

2020

AWARD

IRAN *v.* UNITED STATES, CASES A15 (II:A), A26 (IV) & B43
 40 IRAN-U.S. C.T.R. 5

5

THE ISLAMIC REPUBLIC OF IRAN, *Claimant*

v.

THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, *Respondent*

(Cases Nos. A15 (II:A), A26 (IV) and B43)

Full Tribunal: van Houtte,^[1] *President;* Kronke, Simma,^[2] Nikbakht Fini,^[3]
 Abedian,^[4] Scifi,^[5] Brower,^[6] Johnson^[7] and Barkett,^[8] *Members*

Signed 10 March 2020^[9]

AWARD NO. 604-A15 (II:A)/A26 (IV)/B43-FT

The following is the text as issued by the Tribunal:

PARTIAL AWARD

Appearances:

For the Claimant: Mr. Mohammad H. Zahedin Labbaf,
 Agent of the Islamic Republic of Iran,
 Dr. Siamak Karamzadeh,
 Agent of the Islamic Republic of Iran,
 Mr. Samuel Wordsworth, QC,
 Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,

^[1] Mr. van Houtte's signature is accompanied by the words "Concurring." The Opinion, signed on 10 March 2020 and filed on 10 March 2020, appears at p. 618, below.]

^[2] Mr. Simma's signature is accompanied by the words "Concurring in part, dissenting in part." The Opinion, signed on 10 March 2020 and filed on 10 March 2020, appears at p. 623, below.]

^[3] Mr. Nikbakht Fini's signature is accompanied by the words "Concurring in part, dissenting in part." The Opinion, signed on 10 March 2020 and filed on 10 March 2020, appears at p. 654, below.]

^[4] Mr. Abedian's signature is accompanied by the words "Concurring in part, dissenting in part." The Opinion, signed on 10 March 2020 and filed on 10 March 2020, appears at p. 774, below.]

^[5] Mr. Scifi's signature is accompanied by the words "Concurring in part, dissenting in part." The Opinion, signed on 10 March 2020 and filed on 10 March 2020, appears at p. 840, below.]

^[6] Mr. Brower's signature is accompanied by the words "Concurring in part, dissenting in part." The Opinion, signed on 10 March 2020 and filed on 10 March 2020, appears at p. 899, below.]

^[7] Mr. Johnson's signature is accompanied by the words "Concurring in part, dissenting in part." The Opinion, signed on 10 March 2020 and filed on 10 March 2020, appears at p. 950, below.]

^[8] Ms. Barkett's signature is accompanied by the words "Concurring in part, dissenting in part." The Opinion, signed on 10 March 2020 and filed on 10 March 2020, appears at p. 973, below.]

^[9] Filed 10 March 2020. A related Correction to Award and Decision on Request for Correction and Additional Award, filed on 27 November 2020, appears at p. 999, below.]

Mr. David Sellers,
Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,
Mr. William Thomas,
Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,
Professor Chester Brown,
Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,
Mr. David Davies,
Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,
Professor Andreas Zimmermann,
Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,
Professor Christian Tams,
Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,
Ms. Natasha Harrington,
Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,
Mr. Greg Falkof,
Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,
Ms. Naomi Briercliffe,
Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,
Ms. Natalie Limbasan,
Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,
Mr. David Lindsey,
Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,
Ms. Laura Zielinski,
Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,
Ms. Alexandra Kerjean,
Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,
Mr. W. Pydiamah,
Counsel for the Islamic Republic of Iran,
Ms. Gillian Forsyth,
Assistant to Counsel,
Ms. M. Niknejad,
Assistant to Counsel,
Ms. Fanny Sarnel,
Assistant to Counsel,
Mr. Ali Mokhberolsafa,
Legal Adviser to the Agent,
Mr. Hassan Behrooz Mahdavi,
Legal Adviser to the Agent,
Mr. Mehdi Soroush,
Legal Adviser to the Agent,

Mr. A. Allahjari,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. A. H. Abdolhamid,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. S. Mansouri,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. A.R. Lahabi,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. M.H. Mohazeb,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. O. Ghanami,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. F. Dabiri,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. E. Haditabar,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. Rabia Eskini,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. Reza Fazel,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. Abdolkhalil Moazamzadeh,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. Alireza Khankarami,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. Mohsen Najafi,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. Masoud Nouri,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. A. Sherafat,
Claimant's Representative,
Mr. A. Mosoudpour,
Representative of the Ministry for Islamic
Culture and Guidance,
Mr. H. Mafi,
Representative of the Ministry for Islamic
Culture and Guidance,
Mr. M. Omidvand Chali,
Representative of the Ministry for Islamic
Culture and Guidance,

Mr. H. Arab Najafi,
Representative of Sound and
Vision of the Islamic Republic of
Iran,
Mr. D. Ashrafi,
Representative of Sound and
Vision of the Islamic Republic of
Iran,
Mr. K. Fakim Hashemi,
Representative of Hamadan Glass
Company,
Mr. M. Ebrahimi,
Representative of the Ministry of Roads
and Transportation,
Mr. B. Ghavami,
Representative of the Ministry of Roads
and Transportation,
Mr. G. Rafiei,
Representative of Iran Aseman Airlines,
Mr. A. Khazaie,
Observer,
Mr. Ali Fahim Danesh,
Observer,
Ms. Z. Taghizadeh,
Observer.

For the Respondent:

Ms. Kathleen A. Wilson
Agent of the United States of America,
Mr. Paul S. Veidenheimer,
Deputy Agent of the United States of
America,
Ms. Mary McLeod
Principal Deputy Legal Adviser, United
States Department of State,
Ms. Lisa J. Grosh,
Assistant Legal Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Mr. John Daley,
Deputy Assistant Legal Adviser, United
States Department of State,
Sir Daniel Bethlehem, QC,
Counsel for the United States of America,

Mr. Theodore Kill,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Mr. David M. Bigge,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Ms. Laura Conn,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Ms. Nicole Thornton,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Mr. Jonas Lerman,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Mr. John Blanck,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Mr. Abbas Ravjani,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Ms. Anne Cusick,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Ms. Alicia Cate,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Mr. Harry Barnes,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Ms. Anna Melamud,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Mr. David Salie,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Mr. Audrius Kirvelaitis,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Ms. Megan Grimball,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,

Mr. Julian Simcock,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Ms. Sharon Swingle,
Assistant Director, United States
Department of Justice,
Mr. Neale Bergman,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Ms. Eva Dantzer,
Attorney-Adviser, United States
Department of State,
Ms. Lana Ulrich,
Paralegal, United States Department of
State,
Mr. John Calopietro,
Paralegal, United States
Department of State,
Ms. Mariama Yilla,
Paralegal, United States
Department of State,
Ms. Teshia Ferguson,
Paralegal, United States
Department of State,
Mr. Anjail Al-Ugdah,
Paralegal, United States
Department of State,
Ms. Abby Lounsberry,
Paralegal, United States
Department of State,
Ms. Kristyn Dunleavy,
United States Embassy,
The Hague,
Ms. Brittany Villareal,
United States Embassy,
The Hague,
Mr. Felipe Awad,
Legal Intern, United States
Embassy, The Hague.

IRAN *v.* UNITED STATES, CASES A15 (II:A), A26 (IV) & B43 11
 40 IRAN-U.S. C.T.R. 5

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<i>Paragraph</i>
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. FACTUAL BACKGROUND	8
III. FIRST PHASE OF THE PROCEEDINGS	19
A. Introduction	19
B. Award No. 529	25
1. Executive Order No. 12281	27
2. The Treasury Regulations Issued After 19 January 1981	30
a) Properties of Which Iran Was not the Sole Owner	31
b) Properties Owned by Iran but Where the Right to Possession Was Contested	32
c) Properties as to Which the Sale Could Be Licensed	33
d) Properties Subject to United States Export Control Laws	35
3. Further Proceedings	37
IV. SECOND PHASE OF THE PROCEEDINGS	39
A. Procedure	39
B. Merits	61
1. General Issues	61
a) Introduction	61
b) Scope of the United States' Obligation Under Paragraph 9	62
(1) "Properties" Within the Scope of Paragraph 9	62
(a) Introduction	62
(b) Iran's Contentions	63
(i) The Proper Interpretation of the Term "Iranian Properties" in the Algiers Declarations	65
(ii) A Broad Definition of "Property" in International Law	74
(iii) Non-Applicability of <i>Lex Rei Sitae</i> and UCC Section 2-401 to the Interpretation of the Term "Iranian Properties"	76

	(iv) Changed Circumstances	78
	(v) Competent Forum	80
(c)	The United States' Contentions	81
	(i) Criteria for Properties to Fall Within the Scope of Paragraph 9	81
	(ii) "Iranian Properties" Include only Those Tangible Properties in Which Iran Held Uncontested and Non-Contingent Title	82
	(iii) The <i>Lex Rei Sitae</i> Determines Whether Title Had Been Transferred to Iran	87
	(iv) UCC Section 2-401 as the Relevant Rule for the Transfer of Title	90
	(v) Competent Forum	92
(d)	The Tribunal's Decision	93
	(i) The Issues Before the Tribunal	93
	(ii) In Award No. 529, the Tribunal Has Interpreted the Term "All Iranian Properties" as "Tangible" Properties "Solely Owned by Iran"	97
	(iii) Title Is Indicative of Property Being "Solely Owned by Iran"	125
	(iv) Determining Whether Legal Title Has Passed to Iran in Accordance With General Principles of Private International Law	135
	(v) The General Principles of Private International Law	142
(2)	The United States' Obligations Under the Algiers Declarations with Respect to Iranian Tangible Properties	165
	(a) Introduction	165
	(b) The Date on Which the United States' Paragraph 9 Obligation Arose	170
	(i) The Parties' Contentions	171
	(ii) The Tribunal's Decision	173
	(c) The Nature of the United States' Paragraph 9 Obligation	178