

Mobilizing for Elections

Politicians in Southeast Asia, as in many other regions, win elections by distributing cash, goods, jobs, projects, and other benefits to supporters, but the ways in which they do this vary tremendously, both across and within countries. *Mobilizing for Elections* presents a new framework for analyzing variation in patronage democracies, focusing on distinct forms of patronage and different networks through which it is distributed. The book draws on an extensive, multi-country, multi-year research effort involving interactions with hundreds of politicians and vote brokers, as well as surveys of voters and political campaigners across the region. Chapters explore how local machines in the Philippines, ad hoc election teams in Indonesia, and political parties in Malaysia pursue distinctive clusters of strategies of patronage distribution – what the authors term *electoral mobilization regimes*. In doing so, the book shows how and why patronage politics varies, and how it works on the ground.

Edward Aspinall is Professor of Political Science and Social Change at the Australian National University. He is the author of *Opposing Suharto: Compromise, Resistance and Regime Change in Indonesia* (2005), *Islam and Nation: Separatist Rebellion in Aceh, Indonesia* (2009) and *Democracy for Sale: Elections, Clientelism and the State in Indonesia* (2019, with Ward Berenschot).

Meredith L. Weiss is Professor of Political Science at the University at Albany, SUNY. She is the author of *Protest and Possibilities: Civil Society and Coalitions for Political Change in Malaysia* (2006), *Student Activism in Malaysia: Crucible, Mirror, Sideshow* (2011), and *The Roots of Resilience: Party Machines and Grassroots Politics in Southeast Asia* (2020).

Allen Hicken is Professor of Political Science at the University of Michigan. He is the author, editor, or co-editor of *Building Party Systems in Developing Democracies* (2009), *Politics of Modern Southeast Asia* (2010), *Party and Party System Institutionalization in Asia* (2014), and *Electoral Dynamics in the Philippines* (2019).

Paul D. Hutchcroft is Professor of Political Science and Social Change at the Australian National University. He is the author of *Booty Capitalism: The Politics of Banking in the Philippines* (1998) and editor of *Mindanao: The Long Journey to Peace and Prosperity* (2016) and *Strong Patronage, Weak Parties: The Case for Electoral System Redesign in the Philippines* (2019).

Mobilizing for Elections

Patronage and Political Machines in Southeast Asia

EDWARD ASPINALL

Australian National University

MEREDITH L. WEISS

University at Albany, State University of New York

ALLEN HICKEN

University of Michigan

PAUL D. HUTCHCROFT

Australian National University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-316-51380-4 — Mobilizing for Elections

Edward Aspinall, Meredith L. Weiss, Allen Hicken, Paul D. Hutchcroft

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316513804

DOI: 10.1017/9781009075015

© Edward Aspinall, Meredith L. Weiss, Allen Hicken, and Paul D. Hutchcroft 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Aspinall, Edward, author. | Weiss, Meredith L. (Meredith Leigh), 1972- author. |

Hicken, Allen, 1969- author. | Hutchcroft, Paul D. (Paul David), author.

TITLE: Mobilizing for elections : patronage and political machines in Southeast Asia / Edward

Aspinall, Meredith L. Weiss, Allen Hicken, Paul D. Hutchcroft.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2022. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021063115 (print) | LCCN 2021063116 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316513804

(hardback) | ISBN 9781009074827 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009075015 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Politics, Practical—Southeast Asia—Case studies. | Patron and client—Southeast

Asia—Case studies. | Southeast Asia—Politics and government—1945—Case studies. | BISAC:

POLITICAL SCIENCE / World / General

CLASSIFICATION: LCC JQ750.A91 A78 2022 (print) | LCC JQ750.A91 (ebook) | DDC

320.959—dc23/eng/20220304

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021063115>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021063116>

ISBN 978-1-316-51380-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> vi
<i>List of Tables</i>	vii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	viii
<i>List of Terms and Acronyms</i>	xi
1 Patronage and Political Machines in Southeast Asia	I
2 Historical and Institutional Foundations: States, Parties, Constituencies for Patronage, and Electoral Systems	3 I
3 Mobilization Networks and Patterns of Patronage: National Parties, Ad Hoc Teams, and Local Machines	67
4 Targeting Individuals: Don't You Forget about Me	99
5 Targeting Groups: Pork Barreling and Club Goods	125
6 Hijacked Programs: Using Public Policy for Patronage Purposes	150
7 Patronage and Identity: Domesticating Difference	176
8 Subnational Variation: Violence, Hierarchy, and Islands of Exception	204
9 Conclusion: Patterns, Permutations, and Reform Prospects	235
<i>Appendix A: Surveys</i>	257
<i>Appendix B: Subnational Government and Electoral Systems</i>	265
<i>Bibliography</i>	273
<i>Index</i>	297

Figures

3.1 Levels of micro-particularism (a) and meso-particularism (b) over the electoral cycle	<i>page 76</i>
3.2 Brokerage structures in Indonesia and the Philippines	88
5.1 Prevalence of meso-particularism over the electoral cycle	129
B1 Subnational structures in Indonesia	266
B2 Subnational structures in the Philippines	269
B3 Subnational structures in Malaysia	271

Tables

1.1 Mobilization networks and patronage patterns in Southeast Asia	<i>page</i> 12
1.2 Data sources	25
3.1 Mobilization networks and patronage patterns in Southeast Asia	74
3.2 Philippine and Indonesian brokers compared	96
4.1 Effort by brokers in the Philippines and Indonesia	111
4.2 Number of names on brokers' lists	111
4.3 Limits on brokers	112
4.4 To what extent do brokers feel they were monitored?	113
4.5 Do brokers believe voters can be punished for failing to turn out or voting for an opposing candidate?	114
4.6 Consequences of renegeing	116
6.1 Patterns of hijacking	160
7.1 Pluralism in Indonesia, Malaysia, and the Philippines	181
A1 Frequency table: Indonesia	259
A2 Frequency table: Malaysia	261
A3 Frequency table: Philippines	261
A4 Brokers by candidate	263

Acknowledgments

This book¹ is the culmination of a multiyear and multistranded research effort, and our eighth major publication to date from a study of money politics in Southeast Asia that we began in 2012.² In the succeeding years, we collaborated with large teams of local researchers to observe on-the-ground dynamics in the Malaysian national elections in 2013, Indonesian national elections in 2014, and Philippine national elections in 2016. Our original plan was to undertake a similarly detailed examination of the Thai national elections, supposed to have been held sometime around late 2014 or 2015, but the military coup of May 2014 put those plans indefinitely on hold. We have, however, had the opportunity to observe a range of other elections in the region, including the 2013 and 2019 midterm elections in the Philippines, the 2016 state elections in Malaysia's Sarawak, and numerous polls in Indonesia: village-head elections, the 2019 legislative and presidential elections, and a range of *pilkada* (from *pemilihan kepala daerah*, or elections of regional heads) – most especially the large, simultaneous *pilkada* exercise held in seven different locations across the archipelago in February 2017. We also conducted similar research, though at a smaller scale, in Timor-Leste, Singapore, and Thailand. These discrete strands of research fed into the publications preceding this one, including several edited volumes on particular countries, featuring cases studies of “money politics” across locales, mostly written by our

¹ Author order for this book was determined randomly.

² These publications include Weiss 2014; Aspinall and Sukmajati 2015, 2016; Weiss and Puyok 2017; Aspinall and Berenschot 2019; Hicken, Aspinall, and Weiss 2019; Muhtadi 2019; Weiss 2020c; Teehankee and Calimbahin 2022. In addition, a contribution to debates on constitutional revision in the Philippines drew major inspiration from this project; see Hutchcroft 2019b. The project's findings have further generated a wide range of articles (too numerous to list here) and contributed to several dissertations on related topics.

Acknowledgments

ix

Southeast Asian research partners. The objective of this book is to synthesize and build from our earlier studies, and to present our key findings and identify critical patterns across all our country cases – with a particular focus on national-level characteristics and subnational variation in Indonesia, Malaysia, and the Philippines.

Involving more than 200 researchers across 6 countries, our project has benefited enormously from collaboration with leading universities and public-opinion survey firms. We express our deep thanks to those local research partners and institutions, without whose insights, guidance, and collaboration we would not have been able to conduct such an ambitious study nor bring together such a rich array of observations. Our partners included Universitas Gajah Madah (especially Mada Sukmajati, Amalinda Savirani, Wawan Mas’udi, the late Cornelis Lay, and the other members of the PolGov research center) and Lembaga Survei Indonesia (especially Burhanuddin Muhtadi) in Indonesia; University of Malaya (especially E. Terence Gomez and Surin Kaur), Universiti Malaysia Sarawak (especially Arnold Puyok), and the Merdeka Center for Opinion Research in Malaysia; and De La Salle University (especially Julio Teehankee) and Pulse Asia Research (especially Ronnie Holmes) in the Philippines. We learned a great deal from all these individuals and their organizations, shared many memorable experiences with them, and owe them an enormous debt of gratitude.

We worked closely with scores of researchers in each country. Though they are too numerous to name individually, we wish particularly to thank, in Indonesia, Burhanuddin Muhtadi, Noor Rohman, Zusiana Elly Triantini, David Efendi, Muhammad Mahsun, Rudi Rohi, and Muhammad Uhaib As’ad; in Thailand, Noppadon Kannika, Viengrat Nethipo, and Prajak Kongkirati; in Malaysia, Andrew Aeria, Chiok Phaik Fern, Faisal Hazis, Regina Lim, Ngu Ik Tien, and Tony Paridi Bagang; and in the Philippines, Tetchie Aquino, Cleo Calimbahin, Grace Labalan, Regina Macalandag, Neil Pancho, Ditas Ravanilla, Allen Surla, and Glenn Teh. Joel Rocamora provided particularly valuable insights from his national- and local-level perspectives. We thank Dotan Haim and Michael Davidson for research assistance and coordination and Nico Ravanilla for his collaboration with the broker-survey work in the Philippines. In Timor-Leste, we benefited hugely from our close research collaboration with the late James Scambary, a scholar whose generosity of spirit and commitment is greatly missed. In the course of conducting research for this volume, Edward Aspinall was working on a related book (on Indonesia) with Ward Berenschot; Aspinall’s contribution to the current volume owes a large intellectual debt to this collaboration. Meredith Weiss was likewise working on a related book on Singapore and Malaysia; she thanks especially Eileena Lee and Loke Hoe Yeong in Singapore and Anna Har in Malaysia, beyond those listed above, for their insights and help. Paul Hutchcroft’s four-year stint as Lead Governance Specialist for the Australian

aid program in the Philippines pulled him away from most election-observation opportunities, but by late 2017 he resumed his role in the project.

Working with such a diverse group of researchers not only enriched our study, but it was also personally enriching, making our experiences in the field for this project among the most memorable – and eye-opening – of our research careers to date. Accordingly, we also express our gratitude to the hundreds of candidates, campaign staff, experts, and ordinary citizens who sat down for interviews as part of this project, or who participated in focus groups and surveys. We owe a great deal to the openness, patience, and generosity of a great many people.

Our primary financial debt is to the Australian Research Council, from which a Discovery Grant (DP140103114) funded the bulk of our research (we also drew on research funded through grants DP120103181 and FT120100742). We benefited from supplemental research grants, too. The Centre for Democratic Institutions at the Australian National University funded initial project workshops where our research framework and planning came together. The Australian Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) funded major research efforts on elections in Indonesia, Timor-Leste, and the Philippines. The University of Malaya did the same for Malaysia. We thank our own universities, as well – the Australian National University, the University at Albany of the State University of New York, and the University of Michigan – for their financial and in-kind support. We also thank our hosts for writing workshops as we completed this book: the Center for Southeast Asian Studies at Kyoto University (especially Carol Hau), the Penang Institute (especially Ooi Kee Beng and Ong Siou Woon), and Chiang Mai University (especially Malinee Khumsupa and Tanet Charoenmuang).

Finally, we thank our partners and families for their love and support.

Terms and Acronyms

1MDB	1Malaysia Development Berhad
<i>Barangay</i>	village or urban ward (Philippines)
Barisan Nasional	National Front, BN (Malaysia)
BARMM	Bangsamoro Autonomous Region in Muslim Mindanao
Bersatu	Parti Pribumi Bersatu Malaysia, Malaysian United Indigenous Party
BR1M	Bantuan Rakyat 1Malaysia, 1Malaysia People’s Aid
<i>Bumiputera</i>	Indigenous (lit., “sons of the soil”; Malaysia)
<i>Bupati</i>	Regent (Indonesia)
DAP	Democratic Action Party (Malaysia)
DPR	Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat, People’s Representative Council, national parliament (Indonesia)
DPRD–K	Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah–Kabupaten/Kota, rural district/city legislative council (Indonesia)
DPRD–P	Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah–Provinsi, provincial legislative council (Indonesia)
Gerindra	Partai Gerindra, Greater Indonesia Movement Party
<i>Kabupaten</i>	rural district (Indonesia)
KBL	Kilusang Bagong Lipunan, New Society Movement; or <i>kasal</i> , <i>binyag</i> , <i>libing</i> , weddings, baptisms, funerals (Philippines)
<i>Kelurahan</i>	urban ward or precinct (Indonesia)
<i>Kepala desa</i>	rural village head (Indonesia)
<i>Kota</i>	city (Indonesia)
<i>Kyai</i>	religious scholar (Indonesia)
<i>Lider</i>	vote broker (Philippines)
LP	Liberal Party (Philippines)
MCA	Malaysian Chinese Association

MCP	Malayan Communist Party
MIC	Malaysian Indian Congress
NU	Nahdlatul Ulama, “traditionalist” Islamic organization (Indonesia)
NP	Nacionalista Party (Philippines)
PAP	People’s Action Party (Singapore)
PAS	Parti Islam seMalaysia, Pan-Malaysian Islamic Party
PDI	Partai Demokrasi Indonesia, Indonesian Democracy Party
PDI–P	Partai Demokrasi Indonesia–Perjuangan, Indonesian Democracy Party–Struggle
PDP–LABAN	Partido Demokratiko Pilipino–Lakas ng Bayan, Philippine Democratic Party–Strength of the Nation
<i>Pesantren</i>	Islamic boarding schools (Indonesia)
PH	Pakatan Harapan, Alliance of Hope (Malaysia)
<i>Pilkada</i>	<i>Pemilihan kepala daerah</i> , regional head elections (Indonesia)
PKB	Partai Kebangkitan Bangsa, National Awakening Party (Indonesia)
PKI	Partai Komunis Indonesia, Indonesian Communist Party
PKK	Pemberdayaan Kesejahteraan Keluarga, Family Welfare Movement (Indonesia)
PKR	Parti Keadilan Rakyat, People’s Justice Party (Malaysia)
PNI	Partai Nasional Indonesia, Indonesian National Party
PPP	Partai Persatuan Pembangunan, Development Unity Party (Indonesia)
<i>Preman</i>	gangsters (Indonesia)
<i>Purok</i>	neighborhood (Philippines)
<i>Tim sukses</i>	success team (Indonesia)
<i>Ulama</i>	religious scholar (Indonesia, Malaysia)
UMNO	United Malays National Organisation (Malaysia)
Wanita UMNO	women’s wing of UMNO (Malaysia)