

PONTORMO AND THE ART OF DEVOTION IN RENAISSANCE ITALY

Both lauded and criticized for his pictorial eclecticism, the Florentine artist Jacopo Carrucci, known as Pontormo, created some of the most visually striking religious images of the Renaissance. These paintings, which challenged prevailing illusionistic conventions, mark a unique contribution to the complex relationship between artistic innovation and Christian traditions in the first half of the sixteenth century. Pontormo's sacred works are generally interpreted as objects that reflect either pure aesthetic experimentation or personal and cultural anxiety. Jessica A. Maratsos, however, argues that Pontormo employed stylistic change deliberately for novel devotional purposes. As a painter, he was interested in the various modes of expression and communication – direct address, tactile evocation, affective incitement – as deployed in a wide spectrum of devotional culture, from *sacri monti*, to Michelangelo's marble sculptures, to evangelical lectures delivered at the Accademia Fiorentina. Maratsos shows how Pontormo translated these modes in ways that prompt a critical rethinking of Renaissance devotional art.

Jessica A. Maratsos is Keith Sykes Research Fellow in Italian Studies at Pembroke College, Cambridge University.

PONTORMO AND THE ART OF DEVOTION IN RENAISSANCE ITALY

JESSICA A. MARATSOS

Pembroke College, Cambridge University



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316510551
DOI: 10.1017/9781009037952

© Cambridge University Press 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Books Limited, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Maratsos, Jessica A., author.

TITLE: Pontormo and the art of devotion in Renaissance Italy / Jessica A. Maratsos, Pembroke College, Cambridge.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge ; New York : Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Outgrowth of the author's thesis (doctoral) – Columbia University, 2014, under the title: Devotional imagination of Jacopo Pontormo. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021017112 (print) | LCCN 2021017113 (ebook) | ISBN 9781316510551 (hardback) | ISBN 9781009037952 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Pontormo, Jacopo da, 1494–1556 – Criticism and interpretation. | Christian art and symbolism – Italy – Renaissance, 1450–1600. | Devotion in art.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC ND623.P8 M36 2022 (print) | LCC ND623.P8 (ebook) | DDC 759.5–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021017112>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021017113>

ISBN 978-1-316-51055-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

CONTENTS

<i>List of Plates</i>	page vii
<i>List of Illustrations</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	x
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xii
INTRODUCTION: DRAWING DEVOTION, IMITATING NATURE IN CINQUECENTO FLORENCE	1
Pontormo and Vasari	6
Pontormo and Mannerism	9
Style and Imitation in the Arts	12
Drawing, Nature, and the Studio	15
The Status of the Christian Image	22
1 PERFORMING THE PASSION AT THE CERTOSA DEL GALLUZZO	29
<i>La Maniera Tedesca</i>	41
The Carthusian Context	46
Performativity	58
Audience and Experience	66
2 PICTORIAL THEOLOGY AND THE <i>PARAGONE</i> IN THE CAPPONI CHAPEL	73
Space and Plane, <i>Rilievo</i> and <i>Colore</i>	74
Patronage and Politics	83
Fabricating Divine Imagery	91
Nicodemus as Artist	96
3 ELUSIVE RHETORIC AT SAN LORENZO	111
The Parish Church of San Lorenzo	113
An Enigmatic Iconography	120
Art as Text	126
Rhetoric, Poetics, and the Image	135
The Accademia Fiorentina	147

4	A PONTORMO LEGACY IN FLORENCE?	154
	Baccio Bandinelli's Choir	154
	The Changed Cultural Horizon	160
	The Montauto Chapel	163
	Bronzino's <i>Martyrdom of Saint Lawrence</i>	165
	Funerals and Tombs	167
	<i>Notes</i>	172
	<i>Bibliography</i>	217
	<i>Index</i>	252

Color plates can be found between pages 148 and 149.

PLATES

- I Pontormo, *Study of a Seated Nude*. c. 1519–1521.
- II Pontormo, *Christ before Pilate*. 1522–1525.
- III Pontormo, *Way to Calvary*. 1522–1525.
- IV Pontormo, *Lamentation*. 1522–1525.
- V Giovanni Bellini, *Agony in the Garden*. c.1458–60.
- VI Ambrogio Bergognone, *Christ Carrying the Cross*. 1491–1497.
- VII Attributed to Agnolo di Polo, *The Crucifixion*. c. 1510–1515.
- VIII Pontormo, *Supper at Emmaus*. 1525–1527.
- IX Pontormo, *Pietà*. 1525–28.
- X Pontormo, *Saint John the Evangelist* and Pontormo or Bronzino, *Saint Matthew*. 1525–1526.
- XI Pontormo, *Annunciation*. 1525–1528.
- XII Andrea del Sarto, *Lamentation*. 1523–1524.
- XIII Michelangelo, *Doni Tondo*. 1504–1506.
- XIV Filippino Lippi, *Saint Philip Expelling a Demon from the Altar of Mars*. 1497–1502.
- XV Pontormo, *Saint Veronica*. 1515.
- XVI Pontormo, *Study for Nicodemus* (self-portrait). 1525–1528.
- XVII Andrea del Sarto, *Madonna of the Harpies*. 1517.
- XVIII Michelangelo, *Last Judgment*. 1534–1541.
- XIX Bronzino, *Descent into Limbo*. 1552.
- XX Bronzino, *Martyrdom of Saint Lawrence*. 1565–69.

ILLUSTRATIONS

1	Leonardo da Vinci, <i>The Burlington House Cartoon</i> . About 1499–1500.	page 4
2	Giorgio Vasari, <i>Portrait of Pontormo</i> in <i>Le vite de' più eccellenti pittori, scultori, e architetti</i> . 1568.	7
3	Annibale Carracci, <i>Nude Study of a Young Man Lying on His Back with His Head Thrown Back, Eyes Closed</i> . c. 1580s.	16
4	Pontormo, <i>Study of a Sleeping Nude</i> . c. 1519–1521.	17
5	Pontormo, <i>Study of Figure Descending Stairs</i> . c. 1515.	19
6	Pontormo, <i>Pharaoh with His Butler and Baker</i> . About 1515.	20
7	Pontormo, <i>Study of a Reclining Youth</i> . c. 1519–1521.	21
8	Pontormo, <i>Study of a Sleeping Youth</i> . c. 1522–1525.	21
9	Bacchiacca, <i>Joseph Pardons His Brothers</i> . About 1515.	26
10	Pontormo, <i>Joseph with Jacob in Egypt</i> . About 1518.	26
11	Pontormo, <i>Agony in the Garden</i> . 1522–1525.	31
12	Pontormo, <i>The Resurrection</i> . 1522–1525.	32
13	Pontormo, <i>Nailing to the Cross</i> . c. 1522–1525.	33
14	Pontormo, <i>Figure Studies for the Nailing to the Cross</i> . c. 1522–1525.	34
15	Reconstruction of fresco arrangement in the cloister after Graham Smith.	35
16	<i>Chiostro grande</i> at the Certosa del Galluzzo.	36
17	Andrea del Sarto, <i>Baptism of the People</i> . c. 1515–1517.	37
18	Andrea del Sarto, <i>Arrest of the Baptist</i> . c. 1517.	38
19	Pontormo, <i>Study for Christ before Pilate</i> . 1522–1523.	39
20	Pontormo, <i>Studies for Youth Pouring Water</i> . c. 1522–1525.	43
21	Giovanni della Robbia and workshop, <i>David</i> . Installed 1523.	47
22	Jean de Beaufort and workshop, <i>Calvary with a Carthusian Monk</i> . 1389–1395.	49
23	Ridolfo Ghirlandaio, <i>The Procession to Calvary</i> . c. 1505.	53
24	Raphael and Giovanfrancesco Penni, <i>Lo Spasimo</i> . 1515–1516.	54
25	Albrecht Dürer, <i>Christ Bearing the Cross</i> . n.d.	55
26	Martin Schongauer, <i>Christ Carrying the Cross</i> . c. 1475–1480.	56
27	Attributed to Agnolo di Polo, <i>John and the Three Marys</i> . c. 1510–1515.	64
28	Attributed to Agnolo di Polo, <i>Christ in the Tomb</i> . c. 1510–1515.	65
29	Attributed to Agnolo di Polo, <i>Way to Calvary (Carrying of the Cross)</i> . c. 1510–1515.	66
30	Albrecht Dürer, <i>Supper at Emmaus</i> . c. 1510.	69
31	Pontormo, <i>Study of Two Monks, One Standing behind the Other</i> . c. 1525.	70

32 Pontormo, <i>Study of a Man Standing in Profile to the Right (Self-Portrait)</i> . c. 1525.	71
33 Filippo Brunelleschi and Pontormo. Capponi Chapel. c. 1419–1425/ 1525–1528.	75
34 Michelangelo, <i>Pietà</i> . 1498–99.	76
35 Pontormo, <i>Study for a Patriarch</i> . c. 1525.	77
36 Pontormo, <i>Study for God the Father</i> . c. 1525.	78
37 Attributed to Filippo Brunelleschi, <i>Saint John the Evangelist</i> . c. 1445.	79
38 Michelangelo, <i>Tomb of Giuliano de' Medici</i> . 1520–1534.	89
39 Michelangelo, <i>Tomb of Lorenzo de' Medici</i> . 1520–1534.	89
40 Martin Schongauer, <i>Heilige Veronica</i> . 1470–1490.	92
41 Pontormo, <i>Study for the Pietà</i> . 1525–1526.	97
42 Pontormo, <i>Nicodemus</i> . 1525–1528.	98
43 Michelangelo, <i>Pietà</i> (or <i>Deposition</i>). 1547–1555.	100
44 Baccio Bandinelli, <i>Pietà</i> (detail). 1555–1559.	101
45 Nanni di Banco, <i>Four Crowned Saints</i> (detail). 1408–1416.	101
46 Sandro Botticelli, <i>Adoration of the Magi</i> . c. 1475.	105
47 Orcagna, <i>Dormition of the Virgin</i> (detail of self-portrait). 1352–1359.	107
48 Pontormo, <i>Adoration of the Magi</i> (detail). c. 1520–23.	108
49 Reconstruction of San Lorenzo Choir after Janet Cox-Rearick.	114
50 Pontormo, <i>Study for Sacrifice of Abel and His Murder by Cain</i> . c. 1545–1549.	115
51 Pontormo, <i>Study for Moses Receiving the Law</i> . c. 1545–1549.	116
52 Pontormo, <i>Study for the Four Evangelists</i> . c. 1545–1549.	117
53 Pontormo, <i>Study for Christ in Glory with the Creation of Eve</i> . c. 1545–1549.	118
54 Pontormo, <i>Study for the Expulsion from Paradise</i> . c. 1545–1549.	119
55 Pontormo, <i>Study for the Deluge</i> . c. 1550–1555.	120
56 Pontormo, <i>Study for the Resurrection of the Dead</i> . c. 1550–1555.	121
57 Pontormo, <i>Study for the Resurrection of the Dead</i> . c. 1550–1555.	122
58 Pontormo, <i>Study for Ascension of the Souls</i> . c. 1550–1555.	123
59 Michelangelo, Sistine Chapel ceiling. 1508–1512.	134
60 Roman copy of a fifth-century Greek original by Myron, <i>The Discobolus Lancellotti</i> .	137
61 Agesander, Athenodoros, and Polydorus. <i>Laocöon and His Sons</i> .	138
62 Michelangelo, <i>Pietà</i> . 1540.	146
63 Baccio Bandinelli, <i>God the Father</i> . c. 1549–1555.	157
64 Baccio Bandinelli, <i>Christ Supported by an Angel</i> . 1550s.	158
65 Baccio Bandinelli, <i>Adam and Eve</i> . c. 1549–1551.	159
66 Baccio Bandinelli, <i>Eve-Ceres</i> . 1547–1549.	161
67 Alessandro Allori, Ceiling of the Montauto Chapel. 1560–1564.	164
68 Alessandro Allori, <i>The Trinity</i> . 1562.	168
69 Alessandro Allori, <i>Christ among the Doctors</i> (detail). 1560–1564.	169

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book began, as so many first books do, in a graduate seminar. Taught by William Hood, who had graciously agreed to serve as a visiting professor at Columbia after his retirement from Oberlin College, this course offered the perfect environment to think about the issues of the *paragone* afresh and ultimately led to a new understanding of Pontormo's work in the Capponi Chapel, which is the foundation for Chapter 2 in this book. These interests were cultivated by my mentor, David Rosand, who always advocated tackling challenging artists whose work did not allow for simple interpretations. In researching and writing my doctoral dissertation I also benefited from the advice of David Freedberg, Maria Ruvoldt, Alessio Assonitis at the Medici Archive Project, and Niccolò Capponi, who helped me navigate the treasures of his private family archive. I am particularly grateful to Alexander Nagel and Michael Cole, both of whom provided crucial feedback on the dissertation and have continued to offer guidance and encouragement throughout my career.

It has been a long journey from dissertation to book, during which I have benefited from the support of many friends and colleagues along the way. I want to thank especially Julia Siemon, my roommate and research companion in the cold Florentine winter; Aimee Ng and Christina Ferando, excellent sounding boards for all art-historical issues; Lorenzo Buonanno, who has read more drafts and iterations of this manuscript than anyone should reasonably have done; and Alessandra di Croce, whose insight into the original Italian and assistance in translation was essential. I would also like to acknowledge many others who have shared their knowledge, empathy, companionship, and sushi lunches with me over the course of this undertaking: Emily Beeny, Jaan Bernberg, Rosalind Blakesley, Jessica Caldi, Andrew Chen, Donal Cooper, Una Roman D'Elia, Kirsty Dooston, Dennis Geronimus, Bruce Edelstein, Rob Fucci, Paul Hartman, Frederick Ilchman, Holger Klein, Marika Knowles, Nicky Kozicharow, Holly Levant, Stuart Lingo, Carolina Mangone, Shannon McHugh, Melissa Oaks, Eveline Baseggio Omiccioli, Stephanie O'Rourke, Cara Phillips, Ellie Phillips, Katie Reinhart, David Roxborough, Anna Russakoff, Drew Sawyer, Sertaç Sehlkoglou, Jonathan Shimony, Nathaniel Silver, Evan Sirc, Irina Tolstoy, Ilona van Tuinen, Serdar Yalchin, Carolyn Yerkes, and Taryn Marie Zarillo. The astute and

constructive comments from the reviewers at Cambridge University Press, one of whom kindly revealed himself to be Christian Kleinbub, made the final version of the manuscript much stronger than it would have been otherwise.

I am also indebted to a number of institutions that provided both intellectual and material resources after my departure from Columbia. Teaching at Harvard enabled me to explore many of the themes in this book with perceptive and creative students, and I thank the History of Art and Architecture faculty, and Joseph Koerner particularly, for that stimulating year. The American University of Paris offered me the unequalled opportunity to teach and research in one of the most exciting cities in the world. My colleagues there, especially Hervé Vanel, were excellent interlocutors and also helped guide me through the bureaucratic realities of life as an expat. Finally, thanks to the generous support of Keith Sykes in the form of a research fellowship in Italian Studies, I have found a home at Pembroke College, where I was able to complete the manuscript. It would be difficult to imagine a warmer, more collegial environment in which to bring this project to fruition. Financial assistance for the acquisition of image rights and subvention costs has been provided by the Pembroke Fellows' Research Fund and a Samuel H. Kress Publication Subvention awarded by the Renaissance Society of America. Certain images were made available by the Renaissance Polychrome Sculpture in Tuscany database, created at Queen's University. An earlier version of Chapter 2 was first published in *Art History*, 40 (2017): 938–963 as “Pictorial Theology and the *Paragone* in Pontormo's Capponi Chapel” and I am grateful to the Association for Art History for granting me permission to reproduce this material here.

Finally, this book would not have been possible without the constant encouragement of my family. My parents, Mary Anne and Michael, as academics themselves, have shared both the joys and frustrations of my chosen career. My husband, Jon, has always been there to challenge me, his probing questions forcing me to sharpen my analyses and refine my ideas. And our amazing son, Matteo, arrived just in time to see this work cross the finish line.

ABBREVIATIONS

ACRF	Archivio Capponi, Palazzo alle Rovinate, Florence
ASF	Archivio di Stato di Firenze
BNCF	Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale di Firenze
<i>DBI</i>	<i>Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani</i>