

## ARCHITECTURE AND MATERIAL POLITICS IN THE FIFTEENTH-CENTURY OTTOMAN EMPIRE

In this book, Patricia Blessing explores the emergence of Ottoman architecture in the fifteenth century and its connection with broader geographical contexts. Analyzing how transregional exchange shaped building practices, she examines how workers from Anatolia, the Mediterranean, the Balkans, and Iran and Central Asia participated in key construction projects. She also demonstrates how drawn, scalable models on paper served as templates for architectural decorations and supplemented collaborations that involved the mobility of workers. Blessing reveals how the creation of centralized workshops led to the emergence of a clearly defined imperial Ottoman style by 1500, when the flexibility and experimentation of the preceding century was leveled. Her book radically transforms our understanding of Ottoman architecture by exposing the diverse and fluid nature of its formative period. It also provides the reader with an understanding of the design, planning, and construction processes of a major empire of the Islamic world.

Patricia Blessing is an assistant professor of art history at Princeton University. A scholar of Islamic architecture in the eastern Mediterranean, Iberian Peninsula, and Iran, she is the author of *Rebuilding Anatolia after the Mongol Conquest*.



# ARCHITECTURE AND MATERIAL POLITICS IN THE FIFTEENTH- CENTURY OTTOMAN EMPIRE

PATRICIA BLESSING

Princeton University



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781316517604](http://www.cambridge.org/9781316517604)

DOI: 10.1017/9781009042727

© Cambridge University Press 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Books Limited, Padstow Cornwall

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

ISBN 978-1-316-51760-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Publication is made possible in part by a grant from the Barr Ferree Foundation Publication Fund, Department of Art and Archaeology, Princeton University.

## CONTENTS

<i>Note on Transliteration, Spelling, and Dates</i>	page vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	viii
<i>Maps</i>	x
INTRODUCTION: MATERIAL POLITICS OF ARCHITECTURE IN A FLUID EMPIRE	1
Pasts, Presents, Futures: Architecture and Sources	3
Shifting Architectures, Changing Actors	6
The Ottoman Empire and the Renaissance	9
Styles, International and Otherwise	10
Chapter Summaries	12
1 IMPERIAL AND LOCAL HORIZONS: LOOKING EAST AND WEST	15
Timurid Style in Ottoman Lands?	16
Moving toward Constantinople	19
The Çinili Köşk: Between Constantinople and Khurasan	21
Between Persianate and Byzantine Architecture	23
Epigraphic Artifice and Poetic Cosmology	26
The Tile Decoration of the Çinili Köşk	30
Istanbul beyond the Çinili Köşk	35
Mahmud Pasha's Patronage	39
Transfer to Skopje: Tile Work on the Move	48
Mid-Fifteenth-Century Aesthetics: Istanbul and Beyond	51
2 IMMERSIVE SPACE: EMPIRE BUILDING AND THE OTTOMAN FRONTIER	53
Shifting Styles: Constructing Past, Present, and Future	55
Mehmed I's Mosque- <i>Zāviye</i> Complex in Bursa	57
Dynastic Memory in Bursa	65
Tiles: Timurid, Saljuq, Aqqoyunlu?	68
Building Innovations: Creating Immersive Space	68
The Masters of Tabriz: Tiles and Origin	76
The Saljuq Past: Stone and Pre-Ottoman Anatolia	79
The Timurid Present: Bursa, Tabriz, and International Timurid Style	90
Entangled References	93
3 UNDER THE INFLUENCE: CREATING COSMOPOLITAN ARCHITECTURES	95
Mamluk Style in Ottoman Amasya: The Bayezid Pasha Mosque- <i>Zāviye</i>	99
Construction Sites: Workers and Designers	104
Paper and Architectural Design	107

Consolidating a Style: The Yörgüç Pasha Mosque– <i>Zāviye</i>	109
New Directions in Stone Carving: From Plasticity to Surface	116
Connecting the Mamluk and Ottoman Realms: Scholarship and Language	119
Mamluk Aesthetics on the Move in Western Anatolia and Thrace	121
Transmission and Design	134
Blue-and-White Tiles: A Shared Aesthetic?	135
The Masters of Tabriz beyond Bursa	140
The Virtual Kitabkhāna	142
Mobile Artists and Imperial Aspirations	144
<b>4 BUILDING PARADISE: AFTERLIFE AND DYNASTIC POLITICS</b>	<b>145</b>
Funerary Space and Dynastic Memory	145
The Sultan’s Mausoleum	150
From the Written to the Built Space of Murad II’s Death and Afterlife	157
Paradise in the Funerary Space	159
Ottoman Funerary Landscapes	166
Princely Burials in Bursa’s Muradiye	168
Intertwined Spaces	173
<b>5 AN OTTOMAN AESTHETIC: CONSOLIDATION CIRCA 1500</b>	<b>175</b>
Centralizing Design on Paper	179
Design in the Age of Bayezid II: Amasya	188
Extending into the Balkans: Serres and Skopje circa 1490	194
Emerging Architects	199
Patronage for Sufi Communities in Contested Anatolia	205
Anatolia and Cilicia beyond the Ottoman Realm	207
An Ottoman Aesthetic	214
<b>CONCLUSION</b>	<b>216</b>
<i>Notes</i>	220
<i>Bibliography</i>	245
<i>Index</i>	270

## NOTE ON TRANSLITERATION, SPELLING, AND DATES

Sources in Arabic and Persian appear in the original script when cited in footnotes. For terms and short quotations in the main text, I followed the transliteration system of the *International Journal of Middle East Studies* (*IJMES*). For Ottoman Turkish, the *IJMES* system is used throughout, except when directly quoting from a source that has been published in Latin script in a different transliteration. In personal names, special characters are omitted except for ‘*ayn*, *hamza*, and the long *ā* in Ottoman Turkish names ending in *-zāde* – for example, ‘*Aşıkpaşazāde*. Terms that have entered standard English usage, such as *mihrab*, *muqarnas*, and *kadi*, are not transliterated. Present-day place names (as of 2021) are used throughout, although some historical names are indicated on maps for reference. Dates are given according to the lunar *hijri* calendar as well as the Common Era when referring to specific, dated inscriptions or objects. Otherwise, Common Era dates are used. Unless otherwise noted, all translations into English are my own.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book grew out of the epilogue of my first monograph, *Rebuilding Anatolia after the Mongol Conquest* (Ashgate, 2014), where I reflected on the ways in which early Ottoman architecture was connected to the post-Mongol world. I conducted research for the new project as an H. Allen Brooks Travelling Fellow supported by the Society of Architectural Historians, as a Gerda Henkel Foundation postdoctoral fellow, and as an assistant professor first at Pomona College and now at Princeton University. All of these institutions provided indispensable research support, for which I am deeply grateful, as I am to the Barakat Trust for additional funding. A generous book subvention from the Barr Ferree Foundation Publication Fund, Department of Art & Archaeology, Princeton University enhanced the book's production.

For exceptional library access at Stanford University during the COVID-19 pandemic in 2020–21, I am deeply grateful to Debra Satz and R. Lanier Anderson in the Dean's Office of the School of Humanities and Sciences, Michael A. Keller at Stanford University Libraries, and Lisa Blaydes and Zack al-Witri at the Abbasi Program in Islamic Studies. Scanning services from the Princeton University Libraries and access to HathiTrust were also instrumental in completing the manuscript. For continued support, I thank Gülru Necipoğlu, who has been a role model in scholarly rigor, consistency, and mentorship; and Scott Redford, whose work has been an inspiration ever since I began studying medieval Anatolia. Avinoam Shalem has offered crucial support in cross-cultural studies of the medieval Islamic world and its neighbors, and inspiration to tackle questions of ornament and moveable objects.

I am deeply grateful to Alexander Key, who read the entire manuscript during the pandemic summer of 2020 and offered incisive, transformative suggestions. For timely comments and inspiring questions on elements of this project, I thank Sheila Canby, Moya Carey, John Curry, Walter B. Denny, Thomas Dittelbach, Antony Eastmond, Judson Emerick, Özer Ergenç, Fiona Griffiths, Lara Harb, Robert Hillenbrand, Jeremy Johns, Cemal Kafadar, Ahmed T. Karamustafa, Selim S. Kuru, Oya Pancaroglu, Kathryn Starkey, Joel Walker, and Zeynep Yürekli.

Research would have been impossible without the help of curators, librarians, and archivists at the Bibliothèque d'études arabes, turques et islamiques at the Collège de France in Paris; the Museum für islamische Kunst in Berlin; the Metropolitan Museum of Art in New York; the Courtauld Institute, the School of Oriental and African Studies, and the Victoria & Albert Museum in London; the Ashmolean Museum in Oxford; ANAMED, Istanbul Archaeological Museum, İstanbul Üniversitesi Nadir Eserler Kütüphanesi, İstanbul Büyükşehir Belediyesi Atatürk Kitaplığı, Koç University Library, Türk ve İslam Eserleri Müzesi, and Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Cumhurbaşkanlığı Devlet Arşivleri Başkanlığı Osmanlı Arşivi Külliyesi (formerly Başbakanlık Osmanlı Arşivi) in Istanbul; Marquand and Firestone Libraries at Princeton University; Stanford University Libraries; and Honnold-Mudd Library at the Claremont Colleges. At Pomona College, Alexandra Dean, Cynthia Madrigal, and Susan K. Thalmann scanned my slides from Egypt, Turkey, and Syria so that I could include some of these images in this book. Jacob Wheeler in the Visual Resources Collection at Princeton greatly helped with securing image permissions. The staff of the Department of Art & Archaeology at Princeton, especially Maureen Killeen, have



been a central source of support. Rachael Z. DeLue as department chair has offered crucial support in my early years at Princeton, for which I am deeply grateful. I also thank Michael Koortbojian who served the same role as I was about to start my position in summer 2020.

Participants at numerous conferences challenged me to refine aspects of this project. I especially thank Britta Dümpelmann and members of her Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG) research project for a series of fruitful meetings. I also thank Judith Pfeiffer and the 2017–18 members of the Alexander von Humboldt Kolleg “Islamicate Intellectual History” at the Rheinische Friedrich–Wilhelms–Universität in Bonn for their feedback. I presented aspects of this book at the “Ottoman Topologies” conference at Stanford University in 2014; at the Western Ottomanists’ Workshop at the University of California, Davis in 2015; in the Eurasian Empires workshop at the Stanford Humanities Center, organized by Nancy Kollmann and Ali Yaycıoğlu, in 2017; at the Western Ottomanists’ Workshop at the Claremont Colleges, and in the Near Eastern Languages and Civilization Department at the University of Washington, Seattle, both in 2019. Parts of Chapter 2 were published in *Gesta*, under the expert guidance of Linda Safran and Adam S. Cohen. An article published in *Muqamas*, with detailed comments from Gülru Necipoğlu and Walter B. Denny and the editorial support of Maria Meister and Peri Bearman, laid the foundations of my engagement with Ottoman–Mamluk intersections.

Matt Gleeson’s detailed work on the text pushed me to transform many aspects of the manuscript for the reader’s benefit. Matilde Grimaldi produced architectural drawings and maps that transformed the final manuscript into a productive collaboration. At Cambridge University Press, I thank editor Beatrice Rehl, editorial assistant Edgar Mendez, the production team, Nigel Graves, and Mathi Mareesan. I thank Meridith Murray, who created a detailed index. I am also deeply grateful to the two anonymous reviewers whose comments transformed the first draft into the book that readers will encounter now.

For taking on the various roles of colleagues, mentors, neighbors, traveling companions, and fellow food enthusiasts, I offer heartfelt thanks to Ladan Akbarnia, Nilüfer Akpınar–Şahin, Tuna Artun, Nora E. Barakat, Charles E. Barber, the Başaran family, Deniz Beyazit, İ. Evrim Binbaş, Walter Borghini and Maria Cristina Carile, Ebru Çetin–Milci, Mary L. Coffey, Emre Can Dağlıoğlu and Tamar Nalcı, Lara Deeb, Rowan Dorin, Heather L. Ferguson, Mohammad Gharipour, Denise E. Gill, Dimitri Gondicas, George L. Gorse, Rachel Goshgarian, Christiane J. Gruber, Antonis Hadjikyriacou, Burcu Karahan, Burçak Keskin–Kozat, Arash Khazeni, Kıvanç Kılınç, Beatrice E. Kitzinger, Lorenz Korn, Juliet Koss, Francesca Leoni, Dunja Löbe, AnneMarie Luijendijk, Nina Macaraig, Katherine L. Marsengill, Yumna Masarwa, Richard P. McClary, Matthew Melvin–Koushki, Michelle Millard, Joanne R. Nucho, Tessa Paneth–Pollack, Pamela A. Patton, Bissera V. Pentcheva, Jennifer A. Pruitt, Aron Rodrigue, Eiren L. Shea, Amy Singer, Irene V. Small, Murat Somer, Laura P. Stokes, Hana Taragan, Fatih Tarhan, Baki Tezcan, Erik Thunø, Yektan Türkyılmaz, Nükheth Varlık, Kären Wigen, Elizabeth Dospěl Williams, Kenneth B. Wolf, Suzan Yalman, Anna Zadrožna, Adrien Zakar, and Nino Zchomelidse. Very special thanks to my community of academic mothers – you know who you are. For childcare in the middle of a pandemic, I thank Ayşenur Arıca, and Yina Morris and her team at the YWCA in Princeton.

As always, my family in Switzerland and Turkey bore the brunt of this project, tolerating strange travel schedules, joint treks to museums and sites, and suitcases and books piled on the floor. I thank everyone for their good spirits and support over many years of research. My husband, Ali Yaycıoğlu, has heard and read many iterations of this book, the failed ones and those realized. Our daughter, Aline Marianne Reyhan, was born as I was completing this book, and I dedicate it to her, her grandmother, and her great-grandmother, with whom she shares a middle name.



Map 1. The Ottoman Empire in 1401. Drawing by Matilde Grimaldi



Map 2. The Ottoman Empire in 1415. Drawing by Matilde Grimaldi



Map 3. The Ottoman Empire in 1500. Drawing by Matilde Grimaldi