

Designing Indicators for a Plural Legal World

Designing Indicators for a Plural Legal World engages with the role of quantification in law, and its impact on law and development and judicial reform. It seeks to examine how different institutions shape and influence the making and use of legal indicators globally.

This book sheds light on the limitations of existing quantification tools, which measure rule of law because of their lack of engagement with plural legal orders and countries in the Global South. It offers an alternative framework for measurement, which moves away from an institutional look at rule of law, to a bottom-up, user-centred approach that places importance on the lives that people lead, and the challenges that they face. In doing so, it offers a way of thinking about access to justice in terms of human capabilities.

Siddharth Peter de Souza is a post-doctoral researcher at the Tilburg Institute for Law, Technology and Society, Tilburg University, The Netherlands. He was previously a researcher at the Chair of Public Law and Comparative Law, Humboldt University, Berlin. He has co-edited *Mutinies for Equality: Contemporary Developments in Law and Gender in India* with Tanja Herklotz (Cambridge University Press, 2021), *Technology, Innovation and Access to Justice: Dialogues on the Future of Law* with Maximilian Spohr (2021) and *Crowdsourcing, Constructing and Collaborating: Methods and Social Impacts of Mapping with World Today* with Nida Rehman and Saba Sharma (2020).

GLOBAL LAW SERIES

The series provides unique perspectives on the way globalization is radically altering the study, discipline, and practice of law. Featuring innovative books in this growing field, the series explores those bodies of law which are becoming global in their application, and the newly emerging interdependency and interaction of different legal systems. It covers all major branches of the law and includes work on legal theory, history, and the methodology of legal practice and jurisprudence under conditions of globalization. Offering a major platform on global law, these books provide essential reading for students and scholars of comparative, international, and transnational law.

Series Editors

M. E. A. Goodwin
Tilburg University

Randall Lesaffer
KU Leuven & Tilburg University

David Nelken
King's College London

Han Somsen
Tilburg University

Books in the Series

Intimations of Global Law
Neil Walker

Legalized Families in the Era of Bordered Globalization
Daphna Hacker

Transnational Sustainability Laws
Phillip Paiement

The Sociology of Law and the Global Transformation of Democracy
Chris Thornhill

Authority and the Globalisation of Inclusion and Exclusion
Hans Lindahl

Property Law in a Globalizing World
Amnon Lehavi

*The Law of the List: UN Counterterrorism Sanctions and the Politics of Global
Security Law*
Gavin Sullivan

Democratic Crisis and Global Constitutional Law
Christopher Thornhill

The Redress of Law: Globalisation, Constitutionalism and Market Capture
Emilios Christodoulidis

9/11 and the Rise of Global Anti-Terrorism Law
Arianna Vidaschi and Kim L. Scheppele

On Tyranny and the Global Legal Order
Aoife O'Donoghue

Entangled Legalities beyond the State
Nico Krisch

Designing Indicators for a Plural Legal World

Siddharth Peter de Souza



Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-316-51489-4 — Designing Indicators for a Plural Legal World
Siddharth Peter de Souza
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, vic 3207, Australia

314 to 321, 3rd Floor, Plot No.3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316514894

© Siddharth Peter de Souza 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

Printed in India

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-316-51489-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-316-51489-4 — Designing Indicators for a Plural Legal World
Siddharth Peter de Souza
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

*For Mama and Dada
Tigers in my corner*

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
1 Introduction	1
2 ‘Meanings’, ‘Trust’ and ‘Power’: Critical Perspectives on Legal Indicators	20
3 Rule of Law Promotion, Legal Indicators and Legal Pluralism	51
4 Epistemic Diversity and Voices from the Global South: Countering the Managerial Implications Of Measuring Justice	112
5 A Capability Approach to Access to Justice in Plural Legal Systems	164
6 Conclusion	204
<i>Appendix</i>	215
<i>Bibliography</i>	219
<i>Index</i>	265

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-316-51489-4 — Designing Indicators for a Plural Legal World
Siddharth Peter de Souza
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisor Professor Philipp Dann for being a supportive and engaged mentor throughout my doctoral studies at Humboldt University, Berlin. To the team at the Chair of Public Law and Comparative Law, Smarika Lulz, Dr Tanja Herklotz, Maxim Bönnemann, Thomas Dollmaier, Dr Konrad Vossen, Dr Michael Riegner, Medha Srivastava, Juliane Brauer and Corinna Roudani, thank you for being open and collaborative over these years with your feedback and comments. Lisa Hahn and Dr Larissa Veters helped me think through my project with a socio-legal lens and worked with me through demystifying methods and making them fun. Thanks to several others who have been part of the Chair including Gabriel Noll, Katharina Wommelsdorf, Katharina Hufgard, Freya Schramm, Hoa Vuong and Nadja Baumert. Thanks also to Professor Mattias Kumm for his feedback and suggestions on the thesis.

I would like to thank Amos Helms and Pankaj Madan from the Konrad Adenauer Stiftung for supporting my research with a doctoral scholarship. The generosity of the foundation helped make studying and living in Berlin possible.

This research was initially influenced by my time at the Max Planck Foundation for International Peace and Rule of Law and a very special thanks is due to Dr Tilmann Röder for being available to discuss my project over the years. I have also benefitted from my time as a judicial clerk in Delhi; thank you also to Justice S. Muralidhar for his engagement and advice. During the PhD I had an opportunity to have many useful discussions in India when I conducted exploratory interviews with Dr Melvil Pereira, Ms Sharifa Khanam, Dr V. Geetha, Dr Usha Ramanathan,

xii | Acknowledgements

Ms Patricia Mukhim, Dr Jeuti Barooah, Professor Gassah, Professor Vidhu Verma, Professor Sudhir Krishnaswamy, Professor Sitharamam Kakarala, Professor Siddharth Swaminathan, Professor Arun Thiruvengadam, Professor Nehsat Quaiser, Professor Mohan Gopal, Professor Alito Siqueira, Professor Sasheej Hegde, Justice B. S. Chauhan and Dr Aparna Chandra. These discussions helped me gain further insights into understanding the landscape of judicial data in India, and the place of legal pluralism in India's judicial architecture.

During a research stay at the Centre for Socio-Legal Studies in Oxford, I had very insightful conversations with Professor William Twining on how to shape my research as a dialogue with existing work on legal indicators. I am also thankful to Professor Fernanda Pirie, Professor Jonathan Wolff, Dr Tania Burchardt, Dr Surabhi Ranganathan and Professor David Nelken for making time and offering generous feedback during my research stay in the UK. Thank you to Professor Yash Ghai and Mr Waikwa Wanyoike for their time and advice in understanding constitution making and legal pluralism in Kenya. Thank you also to my colleagues at Tilburg University where I have completed the work on this book, and especially Professor Linnet Taylor for her support. Thank you also to Professor Morag Goodwin and Professor David Nelken for their feedback while including the book in the Global Law Series, and to the great team at Cambridge University Press, Qudsiya Ahmed, Anwasha Rana and Aniruddha De, for their wonderful support. Thanks to Shamoli Barreto for the painting that is used on the cover.

Thank you Patsy, Merlin and Usha for being my Berlin family, and for all their generosity in making me immediately feel welcome and supported in a new city. Thank you to Marja for her support. I am grateful to Pravesh and Rashmi, my in-laws who gave up their study for me in Delhi and who have been full of encouragement and humour as I have navigated working through the book. Thank you to Dhulari and Anastasia, for all their care and reinforcement during my writing in Goa.

My sisters Gayatri and Roshni have been a source of constant cheer and affection knowing when to motivate, when to listen and when to nudge, and I hope to play the same role as they work through their PhDs. Their support has been invaluable and I thank them very much for being there and seeing me through this project.

Saba and I have journeyed through our PhDs together and I am very happy we did so. She has been a sounding board for many of my ideas, provided comfort for many anxieties with the research, and been a source of

motivation by finishing her PhD before me (despite all my bold predictions of finishing before). Her companionship and love have been instrumental throughout these past few years.

My parents Peter and Ligia are the reason why I first thought of doing a PhD. Their confidence, support and love every step of the way has given me the freedom to work on things that I enjoy and in the process explore the life of the mind. None of this would have been possible without having them in my corner, and I am very lucky to have them as interlocutors and buddies. I dedicate this book to them.