

CICERO AND THE PEOPLE'S WILL

This book tells an overlooked story in the history of ideas, a drama of cut-throat politics and philosophy of mind. For it is Cicero, statesman and philosopher, who gives shape to the notion of will in Western thought, from criminal will to moral willpower and “the will of the people”. In a single word – *voluntas* – he brings Roman law into contact with Greek ideas, chief among them Plato’s claim that a rational elite must rule. When the Republic falls to Caesarism, Cicero turns his political argument inward: Will is a force in the soul to win the virtue lost on the battlefield, the mark of inner freedom in an unfree age. Though this constitutional vision failed in his own time, Cicero’s ideals of popular sovereignty and rational elitism have shaped and fractured the modern world – and Ciceronian creativity might save it.

LEX PAULSON is Executive Director of the Université Mohammed VI Polytechnique School of Collective Intelligence (Morocco) and lectures in advocacy at Sciences Po, Paris. Trained in classics and community organizing, he served as a mobilization strategist for the presidential campaigns of Barack Obama in 2008 and Emmanuel Macron in 2017. He has led projects in democratic innovation and leadership for UNICEF, the US State Department, the French National Assembly, and the National Democratic Institute. He served as legislative counsel in the 111th US Congress (2009–2011), organized on six US presidential campaigns, and has worked to advance democratic innovation at the European Commission and in India, Tunisia, Egypt, Uganda, Senegal, the Czech Republic, and Ukraine.

CICERO AND THE
PEOPLE'S WILL

*Philosophy and Power at the End of the
Roman Republic*

LEX PAULSON

Université Mohammed VI Polytechnique



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-316-51411-5 — Cicero and the People's Will
 Lex Paulson
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316514115

DOI: 10.1017/9781009082587

© Lex Paulson 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Paulson, Lex, author.

TITLE: Cicero and the people's will : philosophy and power at the end of the Roman Republic /
 Lex Paulson.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2023. |
 Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2022030496 (print) | LCCN 2022030497 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316514115
 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009077385 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009082587 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Cicero, Marcus Tullius—Political and social views. | Political science—Philosophy—
 History—To 1500. | Republicanism. | Will. | Elite (Social sciences)—Political activity. |
 Rome—Politics and government—265–30 B.C. | Rome—History—Republic, 265–30 B.C.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC JC81.C7 P36 2023 (print) | LCC JC81.C7 (ebook) |
 DDC 320.101—dc23/eng/20220825

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022030496>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022030497>

ISBN 978-1-316-51411-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

Pour la mère extraordinaire

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xii
Introduction	I
PART I THE PRACTICE OF <i>VOLUNTAS</i>	
1 Forebears of Will	17
1.1 Greek Forebears	18
1.2 Latin Forebears	24
2 Innocence and Intent	32
2.1 Legitimacy and Rationality	35
2.2 <i>Controversia ex Scripto et Sententia</i>	38
2.3 Capturing Goodwill	41
2.4 Guilty and Righteous Wills	46
3 Cartographies of Power	57
3.1 Intentions, Alliances, and Schemes	61
3.2 <i>Sua</i> and <i>Summa Voluntate</i>	63
3.3 <i>Voluntas</i> as Affiliation	67
3.4 Boundaries of Political Will	69
3.5 Caesar's <i>Voluntas</i>	75
4 An Economy of Goodwill	79
4.1 The Rules of <i>Voluntas Mutua</i>	84
4.2 The <i>Voluntas</i> Economy	92
4.3 Theorizing <i>Voluntas Mutua</i>	98
5 <i>Voluntas Populi</i> : The Will of the People	105
5.1 Introduction: <i>In Verrem</i>	105
5.2 "I of All Men, Who to Serve the Will of the People . . ."	109
5.3 <i>De republica</i> and <i>De legibus</i>	122
5.4 Ruin and Rebirth	140

PART II THE PHILOSOPHY OF *VOLUNTAS*

6	Willpower	147
6.1	Cicero on Platonic and Stoic Souls	150
6.2	<i>Tusculan Disputations</i> : Cicero's Struggle for Reason	157
6.3	Conclusion: Willing, Willpower, and the Will	164
7	Free Will and the Forum	169
7.1	Lucretius' <i>Libera Voluntas</i>	171
7.2	Cicero's <i>Libera Voluntas</i>	175
7.3	The Politics of Free Will	181
8	The Fourfold Self	186
8.1	The Four <i>Personae</i> : Background and Problems	189
8.2	Will and the Four <i>Personae</i>	195
8.3	Conclusion: Scipio and Foucault	214
	Conclusion	218
	Epilogue: The Afterlife of Cicero's <i>Voluntas</i>	220
	<i>Appendix Occurrences of Voluntas in the Works of Cicero</i>	245
	<i>References</i>	247
	<i>Index</i>	265

Acknowledgments

This book began with a volcano. When Eyjafjallajökull filled Iceland's sky with billowing ash in spring 2010, two traveling friends, Adrien Muller and Rachel Welland (now Muller), were unable to return home from Washington, DC, to Europe. After a sumptuous dinner at Cactus Cantina, Adrien asked if I had considered moving to Paris – a city I had loved from afar – and starting a PhD. A few months later, to my parents' dismay, I traded the life of an overworked, underpaid congressional staffer for that of an overworked, underpaid doctoral student. It was the best decision of my life.

First thanks go, therefore, to Adrien and to his friend Jean-Pierre Reboul, who first helped me navigate the *milieu universitaire*, revising – to be fair, redrafting – the halting French of my Paris-bound emails, making me an infinitely more plausible potential *thésard*. That I was welcomed at the Sorbonne and survived my first brush with its bureaucracy intact I owe to their generosity and *savoir faire*.

My route to Cicero was equally circuitous. John Matthews' survey of Roman history, studied in my final undergraduate semester at Yale, kindled a fascination for the late Republic that blazed through my twenties as I knocked doors for candidates in Connecticut and New Hampshire. One of those campaigns, for a *novus homo* from Chicago in 2008, ended up returning me to my muggy hometown of Washington, DC, and its *collis capitolinus*. Those years on the campaign trail, in courtrooms and legislative chambers, brought me closer without knowing it to the man at the heart of this book.

My new home in Paris also put me two train rides away from the place that became this study's second home. The venerable footpaths to Christ's College, Clare College, and Michaelhouse Cafe in Cambridge were worn a bit deeper through many subsequent trips. David Sedley patiently cleared the debris from my understanding of Hellenistic logic, ethics, and physics.

Acknowledgments

Paul Cartledge not only guided me to the vistas of δημοκρατία but put his painstaking pen to work in revisions to these pages. And over many cups of tea and scones, Malcolm Schofield illuminated the corners of Cicero's corpus as no one else could. That David and Malcolm then offered to serve as jury members for the resulting thesis was a great honor. For the time, generosity, and insights of this eminent trio, I owe tremendous thanks.

At the Sorbonne, my path was made perennially smoother by the kindness of Hélène Casanova-Robin. Her friendly counsel was critical at many stages of this work, as was that of Margaret Graver, Valentina Arena, Jean-Michel David, François Prost, Paul Demont, Sabine Luciani, and Jean-Louis Ferrary. I owe a special word of thanks to Philippe Rousselot and Ermanno Malaspina, who welcomed me with hospitality into the Society of Cicero's Friends. The *secrétaire adjoint* of my initial draft was Guillaume Peynet, a young scholar of astonishing brilliance, who contributed his mastery of this work's four main languages. Whatever felicities of expression were in the French version of my thesis, I owe them to Guillaume; any faults were purely my own. Tina Bouffet kindly offered her generous translation help – and much-needed good humor – at a critical phase. I add my thanks to my editors, Michael Sharp and Katie Idle, as well as to the two anonymous readers of this manuscript, whose corrections were invaluable in its final phases. The staff of Café Le Seigné and Le Rendezvous des Amis kept me equipped with green tea – and stronger fare – during editing sessions that were long even by the standards of Parisian table-lingering. And I owe gratitude to my students and colleagues at the UM6P School of Collective Intelligence, tested and annealed the ideas herein.

As for the director of the thesis, I would need the Arpinate's tongue to give proper words of praise. From his (to me, still baffling) decision to accept me as a doctoral student, to his proposal to make *voluntas* my subject, to the encyclopedic command of ancient thought he has shared, Carlos Lévy is a mentor beyond my hopes and desert. He has taught me the meaning of goodwill.

Finally, an offering to my own *maiores*. To Donna Sabin, my *maman deux*, who made my Paris transhumance possible. To Pat Howell, who planted philosophical seeds on Faraday Place that I will take a lifetime to harvest. To my magnificent teachers at St. Albans, and in particular Donna Denizé, Jim Ehrenhaft, Paul Barrett, Thierry Boussard, Paul Piazza, Tom Carroll, and the inimitable Ted Eagles, each of whom spurred and guided me to new vistas of the mind. To Marshall Ganz, who taught me that noble ideas and effective politics could be woven together in a common

Acknowledgments

xi

story. And to my departed hero and mentor, Harold Bloom – O *papa gnosticorum*, Odyssean overhearer – I give libations of Levon and bear our Gnosis forth to wilder strands.

This thesis is dedicated, at last, to my mother, the extraordinary Elizabeth Custis; to my father, Bill, a poet-in-residence at the end of the mind; and to my wife, Rahma, and our daughter, Illi Zahra, for whom my love would fill the Tiber and cover the seven hills. Whatever spark of humanism lights my soul, I have it from you.

Abbreviations

Aesch.	Aeschylus
<i>Supp.</i>	<i>Supplices</i>
Aët	Aëtius
Alex. <i>Fat.</i>	Alexander of Aphrodisias, <i>On Fate</i>
Arist.	Aristotle
<i>Eth. Eud.</i>	<i>Ethica Eudemia</i>
<i>Eth. Nic.</i>	<i>Ethica Nicomachea</i>
[<i>Mag. mor.</i>]	<i>Magna moralia</i>
<i>Pol.</i>	<i>Politica</i>
August.	Augustine
Conf.	Confessions
De civ. D.	De civitate Dei
Aul. Gell.	see Gell.
Cic.	Cicero (Marcus Tullius)
<i>Acad.</i>	<i>Academicae quaestiones</i>
<i>Acad. post.</i>	<i>Academica posteriora</i> (= Plasberg, Bk. 4)
<i>Acad. Pr.</i>	<i>Academica Priora</i> (= Plasberg, Bk. 1)
<i>Ad Brut.</i>	<i>Epistulae ad Brutum</i>
<i>Amic.</i>	<i>De amicitia</i>
<i>Arch.</i>	<i>Pro Archia</i>
<i>Att.</i>	<i>Epistulae ad Atticum</i>
<i>Balb.</i>	<i>Pro Balbo</i>
<i>Brut.</i>	<i>Brutus</i> or <i>De Claris Oratoribus</i>
<i>Caecin.</i>	<i>Pro Caecina</i>
<i>Cael.</i>	<i>Pro Caelio</i>
<i>Cat.</i>	<i>In Catilinam</i>
<i>Clu.</i>	<i>Pro Cluentio</i>
<i>De or.</i>	<i>De oratore</i>
<i>Deiot.</i>	<i>Pro rege Deiotaro</i>
<i>Div.</i>	<i>De divinatione</i>

List of Abbreviations

xiii

<i>Div. Caec.</i>	<i>Divinatio in Caecilium</i>
<i>Dom.</i>	<i>De domo sua</i>
<i>Fam.</i>	<i>Epistulae ad familiares</i>
<i>Fat.</i>	<i>De fato</i>
<i>Fin.</i>	<i>De finibus</i>
<i>Flac.</i>	<i>Pro Flacco</i>
<i>Font.</i>	<i>Pro Fonteio</i>
<i>Har. resp.</i>	<i>De haruspicum responso</i>
<i>Inv.</i>	<i>De inventione</i>
<i>Leg.</i>	<i>De legibus</i>
<i>Leg. agr.</i>	<i>De lege agraria</i>
<i>Leg. Man.</i>	<i>Pro lege Manilia or De imperio Cn. Pompeii</i>
<i>Lig.</i>	<i>Pro Ligario</i>
<i>Luc.</i>	<i>Lucullus or Academica posteriora</i>
<i>Marcell.</i>	<i>Pro Marcello</i>
<i>Mil.</i>	<i>Pro Milone</i>
<i>Mur.</i>	<i>Pro Murena</i>
<i>Nat. D.</i>	<i>De natura deorum</i>
<i>Off.</i>	<i>De officiis</i>
<i>Orat.</i>	<i>Orator ad M. Brutum</i>
<i>Part. or.</i>	<i>Partitiones oratoriae</i>
<i>Phil.</i>	<i>Orationes Philippicae</i>
<i>Pis.</i>	<i>In Pisonem</i>
<i>Planc.</i>	<i>Pro Plancio</i>
<i>Prov. cons.</i>	<i>De provinciis consularibus</i>
<i>QFr.</i>	<i>Epistulae ad Quintum fratrem</i>
<i>QRosc.</i>	<i>Pro Roscio comoedo</i>
<i>Quinct.</i>	<i>Pro Quinctio</i>
<i>Rab. Post.</i>	<i>Pro Rabirio Postumo</i>
<i>Red. pop.</i>	<i>Post reditum ad populum</i>
<i>Red. sen.</i>	<i>Post reditum in senatu</i>
<i>Rep.</i>	<i>De republica</i>
<i>Rosc. Am.</i>	<i>Pro Sexto Roscio Amerino</i>
<i>Scaur.</i>	<i>Pro Scauro</i>
<i>Sest.</i>	<i>Pro Sestio</i>
<i>Sull.</i>	<i>Pro Sulla</i>
<i>Top.</i>	<i>Topica</i>
<i>Tusc.</i>	<i>Tusculanae disputationes</i>
<i>Vat.</i>	<i>In Vatinius</i>
<i>Verr.</i>	<i>In Verrem</i>

Cicero, <i>Comment. pet.</i>	Cicero (Quintus), <i>Commentariolum petitionis</i>
<i>Dig.</i>	<i>Digesta</i>
<i>Dio Cass.</i>	<i>Dio Cassius</i>
Dio Chrys. <i>Or.</i>	Dio Chrysostomus <i>Orationes</i>
Diod. Sic.	Diodorus Siculus
Diog. Laert.	Diogenes Laertius
Epicurus	Epicurus
Ep. Men.	Epistula ad Menoeceum
Sent. Vat.	Vatican Sayings = Gnomologium Vaticanum
Hom.	Homer
Euseb.	Eusebius
Praep. evang.	Praeparatio evangelica
Gell.	Aulus Gellius
NA	Noctes Atticae
Hdt.	Herodotus
Hom.	Homer
<i>Il.</i>	<i>Iliad</i>
<i>Od.</i>	<i>Odyssey</i>
Hyp.	Hyperides
Liv. Andron. <i>Ter.</i>	Livius Andronicus, <i>Tereus</i>
Lucil.	Lucilius
Lucr.	Lucretius
M. Aur. Med.	Marcus Aurelius, <i>Meditations</i>
Men.	Menander
Dys.	Dyskolos
Phld.	Philodemus
Pl.	Plato
Grg.	Gorgias
Leg.	Laws
Phd.	Phaedo
Phdr.	Phaedrus
Resp.	Republic
Plaut.	Plautus
Curc.	Curculio
Men.	Menaechmi
Merc.	Mercator
Mil.	Miles gloriosus
Poen.	Poenulus
Pseud.	Pseudolus
Rud.	Rudens

List of Abbreviations

xv

Stich.	Stichus
Trin.	Trinummus
Plin.	Pliny (the Younger)
<i>Ep.</i>	<i>Epistulae</i>
Plut.	Plutarch
<i>An seni</i>	<i>An seni respublica gerenda sit</i>
Cic.	Cicero
<i>Quaest. conv.</i>	<i>Quaestiones convivales</i>
Polyb.	Polybius
Quint.	Quintilian
Inst.	Institutio oratoria
<i>Rhet. Her.</i>	<i>Rhetorica ad Herennium</i>
Sall.	Sallust
[<i>Ad Caes. sen.</i>]	<i>Epistulae ad Caesarem senem</i>
<i>Cat.</i>	<i>Bellum Catilinae</i> or <i>De Catilinae coniuratione</i>
<i>Hist.</i>	<i>Historiae</i>
<i>Iug.</i>	<i>Bellum Iugurthinum</i>
Sen.	Seneca (the Younger)
<i>Ep.</i>	<i>Epistulae</i>
Sext. Emp.	Sextus Empiricus
Math.	Adversus mathematicos
Stob.	Stobaeus
Suet.	Suetonius
Tac.	Tacitus
<i>Agr.</i>	<i>Agricola</i>
<i>Ann.</i>	<i>Annales</i>
Ter.	Terence
<i>Ad.</i>	<i>Adelphoe</i>
<i>An.</i>	<i>Andria</i>
<i>Eun.</i>	<i>Eunuchus</i>
<i>Haut.</i>	<i>H(e)autontimorumenos</i>
<i>Hec.</i>	<i>Hecyra</i>
<i>Phorm.</i>	<i>Phormio</i>
Varro, <i>Ling.</i>	Varro, <i>De lingua Latina</i>
Xen.	Xenophon
Hell.	Hellenica

