

## EVIDENTIAL LEGAL REASONING

This book offers a transnational perspective of evidentiary problems, drawing on insights from different systems and legal traditions. It avoids the isolated manner of analyzing evidence and proof within each Common Law and Civil Law tradition. Instead, it features contributions from leading authors in the evidentiary field from a variety of jurisdictions and offers an overview of essential topics that are of both theoretical and practical interest. The collection examines evidence not only as a transnational field, but in a cross-disciplinary context. Each chapter engages with the interdisciplinary themes cutting through the issues discussed, benefiting from the expertise and experience of their diverse authors.

Jordi Ferrer-Beltrán is full professor of Legal Philosophy and director of the Chair of Legal Culture at the University of Girona. He is co-editor of *Quaestio Facti*, International Journal on Evidential Legal Reasoning and member of the International Association of Procedural Law and of the Council of the International Association of Evidence Science.

Carmen Vázquez is Associate Professor of Legal Philosophy at the University of Girona. She is academic coordinator of the Master's Degree on Evidentiary Reasoning at the University of Girona and the Università degli Studi di Genova. She is a member of the editing committee of *Quaestio Facti*, International Journal on Evidential Legal Reasoning. Member of the Council of the International Association of Evidence Science.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-316-51699-7 — Evidential Legal Reasoning  
Edited by Jordi Ferrer Beltrán , Carmen Vázquez  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

# Evidential Legal Reasoning

CROSSING CIVIL LAW AND COMMON LAW  
TRADITIONS

*Edited by*

**JORDI FERRER BELTRÁN**

University of Girona

**CARMEN VÁZQUEZ**

University of Girona



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-316-51699-7 — Evidential Legal Reasoning  
Edited by Jordi Ferrer Beltrán, Carmen Vázquez  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.  
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of  
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781316516997](http://www.cambridge.org/9781316516997)  
DOI: 10.1017/9781009032049

© Cambridge University Press 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

### *Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

NAMES: World Congress on Evidential Legal Reasoning (1st : 2018 : Universitat de Girona) | Ferrer Beltrañ, Jordi, editor. | Vázquez Rojas, Carmen, editor.  
TITLE: Evidential legal reasoning : crossing civil law and common law traditions / edited by Jordi Ferrer Beltrán, Universitat de Girona; Carmen Vázquez, Universitat de Girona.  
DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2020. | Includes bibliographical references and index.  
IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021041366 (print) | LCCN 2021041367 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316516997 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009032049 (ebook)  
SUBJECTS: LCSH: Evidence (Law) – Congresses. | LCGFT: Conference papers and proceedings.  
CLASSIFICATION: LCC K2261.A6 W67 2018 (print) | LCC K2261.A6 (ebook) | DDC 347/.06–dc23/eng/20220208  
LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021041366>  
LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021041367>

ISBN 978-1-316-51699-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of  
URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication  
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,  
accurate or appropriate.

## Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>List of Contributors</i>	x
<b>Introduction</b>	
<i>Jordi Ferrer Beltrán and Carmen Vázquez</i>	1
<b>PART I EVIDENCE AS AN AREA OF KNOWLEDGE</b>	11
<b>1 Evidence as a Multidisciplinary Field: What Do the Law and the Discipline of Law Have to Offer?</b>	
<i>William Twining</i>	13
<b>2 New Directions for Evidence Science, Complex Adaptative Systems, and a Possibly Unprovable Hypothesis About Human Flourishing</b>	
<i>Ronald J. Allen</i>	34
<b>PART II CONVERGENCES BETWEEN SYSTEMS</b>	51
<b>3 The Transformation of Chinese Evidence Theories and System: From Objectivity to Relevancy</b>	
<i>Baosheng Zhang and Ping Yang</i>	53
<b>4 Truth Finding and the Mirage of Inquisitorial Process</b>	
<i>Adrian A. S. Zuckerman</i>	71

5	<b>Evidential Remedies for Procedural Rights Violations: Comparative Criminal Evidence Law and Empirical Research</b> <i>Sarah Summers</i>	84
6	<b>Common Law Evidence and the Common Law of Human Rights: Towards a Harmonic Convergence?</b> <i>John Jackson</i>	98
	<b>PART III ON EVIDENTIAL INFERENCES</b>	123
7	<b>Group Deliberative Virtues and Legal Epistemology</b> <i>Amalia Amaya</i>	125
8	<b>On Probatory Ostension and Inference</b> <i>Giovanni Tuzet</i>	138
9	<b>Inferences in Judicial Decisions About Facts</b> <i>Michele Taruffo</i>	159
10	<b>Silence as Evidence</b> <i>Hock Lai Ho</i>	171
11	<b>Sanctions for Acts or Sanctions for Actors?</b> <i>Frederick Schauer</i>	198
	<b>PART IV EXPERT EVIDENCE</b>	215
12	<b>From Institutional to Epistemic Authority: Rethinking Court Appointed Experts</b> <i>Carmen Vázquez</i>	217
13	<b>Latent Justice: Fingerprint Evidence and the Limits of Adversarialism in England, Australia and New Zealand</b> <i>Gary Edmond</i>	248
14	<b>Prevention and Education: The Path towards Better Forensic Science Evidence</b> <i>Marina Gascón Abellán</i>	296
15	<b>Evidentiary Practices and Risks of Wrongful Conviction: An Empirical Perspective</b> <i>Mauricio Duce J.</i>	323

<i>Contents</i>		vii
<b>PART V STANDARDS OF EVIDENCE AS DECISION-MAKING RULES</b>		359
<b>16 Burdens of Proof and Choice of Law</b>		
<i>Dale A. Nance</i>		361
<b>17 Is It Possible to Formulate a Precise and Objective Standard of Proof? Some Questions Based on an Argumentative Approach to Evidence</b>		
<i>Daniel González Lagier</i>		375
<b>18 Prolegomena to a Theory of Standards of Proof: The Test Case for State Liability for Undue Pre-trial Detention</b>		
<i>Jordi Ferrer Beltrán</i>		395
<i>Index</i>		427

## Figures

3.1	Generalisation used in the judgment made by the Court of First Instance in the case of Nian	<i>page</i> 60
5.1	Presence of counsel at trial	88
5.2	Extent of legal aid provision by the court	89
5.3	Extent of legal aid provision according to the charge	89
5.4	First contact with the accused (according to counsel)	90
5.5	Type of evidence referred to in the oral verdict in convicting the accused	91



## Tables

3.1	The Number of Criminal Judgments Containing the Word 'Relevance' during the Period from 1979 to 2017	<i>page</i> 65
5.1	Fair trial violations raised or observed	90
5.2	Violation of right to counsel raised or observed at trial	92

## Contributors

- RONALD J. ALLEN, Northwestern University  
AMALIA AMAYA, National Autonomous University of Mexico and University  
of Edinburgh  
MAURICIO DUCE, Diego Portales University  
GARY EDMOND, University of New South Wales  
JORDI FERRER BELTRÁN, University of Girona  
MARINA GASCÓN ABELLÁN, University of Castilla La Mancha  
DANIEL GONZÁLEZ LAGIER, University of Alicante  
HOCK LAI HO, National University of Singapore  
JOHN JACKSON, University of Nottingham  
DALE NANCE, Case Western Reserve University  
FREDERICK SCHAUER, University of Virginia  
SARAH SUMMERS, University of Zurich  
MICHELE TARUFFO, University of Girona  
GIOVANNI TUZET, Bocconi University  
WILLIAM TWINING, University College London  
CARMEN VÁZQUEZ, University of Girona  
PING YANG, China Academy of Discipline Inspection and Supervision  
BAOSHENG ZHANG, China University of Political Science and Law  
ADRIAN A. S. ZUCKERMAN, University of Oxford