Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-316-51489-4 — Designing Indicators for a Plural Legal World Siddharth Peter de Souza Index More Information

Index

ability to achieve real freedoms, 170 to critically examine difficult indicators, 38 familiarity of the forum and, 195 individual's, 91 to make choices, 108 of people to engage in the stages, 107 to speak your mind, 64 to standardize multifaceted phenomena, 6 of the user to demand, 107 access to justice, 1 barriers to, 13 demand-driven approach to, 145 Hague Model of, 76, 83-85 justice capabilities framework, 178-179 data for, 199-201 elements of, 184-185 legal pluralism, 18 and measurement of justice delivery in plural legal systems, 96–97 exploring the responsiveness, 97-103 networks, processes and a user focus, 103-110 measuring, 77

in plural legal contexts, 17 in plural legal systems, 164-168 basic capabilities required, 187-189 capabilities to obtain a resolution, 196-199 capability approach, 168-173 capability to navigate a procedure, 194-196 capability to negotiate a solution, 192-194 capability to understand a dispute, 189-191 critiques and challenges of the capability approach, 179–181 data, 199 dispute resolution process, 189 elements of the JCF, 184-185 framing a capability approach, 173-178 justice capabilities framework, 178-179 justice system, 186-187 operationalizing the capability approach, 181-183 populating the JCF, 201-202 user perspective, 186 in resolving disputes, 5

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-316-51489-4 — Designing Indicators for a Plural Legal World Siddharth Peter de Souza Index <u>More Information</u>

266 Index

accountability engineer, 43 in ensuring judicial professionalism, 80 governance, 9 in the higher judiciary, 143 indicators in law, 5 indicators on public, 29 integrity, transparency and, 82 to the law, 61 mutual, 69 in public procurement, 91 reliability and, 43 standards of transparency and, 90 transparency and, 78 Accra Agenda for Action (2008), 69 agency capability and, 104 centric, 108 development, 58 donor, 33 and freedom of an individual, 196 freedoms and, 180 importance of, 107 individual, 180 Asia Foundation, 62 Baxi, Upendra, 62n40, 101n175, 103n187 in comparative law, 129n52 in discussing notions of access, 104 and human rights, 109 Minor Jurisprudence, 109n217 'Rule of Law in India, The', 71n80, 153n148 'Voices of Suffering and the Future of Human Rights', 109n215 Bertelsmann Stiftung Bertelsmann Transformation Index, 83 bottom-up approach analysis of the needs, 89 demand-based, 186 and grounded legal indicator, 113

indicators from, 3-5 building indicators, 12-13 indicators and the law, 5-8 quantification in law, 8-12 questions, design and challenges, 13 - 17justice indicator, 167 perspective, legal needs surveys, 147 realization aspects of justice, 109 rule of law to, 205 Canadian Bar Association, 5n11 capabilities, 12-13, 19, 68, 145, 147, 149, 166-172, 173, 174 capability approach dispute resolution process, 189 data, 198-199 navigate a procedure, 194-196 negotiate a solution, 192-194 obtain a resolution, 196-198 understand a dispute, 189-191 to framing access to justice, 168–169 in plural legal systems, 173–178 reason to use it, 169-173 justice capabilities framework, 178 - 179basic capabilities required, 187-189 critiques and challenges of, 179-181 data for, 199-201 demand or user perspective, 186 elements of, 184-185 interactions with the justice system, 186–187 operationalizing, 181-183 populating the, 201-202 in plural legal systems, 164–168 Centre for Global Development (CGD), 20 commensuration and aggregation, 50 process of, 28

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-316-51489-4 — Designing Indicators for a Plural Legal World Siddharth Peter de Souza Index More Information

Index | 267

as a social process, 26n22 validity of the measurement, 30 community challenges of plural legal systems based on, 166 forums, 105 'informal justice,' 74 judicial institutions, 148 law, 11 legal pluralism, 174 legitimacy in, 192 lines, 172 mechanisms, 89 rule of law programming, 52 social arrangements and relations in, 169 social pressures of, 150 and social sanctions, 197 standing, 170 conceptualization, 29 conduct of conduct, 27 conflict arise, issues of, 99 criminal justice institutions and, 82 dispute resolution, 106 with each other, 174 mask, 40 overarching system for mediating, 58 resolution system, 83-84 violent, 176 Constitution Bolivia, 156, 157n160, 175-177 Comparative Constitutional Law, 130n57 Ecuador, 158 establishment of global, 97 global values, 97 Indian, 150 life enshrined in, 150 provisions, existence of, 80 of South Africa, 176

contestation, masking of, 38-42. See also legal indicators co-production defined, 126, 126n46 grounded and reflexive framework, 127 theories of empowerment and collaboration, 125 transformation and, 122 Danish International Development Agency (DANIDA), 59 data administrative, 82 analysing, 29 civil society organizations, 82 collection, systematic, 98 criminal justice institutions, 82 on criminal matters, 136 on disposal and pendency of cases from 1950 to 2008, 137 from Economist Intelligence Unit, 83 empirical legal, 163 existing, 182 field, 82 on Indian judiciary, 135 international organizations, 82 for the JCF, 199-201 judicial, 149 justice, 131-134 on justice systems in India, source of. 136 'justiciable problems', 101 Lab, Civic, 139 on law and justice in India, 139 legal indicators, 9 managerial perspectives, 144 to measure informal justice, 35 for national lok adalats, 136 on NJDG, 135 from non-governmental organizations, 81 pervasiveness of, 114-120

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-316-51489-4 — Designing Indicators for a Plural Legal World Siddharth Peter de Souza Index <u>More Information</u>

268 | Index

platforms, open, 24 production, 29 rank-ordered, 25 rule of law, 75 sources of GPP and QRQ, 79 we need and how to collect, 199 WGL 81 demand 'audit explosion,' 24 based justice data, 200 centred perspective, 162 driven approach to access to justice, 145 legal pluralism, 57 oriented approach, 95 or user perspective, 186 people-centred and, 59 side, 89 of the users in plural legal orders, 183 Democracy Barometer, 8, 76, 79-80 Department for International Development (DFID), 58, 59 design and challenges, 13-17 of the indicators, 154 legal pluralism in, 12 of legal indicators, 12, 209 of legal institutions, 149, 154–159 through learning and adaptation, project, 98 de Sousa Santos, Boaventura, 14n36, 57n24, 119, 130n55, 156n158, 160n170, 164n1, 167 development agencies, 53 agencies, workings of, 66 agenda, 2015, 71 of building indicators, 30 Centre for Global (CGD), 20 of indicators as tools of construction, 23 of indicators, trade-offs in, 35-37

international law and, 96 of legal indicator, 112 of legal indicators, 5, 13 legal pluralism, 10 legal pluralism plays in, 55 'social science' of law and, 7 of state legal systems, 40 of Sustainable Development Goals, 100 dispute, 12, 15, 90, 103 pyramid, 105 tree, 107 dispute resolution, 1, 2, 4, 12, 19, 103, 104, 162, 164 different avenues for, 54 forums, local, 52 lok adalats, 136n82 multiple forums for, 75 in plural legal orders, 10 requires multiple points of decision-making, 106 donors, 65, 69 DREAMS (Determined, Resilient, Empowered, AIDS-free, Mentored and Safe), 67

ease of business, 21, 138 Ease of Doing Business rankings, 34-35,40 epistemic, 90n144 communities, 49 ROL, 70n80 diversity and voices from the global South, 112-113 diversifying knowledge, 159-162 engage with legal indicators, 120-127 legal institutions, design of, 154-159 managerialism, 131-134 managerial role of measuring justice, 131

Index | 269

measuring justice in India, 134-149 'messiness' of law in action, 150-154 persistence with indicators, 127-131 persisting with quantification, 114 pervasiveness of data, 114-120 plural legal indicators, 149 epistemic plurality, 112, 159, 162 epistemologies of the South, 5, 57, 119 expert, 79, 80, 126 expertise, 22, 29, 39, 41, 46, 79, 132, 133 **European Union Fundamental Rights** Agency, 27 functioning, 7, 76, 91-92, 113, 153, 156, 171 of courts, 139-140, 142, 144 of dispute resolution system, 2, 90 idea of, 170 of institutions, 53, 82-83, 146-147, 160, 209 of justice system, 4, 84 of legal systems, 6, 23, 86, 90, 93, 144, 159, 166, 200, 205 of rule of law, 81, 86-87 freedom, 9, 37, 41, 169, 183, 196, 209 access to justice in plural legal systems, 178 capabilities are concerned with real, 171 of conscience, 60 democracy and, 63 democracy barometer, 79 for a flourishing life, 170 House, Transparency International and, 118 to make choices, people's, 172 to practice their religion, 180 rights of women and individual, 150

general population poll (GPP), 79 Global North, 13, 32, 51, 62, 85, 120, 166 Global South, 4, 12, 13, 18 epistemologies of, 112 Global North and, 62 plurality, power structures and, 85-90 and plural legal contexts, 75 struggles of, 95 voices from, 112-113 diversifying knowledge, 159–162 legal indicators from, 120–127 managerialism, 131–134 measuring justice, 131 measuring justice in India, 134 - 149'messiness' of law in action, 150-154 persistence with indicators, 127-131 persisting with quantification, 114 pervasiveness of data, 114-120 plural legal indicators, 149 reality of pluralism, 154-159 governance, 2, 3, 22, 23 effect, 46 galaxy of, 32, 33 Ibrahim index of African, 8, 83 indicators of legal, 76 World Bank, 7 worldwide, 80-81 matters of law and, 95 measure human rights and, 53 networks, global, 24 rule of law in good, 31 subset of. 8 technologies of, 27, 30 Hague Institute for Innovation of Law,

Hague Institute for Innovation of Law, 84, 125 Hague Model of Access to Justice, 8, 22, 76, 83–85, 95, 106, 125, 165n5 Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-316-51489-4 — Designing Indicators for a Plural Legal World Siddharth Peter de Souza Index More Information

270 | Index

human rights, 3 Committee, 73 and Cultural Diversity', 71 German Development Aid organization, 47 gradual adherence to, 59 measuring of, 23 prioritizing efficiency over, 66 rule of law, 51 standards, 11 UN High Commissioner for, 64 universal conception of, 73 universalization of, 6 welfare state and, 69 Human Rights and Cultural Diversity, 71 Ibrahim Index on African Governance, 8,76,83 India, 21, 26, 34, 150 case of Khap Panchayats, 193 lok adalats, 66 as case study for quantification tool, 17 Economic Survey of, 137 High Courts, 136 joblessness in, 118 Justice Report, 138 Law Commission of, 136, 137 measuring justice in, 134-149 rights in, 62n40 Supreme Court of, 135 'The Rule of Law in India', 71n80 unemployment data in, 35, 118 in World Bank's Ease of Doing Business rankings, 20 indicators, 2 from below, building, 12–13 from the bottom up, 3–5 emergence of, 24-25 comparing and description, 25-27 developing an indicator, 27–30

as forms of valuation, 22 global rule of law, 144 from the Global South, 120-127 Judicial Performance, 142 and the law, 5-8 legal, 11, 31, 51-110 language and symbols of quantification, 31-35 trade-offs in the development of, 35-37 persistence with, 127-131 plural legal, 149-162 'power' of legal judgment of numbers, 44-47 presentation and representation of, 47-49 'trust' in legal, 37-38 masking of contestation, 38–42 reliability of numbers, 42-44 informal justice, 35 criminal justice and, 78 criteria to measure, 40 human rights engagement with, 73 mechanisms in a plural justice system, 93 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), 73 Article 4 of, 73 Article 14 of, 73 Article 34 of, 73 International Development Law Organization (IDLO), 67 International Labour Organization Convention, 72 international organizations in 2019, 1 context-specific rule of law programmes, 67 donor agency, 33 indigenous, 72-73 NSJS by, 58 United Nations (UN), 60

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-316-51489-4 — Designing Indicators for a Plural Legal World Siddharth Peter de Souza Index More Information

Index | 271

justice, 1-5, 8-16, 18, 19, 36, 40 civil system of, 48 delivery in plural legal systems, 96-110 design, 16 informal, 35 Justice Capabilities Framework (JCF), 5, 19, 166, 213 constructing, 178-179 basic capabilities required, 187–189 critiques and challenges of the capability approach, 179–181 demand or user perspective, 186 elements of, 184-185 interactions with the justice system, 186-187 operationalizing the capability approach, 181-183 substantive aspects of, 212–214 Justice for the Poor (J4P) project, 65n60, 68,92 justice gap, 1, 12 knowledge, 3, 18, 22-24, 27, 29, 30, 33, 43-45, 126 ecologies, 120 indicators are used as, 49 legal, 108 of the rule of law, 67 source of expertise and, 46 Law and society, 15n42, 27n30, 98n161, 174n38 Law Commission of India, 136, 137, 140n100, 143n112 law in action, 18, 113 diversity and plurality of, 160 integrating the 'messiness' of, 150 - 154messiness of, 113, 149 legal empowerment, 10, 68, 107 defined, 108 of the poor, 97

legal indicators, 3, 5, 12, 14, 15, 87, 96, 127-131, 150, 151, 161, 164 frameworks, 132 global, 114 grounded, 113 meanings of, 31 language and symbols of quantification, 31-35 trade-offs, 35-37 power of judgment of numbers, 44-47 presentation and representation of indicators, 47-49 rule of law in, 75 trust in, 37-38 masking of contestation, 38-42 reliability of numbers, 42-44 legal needs, 4, 12, 16, 84, 93, 95, 102, 145 legal pluralism, 5, 9, 52–54 absence of an engagement with, 10 - 12'access to justice' and, 164 capturing, 155 existence of, 134 impacts, 173 in the promotion of rule of law rule of law, 59-70 search for interconnections, 70 - 75unpacking, 55-59 relevance of, 148 legal systems, 11-18, 23, 48, 54, 55, 65, 71, 73, 84, 85 legitimacy, 14, 18, 40, 42, 53, 54, 56, 105, 134, 155 capacities, rules and criteria for, 10 normative, 74 of NSJS, 59 lok adalats, 66, 134n72, 136, 136n82, 143, 146, 146n122 managerialism, 131-134, 144, 149, 153,

211–212

272	Index
-----	-------

Merry, Sally Engle, 2n4, 8n24, 22n9, 24n15, 25n17, 27, 29 narratives, 4, 9, 12, 22, 33, 131, 134, 144, 160 counter, 96 divergent, 86 emerge through the numbers, 35 erasure of, 28 impact of, 36 need to pluralize its, 114-120 neutrality, 6, 22, 38 standard, 114 National Crime Records Bureau (NCRB), 136 National Judicial Data Grid (NJDG), 135 National Legal Services Authority (NALSA), 136 National Lok Adalat, 136 National Statistical Commission, 35 NonState Justice systems (NSJS), 3, 16, 52, 58, 72 numbers judgment of, 44-47 reliability of, 42-44 Nussbaum, Martha, 13, 169n16, 170n22, 172n31, 173n34, 179n58, 180, 181n68 objectivity, 7, 21-22, 27, 34, 38, 41-43, 45, 94, 132, 151 Paris Declaration (2005), 69 'parsimony,' 25 people-centred, 59, 126, 146, 164, 183, 202, 203, 210 persistence, 4, 113, 163 with indicators, 127-131 of quantification, critique to, 206-209 plural legal world, 4, 12, 19 complexity of, 110

power, 2, 9, 15, 16, 21, 40, 44, 67, 68, 78, 83, 85, 110 differentials, 128 epistemological, 112 of legal indicators, 44 judgment of numbers, 44-47 presentation and representation of indicators, 47-49 qualified respondent questionnaires (QRQ), 79 quantification, 5, 6, 13, 14, 16-18, 22, 23, 31, 33, 35-37, 44, 49, 112, 113 from critique to persistence of, 206-209 in law, 8-9 persisting with, 114 engage with legal indicators, 120-127 persistence with indicators, 127-131 pervasiveness of data, 114-120 pervasiveness of, 113 rankings, 47, 48, 74 CGD, 21 for issues, 34 law school, 43 rule of law in the good governance, 31 World Bank's Ease of Doing Business, 20 Report on the Rule of Law and Transitional Justice in Conflict and Post-Conflict Societies, 72 Romer, Paul, 21 rule of law, 2, 5, 7-11, 13, 14, 16-18, 23, 31, 32, 37, 38, 40, 48, 49 concept of, 54 index, 35 legal indicators and, 75 concept and method, 75-77

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-316-51489-4 — Designing Indicators for a Plural Legal World Siddharth Peter de Souza Index More Information

Index | 273

Democracy Barometer, 79–80 Hague model of access to justice, 83-85 Ibrahim Index of African Governance, 83 World Justice Project, 77-79 Worldwide Governance Indicators, 80-83 orthodoxy, 87 programming work, 53 promotion of, 51-111, 55 interconnections, 70-75 promotion and application, 59-70 unpacking legal pluralism, 55 - 59UN Rule of Law indicators, 76, 82-83 Sabarimala Judgment, 150 Sen, Amartya, 13, 88, 109, 151n142, 165, 170n21, 171, 172n30, 181, 207n6, 212 Snyder, Jack, 34 state, 2, 4, 6, 7, 10-12, 18, 21, 34, 40, 52, 56-59, 61, 64 State of Justice Report, 138 supply side, 9, 89, 91, 102, 104, 139, 140 Supreme Court, 48, 139, 141, 142 Annual Reports, 136 NJDG established by, 135 Sabarimala Judgment, 150 sustainable development goals (SDG), 46, 47, 100, 207, 210

tara bandu, customary law of, 62, 192 Third World Approaches to International Law (TWAIL), 96n155 transparency, 5, 7, 24, 33, 36, 40, 47, 61, 78, 79, 82, 83, 90, 91, 117 trust, 9, 20, 23, 24, 30 in legal indicators, 37-38 masking of contestation, 38–42 reliability of numbers, 42-44 state-centric, 4, 12, 54, 165, 166 United Nations (UN), 1 Children Fund, 73 Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous People, 73 Rule of Law Indicators, 8, 76, 82-83 Development Programme (UNDP), 71 United States Agency for International Development (USAID), 7 unpacking legal pluralism, 55–59 reproduction, 122, 123, 127 transformation, 122, 124, 210 World Bank, 7, 8, 20, 21, 37 and Asian Development Bank, 81 Democracy Barometer and, 92 Worldwide Governance Indicators, 8,76,80 World Justice Project (WJP), 40, 48, 74, 77-79

Rule of Law Index, 8, 76

Worldwide Governance Indicators (WGI), 80–81