

KUHN'S INTELLECTUAL PATH

Thomas Kuhn's *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* offers an insightful and engaging theory of science that speaks to scholars across many disciplines. Though initially widely misunderstood, it had a profound impact on the way intellectuals and educated laypeople thought about science. K. Brad Wray traces the influences on Kuhn as he wrote *Structure*, including his 'Aristotle epiphany', his interactions with James B. Conant, and his studies of the history of chemistry. Wray then considers the impact of *Structure* on the social sciences, on the history of science, and on the philosophy of science, where the problem of theory change has set the terms of contemporary realism/anti-realism debates. He examines Kuhn's frustrations with the Strong Programme sociologists' appropriations of his views, and debunks several popular claims about what influenced Kuhn as he wrote *Structure*. His book is a rich and comprehensive assessment of one of the most influential works in the modern sciences.

K. Brad Wray is Associate Professor at the Centre for Science Studies at Aarhus University, Denmark. He is the author of *Kuhn's Evolutionary Social Epistemology* (Cambridge University Press, 2011) and *Resisting Scientific Realism* (Cambridge University Press, 2018), and editor of *Interpreting Kuhn: Critical Essays* (Cambridge University Press, 2021).

KUHN'S INTELLECTUAL PATH

Charting *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*

K. BRAD WRAY

Aarhus University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press
 978-1-316-51217-3 — Kuhn's Intellectual Path
 K. Brad Wray
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.
 It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of
 education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
 Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316512173
 DOI: 10.1017/9781009057882

© K. Brad Wray 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception
 and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements,
 no reproduction of any part may take place without the written
 permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Wray, K. Brad, 1963– author.

TITLE: Kuhn's intellectual path : charting The structure of scientific revolutions / K. Brad Wray.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Includes
 bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021016131 (print) | LCCN 2021016132 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316512173
 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009057882 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Kuhn, Thomas S. | Kuhn, Thomas S. Structure of scientific revolutions. |
 Science – Philosophy. | Science – History. | Philosophers – United States – Biography. |
 Historians of science – United States – Biography. | BISAC: SCIENCE / Philosophy & Social
 Aspects

CLASSIFICATION: LCC Q143.K83 W73 2021 (print) | LCC Q143.K83 (ebook) | DDC 501/.092 [B]–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021016131>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021016132>

ISBN 978-1-316-51217-3 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of
 URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication
 and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,
 accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51217-3 — Kuhn's Intellectual Path
K. Brad Wray
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

For Lori

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51217-3 — Kuhn's Intellectual Path
K. Brad Wray
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)

*You know I would have been very glad to get a Nobel
Prize – I certainly wanted fame in some sense.
—Thomas S. Kuhn, “A Discussion with Thomas S. Kuhn”*

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>page ix</i>
Introduction	i
PART I THE GROUNDWORK FOR STRUCTURE: HARVARD 1947 TO 1955	9
1 What Did Aristotle Teach Kuhn?	11
2 The Influence of James B. Conant	25
3 Kuhn and the History of Chemistry	50
4 Kuhn and the Logical Positivists	65
PART II THE UNEXPECTED UPTAKE: KUHN AND THE SOCIAL SCIENCES	81
5 Kuhn's Influence on the Social Sciences	83
6 The Elephant in the Room: The Sociology of Scientific Knowledge	103
PART III KUHN AND THE HISTORY OF SCIENCE	119
7 Copenhagen, 1962–1963: A Return to the History of Science	121
8 Structure, Historicism and the History of Science	136

viii	<i>Contents</i>	
PART IV KUHN’S PHILOSOPHICAL LEGACY		153
9 Squeals of Outrage from Philosophers		155
10 Kuhn and the Contemporary Realism/Anti-Realism Debates		174
11 Kuhn’s Career, Post- <i>Structure</i>		194
<i>Bibliography</i>		206
<i>Index</i>		229

Acknowledgments

This book was written with the support of many people and institutions. The final draft of the manuscript was prepared while I was on sabbatical leave from Aarhus University in fall 2020. I had the pleasure of being a Visiting Fellow at Clare Hall, and a Visiting Scholar in the Department of History and Philosophy of Science, at the University of Cambridge. I thank Clare Hall, and the Department, especially Hasok Chang, my faculty sponsor, for this opportunity. While at Cambridge, I was also able to access Mary Hesse's papers at the Whipple Library. I am honored to have been recently elected a Life Member of Clare Hall. I also thank Paul Hoyningen-Huene, Stathis Psillos and Lutz Bornmann for supporting my applications to Clare Hall and the Department of History and Philosophy of Science.

I thank Aarhus University for the sabbatical leave, and in particular, the Dean's Office in the Faculty of Science for a sabbatical grant, which covered many of my costs related to relocating to Cambridge for the fall semester of 2020. I would also like to acknowledge the support of the Research Foundation at Aarhus University, Aarhus Universitets Forskningsfond (AUFF), for a starting grant I was awarded when I was first hired at AU – Grant: AUFF-E-2017-FLS-7–3. This grant has supported my research with Line Edslev Andersen on the epistemology of scientific publication, as well as other research-related costs for the past three years.

Parts of this book have been presented at a variety of conferences, where I received insightful feedback from the audiences. I thank my audiences from the following conferences: (i) the Estudios Kuhnianos: Pasado, Presente y Futuro conference at the Universidad de la República, in Montevideo, Uruguay, in November 2018; (ii) the Reviving Instrumentalism in Philosophy of Science conference at the Centre for Humanities Engaging Science and Society, Durham University, UK, in July 2019; (iii) the Methods and Problems in Philosophy of Science

conference at the University of Castilla-La Mancha, Toledo, Spain, in September 2019; (iv) the Scientific Realism Workshop at the Centre for Science Studies, Aarhus University, Denmark, in October 2019; (v) the meeting of the Society for Realist/Antirealist Discussion at the Central Division Meeting of the American Philosophical Association, Chicago, in February 2020; and (vi) the Distinguished Lectures Series on Philosophy of Science, at Seoul National University, in November 2020. I presented papers based on drafts of two chapters of my book at the latter conference via Zoom. I also presented a part of the book at a colloquium at the Università degli Studi di Milano in January 2019, when I was visiting there as an examiner for a Ph.D. thesis defense.

The following individuals have given feedback in one way or another. I thank: Lori Nash, Nancy Cartwright, Darrell Rowbottom, Kyle Stanford, Julian Reiss, Omar El-Mawas, Robin Hendry, John Preston, Greg Frost-Arnold, Robert Northcott, Paul Hoyningen-Huene, Pablo Melogno, David Teira Serrano, Paula Atencia, Sam Schindler, Michael Devitt, Anjan Chakravartty, Otavio Bueno, Eric Oberheim, Howard Sankey, Leandro Giri, Hernán Miguel, Juan Vincente Mayoral, Lee McIntyre and Jamie Shaw. Paul Hoyningen-Huene and George Reisch have been especially helpful in guiding me to relevant documents in the Thomas S. Kuhn Archives at MIT. I also thank Jamie Shaw and Lori Nash for reading and commenting on the whole manuscript. Lori also prepared the index and corrected the proofs.

I acknowledge support from the following organizations: the British Society for the Philosophy of Science, the University of Castilla-La Mancha, the Faculty of Information and Communication at the University of the Republic in Montevideo, Uruguay, and the Argentinian Society of Philosophical Analysis (SADAF), and Aarhus Universitets Forskningsfond (Grant: AUFF-E-2017-FLS-7-3). I also thank the Centre for Science Studies at Aarhus University for their support.

I thank the referees for HOPOS for their constructive and thoughtful comments on earlier drafts of papers that I have either drawn on or integrated into the book.

Additionally, I am grateful to the following publishers for permission to reprint parts of the following articles that have been previously published in journals:

2013. "The Future of *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions*," *Topoi: An International Review of Philosophy* 31:1, 75–79. Special issue on *Structure of Scientific Revolutions*, 50 Years On. DOI: 10.1007/s11245-012-9140-0

Acknowledgments

xi

2015. "Kuhn's Social Epistemology and the Sociology of Science," in William J. Devlin and Alisa Bokulich (eds.), *Kuhn's Structure of Scientific Revolutions – 50 Years On, Boston Studies in the Philosophy of Science*, Vol. 311, pp. 167–183. Dordrecht: Springer. DOI: 10.1007/978-3-319-13383-6_12

2016. "The Influence of James B. Conant on Kuhn's *Structure of Scientific Revolutions*," *HOPOS: The Journal of the International Society for the History of Philosophy of Science*, 6:1, 1–23. DOI: 10.1086/685542

2017. "Kuhn's Influence on the Social Sciences," in L. McIntyre and A. Rosenberg (eds.), *Routledge Companion to Philosophy of Social Science*, pp. 65–75. New York, NY, and London: Routledge.

2019. "Kuhn and the History of Science," in M. Fricker, P. J. Graham, D. Henderson, N. Pedersen and J. Wyatt (eds.), *Routledge Handbook of Social Epistemology*, pp. 40–48. New York, NY: Routledge.

2019. "Kuhn, the History of Chemistry, and the Philosophy of Science," *HOPOS: The Journal of the International Society for the History of Philosophy of Science* 9:1, 75–92.

2021. "Kuhn and the Contemporary Realism/Anti-Realism Debates," *HOPOS: The Journal of the International Society for the History of Philosophy of Science*, 11:1, 72–92.

I also thank the Department of Distinctive Collections at the MIT Libraries for their permission to cite material from their collections. I am especially delighted about the recent updating of their copyright permissions policy, which has streamlined the process significantly. I would also like to extend my thanks to Myles Crowley and Nora Murphy for providing a supportive and warm environment in which to conduct my research during my visits to the Department of Distinctive Collections. I am grateful to David Kaiser, of MIT, for providing me with some valuable information about the collection when I first visited it in 2013. David saved me a significant amount of time, enabling me to hit the ground running. I thank the State University of New York, Oswego, my former employer, for providing support for my research trips to Cambridge, Massachusetts. And I thank MIT and the Department of Linguistics and Philosophy for hosting me as a Visiting Scholar in fall 2015, when I was on a sabbatical leave in Cambridge, MA.

I thank Hilary Gaskin of Cambridge University Press for working with me on this project, and for supporting my work over the years. Thanks also go to Hal Churchman at Cambridge University Press, and I thank the

referees for Cambridge University Press for their constructive feedback on and encouraging support of my project.

I dedicate this book to Lori Nash, my partner, who has both enjoyed and endured my career in philosophy, living in four different countries over the years. It is she who has had to reinvent herself each time we move, as well as learn the tax systems in each country.