

## Zionism's Redemptions

In this volume, Arieh Saposnik examines the complicated relations between nationalism and religious (and nonreligious) redemptive traditions through the case study of Zionism. He provides a new framework for understanding the central ideas of this movement and its relationship to traditional Jewish ideas, Christian thought, and modern secular messianisms. Providing a *longue-durée* and broad view of the central themes and motivations in the making of Zionism, Saposnik connects its intellectual history with the concrete development of the Zionist project in Israel in its cultural, social, and political history. Saposnik demonstrates how Zionism offers lessons for a politics in which human perfectibility continues to serve as a guiding light and as a counternarrative to the contemporary politics of self-interest, self-promotion, and “post-truth.” This is a study that bears implications for our understanding of modernity, of space and place, of history and historical trajectories, and of the place of Jews and Judaism in the modern world.

Arieh Saposnik is Associate Professor at the Ben-Gurion Research Institute for the Study of Israel and Zionism at Ben-Gurion University of the Negev.

# Zionism's Redemptions

*Images of the Past and Visions of the Future in  
Jewish Nationalism*

ARIEH SAPOSNIK

*Ben-Gurion University of the Negev*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press  
 978-1-316-51711-6 — Zionism's Redemptions  
 Arieħ Saposnik  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
 New Delhi – 110025, India  
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.  
 It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of  
 education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
 Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781316517116](http://www.cambridge.org/9781316517116)  
 DOI: 10.1017/9781009036771

© Cambridge University Press 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

NAMES: Saposnik, Arieħ Bruce, 1966– author.

TITLE: Zionism's redemptions : images of the past and visions of the future in Jewish  
 nationalism / Arieħ Saposnik.

DESCRIPTION: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2022. | Includes index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021025400 (print) | LCCN 2021025401 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781316517116 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009036771 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Zionism – History – 21st century. | Jewish nationalism.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC DS149 .S48245 2022 (print) | LCC DS149 (ebook) | DDC  
 320.54095694–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021025400>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021025401>

ISBN 978-1-316-51711-6 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of  
 URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication  
 and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,  
 accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-316-51711-6 — Zionism's Redemptions  
Arieh Saposnik  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

“To ignore the paradox is to miss the truth.”  
—Abraham Joshua Heschel

Contents

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	<i>page viii</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>x</i>
1 Introduction	1
2 Rivalries, Rescues, Redemptions: Zionism’s Formative Moment as a Redemptive Movement?	22
3 Echoing Paradigms: Exodus and Redemption in Zionism and Palestine	45
4 Expounding Exile, Narrating Redemption	75
5 <i>Bellum Mundi</i> in <i>Axis Mundi</i> : World War I, Balfour, and Redemption	112
6 Sites of Redemption: Redeeming a Zion Unredeemed	136
7 Zionism and the Christian Holy Land	172
8 Postscript: Redeeming Zionism’s Redemptions?	199
<i>Index</i>	209

## Illustrations

3.1 Ephraim Moshe Lilien, "Passah," c.1901	page 50
3.2 Ephraim Moshe Lilien, "Mose," 1908	54
3.3 Leopold Pilichowski, Theodor Herzl, undated.	56
3.4 "Siblings Adina and Zvi Ginsburg, Colonists in Rishon Le-Zion, Bearing Grapes," early twentieth century	59
3.5 Cover of Boris Schatz, <i>On Art, Artists, and their Critics</i> , 1924.	61
3.6 Ze'ev Raban and Yaacov Stark, poster for the Bezalel Exhibition, 1913.	62
3.7 Cover of Passover Haggadah, Kibbutz Giv'at Brenner, 1935.	69
3.8 Tim Gidal, "Celebration of the Omer (First Crop), Kibbutz Beit ha-Shita," 1947.	70
6.1 Jewish men at the Wall in a postcard dated c.1900	143
6.2 Jewish National Fund promotion with Herzl gazing at Pioneers ascending to the Tower of David.	144
6.3 Zionist postcard and delegate card, 1897.	145
6.4 "The Partition at the Wall" (from <i>Mishpat ha-Kotel</i> )	158
6.5 "Violation of the Status Quo" (from <i>Mishpat ha-Kotel</i> )	160
6.6 Zoltan Kluger, "Police Post outside the Wall Compound," 1933.	162

<i>List of Illustrations</i>	ix
6.7 David Rubinger, “Chief Military Rabbi Shlomo Goren at the Wall in 1967.”	163
6.8 David Rubinger, “Paratroopers at the Wall,” 1967.	164

## Acknowledgments

This book is the product of many years of geographical and intellectual wanderings – now itself being redeemed in a sense. Over the course of those years, I have naturally incurred many debts.

Two of the book's chapters appeared in earlier forms as an article and a book chapter. An earlier version of Chapter 3 appeared as "The Desert Comes to Zion – A Narrative Ends its Wandering," in *Exodus in the Jewish Experience – Echoes and Reverberations*, edited by Pamela Barmash and W. David Nelson (Lexington Books, 2015). Similarly, an earlier version of much of Chapter 6 appeared as "Wailing Walls and Iron Walls: The Western Wall as Sacred Symbol in Zionist National Iconography," in the *American Historical Review* 120:5 (December 2015). I am thankful to Lexington Books and to the *American Historical Review* for permission to republish these (in modified form) as chapters in the present book.

Those same two chapters had an even earlier genesis as papers for conferences to which I was invited. David Nelson and Pamela Barmash provided the initial impetus for what would become Chapter 3. Ron Zweig, in addition to being a source of support and insight for many years, also happened to provide the initial impetus for beginning to think about what would become Chapter 5.

Some of the research that went into this book began while I was at UCLA, where I benefited from the friendship and advice of my colleagues, particularly in the Department of Near Eastern Languages and Cultures and in the Nazarian Center for Israel Studies. Arnold Band welcomed me there warmly from the very start and provided unfailing intellectual stimulation and support. I was fortunate to have had the opportunity to learn from him. Together with Ora z"l, they opened their



### *Acknowledgments*

xi

home to me and my family. Carol Bakhos offered both friendship and intellectual exchange. Bill Schniedewind was a source of constant support, and the conversations I was fortunate to have with Rahim Shayegan were always pleasant and thought-provoking. Important portions of the book were completed during a summer that I spent as a guest of the Mosse/Weinstein Center for Jewish Studies at the University of Wisconsin, Madison. I am grateful to the Center and particularly to its director, Tony Michels, for inviting me and providing me with the resources and a nearly optimal setting for productive and pleasant work.

I have had the great fortune over the past several years to make my academic home at the Ben-Gurion Research Institute for the Study of Israel and Zionism (BGRI) at Ben-Gurion University in the Negev. It has been a transformative experience to find colleagues whose areas of research have so much in common with my own. I remain profoundly grateful to Avigad Vonshak for facilitating my move here. In her endless investment in the growth of the BGRI, Paula Kabalo has helped to create an ever more stimulating environment in which to pursue my work. I have benefitted greatly from intellectual exchange and comradeship with Avi Bareli. In Gideon Katz, I have found a rare friendship and intellectual companionship. If, many years ago, Henry David Thoreau could lament that “there are nowadays professors of philosophy, but not philosophers” (Thoreau, *Walden and Civil Disobedience* [New York: Mockingbird Classics Publishing, 2016], 6), Gideon serves as a reminder that this is not yet entirely true. It has also been my good fortune to learn a great deal from Arye Tepper and to have gained from his friendship. Dvir Tzur has provided often profound insights, an important and stimulating sounding-board for developing ideas, and another meaningful friendship.

Conversations with Motti Inbari on questions of the sacred and on religious overtones attached to the Holy Land have been informative and enlightening. Ilan Troen has been helpful over the years in countless ways, from thinking about some of the central themes in this book to navigating the academic world. I am indebted to Derek Penslar for his insight into countless matters of history and historiography. Finally, I am grateful for the painstaking and meticulous work of the editorial team at Cambridge University Press, who have helped make this a better book.

Anything in my own experience that might approximate the redemptive is connected to the chance encounter, some two decades ago, with my (now-)wife Sara. Even this book's own redemption is in debt to her: its many years of intellectual wandering began to come to an end when, returning from a conference at which I presented what would

become Chapter 5 and telling her about some of its implications, she said, “You realize you’re writing a book about that.” Like so much else, I dedicate this book to her and to our daughters, Hallel Doria, Neta Or, and Ayana Matar – each in her own way a manifestation of an almost redemptive wonder and amazement.