

## BELIEVING IN DANTE

Alison Cornish offers a compelling new take on the *Commedia* with modern sensibilities in mind. *Believing in Dante* reexamines the infernal dramas of Dante's masterpiece that alienate and perplex modern readers, offering an invigorating view of the whole *Divine Comedy*, bringing it to meaningful life today. Addressing the characteristics that distance an author like Dante from the modern world, Alison Cornish shows the value of critically and constructively engaging with texts that do not coincide with current worldviews. She thereby reveals how we might discover constellations by which to navigate the process of reading. Written with incisiveness and sophistication, this landmark book elucidates Dante's eminently readable universe: one where we can and must choose what we want to believe.

Alison Cornish is Professor and Chair of Italian Studies at New York University and current President of the Dante Society of America. She is the author of *Reading Dante's Stars* (2000), *Vernacular Translation in Dante's Italy* (Cambridge University Press, 2011), a commentary on Dante's *Paradiso* (2017), and numerous essays on Dante, Petrarch, and Boccaccio. She is a former fellow at the University of Michigan Institute for the Humanities and the Harvard Center for Renaissance Studies at Villa I Tatti. She is also the curator of the YouTube series, "Canto per Canto: Conversations with Dante in Our Time."

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-316-51506-8 – Believing in Dante

Alison Cornish

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

---

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-316-51506-8 – Believing in Dante  
Alison Cornish  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

BELIEVING  
IN DANTE

TRUTH IN FICTION

ALISON CORNISH  
*New York University*



Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-316-51506-8 – Believing in Dante  
Alison Cornish  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi –  
110025, India  
103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.  
It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of  
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)  
Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781316515068](http://www.cambridge.org/9781316515068)  
DOI: 10.1017/9781009091923

© Alison Cornish 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Books Limited, Padstow Cornwall

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

ISBN 978-1-316-51506-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of  
URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication  
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,  
accurate or appropriate.

## CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page vi</i>
<i>Bibliographical Note</i>	<i>x</i>
Introduction	I
1 “So Great a Lover”: Facts and Narratives in the Love Stories of the Lustful	22
2 “Bad Light”: Factionalism and the Facts in the Cemetery of the Heretics	62
3 “Never Broke Faith”: Losing Credibility in the Wood of the Suicides	93
4 “Where Your Soul Is Pointed”: Facts and Values in Ulysses’ Quest and the Examination on Love	123
5 “Against Her Will”: Diversity of Desire in the Heaven of the Moon	156
6 “How Much from the Point”: Saving Appearances at the Edge of the Universe	208
Conclusion	244
<i>Index</i>	254

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The idea for this book came from Kristin Nelson, who attended my Dante class at the University of Michigan when she was a Masters of Fine Arts student there. I would like to give her credit if not blame. I did not want to write yet another introduction to the poet and his works, but I did want to lay down a case for why I find the *Comedy* compelling or, as she called it, “legible,” in our particular moment. I would also like to thank another loyal repeat attendee of my Dante lectures, Claudia Sala Elli, whose long and deep engagement has informed many a rethinking on my part and spawned a Dante reading group of her own. My students at Yale, at the University of Michigan, and now at New York University, have challenged me to make sense of an alien text in contemporary terms as best I can. I was also most appreciative of the participants of the Yale Alumni College virtual course this past Covid year who, in concert with a twin sequence led by Peter Hawkins, started in the *Inferno* and pushed on through *Purgatorio* all the way to *Paradiso*, all the while making me feel that Dante and I had something urgent to say. There is no “crisis in the humanities” among such folk.

The first chapter, on the episode of Francesca, was given as the 29th annual Bernardo Lecture at Binghamton University with the title “Dante and the Legibility of the Universe: Facts and Narratives” in November 2019 at the invitation of Olivia Holmes. Material from the

---

### Acknowledgments

---

second, on the inability of different factions to see the same facts, was given twice in November 2020, both virtually, first as “Belief in Hell: Breaking Faith in the Circle of Violence” at Fairfield University at the invitation of Mary Ann Carolan, and then as “Factionalism and Facts among Dante’s Heretics (*Inferno* 10)” at the University of Cambridge at the invitation of the Cambridge Italian Research Seminar. The third, on the broken faith of the suicides, was given, also virtually, as a keynote lecture entitled “‘Faith: What is it?’ The Problem of Credibility” at the Dante Society of America annual symposium in September 2020, organized by Michael Sherberg and originally meant to be held at Washington University in St. Louis in May 2020. Material from both the second and third chapters was presented, virtually, as “Breaking Faith in the Circle of Violence (*Inferno* 10 and 13)” at the annual series of public lectures on Dante at the Centre for Dante Studies in Ireland at University College Cork in February 2021 at the invitation of Daragh O’Connell. The fourth chapter, connecting the examination on love to the failed expedition of Ulysses to follow virtue and knowledge, came out of a *Lectura Dantis Andreapolitana* entitled “*Paradiso* 26: Knowledge and Virtue” presented at the University of St. Andrews in Scotland in September 2019, curated by Claudia Rossignoli and Robert Wilson. The fifth, on how Piccarda could be happy in the “slowest sphere,” was given, virtually, at the Pre-Modern Colloquium at the University of Michigan, as “Cheap Seats in Dante’s Heaven,” on invitation from Thomas Willette. The sixth, on metaphysical explanations of physical phenomena, was originally a *Lectura* of *Paradiso* 29, given at a seminar at the University of California,

---

## Acknowledgments

---

Berkeley, aptly entitled “Three Days in Paradise” on invitation from Albert Ascoli in June 2019. I thank the organizers and attendees of all those events for their responses and their criticisms that helped me hone what I think about Dante. I am grateful for further conversations with Albert Ascoli, Zygmunt Baranski, Ted Cachey, and Arielle Saiber, among others. Versions of Chapter 1 and Chapter 6 were published as *Dante and the Legibility of the Universe: Facts and Narratives*, Bernardo Lecture Series, No. 21 (SUNY: Excelsior Editions, 2021) and “*Paradiso* 29: Saving the Appearances,” *Dante Studies*, 137 (2019): 107–123. Thanks to Olivia Holmes and Justin Steinberg respectively for their editorial judgment and labors.

I am grateful to my colleagues in Italian Studies at New York University and the Casa Italiana Zerilli-Marimò for welcoming me into their midst and encouraging and stimulating me to engage in new ways and with new audiences. Also in New York, Anna Squatriti offered me many good meals and a sympathetic ear. Thanks to my fellow members and council members of the Dante Society of America for their votes of confidence and wise counsel during these strange times. Thanks to Emily Hockley for answering my email and shepherding my originally half-baked proposal, to her assistant George Laver, and to the anonymous readers of Cambridge University Press who helped give this project sense and shape.

My husband Paolo Squatriti, when he wasn’t feeding me and taking me on outings, actually listened to me read him a whole chapter out loud. I thank Sofia, Giacomo, and Cristina for arguing with me and occasionally taking my point. The proverbial “cobbler’s children” really might want to read the *Divine Comedy* someday. It’s a



### Acknowledgments

---

really good book. Cristina Squatriti, who has ventured with me at least partway into hell, did end up reading this one, when she prepared the index. I would like to dedicate this volume to my parents, Judson Edward Cornish and Christine Ames Cornish, who taught me to love both science and literature.

## BIBLIOGRAPHICAL NOTE

Passages from *Inferno*, *Purgatorio*, and *Paradiso* are quoted from Dante Alighieri, *La Commedia secondo l'antica vulgata*, ed. Giorgio Petrocchi (Milan: Mondadori, 1966–1967). For Dante's other works:

Citations from Dante's *Convivio* are from the edition curated by Franca Brambilla Ageno, 2 vols. (Florence: Le Lettere, 1995). English versions are from Dante, *Il Convivio The Banquet*, trans. Richard Lansing (New York: Garland Publishing, 1990). The edition of the *De vulgari eloquentia* used is edited by Pio Rajna, vol. 1 of *Le opere di Dante* (Florence: Società Dantesca Italiana, 1960). The *Vita nuova* is translated by Mark Musa (University of Indiana Press, 1973).

Passages from the Bible are from the Latin Vulgate and Douay-Rheims English translation, available at [www.drbo.org/](http://www.drbo.org/).

The English text of the *Summa Theologiae* of Thomas Aquinas, abbreviated as *ST*, is from the 1920 edition, translated by the Fathers of the English Dominican Province, available online at [www.newadvent.org/summa/](http://www.newadvent.org/summa/). The Latin originals of all works by Aquinas are from the *Corpus Thomisticum S. Thomae de Aquino Opera Omnia*, available at [www.corpusthomisticum.org/iopera.html](http://www.corpusthomisticum.org/iopera.html).

Unless otherwise noted, translations are mine.

All other sources are cited in the notes and referred to in the index.