

Performing Power in Zimbabwe

Focusing on political trials in Zimbabwe's Magistrates' Courts between 2000 and 2012, Susanne Verheul explores why the judiciary have remained a central site of contestation in post-independence Zimbabwe. Drawing on rich court observations and in-depth interviews, this book foregrounds law's potential to reproduce or transform social and political power through the narrative, material and sensory dimensions of court-room performances. Instead of viewing appeals to law as acts of resistance by marginalised orders for inclusion in dominant modes of rule, Susanne Verheul argues that it was not recognition by but of this formal, rule-bound ordering, and the form of citizenship it stood for, that was at stake in performative legal engagements. In this manner, law was much more than a mere instrument. Law was a site in which competing conceptions of political authority were given expression, and in which people's understandings of themselves as citizens were formed and performed.

SUSANNE VERHEUL is a Research Fellow in International Development at the University of Oxford where her research focuses on questions of law and politics in southern Africa. She previously taught at University College Roosevelt, Utrecht University and holds a DPhil from the University of Oxford.



African Studies Series

The African Studies series, founded in 1968, is a prestigious series of monographs, general surveys, and textbooks on Africa covering history, political science, anthropology, economics, and ecological and environmental issues. The series seeks to publish work by senior scholars as well as the best new research.

Editorial Board:

David Anderson, *The University of Warwick* Carolyn Brown, *Rutgers University*, *New Jersey* Christopher Clapham, *University of Cambridge* Richard Roberts, *Stanford University*, *California* Leonardo A. Villalón, *University of Florida*

Other titles in the series are listed at the back of the book.



Performing Power in Zimbabwe

Politics, Law, and the Courts since 2000

SUSANNE VERHEUL University of Oxford





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316515860

DOI: 10.1017/9781009026826

© Susanne Verheul 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Verheul, Susanne, 1986- author.

Title: Performing power in Zimbabwe: politics, law, and the courts since 2000 / Susanne Verheul, University of Oxford.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Series: African studies | Based on author's thesis (doctoral - University of Oxford, 2017) issued under title: 'Government is a legal fiction': performing political power in Zimbabwe's magistrates' courts after 2000. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021024666 (print) | LCCN 2021024667 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316515860 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009011792 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009026826 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Political crimes and offenses–Zimbabwe. | Courts of first instance–Zimbabwe. | Zimbabwe-Politics and government–1980-

Classification: LCC KTZ441 .V47 2021 (print) | LCC KTZ441 (ebook) | DDC 345. 6981/0231–dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021024666

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021024667

ISBN 978-1-316-51586-0 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Voor Oma



Contents

Li	st of Figures	page ix
Αc	knowledgements	X
Li	st of Abbreviations	xiii
Int	troduction: Law, State Authority and the Courts	1
1	History, Authority and the Law in Zimbabwe, 1950–2002	33
2	'Rebels' and 'Good Boys': Examining the Working Conditions in Zimbabwe's Attorney General's Office after 2000	60
3	'Zimbabweans Are Foolishly Litigious': Debating Citizenship When Engaging with a Politicised Legal System	85
4	'What Is Abnormal Is Normal': Performative Politics on the Stages of Arrest and Detention	107
5	Material and Sensory Courtrooms: Observing the 'Decline of Professionalism' in Harare's Magistrates' Courts	123
6	The Trials of the 'Traitor' in Harare's Magistrates' Courts under the Unity Government	153
7	History, Consciousness and Citizenship in Matabeleland: The Impact of the MLF Case	181

vii



viii	
8 Historical Narrative and Political Strategy	
in Bulawayo's Magistrates' Courts: The Case of Owen Maseko	206
Conclusion: 'Government Is a Legal Fiction' – Performing Law, the State, Citizenship and Politics	228
Bibliography	238
Index	260



Figures

1.1	Hierarchy of Zimbabwe's criminal courts	page 43
1.2	Trial process in the criminal Magistrates' Courts	44
5.1	Aerial view of Harare's Magistrates' Courts	128
5.2	Journalist Hopewell Chin'ono on entrance ramp to	
	holding cells	129
5.3	Layout of the courtroom at Rotten Row	132
8.1	Ongowane'zibomvu	209
8.2	Babylon Songs	210
8.3	Unity Accord	211
8.4	Covered windows in the National Gallery	213

ix



Acknowledgements

The seeds for this book were sown while I was sitting in the World Food Programme's office in Kampala, Uganda, following the news about the 2008 presidential and parliamentary elections in Zimbabwe. During my M.Phil and D.Phil in International Development at the University of Oxford, these seeds were able to grow into a research project, and, over the course of my Leverhulme Trust Early Career Fellowship, into a book.

Writing this book, then, was a lengthy process, during which I benefitted from immeasurable opportunities and support. First and foremost, I am indebted to all those who shared their lives, experiences and thoughts with me during my time in Zimbabwe. I am not able to name everyone here, but I hope I have done justice to our exchanges. Among the select few I can mention, I wish to thank Zimbabwe Lawyers for Human Rights for facilitating my access to the courts in Harare and Bulawayo, to the Royal Netherlands Embassy in Harare for their support, to Ushehwedu Kufakurinani, Phillan Zamchiya, Innocent Kasiyano, Cleto Manjova and Eddson Chakuma for showing me new sides of Harare on a regular basis, and to Rodrick Fayayo, Delta Mbonisi and Philani Mpofu at the Bulawayo Progressive Residents Association for sharing their wisdom and their office space. For their continued assistance in Zimbabwe and following my return to Oxford, I am especially indebted to David Hofisi, Hopewell Gumbo, Jeremiah Bamu, and Kucaca Phulu. Owen Maseko created this book's cover image, beautifully capturing both the form and atmosphere of Zimbabwe's courtrooms.

My research trips to Zimbabwe were generously supported by the Prins Bernhard Cultuur Fonds, the Oxford Department of International Development and the Leverhulme Trust. With funding from Point Sud and the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft I was also given the opportunity to attend a series of thought-provoking international workshops on Courts in Africa in Niamey, Niger (December



Acknowledgements

xi

2014) and Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso (February 2016). I am further grateful for my time at the University College Roosevelt, The Netherlands: teaching at an undergraduate level showed me another side of academia and highlighted the importance of strong academic role models.

In that vein, my heartfelt thanks go to Jocelyn Alexander, whose thoughtful and thorough supervision guided me during my postgraduate years, and whose commitment to scholarship and to Zimbabwean history and politics continue to be an inspiration, encouraging me to think more critically, to work more methodically and to persevere. For igniting the spark of academic research during my undergraduate studies, and for their continued support along the way, I am indebted to John Friedman and Fatima Mueller-Friedman. In their positive feedback and encouragement to transform my thesis into a book, my examiners Jonny Steinberg and Sara Rich Dorman were further invaluable guides. For their generous support throughout the publication process, I thank Maria Marsh, Daniel Brown, Atifa Jiwa, Natasha Whelan, Dhivyabharathi Elavazhagan, Dan Harding and the entire Cambridge University Press African Studies series team, as well as the two anonymous reviewers for their encouraging feedback on an early draft of this book

Many of the ideas in this book grew out of exchanges with the dynamic academic community in Oxford, particularly with the members of Tuesday's Southern Africa Discussion Group, the Loft community and the Womyn's Discussion Group. Alex Löwe, Andy Emmerich, Carolin Fischer, Chloé Lewis, Dan Hodgkinson, George Karekwaivanane, Georgia Cole, Hannah Hoechner, Hannah Waddilove, Luisa Enria, Miles Tendi, Shrochis Karki and Taylor St John – thank you for listening to or reading various drafts of this work, and offering me an intellectual home where we could share research advice, coffee, wine and the occasional much-needed rant. To everyone who had to suffer living with me through all this, but especially the Cranham 'girls' - Andrea Kolbel, Andrea Ruediger, Eveliina Lyytinen and Nora Stappert - thank you for making our house such a warm and welcoming home, and for our continued friendship. I am immensely grateful also for our friendship: Alex Barnard, Cole Paulson, Fauzia Jamal, Sasha Romary and Sophia Mann.

Most of all, I am grateful for my parents Gonnie Biemold and Jeroen Verheul, my brother Bart and my Opa Eppie and Oma Willie. I would



xii

Acknowledgements

never had started this journey if they hadn't pushed me to finish high school, and I probably would not have completed it without their unwavering support, the occasionally necessary constructive criticism and the many calls to bridge the physical distance between us. Last but certainly not least, I want to thank my new-found family, Laelia Dard-Dascot, for not only putting up with my imperfections, but for reminding me often that it is precisely through this crack in everything that the light gets in.

Earlier versions of Chapter 2 and Chapter 3 were published as articles in the Journal of Southern African Studies¹ and Africa² respectively. In addition, I drew on empirical material from Chapter 5 for an article in Political and Legal Anthropology Review, and on parts of the historical review from Chapter 1 for a chapter in an edited volume on Zimbabwean politics for Oxford University Press.⁴

¹ Susanne Verheul, "Rebels" and "Good Boys": Patronage, Intimidation, and Resistance in Zimbabwe's Attorney General's Office Post-2000', Journal of Southern African Studies, 39, 4, 2013, pp. 765-82.

² Susanne Verheul, "Zimbabweans Are Foolishly Litigious": Exploring the Internal Logics for Appeals to a Politicised Legal System', Africa, 86, 1, 2016,

pp. 78-97.

Susanne Verheul, "Rotten Row Is Rotten to the Core": The Material and Sensory Politics of Harare's Magistrates Courts after 2000', PoLAR: Political

and Legal Anthropology Review, 43, 2, 2020, pp. 262-79.

⁴ Susanne Verheul, 'Land, Law and the Courts in Zimbabwe', in Jocelyn Alexander, JoAnn McGregor and Miles Tendi (eds), Handbook of Zimbabwean Politics, July 2020, retrieved from https://www.oxfordhandbooks.com/view/10 .1093/oxfordhb/9780198805472.001.0001/oxfordhb-9780198805472-e-4.



Abbreviations

CCJP Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace

CFU Commercial Farmers Union
CIO Central Intelligence Organisation
GNU Government of National Unity
GPA Global Political Agreement

ICTR International Criminal Tribunal for Rwanda

ISO International Socialist Organisation ISO-Z International Socialist Organisation in

Zimbabwe

LOMA Law and Order Maintenance Act
LRF Legal Resources Foundation
MDC Movement for Democratic Change

MDC Movement for Democratic Change
MLF Mthwakazi Liberation Front

MP Member of Parliament POSA Public Order and Security Act

SPT Solidarity Peace Trust

ZANLA Zimbabwe African National Liberation Army

ZANU Zimbabwe African National Union ZANU-PF Zimbabwe African National Union-

Patriotic Front

ZAPU Zimbabwe African People's Union
 ZINASU Zimbabwe National Students Union
 ZIPRA Zimbabwe People's Revolutionary Army
 ZLHR Zimbabwe Lawyers for Human Rights

ZLP Zimbabwe Liberators Platform ZNLWVA Zimbabwe National Liberation War

Veterans' Association

ZRP Zimbabwe Republic Police

xiii