

Plato's Sun-Like Good

Plato's Sun-Like Good is a revolutionary discussion of the *Republic's* philosopher-rulers, their dialectic, and their relation to the form of the good. With detailed arguments Sarah Broadie explains how, if we think of the form of the good as 'interrogative', we can re-conceive those central reference-points of Platonism in down-to-earth terms without loss to our sense of Plato's philosophical greatness. The book's main aims are, first, to show how for Plato the form of the good is of practical value in a way that we can understand; secondly, to make sense of the connection he draws between dialectic and the form of the good; and thirdly, to make sense of the relationship between the form of the good and other forms while respecting the contours of the sun-good analogy and remaining faithful to the text of the *Republic* itself.

SARAH BROADIE is Bishop Wardlaw Professor of Philosophy at the University of St Andrews. She is author of *Aristotle and Beyond: Essays on Metaphysics and Ethics* (Cambridge University Press, 2007) and *Nature and Divinity in Plato's 'Timaeus'* (Cambridge University Press, 2011), and editor of *Aristotle's Nicomachean Ethics: A Philosophical Introduction and Commentary* (2002). She has published dozens of book chapters and articles on Plato and Aristotle, and was awarded an OBE in 2019 for services to classical philosophy.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51687-4 — Plato's Sun-Like Good
Sarah Broadie
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51687-4 — Plato's Sun-Like Good
Sarah Broadie
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Plato's Sun-Like Good

Dialectic in the Republic

Sarah Broadie

University of St Andrews



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51687-4 — Plato's Sun-Like Good
Sarah Broadie
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316516874
DOI: 10.1017/9781009025379

© Sarah Broadie 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Broadie, Sarah, author.

Title: Plato's sun-like good : dialectic in the Republic / Sarah Broadie.

Description: First edition. | Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY, USA:

Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021019444 (print) | LCCN 2021019445 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316516874 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009016407 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009025379 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Plato. Republic. | Good and evil.

Classification: LCC B398.G65 B76 2021 (print) | LCC B398.G65 (ebook) | DDC 321/.07–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021019444>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021019445>

ISBN 978-1-316-51687-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51687-4 — Plato's Sun-Like Good
Sarah Broadie
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

The philosophers' motto: *illuminatio dominus meus*

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51687-4 — Plato's Sun-Like Good
Sarah Broadie
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Contents

| | |
|--|----------------|
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | <i>page ix</i> |
| | |
| Part 1 Approaching the Sun-Good Analogy | 1 |
| 1.1 Introductory | 1 |
| 1.2 The Philosopher-Rulers' Intellectual Task | 3 |
| 1.3 'The Most Important Thing to Learn': Between Plural and Singular | 9 |
| 1.4 What Further Knowledge Does the Longer Way Achieve? | 10 |
| | |
| Part 2 The Form of the Good and Knowledge | 13 |
| 2.1 Sun, Cave, and Sun Again | 13 |
| 2.2 Connecting Sun and Line | 16 |
| 2.3 Higher and Lower Intellectual Levels | 22 |
| 2.4 Mathematical versus Dialectical Hypotheses | 26 |
| 2.5 <i>Sphēneia</i> | 32 |
| 2.6 The Form of the Good as Non-Hypothetical Principle | 34 |
| 2.7 Dialectic and the Good: Some Questions | 39 |
| 2.8 The Role of the Form of the Good in Dialectic | 44 |
| 2.9 Some Objections and Replies | 52 |
| 2.10 Textual Counter-evidence | 55 |
| 2.11 The Non-Hypothetical Principle as First Premiss? | 65 |
| 2.12 The Form of the Good as Object of Definition? | 72 |
| 2.13 Dialectic and Experience | 75 |
| 2.14 Diagrams, Dialectic, and Context | 80 |
| 2.15 Dialectic in Government | 84 |
| 2.16 Not Rigorous Enough? | 90 |
| 2.17 Why Is Dialectic Cognitively Superior to Mathematics? | 95 |
| 2.18 Why Are We Shown So Little about Dialectic in the <i>Republic</i> ? | 101 |
| 2.19 True Philosophers versus Sight-Lovers | 111 |
| 2.20 The Criteria and Scope of 'Good' | 123 |
| 2.21 Main Positions of Parts 1 and 2 | 132 |
| | |
| Part 3 The Form of the Good and Being | 136 |
| 3.1 Preliminaries | 136 |
| 3.2 First Proposal | 140 |
| | vii |

| | | |
|------|---|------------|
| viii | Contents | |
| 3.3 | Interim Discussion of 505a2–4 | 147 |
| 3.4 | Second Proposal | 149 |
| 3.5 | Perfectionist Accounts | 155 |
| 3.6 | System Accounts | 159 |
| | Part 4 Various Further Questions | 163 |
| 4.1 | Ambiguity of ‘the Good’ (I) | 163 |
| 4.2 | Ambiguity of ‘the Good’ (II) | 168 |
| 4.3 | Why the Mathematical Education? | 176 |
| 4.4 | Cosmology, Theology | 195 |
| | Part 5 Winding Up | 206 |
| | <i>References</i> | 226 |
| | <i>Index of Passages</i> | 235 |
| | <i>General Index</i> | 239 |

Acknowledgements

I have had the opportunity to present a few parts of this book to many audiences, provoking much helpful discussion. The work has also benefited from probing comments on earlier drafts by Rachel Barney, Sean Kelsey, Tony Long, Mitchell Miller, Richard Patterson, and Christopher Rowe. The most recent version owes significant improvements to Alex Long and Barbara Sattler, and to an anonymous reader for Cambridge University Press. I warmly thank all these scholars for their generosity.

Parts of Sections 2.3 and 4.3 were delivered as the 2020 Aquinas Lecture at Marquette University. I am grateful to Dr James South, Director of Marquette University Press, for the Press's permission to reproduce that material here.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51687-4 — Plato's Sun-Like Good
Sarah Broadie
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
