

EXPERIMENTAL PHILOSOPHY AND THE ORIGINS OF EMPIRICISM

The emergence of experimental philosophy was one of the most significant developments in the early modern period. However, it is often overlooked in modern scholarship, despite being associated with leading figures such as Francis Bacon, Robert Boyle, Isaac Newton, Jean Le Rond d'Alembert, David Hume, and Christian Wolff. Ranging from the early Royal Society of London in the seventeenth century to the uptake of experimental philosophy in Paris and Berlin in the eighteenth, this book provides new terms of reference for understanding early modern philosophy and science, and its eventual eclipse in the shadow of post-Kantian notions of empiricism and rationalism. *Experimental Philosophy and the Origins of Empiricism* is an integrated history of early modern experimental philosophy which challenges the rationalism and empiricism historiography that has dominated Anglophone history of philosophy for more than a century.

PETER R. ANSTEY is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Sydney and a Fellow of the Australian Academy of the Humanities. He specialises in early modern philosophy, in particular the philosophy of John Locke, Robert Boyle, Francis Bacon, and the French Philosophes. He is the author of the prize-winning book *John Locke and Natural Philosophy* (2011).

ALBERTO VANZO is an independent scholar. He has been a Marie Curie fellow at the University of Birmingham and the University of Warwick. His research in early modern philosophy ranges from Kant to experimental philosophy.

IDEAS IN CONTEXT

Edited by DAVID ARMITAGE, RICHARD BOURKE and JENNIFER
PITTS

The books in this series will discuss the emergence of intellectual traditions and of related new disciplines. The procedures, aims and vocabularies that were generated will be set in the context of the alternatives available within the contemporary frameworks of ideas and institutions. Through detailed studies of the evolution of such traditions, and their modification by different audiences, it is hoped that a new picture will form of the development of ideas in their concrete contexts. By this means, artificial distinctions between the history of philosophy, of the various sciences, of society and politics, and of literature may be seen to dissolve.

A full list of titles in the series can be found at: www.cambridge.org/IdeasContext

EXPERIMENTAL
PHILOSOPHY AND THE
ORIGINS OF EMPIRICISM

PETER R. ANSTEY

University of Sydney

ALBERTO VANZO

Independent Scholar



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-316-51646-1 — Experimental Philosophy and the Origins of Empiricism
Peter R. Anstey, Alberto Vanzo
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316516461
DOI: 10.1017/9781009030236

© Peter R. Anstey and Alberto Vanzo 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Anstey, Peter R., 1962– author. | Vanzo, Alberto, author.

Title: Experimental philosophy and the origins of empiricism /
Peter R. Anstey, Alberto Vanzo.

Description: Cambridge ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2023 |

Series: Ideas in context | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022030728 (print) | LCCN 2022030729 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316516461
(hardback) | ISBN 9781009030236 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Philosophy – History | Methodology | Empiricism

Classification: LCC B72 .A57 2023 (print) | LCC B72 (ebook) | DDC 109–dc23/
eng/20221006

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022030728>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022030729>

ISBN 978-1-316-51646-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of
URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>List of Figures</i>	page vi
<i>List of Tables</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	viii
<i>A Note on Citations</i>	x
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xi
Introduction	1
PART I The Rise of Experimental Philosophy	17
1 The Origins of the Experimental/Speculative Distinction	19
2 Experimental Philosophy in the Seventeenth Century	43
3 Experimental Natural History	75
PART II The Heyday of Experimental Philosophy	109
4 Mathematical Experimental Philosophy	111
5 Experimental Philosophy in France	149
6 Experimental Natural Philosophy and Moral Philosophy	176
PART III From Experimental Philosophy to Empiricism	201
7 Experimental Philosophy in Eighteenth-Century Germany	203
8 Kant and the Genesis of Empiricism	234
9 Reinhold, Tennemann, and the Rise of Empiricism	258
Conclusion	285
<i>Manuscripts Cited</i>	299
<i>Newspapers, Broadshets, and Almanacs</i>	300
<i>References</i>	301
<i>Index</i>	353

FIGURES

1.1 Experimental philosophy and its relation to the neo-Aristotelian theory of knowledge	<i>page 7</i>
1.1 Aristotle's division of knowledge	25
1.2 Aquinas' practical/speculative distinction	26
1.3 Toletus' operative/speculative distinction	27
1.4 Sennert's division of philosophy	28
1.5 Francis Bacon's mature division of natural philosophy	35
1.6 Johnston's division of philosophy with natural history	37
4.1 Proposals for an annual course in experimental philosophy at St Salvator's College, University of St Andrews, Scotland, 1700	117
4.2 The final page of Desaguliers' <i>A Catalogue of the Experiments in Mr Desaguliers's Course</i> , 1713	118
4.3 James Jurin's weather diary exemplar, <i>Philosophical Transactions</i> 32.379, 1723, p. 427	146
6.1 The branches of philosophy in the late seventeenth century	179
6.2 Speculative and practical moral philosophy	180
8.1 A classification of ancient philosophers in Kant's lecture transcripts	244
9.1 One of Reinhold's classifications of the main philosophical movements	267
9.2 Main philosophical movements of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries according to Tennemann	275
9.3 Seventeenth- and eighteenth-century philosophers discussed for at least forty-five pages in Tennemann's <i>History of Philosophy</i> , vols. 10–11	278

TABLES

3.1	Varenius' heads for special geography and Boyle's heads for a natural history of a country	<i>page</i> 85
4.1	Lecturers in experimental philosophy at the University of Oxford	120
8.1	Early modern philosophers whom Kant explicitly classes as rationalists or empiricists	247
8.2	Early modern philosophers whom Kant appears to regard as rationalists or empiricists	247
9.1	Seventeenth- and eighteenth-century philosophers discussed for at least one section each in Tennemann's <i>History of Philosophy</i> , vols. 10–11	276
9.2	Jakob Brucker's classification of seventeenth- and eighteenth-century philosophers	277

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

For helpful comments and feedback on the materials on which this book is based, we are grateful to Zvi Biener, Michael Bycroft, Matteo Favaretti Camposampiero, Alan Chalmers, Andrew Cooper, Sorana Corneanu, Greg Dawes, Mihnea Dobre, Mordechai Feingold, Daniel Garber, Stephen Gaukroger, Juan Gómez, Niccolò Guicciardini, Philippe Hamou, Peter Harrison, Helen Hattab, John Henry, Michael Hunter, Dana Jalobeanu, Jamie Kassler, Alex Klein, Dmitri Levitin, Fui Lee Luk, Noel Malcolm, Gideon Manning, Oana Matei, Tim Mehigan, Lucian Petrescu, Tinca Prunea-Bretonnet, Evan Ragland, Sophie Roux, Eric Schliesser, John Schuster, Richard Serjeantson, Stephen Snobelen, Tom Sorell, Hanna Szabelska, Wiep van Bunge, Anik Waldow, Kirsten Walsh, Eric Watkins, Catherine Wilson, Charles Wolfe, John Zammito, and audiences at the Universities of Bucharest, Mainz, Reading, Otago, and Warwick. This work was supported by the Marsden Fund of the Royal Society of New Zealand (grant number UOO0815), the Arts and Humanities Research Council, UK (grant number AH/L014998/1), the Australian Research Council (grant number FT120100282), and a Marie Curie International Incoming Fellowship within the 7th European Community Framework Programme.

We would like to thank the Bodleian Library, Oxford for permission to cite Bodleian MS Bradley 1 and MS Bradley 12; the British Library for permission to cite British Library Add. MS 32545 and British Library Add. MS 32546; Cambridge University Library for permission to cite Cambridge University MS Add. 3968. We would like to thank the National Library of Scotland for permission to reproduce 'Proposals for an annual course of experimental philosophy in St Salvator's College of the University of St Andrews', shelf mark Crawford MB 772 as Figure 4.1. It is reproduced with permission from materials on loan to the National Library of Scotland by the Balcarres Trust. We would also like to thank the National Library of Scotland for permission to reproduce James Jurin's weather diary exemplar, *Philosophical Transactions*, 32.379, 1723, p. 427 as Figure 4.3. We would like to thank the British Library for permission to reproduce the final page of John Theophilus Desaguliers' *A Catalogue of the Experiments in Mr Desaguliers's Course*, 1713, shelf mark C.112.f.9(181) as Figure 4.2. The cover image, 'Two Boys by Candlelight,

Blowing a Bladder', c. 1767–1773, by Joseph Wright of Derby (Object Number 58.16) is used courtesy of the Huntington Art Museum, San Marino, California, USA.

Chapter 1 draws from Anstey and Vanzo, 'The origins of early modern experimental philosophy', *Intellectual History Review*, 22, 2012, pp. 499–518 with permission from Taylor & Francis. Section 2.1 draws from Anstey and Vanzo, 'Early modern experimental philosophy', in *A Companion to Experimental Philosophy*, eds. Justin Sytsma and Wesley Buckwalter, Oxford: Blackwell, 2016, pp. 87–102 with permission from John Wiley and Sons. Section 3.3 draws on Anstey, 'Philosophy of experiment in early modern England: The case of Bacon, Boyle and Hooke', *Early Science and Medicine*, 19, 2014, pp. 103–32, and Sections 5.2, 5.4, and 5.5 draw on Anstey, 'Bacon, experimental philosophy and French Enlightenment natural history', in *Natural History in Early Modern France: The Poetics of an Epistemic Genre*, eds. Raphaële Garrod and Paul J. Smith, Leiden: Brill, 2018, pp. 205–40 with permission from Brill. Section 5.6 draws on Anstey, 'D'Alembert, the "Preliminary Discourse" and experimental philosophy', *Intellectual History Review*, 24, 2014, pp. 495–516 with permission from Taylor & Francis. Sections 7.1, 7.2, and 7.3 draw on Vanzo, 'Christian Wolff and Experimental Philosophy', *Oxford Studies in Early Modern Philosophy*, 7, 2015, pp. 225–55 with permission from Oxford Publishing Limited. Section 7.4 draws on Anstey, 'The four classes of the Berlin Academy', in *The Berlin Academy in the Reign of Frederick the Great: Philosophy and Science*, eds. Tinca Prunea-Bretonnet and Peter R. Anstey, Oxford University Studies in the Enlightenment, Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 2022, pp. 17–38. Chapter 8 draws on Vanzo, 'Kant on empiricism and rationalism', *History of Philosophy Quarterly*, 30, 2013, pp. 53–74 with permission from *History of Philosophy Quarterly*. Section 9.1 draws on Vanzo, 'From empirics to empiricists', *Intellectual History Review*, 24, 2014, pp. 517–38 with permission from Taylor & Francis.

A NOTE ON CITATIONS

Aristotle's works are cited with the title, followed by the Bekker numbers. Quotations are from Aristotle 1984.

The *Critique of Pure Reason* is quoted with the page numbers of the first edition of 1781 ('A') and of the second edition of 1787 ('B'). Other writings by Kant are cited with the title (sometimes in an abbreviated form), followed by the volume and page number of the Academy Edition (Kant 1900–). Citations from Kant's *Reflexionen* also indicate each *Reflexion*'s number and the dating established by Adickes (sometimes in a simplified form). Translations are our own for those writings of Kant which have not been translated into English. All other translations are from the *Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant* (Kant 1992–). American spelling has been replaced with British spelling in quotations.

Italics in quotations are original, underlinings are added. All translations are our own unless otherwise specified.

ABBREVIATIONS

Bodl.	Bodleian Library
ESD	Experimental/speculative distinction
MS/S	Manuscript/s
OED	<i>Oxford English Dictionary</i>
RED	Rationalism/empiricism distinction

Jean Le Rond d'Alembert

PD *Preliminary Discourse to the Encyclopedia of Diderot*, trans. Richard N. Schwab, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995. First published as 'Discours préliminaire des éditeurs', in *Encyclopédie, ou dictionnaire raisonné des sciences, des arts et des métiers*, eds. Denis Diderot and Jean Le Rond d'Alembert, vol. 1, Paris, 1751.

Francis Bacon

OFB *The Oxford Francis Bacon*, eds. Graham Rees et al., Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996–. Cited by volume number and page number, for example, OFB 11 103.

SEH *The Works of Francis Bacon*, 7 vols., eds. James Spedding, Robert L. Ellis, and D. D. Heath, London: Longmans and Co., 1857–74. Cited by volume number and page number, for example, SEH 4 104.

Robert Boyle

B *The Works of Robert Boyle*, 14 vols., eds. Michael Hunter and E. B. Davis, London: Pickering and Chatto, 1999–2000. Cited by volume number and page number, for example, B 4 104. Short titles of Boyle's individual works are used throughout the text.

Boyle Corr. *The Correspondence of Robert Boyle*, 6 vols., eds. Michael Hunter, Antonio Clericuzio, and Lawrence M. Principe, London: Pickering and Chatto, 2001.

Denis Diderot

Pensées *Pensées sur l'interprétation de la nature*, Amsterdam, 1754.

Denis Diderot and Jean Le Rond d'Alembert

Encycl. *Encyclopédie, ou dictionnaire raisonné des sciences, des arts et des métiers*, eds. Denis Diderot and Jean le Rond d'Alembert, University of Chicago: ARTFL Encyclopédie Project (Spring 2021 ed.), eds. Robert Morrissey and Glenn Roe, <http://encyclopedia.uchicago.edu/>. First published Paris, 1751–72.

David Hume

Treatise *A Treatise of Human Nature*, vol. 1, eds. David F. Norton and Mary J. Norton, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2007 (1st ed., 3 vols., London, 1739–40).

Immanuel Kant

A ... /B ... *Kritik der reinen Vernunft*, Riga: Hartknoch, 1st ed. 1781 ('A'), 2nd ed. 1787 ('B'), ed. Jens Timmermann, Hamburg: Meiner, 1996.

Entd. *Über eine Entdeckung, nach der alle neue Kritik der reinen Vernunft durch eine ältere entbehrlich gemacht werden soll*, in Kant 1900–, vol. 8, pp. 185–251.

Fort. *Welches sind die wirklichen Fortschritte, die die Metaphysik seit Leibnizens und Wolffs Zeiten in Deutschland gemacht hat?*, in Kant 1900–, vol. 20, pp. 253–351.

KpV *Kritik der praktischen Vernunft*, in Kant 1900–, vol. 5, pp. 1–163.

KU *Kritik der Urteilskraft*, in Kant 1900–, vol. 5, pp. 165–485.

Prol. *Prolegomena zu einer jeden künftigen Metaphysik, die als Wissenschaft wird auftreten können*, in Kant 1900–, vol. 4, pp. 253–383.

Refl. *Reflexionen from Kant's Handschriftlicher Nachlaß*, in Kant 1900–, vols. 14–19.

G. W. Leibniz

New Essays *New Essays on Human Understanding*, trans. Peter Remnant and Jonathan Bennett, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.

John Locke

Essay *An Essay concerning Human Understanding*, ed. Peter H. Nidditch, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1975.

Isaac Newton

Newton Corr. *The Correspondence of Isaac Newton*, 7 vols., eds. W. H. Turnbull et al., Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1959–77.

Principia *The Principia: Mathematical Principles of Natural Philosophy*, eds. and trans. I. Bernard Cohen and Anne Whitman, Berkeley: University of California Press, 1999.

Henry Oldenburg

Oldenburg Corr. *The Correspondence of Henry Oldenburg*, 13 vols., eds. A. R. Hall and M. B. Hall, Madison, Milwaukee, and London: University of Wisconsin Press, Mansell, and Taylor & Francis, 1965–86.