

# The Cambridge Companion to the Rule of Law

The Cambridge Companion to the Rule of Law introduces students, scholars, and practitioners to the theory and history of the rule of law, one of the most frequently invoked – and least understood – ideas of legal and political thought and policy practice. It offers a comprehensive re-assessment by leading scholars of one of the world's most cherished traditions. This high-profile collection provides the first global and interdisciplinary account of the histories, moralities, pathologies and trajectories of the rule of law. Unique in conception, and critical in its approach, it evaluates, breaks down, and subverts conventional wisdom about the rule of law for the twenty-first century

Jens Meierhenrich is Associate Professor of International Relations at the London School of Economics and Political Science and previously taught at Harvard University. His books include *The Legacies of Law* (2008), *The Remnants of the Rechtsstaat* (2018), *The Violence of Law* (2021), and, as co-editor, *The Oxford Handbook of Carl Schmitt* (2016).

Martin Loughlin is Professor of Public Law at the London School of Economics and Political Science and previously taught at the University of Glasgow and at the University of Manchester. His books include *Sword and Scales* (2000), *The Idea of Public Law* (2003), *Foundations of Public Law* (2010), and, as co-editor, *The Paradox of Constitutionalism* (2007).



### Cambridge Companions to Law

#### Cambridge Companions to Law

Cambridge Companions to Law offers thought-provoking introductions to different legal disciplines, invaluable to both the student and the scholar. Edited by world-leading academics, each offers a collection of essays which both map out the subject and allow the reader to delve deeper. Critical and enlightening, the Companions library represents legal scholarship at its best.

The Cambridge Companion to European Union Private Law Edited by Christian Twigg-Flesner

The Cambridge Companion to International Law Edited by James Crawford and Martti Koskenniemi

The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Law Edited by Mauro Bussani and Ugo Mattei

The Cambridge Companion to Human Rights Law Edited by Conor Gearty and Costas Douzinas

The Cambridge Companion to Public Law Edited by Mark Elliott and David Feldman

The Cambridge Companion to International Criminal Law Edited by William A. Schabas

The Cambridge Companion to Natural Law Jurisprudence Edited by George Duke and Robert P. George

The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Family Law Edited by Shazia Choudhry and Jonathan Herring

The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Constitutional Law Edited by Roger Masterman and Robert Schütze

The Cambridge Companion to the First Amendment and Religious Liberty Edited by Michael D. Breidenbach and Owen Anderson



The Cambridge Companion to the Philosophy of Law Edited by John Tasioulas

The Cambridge Companion to Legal Positivism Edited by Torben Spaak and Patricia Mindus

The Cambridge Companion to Hugo Grotius Edited by Randall Lesaffer and Janne E. Nijman

The Cambridge Companion to International Arbitration Edited by Chin Leng Lim





# The Cambridge Companion to

## the Rule of Law

Edited by

Jens Meierhenrich

London School of Economics and Political Science

Martin Loughlin

London School of Economics and Political Science





# CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316512135 DOI: 10.1017/9781108600569

© Cambridge University Press 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-316-51213-5 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-45443-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



### **Contents**

	List of Contributors	page x
	Part I Introduction	1
	Thinking about the Rule of Law Jens Meierhenrich and Martin Loughlin	3
	Part II Histories	23
1	Classical Athens' Radical Democratic "Rule of Law" Adriaan Lanni	25
2	Rechtsstaat versus the Rule of Law Jens Meierhenrich	39
3	<i>État de droit</i> : The Gallicization of the <i>Rechtsstaat</i> Luc Heuschling	68
4	Islamic Conceptions of the Rule of Law Lawrence Rosen	86
5	Empires and the Rule of Law: Arbitrary Justice and Imperia Legal Ordering Lauren Benton and Lisa Ford	l 101
	Part III Moralities	119
6	The Rule of Law as an Essentially Contested Concept Jeremy Waldron	121
7	The Rule of Law in Montesquieu	137



#### viii Contents

8	The Spirit of Legality: A. V. Dicey and the Rule of Law Mark D. Walters	
9	Michael Oakeshott's Republican Theory of the Rule of Law Martin Loughlin	171
10	The Morality of the Rule of Law: Lon L. Fuller Kristen Rundle	
11	E. P. Thompson and the Rule of Law: Qualifying the Unqualified Good Douglas Hay	202
12	Functions of the Rule of Law Brian Z. Tamanaha	221
13	A Positive Theory of the Rule of Law Gillian K. Hadfield, Jens Meierhenrich, and Barry R. Weingast	237
	Part IV Pathologies	259
14	Thomas Hobbes and the Rule by Law Tradition David Dyzenhaus	261
15	Conservative Critiques of the <i>Rechtsstaat</i> Peter C. Caldwell	278
16	Judith Shklar's Critique of Legalism Seyla Benhabib and Paul Linden-Retek	295
17	The Frankfurt School and the Rule of Law William E. Scheuerman	312
18	Critical Legal Studies and the Rule of Law Mark Tushnet	328
19	Feminist Critiques of the Rule of Law Vanessa E. Munro	340
20	Critical Race Theory and the Rule of Law Khiara M. Bridges	357



		Contents	ix
	Part V Trajectories	375	
21	(Economic) Development and the Rule of Law Shane Chalmers and Sundhya Pahuja	377	
22	Democracy and the Rule of Law Martin Krygier	406	
23	Constitutionalism and the Rule of Law Roberto Gargarella	425	
24	Punishment in the Rule of Law Lindsay Farmer	443	
25	Populism and the Rule of Law Nicola Lacey	458	
26	An "International Rule of Law Movement"? Stephen Humphreys	474	
27	Rule of Law Measurement Tom Ginsburg and Mila Versteeg	494	
28	Post-Conflict Rule of Law Jane E. Stromseth	513	
29	A Global Rule of Law Anne Orford	538	
	Part VI Conclusion	567	
30	What the Rule of Law Is and Is Not Jens Meierhenrich	569	
	Bibliography Index	622 682	



### **Contributors**

**Seyla Benhabib** is the Eugene Meyer Professor of Political Science and Philosophy Emerita at Yale University.

Lauren Benton is the Barton M. Biggs Professor of History and Professor of Law at Yale University.

**Khiara M. Bridges** is Professor of Law at the University of California, Berkeley.

Peter C. Caldwell is the Samuel G. McCann Professor of History at Rice University.

Shane Chalmers is McKenzie Research Fellow and Program Director in Law and Art at the Institute for International Law and the Humanities at Melbourne Law School.

**David Dyzenhaus** is University Professor of Law and Philosophy at the University of Toronto.

Lindsay Farmer is Professor of Law at the University of Glasgow.

Lisa Ford is Professor of History at the University of New South Wales.

Roberto Gargarella is Professor of Constitutional Theory and Political Philosophy at the Universidad de Buenos Aires and at the Universidad Torcuato Di Tella, Argentina.

Tom Ginsburg is the Leo Spitz Professor of International Law at the University of Chicago Law School, and a Research Professor at the American Bar Foundation.

Gillian K. Hadfield is the Schwartz Reisman Chair in Technology and Society, Professor of Law, and Professor of Strategic Management at the University of Toronto.

**Douglas Hay** is Professor Emeritus of Law and History at York University, Canada.



List of Contributors

χi

**Stephen Humphreys** is Associate Professor of Law at the London School of Economics and Political Science.

**Sharon R. Krause** is the William R. Kenan, Jr. University Professor of Political Science at Brown University.

Martin Krygier is the Gordon Samuels Professor of Law and Social Theory at the University of New South Wales.

Nicola Lacey is School Professor of Law, Gender, and Social Policy at the London School of Economics and Political Science.

Adriaan Lanni is the Touroff-Glueck Professor of Law at Harvard Law School.

**Paul Linden-Retek** is Lecturer in Law and Society, University at Buffalo School of Law, State University of New York.

Martin Loughlin is Professor of Public Law at the London School of Economics and Political Science.

Jens Meierhenrich is Director of the Centre for International Studies at the London School of Economics and Political Science and a Visiting Professor of Law at Harvard Law School.

Vanessa E. Munro is Professor of Law at the University of Warwick.

Anne Orford is the Redmond Barry Distinguished Professor and the Michael D. Kirby Chair of International Law at Melbourne Law School.

**Sundhya Pahuja** is Professor and Director of Melbourne Law School's Institute for International Law and the Humanities.

Lawrence Rosen is the William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Anthropology Emeritus at Princeton University.

Kristen Rundle is Professor of Law at Melbourne Law School.

William E. Scheuerman is the James H. Rudy Professor of Political Science and International Studies at Indiana University.

**Jane E. Stromseth** is the Francis Cabell Brown Professor of International Law at Georgetown University.

Brian Z. Tamanaha is the John S. Lehmann University Professor at Washington University School of Law.



#### xii List of Contributors

Mark Tushnet is William Nelson Cromwell Professor of Law Emeritus at Harvard Law School.

Mila Versteeg is Professor of Law at the University of Virginia School of Law and Director of the Human Rights Program.

**Jeremy Waldron** is University Professor at New York University School of Law.

Mark D. Walters is Professor and Dean of Law at Queen's University, Canada.

Barry R. Weingast is the Ward C. Krebs Family Professor in the Department of Political Science at Stanford University.