

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-316-51275-3 — Alternative Approaches to Human Rights: The Disparate Historical Paths of the European, Inter-American and African Regional Human Rights Systems

Christopher Roberts

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

---

## ALTERNATIVE APPROACHES TO HUMAN RIGHTS

This book explores the comparative historical evolution of the European, Inter-American and African regional human rights systems. The book devotes attention to various factors that have shaped the systems: the different circumstances in which they were founded; the influence of major states and inter-state politics within their respective regions; gradual processes of institutional evolution; and the impact of human rights advocates and claimants. Throughout, the book devotes careful attention to the impact of institutional and procedural choices on the functioning of human rights systems. Overarchingly, the book explores the contextually generated differences between the three systems, suggesting that human rights practice is less unitary than it might at times appear. Prescriptively, the book proposes that, contrary to the received wisdom in some quarters, the Inter-American system's dual-track approach may provide the most promising model in regards to future human rights system design.

CHRISTOPHER ROBERTS is an assistant professor at the Chinese University of Hong Kong. He has worked with several human rights organizations and mandates, including the Cairo Institute for Human Rights Studies, the Egyptian Initiative for Personal Rights, and the United Nations Special Rapporteur on the rights to freedom of peaceful assembly and of association.

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-316-51275-3 — *Alternative Approaches to Human Rights: The Disparate Historical Paths of the European, Inter-American and African Regional Human Rights Systems*

Christopher Roberts

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

## ASCL STUDIES IN COMPARATIVE LAW

*ASCL Studies in Comparative Law* publishes monographs and collections that broaden theoretical and practical knowledge of the world's many legal systems. Published under the direction of the American Society of Comparative Law, the *ASCL Studies* examine legal problems in a comparative light to advance legal science, develop technical insights, and promote greater cooperation across jurisdictional and cultural boundaries. This book series serves legal practitioners and those seeking to improve law and justice by publishing in-depth comparative studies of specific legal problems in every area of law.

The series has two general editors. David Gerber is Distinguished Professor of Law and Co-Director of the Program in International and Comparative Law at Chicago-Kent College of Law, Illinois Institute of Technology. He is past President of the American Society of Comparative Law. Mortimer Sellers is Regents Professor of the University System of Maryland and Director of the Baltimore Center for International and Comparative Law. He is past President of the Internationale Vereinigung für Rechts- und Sozialphilosophie.

### *Series Editors*

David Gerber *Chicago-Kent College of Law*

Mortimer Sellers *University of Baltimore*

### *Editorial Board*

Richard Albert *University of Texas*

David Clark *Willamette University*

Helge Dedek *McGill University*

James Feinerman *Georgetown University*

Richard Kay *University of Connecticut*

Maximo Langer *University of California Los Angeles*

Ralf Michaels *Duke University*

Fernanda Nicola *American University*

Jacqueline Ross *University of Illinois*

Kim Lane Scheppelle *Princeton University*

Franz Werro *Georgetown University*

### *External Advisory Board*

Josef Drexler *University of Munich*

Diego Fernandez Arroyo *Institut d'etudes politiques de Paris*

Hongjun Gao *Tsinghua University*

Michele Graziadei *University of Turin*

Ko Hasegawa *University of Hokkaido*

Hisashi Harata *University of Tokyo*

Andreas Heinemann *University of Zurich*

Christophe Jamin *Institut d'etudes politiques de Paris*

Yong-Sun Kang *Yonsei University*

Claudia Lima Marques *Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul*

Bertil Emrah Oder *Koc University*

Amr Shalakany *American University of Cairo*

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-316-51275-3 — Alternative Approaches to Human Rights: The Disparate Historical Paths  
of the European, Inter-American and African Regional Human Rights Systems

Christopher Roberts

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

ALTERNATIVE  
APPROACHES TO  
HUMAN RIGHTS

The Disparate Historical Paths of the  
European, Inter-American and African  
Regional Human Rights Systems

CHRISTOPHER ROBERTS

*Chinese University of Hong Kong*



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-316-51275-3 — Alternative Approaches to Human Rights: The Disparate Historical Paths  
of the European, Inter-American and African Regional Human Rights Systems

Christopher Roberts

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,  
New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of  
education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781316512753](http://www.cambridge.org/9781316512753)

DOI: 10.1017/9781009071154

© Christopher Roberts 2023

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception  
and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,  
no reproduction of any part may take place without the written  
permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2023

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available*

ISBN 978-1-316-51275-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of  
URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication  
and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,  
accurate or appropriate.

## CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	page vii
<i>Table of Cases</i>	viii
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2 Foundational Moments</b>	<b>19</b>
I Introduction	19
II Europe	20
II.1 The European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms	20
II.2 The Colonial Question	31
II.3 Judicialization	37
III The Americas	44
III.1 The American Declaration of the Rights and Duties of Man	44
III.2 The Inter-American Commission	54
III.3 The American Convention and Court	65
IV Africa	71
IV.1 The African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights	71
IV.2 The African Court	82
V Conclusion	88
V.1 Europe	88
V.2 The Americas	90
V.3 Africa	92
<b>3 Struggles</b>	<b>95</b>
I Introduction	95
II Europe	95
II.1 The Triumph of the Individual Complainant	95

II.2	The Gradual Development of Jurisprudential Standards	98
II.3	Institutional Pressure and Reform	107
III	The Americas	120
III.1	The Adoption of an Assertive Approach	120
III.2	From Mass to Structural Violation	135
IV	Africa	152
IV.1	Early Challenges	152
IV.2	Coming to Grips with Violation as the Norm	160
V	Conclusion	173
V.1	Europe	173
V.2	The Americas	176
V.3	Africa	183
<b>4</b>	<b>Comparisons</b>	<b>186</b>
I	Introduction	186
II	Similar Dynamics	187
III	Alternative Approaches	194
III.1	The Judicial Model	196
III.2	The Strongly Integrated Dualist Model	202
III.3	The Weakly Integrated Dualist Model	207
III.4	Optimal System Design?	211
IV	Structural Context, Path Dependence, and Choice in Rights System Design	213
<b>5</b>	<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>218</b>
	<i>Index</i>	225

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Thanks are due to all the friends and intellectual interlocutors who provided suggestions and provocations along the way, conversations with whom helped to determine both the substance and the limits of this work. More substantively still, gratitude is owed to numerous participants in the regional rights systems, including former and current judges, commissioners, members of secretariats and registries, litigants, advocates, academics, and others, who shared their time and thoughts. Thanks are particularly due to Grainne de Burca, Nehal Bhuta, and above all Philip Alston, who provided invaluable insights and encouragement across the innumerable iterations of this work. Any insights are due to the wisdom these different parties imparted; any limitations or oversights, the author's alone. The most extensive debt of gratitude goes to my parents, Michael and Linda Roberts, and to my wife, Aneesa Walji, for their support throughout the process and beyond.

## TABLE OF CASES

**European Court of Human Rights**

- Airey v. Ireland, App. No. 6289/73, Eur. Ct. H.R. (October 9, 1979) 106, 174
- Aksoy v. Turkey, App. No. 21987/93, Eur. Ct. H.R. (December 18, 1996) 111
- Al-Skeini and others v. United Kingdom, App. No. 55721/07, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 7, 2011) 223
- Alisic and others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, “the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia,” Serbia and Slovenia, App. No. 60642/08, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 16, 2014) 115
- Ananyev and others v. Russia, App. Nos. 42525/07 & 60800/08, Eur. Ct. H.R. (January 10, 2012) 115
- Anchugov and Gladkov, App. Nos. 11157/04 & 15162/05, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 4, 2013) 119
- Angelova v. Bulgaria, App. No. 38361/97, Eur. Ct. H.R. (June 13, 2002) 111
- Assanidze v. Georgia, App. No. 71503/01, Eur. Ct. H.R. (April 8, 2004) 109, 110
- Assenow and others v. Bulgaria, App. No. 24760/94, Eur. Ct. H.R. (October 28, 1998) 111
- Athanasiou and others v. Greece, App. No. 36546/10, Eur. Ct. H.R. (December 21, 2010) 115
- Aydin v. Turkey, App. No. 23178/94, Eur. Ct. H.R. (September 25, 1997) 111
- Baczkowski v. Poland, App. No. 1543/06, Eur. Ct. H.R. (May 3, 2007) 117
- Belgian Linguistics case, App. Nos. 1474/62, 1677/62, 1691/62, 1769/63, 1994/63, & 2126/64, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 23, 1968) 99, 201
- Bottazi v. Italy, App. No. 34884/97, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 28, 1999) 110
- Broniowski v. Poland, App. No. 31443/96, Eur. Ct. H.R. (June 22, 2004) 114
- Burdov v. Russia, App. No. 33509/04, Eur. Ct. H.R. (January 15, 2009) 115
- Burmych and others v. Ukraine, App. Nos. 46852/13 et al., Eur. Ct. H.R. (October 12, 2017) 117
- Çakici v. Turkey, App. No. 23657/94, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 8, 1999) 111
- Camenzind v. Switzerland, App. No. 21353/93, Eur. Ct. H.R. (December 16, 1997) 111
- Çerikçi v. Turkey, App. No. 33322/07, Eur. Ct. H.R. (October 13, 2010) 221
- Cobzaru v. Romania, App. No. 48254/99, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 26, 2007) 111
- Conka v. Belgium, App. No. 51564/99, Eur. Ct. H.R. (February 5, 2002) 111



## TABLE OF CASES

ix

- D.H. and others v. The Czech Republic, App. No. 57325/00, Eur. Ct. H.R. (November 13, 2007) 176
- De Becker v. Belgium, App. No. 214/56, Eur. Ct. H.R. (March 27, 1962) 98
- De Wilde, Ooms, and Versyp v. Belgium, App. Nos. 2832/66, 2835/66, & 2899/66, Eur. Ct. H.R. (June 18, 1971) 97
- Dimitrov and Hamanov v. Bulgaria, App. Nos. 48059/06 & 2708/09, Eur. Ct. H.R. (May 10, 2011) 115
- Driza v. Albania, App. No. 33771/02, Eur. Ct. H.R. (November 13, 2007) 115
- Dybeku v. Albania, App. No. 41153/06, Eur. Ct. H.R. (December 18, 2007) 115
- Enerji Yapi-Yol Sen v. Turkey, App. No. 68959/01, Eur. Ct. H.R. (April 21, 2009) 221
- Ergi v. Turkey, App. No. 23818/94, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 28, 1998) 111
- Faimblat v. Romania, App. No. 23066/02, Eur. Ct. H.R. (January 13, 2009) 115
- Finger v. Bulgaria, App. No. 37346/05, Eur. Ct. H.R. (May 10, 2011) 115
- Gazso v. Hungary, App. No. 48322/12, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 16, 2015) 115
- Gerasimov and others v. Russia, App. Nos. 29920/05, 3553/06, 18876/10, 61186/10, 21176/11, 36112/11, 36426/11, 40841/11, 45381/11, 55929/11, & 60822/11, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 1, 2014) 115
- Glykantzi v. Greece, App. No. 40150/09, Eur. Ct. H.R. (October 30, 2012) 115
- Golder v. United Kingdom, App. No. 4451/70, Eur. Ct. H.R. (February 21, 1975) 102, 174
- Greens and M.T. v. the United Kingdom, App. Nos. 60041/08 & 60054/08, Eur. Ct. H.R. (November 23, 2010) 118
- Handyside v. United Kingdom, App. No. 5493/72, Eur. Ct. H.R. (December 7, 1976) 105
- Hutten-Czapska v. Poland, App. No. 35014/97, Eur. Ct. H.R. (June 19, 2006) 115
- Ilascu v. Moldova and Russia, App. No. 48787/99, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 8, 2004) 109
- Ireland v. United Kingdom, App. No. 5310/71, Eur. Ct. H.R. (January 18, 1978) 103
- Karacay v. Turkey, App. No. 6615/03, Eur. Ct. H.R. (June 6, 2007) 221
- Katz v. Romania, App. No. 29739/03, Eur. Ct. H.R. (January 20, 2009) 115
- Kauczor v. Poland, App. No. 45219/06, Eur. Ct. H.R. (February 3, 2009) 115
- Kaya and Seyhan v. Turkey, App. No. 30946/04, Eur. Ct. H.R. (September 15, 2009) 221
- Kaya v. Turkey, App. No. 22729/93, Eur. Ct. H.R. (February 19, 1998) 111
- Kjeldsen, Busk Madsen, & Pedersen v. Denmark, App. Nos. 5095/71, 5920/72, & 5926/72, Eur. Ct. H.R. (December 7, 1976) 103
- Kudla v. Poland, App. No. 30210/96, Eur. Ct. H.R. (October 26, 2000) 111
- Kuric and others v. Slovenia, App. No. 26828/06, Eur. Ct. H.R. (June 26, 2012) 116
- Lawless v. Ireland, App. No. 332/57, Eur. Ct. H.R. (November 14, 1960) 96, 97
- Loizidou v. Turkey, App. No. 15318/89, Eur. Ct. H.R., Judgment on Preliminary Objections (March 23, 1995) 223
- Lukenda v. Slovenia, App. No. 23032/02, Eur. Ct. H.R. (October 6, 2005) 115
- M.C. and others v. Italy, App. No. 5376/11, Eur. Ct. H.R. (September 3, 2013) 115

- Manole and others v. Moldova, App. No. 13936/02, Eur. Ct. H.R. (September 17, 2009) 116
- Manushaqe Puto and others v. Albania, App. Nos. 604/07, 43628/07, 46684/07, & 34770/09, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 31, 2012) 115
- Marckx v. Belgium, App. No. 6833/74, Eur. Ct. H.R. (June 13, 1979) 105, 106, 174
- Maria Atanasiu and others v. Romania, App. Nos. 30767/05 & 33800/06, Eur. Ct. H.R. (October 12, 2010) 115
- Matko v. Slovenia, App. No. 43393/98, Eur. Ct. H.R. (November 2, 2006) 117
- Matznetter v. Austria, App. No. 2178/64, Eur. Ct. H.R. (November 10, 1969) 174
- Messina v. Italy, App. No. 25498/94, Eur. Ct. H.R. (September 28, 2000) 110
- Michelioudakis v. Greece, App. No. 54447/10, Eur. Ct. H.R. (April 3, 2012) 115
- Nachova and others v. Bulgaria, App. Nos. 43577/98 & 43579/98, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 6, 2005) 116, 176
- Neshkov and others v. Bulgaria, App. Nos. 36925/10, 21487/12, 72893/12, 73196/12, 77718/12, & 9717/13, Eur. Ct. H.R. (January 27, 2015) 115
- Neumeister v. Austria, App. No. 1936/63, Eur. Ct. H.R. (June 27, 1968) 174
- Neumeister v. Austria, App. No. 1936/63, Eur. Ct. H.R. (May 7, 1974) 101
- OAo Neftyanaya Kompaniya Yukos v. Russia, App. No. 14902/04, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 31, 2014) 119
- Ocalan v. Turkey, App. No. 46221/99, Eur. Ct. H.R. (May 12, 2005) 115
- Olaru and others v. Moldova, App. Nos. 476/07, 22539/05, 17911/08, & 13136/07, Eur. Ct. H.R. (November 15, 2009) 115
- R.M.T. v. UK, App. No. 31045/10, Eur. Ct. H.R. (April 8, 2014) 221
- Ramadhi v. Albania, App. No. 38222/02, Eur. Ct. H.R. (November 13, 2007) 115
- Ramirez Sanchez v. France, App. No. 59450/00, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 4, 2006) 115
- Ringelsen v. Austria, App. No. 2614/65, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 16, 1971) 174
- Rumpf v. Germany, App. No. 46344/06, Eur. Ct. H.R. (September 2, 2010) 115
- Rutkowski and other v. Poland, App. Nos. 72287/10, 13927/11, & 46187/11, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 7, 2015) 115
- Scordino v. Italy (No 1), App. No. 36813/97, Eur. Ct. H.R. (March 29, 2006) 115
- Scozzari and Giunta v. Italy, App. Nos. 39221/98 & 41963/98, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 13, 2000) 110
- Sejdovic v. Italy, App. No. 56581/00, Eur. Ct. H.R. (November 10, 2004) 115
- Silih v. Slovenia, App. No. 71463/01, Eur. Ct. H.R. (April 9, 2009) 117
- Slawomir Musial v. Poland, App. No. 28300/06, Eur. Ct. H.R. (January 20, 2009) 115
- Soering v. the United Kingdom, App. No. 14038/88, Eur. Ct. H.R. (July 7, 1989) 223
- Stögmüller v. Austria, App. No. 1602/62, Eur. Ct. H.R. (November 10, 1969) 174
- Suheyly Aydin v. Turkey, App. No. 25660/94, Eur. Ct. H.R. (May 24, 2005) 111
- Suljagic v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, App. No. 27912/02, Eur. Ct. H.R. (June 20, 2006) 115
- Sunday Times v. United Kingdom, App. No. 6538/74, Eur. Ct. H.R. (April 26, 1979) 104, 105, 174

## TABLE OF CASES

xi

- Torreggiani and others v. Italy, App. Nos. 43517/09, 46882/09, 55400/09, 57875/09, 613535/09, 35315/10, & 37818/10, Eur. Ct. H.R. (January 8, 2013) 115
- Tyrer v. United Kingdom, App. No. 5856/72, Eur. Ct. H.R. (April 25, 1978) 103, 104, 174
- Tysiac v. Poland, App. No. 5410/03, Eur. Ct. H.R. (March 20, 2007) 117
- Ummuhan Kaplan v. Turkey, App. No. 24240/07, Eur. Ct. H.R. (March 20, 2012) 115
- Varga and others v. Hungary, App. Nos. 14097/12, 45135/12, 73712/12, 34001/13, 44055/13, & 64586/13, Eur. Ct. H.R. (March 10, 2015) 115
- Viasu v. Romania, App. No. 75951/01, Eur. Ct. H.R. (December 9, 2008) 115
- Wemhoff v. Germany, App. No. 2122/64, Eur. Ct. H.R. (June 27, 1968) 174
- Xenides-Arestis v. Turkey, App. No. 46347/99, Eur. Ct. H.R. (December 22, 2005) 115
- Yuriy Nikolayevich Ivanov v. Ukraine, App. No. 40450/04, Eur. Ct. H.R. (January 15, 2010) 115
- European Commission of Human Rights
- Cyprus v. Turkey, App. No. 6780/74, Eur. Comm. H.R. (July 10, 1976) 35
- Cyprus v. Turkey, App. No. 6950/75, Eur. Comm. H.R. (July 10, 1976) 35
- Cyprus v. Turkey, App. No. 8007/77, Eur. Comm. H.R. (October 4, 1983) 35
- Denmark, Norway, Sweden, & the Netherlands v. Greece, App. Nos. 3321–2/67 & 3344/67, Eur. Comm. H.R. (November 5, 1969) 35
- East African Asians v. United Kingdom, App. No. 4403/70, Eur. Comm. H.R. (December 14, 1973) 36
- German Communist Party v. Germany, App. No. 250/57, Eur. Comm. H.R. (July 20, 1957) 26
- Greece v. United Kingdom, App. No. 176/56, Eur. Comm. H.R., Admissibility (June 2, 1956) 173
- Greece v. United Kingdom, App. No. 299/57, Eur. Comm. H.R., Admissibility (October 12, 1957) 174
- Greece v. United Kingdom, Eur. Comm. H.R., 2 EUR. YBK. HUM. RTS. 182 (1958–1959) 33, 173
- Ireland v. United Kingdom, App. No. 5310/71, Eur. Comm. H.R. (January 18, 1978) 35, 122

**Inter-American Court of Human Rights**

- Almonacid Arellano et al. v. Chile, App. No. 12.057, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (September 26, 2006) 133, 137, 178, 207
- Aloeboetoe v. Suriname, App. No. 10.150, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Reparations and Costs (September 10, 1993) 129, 181
- Anzualdo Castro v. Peru, App. No. 11.385, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (September 22, 2009) 136
- Apitz Barbera et al. v. Venezuela, App. No. 12.489, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (August 5, 2008) 137

- Atala Riffo and Daughters v. Chile, App. No. 12.502, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (February 24, 2012) 138
- Barreto Leiva v. Venezuela, App. No. 11.663, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (November 17, 2009) 137
- Barrios Altos v. Peru, App. No. 11.528, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits (March 14, 2001) 133, 178
- Blake v. Guatemala, App. No. 11.219, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections (July 2, 1996) 130, 177
- Blanco-Romero et al. v. Venezuela, App. Nos. 12.256, 12.258, & 12.307, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (November 28, 2005) 136
- Cabrera García and Montiel Flores v. Mexico, App. No. 12.449, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (November 26, 2010) 138
- Caracazo v. Venezuela, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Reparations and Costs (August 29, 2002) 136
- Case of Gonzalez et al. (“Cotton Field”) v. Mexico, App. Nos. 12,496, 12,497, & 12,498, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (November 16, 2009) 143
- Certain Attributes of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Advisory Opinion No. OC-13/93 (July 16, 1993) 148
- Chocrón Chocrón v. Venezuela, App. No. 12.556, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (July 1, 2011) 137
- Claude-Reyes v. Chile, App. No. 12.108, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (September 19, 2006) 137
- Compulsory Membership in an Association Prescribed by Law for the Practice of Journalism (Arts 13 and 29), Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Advisory Opinion OC-5/85 (November 13, 1985) 127
- Contreras and others v. El Salvador, App. Nos. 12,494, 12,517, & 12,518, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., para. 122 (August 31, 2011) 205
- Cuscul Pivaral and Others v. Guatemala, App. No. 12.484, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (August 23, 2018) 222
- Dismissed Congressional Employees v. Peru, App. Nos. 11.830 & 12.038, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (November 24, 2006) 138
- El Amparo v. Venezuela, App. No. 10.602, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Reparations (September 14, 1996) 131, 177
- El Amparo v. Venezuela, App. No. 10.602, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Interpretation of Reparations (April 16, 1997) 131
- Environment and Human Rights, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Advisory Opinion No. OC-23/17 (November 15, 2013) 222
- Fernandez Ortega et al. v. Mexico, App. No. 12.580, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (August 30, 2010) 144, 182
- Fontevicchia and D’Amico v. Argentina, App. No. 12.524, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (November 29, 2011) 151

## TABLE OF CASES

xiii

- Francisco Fairen-Grabi and Yolanda Solis-Corrales v. Honduras, App. No. 7951, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R. (March 15, 1989) 127, 176
- Garrido v. Argentina, App. No. 11.009, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Reparations and Costs (August 27, 1998) 176
- Gelman v. Uruguay, App. No. 12.607, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits and Reparations (February 24, 2011) 134, 178
- Gelman v. Uruguay, App. No. 12.607, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Monitoring Compliance with Judgment (March 20, 2013) 138
- Genie Lacoyo v. Nicaragua, App. No. 10.792, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Application for Review (September 13, 1997) 131, 177
- Goiburu et al. v. Paraguay, App. Nos. 11.560, 11.665, & 11.667, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (September 22, 2006) 136
- Gomes Lund et al. v. Brazil, App. No. 11.552, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (November 24, 2010) 133, 138, 139, 177, 178
- Gomez-Palomino v. Peru, App. No. 11.062, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (November 22, 2005) 136, 176
- Gonzalez Medina and Family v. Dominican Republic, App. No. 11.324, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (February 27, 2012) 137
- Gutierrez-Soler v. Colombia, App. No. 12.291, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (September 12, 2005) 136
- Heliodoro Portugal v. Panama, App. No. 12.408, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (August 12, 2008) 136
- Hilaire et al. v. Trinidad & Tobago, App. Nos. 11.816 et al., Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (June 21, 2002) 136
- In the Matter of Viviana Gallardo et al., Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Advisory Opinion G 101/81 (November 13, 1981) 125, 126, 135
- Indigenous Community Members of the Lhaka Honhat (Our Land) Association v. Argentina, App. No. 12.094, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (February 6, 2020) 222
- Ituango Massacres v. Colombia, App. Nos. 12.050 & 12.266, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R. (July 1, 2006) 177
- Juridical Condition and Rights of Undocumented Migrants, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Advisory Opinion No. OC-18/03 (September 17, 2003) 223
- Juvenile Reeducation Institute v. Paraguay, App. No. 11.666, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R. (September 2, 2004) 182
- La Cantuta et al. v. Peru, App. No. 11.045, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (November 29, 2006) 136
- Lagos del Campo v. Peru, App. No. 12.795, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (August 31, 2017) 222
- “Las Dos Erres” Massacre v. Guatemala, App. No. 11.681, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (November 24, 2009) 138, 177

- Lori Berenson Mejia v. Peru, App. No. 11.876, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (November 25, 2004) 136
- Mampiripan Massacre v. Colombia, App. No. 12.250, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R. (March 7, 2005) 176
- Massacres of El Mozote v. El Salvador, App. No. 10.720, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (October 25, 2012) 134, 178
- Mayagna Awas Tingni Community v. Nicaragua, App. No. 11.577, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits (August 31, 2001) 134, 181
- Mendoza et al. v. Argentina, App. No. 12.651, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, and Reparations (May 14, 2013) 140
- Moiwana Village v. Suriname, App. No. 11.821, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (June 15, 2005) 141, 177, 181
- Montero-Aranguren v. Venezuela, App. No. 11.699, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (July 5, 2006) 136
- Nadege Dorzema et al. v. Dominican Republic, App. No. 1351-05, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (October 24, 2012) 147, 182
- Olmedo Bustos et al. v. Chile, App. No. 11.803, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (February 5, 2001) 132
- Oscar Elias Biscet et al. v. Cuba, App. No. 12.476, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (October 21, 2006) 136
- Palamara-Iribarne v. Chile, App. No. 11.571, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (November 22, 2005) 136, 137
- Plan de Sanchez Massacre v. Guatemala, App. No. 11.763, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R. (April 29, 2004) 176
- Poblete Vilches and Others v. Chile, App. No. 12.695, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (March 8, 2018) 222
- Pueblo Saramaka v. Suriname, App. No. 12.338, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (November 28, 2007) 142, 182
- Radilla Pacheco v. Mexico, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (November 23, 2009) 136
- Restrictions to the Death Penalty (Arts 4(2) and 4(4) American Convention on Human Rights), Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Advisory Opinion OC-3/83 (September 8, 1983) 126
- Reveron-Trujillo v. Venezuela, App. No. 12.565, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (June 30, 2009) 137
- Rochela Massacre v. Colombia, App. Nos. 11.995, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (May 11, 2007) 144
- Rosendo Cantú et al. v. Mexico, App. No. 12.579, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (August 31, 2010) 144, 182
- Sarayaku v. Ecuador, App. No. 12.465, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits and Reparations (June 27, 2012) 142, 182
- Saul Godinez Cruz v. Honduras, App. No. 8097, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R. (January 20, 1989) 127, 176

## TABLE OF CASES

xv

- Sawhoyamaxa Indigenous Community v. Paraguay, App. No. 12.419, Int. Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (March 29, 2006) 142, 181
- Suarez Rosero v. Ecuador, App. No. 11.273, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits (November 12, 1997) 131, 177
- Vargas-Areco v. Paraguay, App. No. 12.300, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (September 26, 2006) 136
- Velásquez Rodríguez v. Honduras, App. No. 7920, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R. (July 29, 1988) 127, 135, 152, 176, 180
- Villagran Morales et al. v. Guatemala, App. No. 11.383, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits (November 19, 1999) 182
- Xákmok Kásek Indigenous Community v. Paraguay, App. No. 12.420, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (August 24, 2010) 222
- Ximenes-Lopes v. Brazil, App. No. 12.237, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (June 4, 2006) 136
- Yakye Axa Indigenous Community v. Paraguay, App. No. 12.313, Int. Am. Ct. H.R., Merits, Reparations, and Costs (June 17, 2005) 142, 181, 221
- YATAMA v. Nicaragua, App. No. 12.388, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (June 23, 2005) 140, 181
- Yean and Bosico v. Dominican Republic, App. No. 12.189, Int.-Am. Ct. H.R., Preliminary Objections, Merits, Reparations, and Costs (September 8, 2005) 145, 182, 222

### Inter-American Commission on Human Rights

- Alfonso Rene Chanfreau et al. v. Chile, App. Nos. 11.505 et al., Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (April 7, 1998) 129
- Alicia Consuelo Herrera et al. v. Argentina, App. Nos. 10.147, 10.181, 10.240, 10.262, 10.309, & 10.311, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (October 2, 1992) 128, 129
- Amalia Rada et al. v. Bolivia, Case No. 1757, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (June 3, 1974) 123
- Baby Boy Case, Case No. 2141, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (March 6, 1981) 64
- Cases 1702, 1748, and 1755 (concerning Guatemala), Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (August 12, 1975) 123
- Cases of Disappearance of Persons in Guatemala, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (April 9, 1986) 124
- Cases of Disappeared Persons in Argentina, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (April 8, 1983) 124
- Cases of Disappeared Persons in Chile, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (July 1, 1983) 124
- Clarence Allen Lackey et al. v. United States, App. Nos. 11.575, 12.333, & 12.341, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (July 15, 2013) 140
- Comm. No. 1684 (concerning Brazil), Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (June 25, 1970) 120
- Gonzalez et al. (Campo Algodonero) v. Mexico, App. Nos. 12.496, 12.497, & 12.498, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (November 4, 2007) 143

- Hugo Leonardo de los Santos Mendoza et al. v. Uruguay, App. Nos. 10.029, 10.036, 10.145, 10.305, 10.373, 10.374, & 10.375, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (October 2, 1992) 128, 129
- Jessica Lenahan (Gonzales) et al. v. United States, App. No. 12.626, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (July 21, 2011) 144, 145, 182
- Juvenile Death Penalty Case, Case No. 9647, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (September 1987) 64
- Mapuche Paynemil and Kaxipayiñ Communities, Case No. 12.010, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (February 5, 2013) 222
- Maria da Penha Fernandes v. Brazil, App. No. 12.051, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (April 16, 2001) 143, 182
- Mary and Carrie Dann v. United States, App. No. 11.140, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (December 27, 2002) 149, 181
- Meneses et al. v. Chile, App. Nos. 11.228, 11.229, 11.231, & 11.282 et al., Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (October 15, 1996) 129
- Olmedo Bustos et al. v. Chile, App. No. 11.803, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (September 29, 1998) 132
- Sebastião Camargo Filho v. Brazil, App. No. 12.310, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (March 19, 2009) 146
- Simone Andre Diniz v. Brazil, App. No. 12.001, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (October 21, 2006) 182
- Undocumented Workers v. United States of America, Case No. 12.834, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (November 30, 2016) 224
- Wallace de Almeida v. Brazil, App. No. 12.440, Int.-Am. Comm. H.R. (March 20, 2009) 145, 182

### African Court of Human and Peoples' Rights

- Actions Pour la Protection des Droits de l'Homme (APDH) v. Côte d'Ivoire, App. No. 001/2014, Af. Ct. H.P.R. (November 18, 2016) 170
- African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights v. Great Socialist People's Libyan Arab Jamahiriya, App. No. 004/2011, Af. Ct. H.P.R., Order for Provisional Measures (March 25, 2011) 170
- African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights v. Great Socialist People's Libyan Arab Jamahiriya, App. No. 004/2011, Af. Ct. H.P.R., Order Striking Out the Case (March 15, 2013) 171
- African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights v. Kenya, App. No. 006/2012, Af. Ct. H.P.R. (May 26, 2017) 171
- African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights, Request for Advisory Opinion by the Centre for Human Rights at the University of Pretoria and the Coalition of African Lesbians, Request No. 002/2015, Af. Ct. H.P.R. (September 28, 2017) 172
- Atabong Denis Atemnkeng v. African Union, App. No. 007/2011, Af. Ct. H.P.R. (September 2, 2011) 155



## TABLE OF CASES

xvii

- Femi Falana v. African Union, App. No. 001/2011, Af. Ct. H.P.R. (June 26, 2012) 155
- In the Matter of Beneficiaries of Late Norbert Zongo et al. v. Burkina Faso, App. No. 013/2011, Af. Ct. H.P.R. (March 28, 2014) 169
- Konaté v. Burkina Faso, App. No. 004/2013, Af. Ct. H.P.R. (December 5, 2014) 170
- Tanganyika Law Society et al. v. Tanzania, App. Nos. 009/2011 & 011/2011, Af. Ct. H.P.R. (June 14, 2013) 169

**African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights**

- Abdel Hadi & others v. Sudan, Comm. No. 68/09, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (November 5, 2013) 168
- Amnesty International and others v. Sudan, Comm. Nos. 48/90, 50/91, 52/91, & 89/93, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (November 15, 1999) 160, 183
- Article 19 v. Eritrea, Comm. No. 275/03, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (May 30, 2007) 164, 210
- Association of Victims of Post Electoral Violence and INTERIGHTS v. Cameroon, App. No. 273/03, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (November 25, 2009) 183
- Centre for Minority Rights Development (Kenya) and Minority Rights Group (on behalf of Endorois Welfare Council) v. Kenya, Comm. No. 276/03, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (November 25, 2009) 167, 184
- Civil Liberties Organisation v. Nigeria, Comm. No. 101/93, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (March 22, 1995) 159
- Civil Liberties Organisation v. Nigeria, Comm. No. 129/94, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (March 22, 1995) 159, 183
- Comité Culturel pour la Démocratie au Bénin et al. v. Bénin, Comm. Nos. 16-18/88, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (April 27, 1994) 156
- Commission Nationale des Droits de l'Homme et des Libertés v. Tchad, Comm. No. 74/92, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (October 11, 1995) 157, 183
- Constitutional Rights Project and Civil Liberties Organisation v. Nigeria, Comm. Nos. 143/95 & 150/96, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (November 5, 1999) 160, 184
- Constitutional Rights Project and others v. Nigeria, Comm. Nos. 140/94, 141/94, & 145/95, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (November 5, 1999) 159, 184
- Constitutional Rights Project v. Nigeria, Comm. No. 60/91, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (March 22, 1995) 159
- Constitutional Rights Project v. Nigeria, Comm. No. 87/93, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (March 22, 1995) 159
- Dabalorivhuwa Patriotic Front v. South Africa, Comm. No. 335/06, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (April 23, 2013) 168
- DRC v. Burundi, Rwanda, and Uganda, Comm. No. 227/99, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (May 29, 2003) 164, 183

- Embga Mekongo Louis v. Cameroon, Comm. No. 59/91, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (March 22, 1995) 155
- Free Legal Assistance Group et al. v. Zaire, Comm. Nos. 25/89, 47/90, 56/91, & 100/93, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (April 4, 1996) 156, 210
- Front for the Liberation of the State of Cabinda v. Angola, Comm. No. 328/06, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (November 5, 2013) 168
- Haregewoin Gabre-Selassie and IHRDA v. Ethiopia, App. No. 301/05, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (October 12, 2013) 210
- Institute for Human Rights and Development in Africa (IHRDA) v. Angola, Comm. No. 292/04, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (May 22, 2008) 165, 184
- Institute for Human Rights and Development in Africa v. Guinea, Comm. No. 249/02, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (December 7, 2004) 164, 184
- International PEN, Constitutional Rights Project, Civil Liberties Organisation and Interights (on behalf of Ken Saro-Wiwa Jr.) v. Nigeria, Comm. Nos. 137/94, 139/94, 154/96, & 161/97, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (October 31, 1998) 163
- Jawara v. the Gambia, Comm. Nos. 147/95 & 149/96, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (May 11, 2000) 161, 183, 210
- Kalenga v. Zambia, Comm. No. 11/88, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (April 27, 1994) 156
- Kevin Mgwanga Gunme et al. v. Cameroon, Comm. No. 266/03, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (May 27, 2009) 164
- Krishna Achuthan (on behalf of Aleke Banda) and others v. Malawi, Comm. Nos. 64/92, 68/92, & 78/92, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (March 22, 1995) 157
- Malawi African Association and others v. Mauritania, Comm. Nos. 54/91, 61/91, 96/93, 98/93, 164/97, 196/97, & 210/98, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (May 11, 2000) 162, 164, 178, 184
- Media Rights Agenda and others v. Nigeria, Comm. Nos. 105/93, 128/94, 130/94, & 152/96, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (October 31, 1998) 159, 184
- Mouvement Ivoirien des Droits de l'Homme v. Côte d'Ivoire (1), Comm. No. 262/02, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (May 22, 2008) 165, 178
- Mouvement Ivoirien des Droits de l'Homme v. Côte d'Ivoire (2), Comm. No. 246/02, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (July 29, 2008) 166, 210
- Organisation Mondiale Contre la Torture and others v. Rwanda, Comm. Nos. 27/89, 46/91, 49/91, & 99/93, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (October 31, 1996) 158, 210
- Purhoit and Moore v. The Gambia, Comm. No. 241/01, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (May 29, 2003) 221
- Rencontre Africaine pour la Défense des Droits de l'Homme v. Zambia, Comm. No. 71/92, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (October 31, 1996) 158
- Scanlen and Holderness v. Zimbabwe, Comm. No. 297/05, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (April 3, 2009) 166
- Social and Economic Rights Action Center and Center for Economic and Social Rights v. Nigeria, Comm. No. 155/96, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (October 27, 2001) 163, 210, 221

## TABLE OF CASES

xix

- Sudan Human Rights Organisation and Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions (COHRE) v. Sudan, Comm. No. 279/03 & 296/05, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (May 27, 2009) 164, 183
- Union Interafricaine des Droits de l'Homme and others v. Angola, Comm. No. 159/96, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (November 11, 1997) 158
- Zimbabwe Human Rights NGO Forum v. Zimbabwe, Comm. No. 245/02, Af. Comm. H.P.R. (May 15, 2006) 164, 183

**International Court of Justice**

- South-West Africa Cases (Ethiopia v. South Africa; Liberia v. South Africa), Second Phase, ICJ (July 18, 1966) 75

**Human Rights Committee**

- Kalenga v. Zambia, Comm. No. 326/1988, HRC (July 27, 1993) 157

**Court of Justice of the European Union**

- Opinion 2/13, Court of Justice of the European Union (December 18, 2014) 119

**African Committee of Experts on the Rights and Welfare of the Child**

- Centre for Human Rights and Rencontre Africaine pour la Défense des Droits de l'Homme v. Senegal, Comm. No. 003/12, ACRWC Committee (April 15, 2014) 171
- IHRDA and OSJI (on behalf of children of Nubian descent in Kenya) v. Kenya, Comm. No. 002/09, ACRWC Committee (March 22, 2011) 171
- Michelo Husungule & others (on behalf of children in Northern Uganda) v. Uganda, Comm. No. 1/2005, ACRWC Committee (April 19, 2013) 171

**Economic Community of West African States Court of Justice**

- Essien v. The Gambia, Judgment ECW/CCJ/APP/05/05, ECOWAS Ct. (March 17, 2007) 171
- Karaou v. Niger, Judgment ECW/CCJ/JJD/06/08, ECOWAS Ct. (October 27, 2008) 236
- Manneh v. The Gambia, Judgment ECW/CCJ/JJD/03/08, ECOWAS Ct. (June 5, 2008) 171
- Registered Trustees of SERAP v. Nigeria, Judgment ECW/CCJ/JUD/07/10, ECOWAS Ct. (November 30, 2010) 171

Cambridge University Press & Assessment

978-1-316-51275-3 — Alternative Approaches to Human Rights: The Disparate Historical Paths  
of the European, Inter-American and African Regional Human Rights Systems

Christopher Roberts

Frontmatter

[More Information](#)

xx

TABLE OF CASES

### **East African Court of Justice**

Anyang' Nyong'o and others v. Attorney General of Kenya and others, Reference 1 of  
2006, EAC Ct. (November 27, 2006) 171

Katabazi and others v. Secretary General of the EAC and another, Reference 1 of 2007,  
EAC Ct. (November 1, 2007) 171

### **Southern African Development Community Tribunal**

Campbell v. Zimbabwe, Case No 2/2008, SADC (T) (November 28, 2008) 87

Gondo and others v. Zimbabwe, Case No. 5/2008, SADC (T) (December 9, 2010) 87

Tembani v. Zimbabwe, Case No. 7/2008 SADC (T) (June 5, 2009) 87