

GROWTH AND SURVIVAL

Bridging disparate literatures on courts and the legal profession in China, Jonathan J. Kinkel introduces an innovative cross-disciplinary framework to understand the reality of Chinese politics and society. Fusing a variety of perspectives from social ecology, historical institutionalism, and empirical legal studies, Kinkel contextualizes patterns of court reform within China's rapid economic and social transformations. This book's extensive case studies emphasize the dynamic expansion of the legal system in the post-Mao reform period and demonstrate that law firm growth in large cities, especially in the early twenty-first century, pressured courts at the local and national levels to enhance judicial autonomy. Advancing debates on the multiplicity of political–legal regimes, this book offers a comprehensive, empirical account of how reforms in both the public and private arenas can interact and operate alongside one another.

JONATHAN J. KINKEL is a lecturer in the School of Politics and Global Studies at Arizona State University, where his research has focused on the intersection between comparative politics, law and society, and Chinese studies. He is also an Associate in Research with the Fairbank Center for Chinese Studies at Harvard University. He is a past recipient of the Best Graduate Student Paper award from Law & Social Inquiry (LSI), and his research has appeared in journals including *LSI*, *China Quarterly*, and the *Journal of East Asian Studies*. This is his first book.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-316-51436-8 — Growth and Survival
Jonathan J. Kinkel
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

GROWTH AND SURVIVAL

An Ecological Analysis of Court Reform
in Urban China

JONATHAN J. KINKEL
Arizona State University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316514368

DOI: 10.1017/9781009086868

© Jonathan J. Kinkel 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Kinkel, Jonathan J., author.

Title: Growth and survival : an ecological analysis of court reform in urban China / Jonathan J. Kinkel, Arizona State University.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY :

Cambridge University Press, 2022. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021970022 | ISBN 9781316514368 (hardback) |

ISBN 9781009086868 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Courts – China. | Judges – China. | Justice, Administration of – China.

Classification: LCC KNQ1580 .K56 2022 | DDC 347.5101–dc23/eng/20220131

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021970022>

ISBN 978-1-316-51436-8 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

for Rey

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-316-51436-8 — Growth and Survival
Jonathan J. Kinkel
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CONTENTS

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i>	ix
<i>List of Tables</i>		x
<i>Acknowledgments</i>		xi
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>		xiii
1 Introduction	1	
A New Theoretical Approach to Court Reform in China		5
Chapter Summaries		9
Conclusion		11
2 An Ecological Theory of Court Reform in Urban China	12	
The Central Puzzle and Extant Theoretical Explanations		14
Court Change in Urban China through the Lens of Ecology		18
Conceptualizing and Measuring the Outcome		
Variable: Personal Judicial Autonomy		33
Case Studies: The Interrelated Spatial and Temporal		
Aspects of Courts in Urban China		38
Conclusion		45
3 The Judicial Cadre Evaluation System: Foundational Institutional Incentives Undergirded by “Intra-state Legibility”	48	
The Emergence of Unified Judicial Performance		
Evaluation, 1980–2014		52
The Boundary between Boss and Worker: The Collective		
Nature of Court Leader Performance Evaluation		
in China Prior to the 2014–2016 Judicial Reforms		55
Quantified Assessment of Ordinary Judges		
and the Saliency of Intrastate Legibility		60
Intrastate Legibility Supplants Formal Rewards		
and Punishments		64
Conclusion		67

4 High-End Demand for Legal Services and Local Pressure to Professionalize the Judiciary	70
The First Two Decades of the Post-Mao Legal Profession in China: From State Legal Worker to “Unhooked” Private Counsel (1979–2000)	72
The Emergence of Localized Markets for Private Legal Services (2000–present)	76
Local Law Market Revenues and Characteristics	83
The Suitability of Judges for Law Firm Careers in Urban China	86
Conclusion	90
5 Expansions in Competitive Promotion and the Implications for Judicial Autonomy	93
Changes to Judicial Selection and Promotion Before and After 1992	95
The Effects of High-End Demand on Judicial Selection and Promotion: Case Study Comparison	104
Transparency Rankings: Case Study Comparison (2012–2013)	112
Autonomy Reflected in Published Judicial Opinions (2006–2011): Case Study Comparison	116
Conclusion	125
6 Court Personnel, Bureaucratic Specialization, and the Limits of Top-Down Theory	127
Personnel Policy and the Origins of the PRC Court System	128
Case Studies on Bureaucratic Specialization in Local Courts	138
Conclusion	146
7 Conclusion	148
Historical Perspectives, Post-2016 Realities, and the Limits of This Study	152
Building a Research Agenda	156
Lessons for Authoritarian Judiciaries	161
Conclusion	164
<i>Appendix</i>	167
<i>References</i>	168
<i>Index</i>	183

FIGURES

- 1.1 FDI and law firm growth *page 9*
- 2.1 Map of primary case study cities 41
- 4.1 Selected annual estimates of lawyer income across
local legal services case study cities (as of 2014) 80
- 5.1 Summary of general procedure for promoting mid-level judicial
cadres (2012–2014) 101
- 5.2 Local courts' scores on the 2012–2013 CASS Transparency
Index (max score = 100) 114

TABLES

1.1	Periodization of political–legal reform in post-Mao China, with focus on 1992–2016	<i>page</i> 4
2.1	Overview of judicial rankings at an intermediate-level court in urban China (as of 2014)	30
2.2	Review of variation in judges’ decisional autonomy across urban court case studies (2012–2014)	44
3.1	Selection of indices deemed important in Chinese lower courts’ Case Quality Assessment System (2008–2013)	58
4.1	Variation in revenue from legal services across selected Chinese provinces (2009)	84
4.2	Summary of revenue from lawyer practice (2004 and 2006)	85
4.3	Distribution of case type across localities (2004)	85
5.1	Review of variation in competitive promotion across urban court case studies (2012–2014)	111
5.2	Review of variation in competition and transparency across cases (2012–2014)	115
5.3	Measures of “giving reasons requirement” (opinion length and citation count) and mediation rate across case study localities (2006–2011)	124
6.1	Chengdu Intermediate People’s Court, internal structure (2012)	140
6.2	Shenzhen Intermediate Court, internal structure (2013)	142
6.3	Shanghai Second Intermediate Court, internal structure (2013)	145

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am more than fortunate to have received the support of many friends and colleagues during the years spent writing this book. First, my advisers and dissertation committee members at the University of Texas deserve much of the credit, and none of the blame, for the following pages. This project would not have been possible without Dan Brinks' constructive, incisive feedback on seemingly countless drafts of chapters and article manuscripts. Bill Hurst has been as important an influence as anyone on this project, intellectually and personally; I thank Bill not only for his mentorship, but also for his collegial and collaborative spirit. Zachary Elkins, Patricia Maclachlan, and H. W. Perry never assumed secondary status in their roles as committee members, providing indispensable advice and timely revisions to draft manuscripts. As scholars whose substantive interests in the discipline overlap in many ways with mine, their non-China perspectives have proven both fresh and valuable.

Many others provided important help revising earlier drafts or offered comments at various conferences and invited talks in the past few years. I particularly thank Mary Gallagher, Nico Howson, Sida Liu, Eva Pils, Ethan Michelson, Rachel Stern, and Yuhua Wang. For all of the guidance from these scholars and from my dissertation committee, any remaining flaws in reasoning are mine alone.

I would not have been able to conduct the fieldwork in China upon which this book relies without the help of Professor Wang Qian at East China University of Political Science and Law (ECUPL) in Shanghai, who hosted my research and helped arrange for me to serve as a visiting professor at ECUPL during 2012–2013. I am grateful for the financial support of the Boren Fellowship, the University of Texas at Austin's Government Department, the University of Texas College of Liberal Arts, the Chinese University of Hong Kong, and Arizona State University, which all provided funding at various points of my research and writing from 2012 to 2021.

Many Mandarin teachers in the United States and China have corrected my tones, comprehension, and basic writing skills over the years,

providing me with the indispensable language foundation that I used to conduct this study's interviews and documentary analysis. More Chinese teachers than I can remember deserve my gratitude, but I would like to particularly thank Camille Hsieh and Jeanette Chen for their patience and persistence at a time when my naivete in the language would have been comical if not for my sincerity.

Numerous friends in China who cannot be named here provided indispensable help finding contacts and arranging interviews and stays in several cities throughout China, and I owe them all a debt of gratitude. I also thank Christian Sorace, Eddie Schmitt, Bill McCormick, and many others for their friendships at difficult moments of graduate school and the book drafting process.

At Cambridge University Press, I sincerely thank Finola O'Sullivan and Joe Ng for encouragement and support of the project, as well as three anonymous reviewers who provided constructive and helpful reviews that shaped the manuscript in significant ways.

Most importantly, I would like to thank my family for constantly supporting me before, during, and after this project was launched. My parents no doubt did more in this regard than anyone. Danielle and Ben have always provided encouragement and a warm, happy home-away-from-home on the many trips I have taken to Boston for "a little R&R" (relaxation and research). Of course, my wife Nichole has lived this book as much as I have, and looking back, the much-needed distractions she and our daughters brought me over the past few years will always be the most cherished part of the time spent moving this project along.

ABBREVIATIONS

CASS	Chinese Academy of Social Sciences
CCP	Chinese Communist Party
CQAS	Case Quality Assessment System
ECUPL	East China University of Political Science and Law
FDI	foreign direct investment
IP	intellectual property
KMT	<i>Kuomintang</i>
MOJ	Ministry of Justice
OD	Organization Department (of the CCP)
PRC	People's Republic of China
SAIC	State Administration for Industry and Commerce
SEZ	Special Economic Zone
SPC	Supreme People's Court
TMRS	Target Management Responsibility System
TRIPs	Trade-related intellectual property rights
USCBC	US-China Business Council
WTO	World Trade Organization

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-316-51436-8 — Growth and Survival
Jonathan J. Kinkel
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
