

Index

Hutcheson, Francis and, 76 act-consequentialism, 17, 43, 54, 100, 176, 186, 187-8, 193, 215, 216, see also legislative perspective and, 73 consequentialism Shaftesbury and, 73 act-utilitarianism, 17, 24, 86, 106, 119, 128, 136, spectator metaphor and, 76 137, 138, 142, 146, 176, see also utilitarianism Cohen, Gerald Allan, 205 Brandt, Richard and, 149-51 counterintutive conclusions of, 5, 7, 8, conscience-consequentialism, see motiveconsequentialism 17, 27 Hare, Richard Mervyn and, 144, 146, 147 conscience-utilitarianism, see sanction-Mill, John Stuart and, 108-9 utilitarianism rule-utilitarianism, critique of, 138-43 consequentialism, 7, 10, 127, 173, see also twentieth-century critique of, 132-4 act-consequentialism, motive-Albee, Ernest, 18, 34, 92 consequentialism, and rule-Anscombe, Elizabeth, 7 consequentialism Austin, John, 8, 137 definition of, 3, 5, 22 Paley, William and, 99-100 disjunctive, 169 Stout, Alan Ker on, 138-9 indirect, 164, 194 institutional, 159 Beauchamp, Philip, see Bentham, Jeremy legislative perspective and, 20 natural law and, 33–57 Bentham, Jeremy, 8, 17, 18, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, secular, 99, 152 47, 76, 77, 81, 82, 83–5, 92–100, 101, 102, 105, 106, 118, 127, 137, 140, 141, 152, 153, 154, 162, theological foundations of, 8 190, 217, 218, 220, 222, 223 weak, 7, 48, 50, 152, 198 human legislation and, 92-4, 97 legislative, 12, 57, 84, 92, 103, 109, 124, 125, indirect legislative perspective and, 97-9 rejection of natural theology and, 94-7 127, 159–61, 164, 167, 168, 169, 209, secular approach of, 83, 92 211-13 Berger, Peter, 110 political, 16, 29, 163, 164, 190, 209, 211-13 Berkeley, George, 58, 152 Cooper, Anthony Ashley, see Shaftesbury, Third legislative perspective, use of, 59-63 Farl of Locke and, 59, 62 Crimmins, James, 18, 95, 140 Birks, Thomas Rawson, 94 Crisp, Roger, 108, 121 Cumberland, Richard, 25, 34, 42-7, 57, 101 Brandt, Richard, 175, 193 extended rule-utilitarianism and, 137-8 ideal code and, 149-50, 195 Dancy, Jonathan, 11 Darwall, Stephen, 64, 73 legislative approach to morality of, 150-1 Brink, David Ö., 108 Davis, Kevin R., 203 Broad, Charlie Dunbar, 129 discretion, 3, 6, 13, 15, 163, 168, 210 Donner, Wendy, 103, 107 Bull, Hedley, 36 Butler, Joseph, 83, 120, 130, 153, 190 benevolence, critique of, 73-4 Ewing, Alfred Cyril, 134-5



Index 227

fallibility, 3, 4, 8, 10, 16, 23, 25, 46, 47, 55, 57, 62, 63, 65, 79, 80, 87, 91, 102, 112, 152, 193, 194, 198, 206, 207, 208, 212, 215

Forde, Steven, 39, 40

Frankena, William, 146

Fuchs, Thomas, 104, 109

Gert, Bernard, 172 Gibbard, Alan, 196–7 Gill, Michael B., 64 Goodin, Robert, 28, 159, 161, 162–4 Grotius, Hugo, 23, 25, 33, 36–42 legal conventions and, 33–4 natural law, theory of, 42, 57 Suarez, Francisco and, 35

Hardin, Garrett, 77 Hare, Richard Mervyn, 28, 143-7, 148, 175 utilitarianism and, 143-7 Harrison, Jonathan, 132-4 Harrison, Ross, 94 Harrod, Roy Forbes, 130-2, 133, 148 Harsanyi, John, 28, 143, 146, 150 rule-utilitarianism and, 148-9 Hart, Herbert L.A., 136 Hill, Thomas Jr., 151, 159, 181–3, 205 Hobbes, Thomas, 33, 45, 46, 47, 131 Hooker, Brad, 22, 28, 159, 174-80, 198, 204 Hume, David, 59, 68, 97, 153 justice as an artificial virtue and, 76-81 rule-based thinking and, 78 Hutcheson, Francis, 58, 65-72, 101, 152 legislative perspective and, 69-72 natural law and, 70 moral sense and, 70 Shaftesbury and, 69 spectator metaphor and, 26 hybrid approaches, 20, 134, 135, 142, 155 benefits of, 192-9 defense of, 29, see also legislative perspective, hybrid approach, and definition of, 7 rule-utilitarians and, 8

ideal conscience-utilitarianism, see sanctionutilitarianism Irwin, Terrance, 34–6, 38, 47

Johnson, Conrad, 28, 159, 161, 164–6, 169 justice benevolence and, 51, 67, 75 Hume, David and, 76–81 legal character of, 59

Mill, John Stuart and, 106 non-consequentialist theories of, 20 non-ideal theory and, 206 Rawls, John and, 103, 136, 202 secularization of, 17–19, 26, 76–81, 153 Sidgwick, Henry and, 121 utilitarianism and, 143

Kantianism, see Kant, Immanuel
Kant, Immanuel, 9, 11, 49, 131, 134, 135, 143, 145,
203, 204
approaches inspired by, 10, 134, 180–9
consequentialism, critique of, 10
legislative perspective and, 9–11
Kaye, Frederick Benjamin, 66
Korsgaard, Christine, 200, 202, 211

Lazari-Radek, Katarzyna de, 28, 123, 159, 171 legislative contexts, 191 legislative perspective, 123-4 contextual distinctions and, 13-16 counterfactual, 109, 112, 126 definition of, 2 disjunctive consequentialism and, 174 foundations of, 7 four dimensions, 9-13 hybrid approach and, 180-9, 191, 207-8, see hybrid approaches illustrations of, 2-5 institutional consequentialism and, 169 moral expression as legislation, 126 morality as a code and, 87 natural law theory and, 39-40, 53-6 noncompliance and misapplication of rules and, 182 political ethics and, 209–15 Rawlsian rule-consequentialism and, legislative point of view, see legislative perspective Leidhold, Wolfgang, 66 Little, Olivia, 204 Locke, John, 101, 152, 161 consequentialism and, 55 God as a legislator and, 26 Kantian parallels in, 49 legislative perspective of, 48 natural law theory of, 48, 53-6 rule-consequentialism and, 49-51, 57 toleration and, 56, 57, 62 virtue and vice and, 52 Lyons, David, 6, 27, 106, 129, 141-2, 149, 208

Mabbott, John David, 134 Mackie, John L., 20, 142 Mandeville, Bernard, 66 McCloskey, Henry John, 141 McKown, Delos B., 94



228

Mill, John Stuart, 100, 101, 137, 154, 192, 213 act-utilitarianism and, 108 defense of freedom of expression of, 112-13 example of counterfactual legislative perspective in, 110 historical background of, 101-2 legislative perspective and, 107-12, 114-18 moral expression and, 115-16 secondary moral rules and, 102 Paley, William and, 84 public opinion and, 113-14 rule-utilitarianism and, 103-8, 109, 126 Miller, Dale, 180 Miller, David, 107, 206 Montague, Philip, 180 Moore, George Edward, 128-9, 141, 147 moral rules, 128 moral expression as legislation, 42, 112-18, 126, 166, 192 morality as legislation, 24, 26, 46, 143, 151 historical argument, review of, 151-5 justifying the hybrid approach and, 20-2 morality expressed as universal laws and, necessary moral commitments of, 199-207 Morison, William Loutit, 100 motive-consequentialism, 187 Nowell-Smith, Patrick, 135

O'Flaherty, Michael, 83 orthodoxy, utilitarian, see utilitarianism, orthodoxy and

Paley, William, 8, 18, 22, 23, 26, 47, 81, 92, 94, 98, 101, 153, 161, 190 Austin, John and, 99-100 consequentialism of, 84, 87, 99 divorce laws, views on, 88 God, role of, 84-7 greatest good, promotion of, 89 property, views on, 88 religious toleration and establishment, views on, 90-2 rule-based approach of, 83 rules, principles for evaluating, 90 self-defense, views on, 89 suicide, views on, 90 Parfit, Derek, 159, 181, 197 consequentialism, self-defeating, 19 Kantian contractualism, 183–8 paternalism, 111, 112, 114 Pettit, Philip, 179, 212 political context, see context, political

Index

Portmore, Douglas, 202 Proast, Jonas, 53-6 Pufendorf, Samuel von, 33, 48 Rawls, John, 5, 6, 20, 103, 136, 141, 150, 172, 176, 178, 202–3, 205 religion, 74, 76, 161, 195, 213 Austin, John and, 100 benevolence and, 8 Benthem, Jeremy and, 99 divine legislation and, 8 Hutcheson, Francis and, 67 legislative perspective and, 29, 200 Mill, John Stuart and, 116 morality as legislation and, 25 Paley, William and, 84, 90-2 rule-utilitarianism and, 7 sanctions, see sanctions, divine Sidgwick, Henry and, 118, 119 toleration and, 34, 47, 53-6, 57, 62, 71, 152, 205, 207 utilitarianism and, 18, 26, 127 Rosen, Frederick, 24, 77 Ross, William David, 130, 133, 154, 201 rule-consequentialism, 8, 12, 17, 27, 28, 44, 46, 56, 100, 124, 127, 137, 161, 163, 165, 169, 186, 192, 193, 198 Brandt, Richard and, 137 Hooker, Brad and, 174-80, 203 legislative forms of, 54 Locke, John and, 34, 47-51, 54-6, 57 Parfit, Derek and, 183-9 rule-utilitarianism, 5, 7, 8, 11, 17, 18, 24, 27, 83, 124, 127–8, 137 Brandt, Richard and, 137-8, 149-51 consistency of, 6 critics of, twentieth century, 138-43 development of, early twentieth century, 128-32 development of, mid-twentieth century, Hare, Richard Mervyn and, 144-7 Harsanyi, John and, 148-9 Mill, John Stuart and, 6, 103-9, 126 religion and, 7, 74 rules, exceptions to, 132-5 sanctions, 13, 64, 65, 93, 120, see also sanctionutilitarianism conscience and, 27, 106-8 divine, 17, 18, 27, 45, 65, 67, 81, 85, 93, 95, 101 legal, 93, 98, 102, 109, 114 reputational, 27, 93, 97, 98, 102, 113-6, 153, 213, 215

sanction-utilitarianism, 106-8



Index 229

Schauer, Frederick, 28, 159, 161, 166, 169, 174 four ways of thinking about rules of, 166-8 Schneewind, Jerome B., 121 Schultz, Bart, 18, 98, 103, 118, 119 Sen, Amartya, 143, 146 Shaftesbury, Third Earl of, 58, 66, 190 architect metaphor and, 26 Hutcheson, Francis and, 69 legislative approach to morality and, 63-5 Sidgwick, Henry, 23, 100, 101, 118-25, 145, 154, 192, 196 esoteric morality of, 122-3 intuitionism and, 121 legislative perspective and, 118-20 moral motivation and, 17 moral rules for secular utilitarianism in, secondary moral rules and, 102 Simmons, A. John, 48-9, 51, 206 Singer, Peter, 28, 123, 136, 159, 171 situated perspective, 5, 9, 19, 21, 22, 98, 111, 124 Smart, John Jamieson Carswell, 1, 6, 8, 27, 140-1, 187 Smith, Adam, 68 Sobel, Jordan H., 81 Stephen, Leslie, 18 Stout, Alan Ker, 139 Suarez, Francisco, 33, 35, 38

toleration, 34, 47, 53–6, 57, 62, III, 207 Hutcheson, Francis and, 71 Locke, John and, III, 152, 205 Paley, William and, 90–2 Tuck, Richard, 36 Tuckness, Alex, 20, 35, 50, 53

Urmson, James Opie, 6, 104
utilitarianism, see also act-utilitarianism, motiveutilitarianism, and rule-utilitarianism
consistency of, 6, 17, 24, 127, 138–43, 147, 174
definition of, 5, 22–3
Hume, David and, 80
impartiality and, 89
indirect, 120
orthodoxy and, 138–49
secular, 8, 92, 152

Voitle, Robert, 64

Waldron, Jeremy, 206
Wallace, R. Jay, 202
Whewell, William, 84
White, Morton, 49
Williams, Bernard, 143, 146, 147, 171, 203
Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 209

Zamzow, Jennifer, 201