions of Chapter 1 were previously published in the

I want to thank all of the colleagues who volunteered their time and their comments, in their offices, over email, and at the many conferences at which these chapters took shape, including Jed Atkins, Richard Bourke, Joy Connolly, John DiIulio, Jane Gordon, Jeffrey Green, Michael Hawley, Matthew Landauer, Matthew Maguire, John McCormick, Alison McQueen, Jeff Miller, Adam Potkay, Christian Rostbøll, and Adam Seligman. Thanks, as well, to David L. Marshall for the translation of this book's epigraph, which I found in his insightful work *The Weimar Origins of Rhetorical Inquiry*. And I want to acknowledge my undergraduate advisor, George Gopen of Duke University, who is responsible for sparking the love of rhetoric that resulted in this book, and hopefully more to come.

*European Journal of Political Theory* (20[4] [2021]). Portions of Chapter 3 were previously published in the *American Political Science Review* (112[2] [2018]).

I thank Robert Dreesen, Claire Sissen, Erika Walsh, and the staff at Cambridge University Press for their valuable support and counsel. Their confidence in this project helped me to carry it over the finish line. Thanks also to Sindhuja Sethuraman and Nitya Swaruba for their help with copyediting, and to Arc Indexing for preparing the book's index.

Of course, none of this would have been possible without the steadfast love and support of my wife, Ellen Goodman, and our two daughters, Abigail and Louisa. In some way or another, they are on every page of this book. As I finish this, Abigail's favorite book is *Charlotte's Web*, and Louisa's is *Chicken Soup with Rice*. I can't compete with either, but I look forward to the day when they'll at least humor their dad by pulling this volume down from the shelf.