

## PUBLIC REASON AND DIVERSITY

Gerald Gaus was one of the leading liberal theorists of the late twentieth and early twenty-first centuries. He developed a pioneering defense of the liberal order based on its unique capacity to handle diversity and disagreement, and he presses the liberal tradition towards a principled openness to pluralism and diversity. This book brings together Gaus's most seminal and creative essays in a single volume for the first time. It also covers a broad span of his career, including essays published shortly before his death, and topics including reasonable pluralism, moral rights, public reason, and the redistributive state. The volume makes accessible the work of one of the most important recent liberal theorists. Many readers will find it of value, especially those in political philosophy, political science, and economics.

GERALD GAUS was James E. Rogers Professor of Philosophy, and Head of the Department of Political Economy and Moral Science, at the University of Arizona. His books include *The Order of Public Reason* (Cambridge, 2011), *The Tyranny of the Ideal* (2016), and *The Open Society and Its Complexities* (2021).

KEVIN VALLIER is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Bowling Green State University. His books include *Liberal Politics and Public Faith* (2014), *Must Politics Be War?* (2019), and *Trust in a Polarized Age* (2020).

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
978-1-316-51259-3 — Public Reason and Diversity  
Gerald Gaus , Edited by Kevin Vallier  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

PUBLIC REASON AND  
DIVERSITY

*Reinterpretations of Liberalism*

GERALD GAUS

EDITED BY

KEVIN VALLIER



CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment  
 978-1-316-51259-3 — Public Reason and Diversity  
 Gerald Gaus, Edited by Kevin Vallier  
 Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India  
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781316512593](http://www.cambridge.org/9781316512593)

DOI: 10.1017/9781009067867

© Cambridge University Press 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

The essays in this volume are published under license from their publishers as listed on p. viii

First published 2022

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.*

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

NAMES: Gaus, Gerald F., author. | Vallier, Kevin, editor.

TITLE: Public reason and diversity: reinterpretations of liberalism / Gerald Gaus; Edited by Kevin Vallier.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2022. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2022010291 (print) | LCCN 2022010292 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316512593 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009068307 (paperback) | ISBN 9781009067867 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Liberalism. | Political science—Philosophy. | Pluralism. | Political ethics.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC JC574 .G387 2022 (print) | LCC JC574 (ebook) | DDC 320.51—dc23/eng/20220401

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022010291>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2022010292>

ISBN 978-1-316-51259-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

## *Contents*

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> vi
<i>List of Tables</i>	vii
<i>A Note on the Essays</i>	viii
Introduction	i
PART I: LIBERALISM	7
1 Reasonable Pluralism and the Domain of the Political: How the Weaknesses of John Rawls’s Political Liberalism Can Be Overcome by a Justificatory Liberalism (1999)	9
2 On Justifying the Moral Rights of the Moderns: A Case of Old Wine in New Bottles (2007)	38
3 Recognized Rights as Devices of Public Reason (2009)	77
4 The Moral Foundations of Liberal Neutrality (2009)	105
5 Coercion, Ownership, and the Redistributive State: Justificatory Liberalism’s Classical Tilt (2010)	128
PART II: DIVERSE PUBLIC REASON	177
6 A Tale of Two Sets: Public Reason in Equilibrium (2011)	179
7 Self-Organizing Moral Systems: Beyond Social Contract Theory (2018)	202
8 Political Philosophy as the Study of Complex Normative Systems (2018)	237
<i>Index</i>	266

## *Figures*

5.1	The general relation between economic freedom and protection of civil rights	<i>page</i> 149
5.2	The general relation between economic freedom and protection of political rights	152
5.3	Two utility functions, each split into two parts ( $\alpha$ and $\beta$ )	166
5.4	Two utility functions, disagreeing about the nature of coercion	168
5.5	Overall utility functions	168
5.6	An anti-small-state utility function	171
7.1	‘I believe we ought $f$ ’ implies ‘I ought to $f$ ’ (go your own way game)	206
7.2	‘I believe we ought $f$ ’ does not imply ‘I ought to $f$ ’ (reconciliation game)	207
7.3	An asymmetric reconciliation game	211
7.4	Four weighting (reconciliation) types	216
7.5	Convergence in model I, all types	220
7.6	Periods for convergence in model I, three types	221
7.7	Periods for complete convergence in model II	223
7.8	Differential reference groups	226
7.9	Convergence: Five differential reference groups with Hi–Lo polarity in four groups	227
7.10	Random distribution of types (linear agent and quasi-Kantians halt convergence)	228
8.1	“The Choice”	245

## *Tables*

2.1	Condorcet paradox rankings	<i>page 52</i>
5.1	Orderings distinguishing eligible from ineligible proposals	147
5.2	Economic freedom in thirty-six states that best protect civil rights	151
5.3	Civil rights scores and economic freedom in remaining socialist states	152
5.4	The relation between income inequality and effective political rights in selected OECD countries	154
5.5	The relation between wealth inequality and effective political rights in selected OECD countries	155
6.1	Impure coordination game	189
6.2	Assurance problem	193
6.3	Neighborhood interaction	200
7.1A	Agent types	234

## *A Note on the Essays*

These essays were published in the following venues.

- “Reasonable Pluralism and the Domain of the Political: How the Weaknesses of John Rawls’s Political Liberalism Can be Overcome by a Justificatory Liberalism.” *Inquiry*, 42 (June 1999): 229–58. Reprinted in *Liberalism: Critical Assessments*, vol. III: *The Limits of Liberalism*, ed. Geoffrey Smith (London: Routledge, 2002).
- “On Justifying the Liberties of the Moderns: A Case of Old Wine in New Bottles.” *Social Philosophy & Policy*, 25 (2007): 84–119. Republished in *Liberalism: Old and New*, ed. Ellen Frankel Paul, Fred D. Miller, and Jeffrey Paul (Cambridge University Press, 2007).
- “Recognized Rights as Devices of Public Reason.” *Philosophical Perspectives: Ethics*, 23 (2009): 111–36.
- “The Moral Foundations of Liberal Neutrality.” In *Debates in Contemporary Political Philosophy*, ed. Thomas Christiano and John Christman (Oxford: Blackwell, 2009), 81–98.
- “Coercion, Ownership, and the Redistributive State: Justificatory Liberalism’s Classical Tilt.” *Social Philosophy & Policy*, 27 (Winter 2010): 233–75. Reprinted in *Ownership and Justice*, ed. Ellen Frankel Paul, Fred D. Miller, and Jeffrey Paul (Cambridge University Press, 2010), 233–75.
- “A Tale of Two Sets: Public Reason in Equilibrium.” *Public Affairs Quarterly*, 25 (October 2011): 305–25.
- “Self-Organizing Moral Systems: Beyond Social Contract Theory.” *Politics, Philosophy & Economics*, 17 (May 2018): 119–47.
- “Political Philosophy as the Study of Complex Normative Systems.” *Cosmos + Taxis*, 5/2 (2018): 62–78.