

Index

- academic freedom
 - contract law and, 115
 - definition of, 113, 117
 - as distinctive right, 116, 119
 - extramural expression, 113
 - freedom of expression, distinction from, 427
 - harm and, 129, 133
 - knowledge and, 130
 - LA's responses to contributors, 427
 - LA's theory, 11
 - legal status of, 114
 - and Marcuse, Herbert, 129
 - other countries compared with USA, 118
 - positivism and, 117
 - private employees, 117
 - reasons for protecting speech, 119
 - scientific inquiry, nature of, 130
 - tenure and, 115
 - truth and, 130
- action
 - intention and, 206
- Alexander, Candy (sister), 3
- Alexander, David (son), 20
- Alexander, Elaine (wife), 3, 4
- Alexander, Helen Rosenwasser (mother), 2
- Alexander, Jenny (daughter), 20
- Alexander, Jonathan (son), 20
- Alexander, Lawrence (Larry) (indicated elsewhere
 - in the index as LA)
 - and Alexander, Elaine, 3, 4
 - early life, 2
 - family, 20
 - present volume as 'readers guide', 2
 - responses to contributors, 407
 - scholarly method, 5
 - scholarship on constitutional law, overview, 9
 - scholarship on criminal law, overview, 6
 - scholarship on jurisprudence, overview, 14
 - scholarship on moral philosophy,
 - overview, 16
- Alexander, Simon Ray (father), 2
- anarchism
 - authority and, 273, 283
 - definition of, 272
- animals
 - moral status, 321
- Arendt, Hannah, 276, 277
- Arneson, Richard, 18, 350, 372, 434
- attempts. *See* criminal attempts
- Austin, J.L., 82
- authority
 - anarchism and, 273, 283
 - "asymmetry" of, 303, 430
 - definition of legal authority, 272
 - dissolution of, 276
 - epistemic authority, 275
 - intentionalism and, 279
 - interpretation and, 15, 279, 428
 - LA's responses to contributors, 428
 - LA's theory of, 15, 277
 - lawmaking authority, seat of, 281
 - modern theories of, 273
 - obligation and, 274, 275
 - and original public meaning originalism
 - (textualism), 280
 - premodern origins of, 273
 - reasons for obeying, 275
 - See also* rules

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51045-2 — Moral Puzzles and Legal Perplexities

Edited by Heidi M. Hurd

Index

[More Information](#)

454

Index

- Barnett, Randy, 161
- Baude, William, 15, 260, 431
- benevolent despotism
 - denial of freedom of expression, 121
- Berger, Raoul, 165
- Berman, Mitchell, 14, 92, 241, 432
- Blackstone, William, 49
- blame. *See* criminal responsibility
- Bratman, Michael, 293, 300
- Brest, Paul, 160
- Brink, David, 7, 39, 411
- Brudner, Alan, 89
- Canada
 - judicial supremacy, 146
- capital punishment
 - constitutionality of, 165
- capitalism
 - and freedom of expression, 124, 128
- causation
 - and criminal attempts, 65
- choice
 - rationality and, 292
- Chomsky, Noam, 132
- Christopher, Russell, 391, 392, 394
- Cicero, 81
- Claus, Laurence, 13, 134, 277, 425
- coercion. *See* duress
- Cole, Kevin, 19, 372, 388, 436
- colonialism
 - denial of freedom of expression, 121
- competence. *See* criminal responsibility
- conditional relevance, 5
- consent
 - authority and, 273
 - and moral obligation, 16
- consequentialism
 - deontological ethics, 17, 350
 - means principle, 355
 - punishment. *See* punishment
- constitutional law
 - constitutionalism, concept of, 238
 - death penalty, constitutionality of, 165
 - entrenched laws, 10
 - enumeration of powers, 143
 - free speech. *See* freedom of expression
 - gerrymanders, 10
 - interpretation, 12
 - LA's responses to contributors, 415
 - LA's theories, 9
 - lawmaking authority, seat of, 281
 - legal status of Constitution, 264
 - legislative delegations of power, 10
 - originalism and constitutional authority, 265
 - overview of present volume contributions, 9
 - preconstitutional rule of constitutional authority, 264
 - and rule of recognition, 265
 - "self-validating" constitutions, 230
 - separation of powers, 147
 - settlement as primary function of, 262
 - state action defense, 9
 - supremacy of Constitution, 226, 231, 260, 269, 431
 - unconstitutional conditions theory, 10
- See also* academic freedom; democracy; intentionalism; interpretation; judicial supremacy; originalism; settlement
- constraint principle
 - originalism, 190
 - threshold deontology, 355
- construction. *See* interpretation
- contract law
 - academic freedom and, 115
- control. *See* criminal responsibility
- Converse, Philip, 124
- crimes, criminal acts. *See* offenses
- criminal attempts
 - causation and, 65
 - collective responsibility, 62, 64, 75
 - culpable mental states, 67
 - example scenarios
 - failed murder attempt, 64
 - firing squad, 62
 - use of, 61
 - individual responsibility, 62, 64, 75
 - justifications, 67
 - LA's responses to contributors, 409
 - LA's theory, 7
 - "moral ledger" concept, 68
 - outcome of, effect on offender's liability ("results matter" argument), 60
 - and reckless actions, 60, 68
 - relief over failed attempts ("Thank God you failed" response), 74
 - remorse, effect on offender's liability ("Thank God I failed!" response), 64, 74
 - retributivist approach, 69
 - unexpected (but welcome) consequences, 65
- criminal law
 - bivalent character of, 39
 - LA's responses to contributors, 408
 - LA's theories, 6
 - overview of present volume contributions, 6

- retributivist character of, 40
- See also* criminal attempts; criminal responsibility; defenses; duress; lesser evils defense; punishment
- criminal responsibility
 - for attempts. *See* criminal attempts
 - bivalent approach, 39, 46
 - collective responsibility, 62, 64, 75
 - conditions of, 9
 - culpability and, 40, 43
 - culpable mental states, 67
 - defenses. *See* defenses
 - determinations of degrees of, 52
 - diminished responsibility, 53
 - excuse in inverse relation to, 42
 - individual responsibility, 62, 64, 75
 - LA's responses to contributors, 411
 - M'Naghten rule, 43
 - negligence, 9
 - normative competence, condition
 - of, 43, 46, 49
 - partial responsibility
 - examples of, 40
 - ideal theory of, 46
 - nonideal theory of, 51
 - summary overview of options, 58
 - proportionality, 39, 46
 - recklessness, 9
 - scale of, 39, 46
 - situational control, condition of, 43, 44, 45
 - tetravalent approach, 56
 - thresholds, 50
 - trivalent approach, 53
 - wrongdoing and, 40
- culpability. *See* criminal responsibility
- Curtin, Hoyt, 155
- Darwall, Stephen, 324
- death penalty
 - constitutionality of, 165
- defenses
 - availability of, 99
 - contrived defenses
 - intransitivity and, 313
 - morality and rationality in relation to, 311
 - diminished responsibility, 53
 - duress. *See* duress
 - excuse
 - justification and. *See* duress
 - responsibility and, 42, 46
 - incompetence, 42
 - insanity, 54
 - justification
 - excuse and. *See* duress
 - usages of term, 109
 - lesser evils defense, 8
 - provocation, 46
 - self-defense, 8
 - self-defense, contrived, 313
 - state action defense, 9
- democracy
 - and constitutional authoritative settlement, 234
 - and freedom of expression, 123
 - See also* constitutional law
- deontological ethics
 - consequentialism and, 17, 350, 373
 - consequentialist obligations, strength
 - (stringency) of, 378, 384
 - deontological obligations, strength (stringency)
 - of, 379, 384
 - LA's responses to contributors, 434
 - LA's theories, 17, 351
 - means principle. *See* means principle
 - morality of, 373
 - as nonconsequentialism, 350
 - obligations
 - conflict of, 375, 381, 383, 384
 - strength (stringency) of, 377, 378, 379, 381, 383, 384
 - problems with, 350
 - purpose of, 350
 - and retributive punishment, 19
- threshold deontology
 - and constraint principle, 355
 - justification for, 386
 - LA's "moral ballast" critique of, 395, 398
 - LA's responses to contributors, 436
 - LA's theory, 18, 354, 371
 - limitations of, 404
 - nature of thresholds, 373
 - punishment and, 388
 - rationality of, 371
- deprivation. *See* punishment
- desert. *See* punishment
- despotism. *See* benevolent despotism
- dignity. *See* human dignity
- diminished responsibility
 - defense of, 53
- discrimination, 320
 - contempt and, 326
 - disrespectful discrimination, 318, 323, 326, 329, 332
 - egalitarian and inegalitarian beliefs, 321
 - intrinsically wrongful discrimination, 320

discrimination (*cont.*)

LA's responses to contributors, 438

LA's theory, 16, 317

moral status of animals, 321

moral status of persons, 318, 321

positive discrimination, wrongfulness of, 320

wrongfulness of, 16, 317, 438

distributive justice

equality and, 16

double effect

doctrine of, 336, 347, 352, 388, 392, 434

Dressler, Joshua, 87

Driver, Justin, 268

Duff, Antony, 60, 90, 93, 409

duress

applicability to any crime, 77

"average person" standard, 87

broader defense, 78

coercion, 77, 83

coercive and noncoercive threats contrasted, 93

defense of, 42

and defense of others, 78

distinction between justification and excuse, 81

elements of, 77

example scenarios

alternative trial outcomes, 85

comparison between, 85

fleeing felon, 80, 95

housekeeper, 84, 90

novelist's laptop, 88

phobic manager, 84, 85

as excuse, 76, 78, 80, 83, 90, 94, 95, 96

as exoneration, 76, 94

intransitivity and, 312

as justification, 76, 80, 83, 90, 94, 95, 96

LA's ambivalent approach, 76, 80

LA's responses to contributors, 411

LA's theory, 78

and lesser evils defense, 79, 411

and mistakes of law, 89

and moral weakness, 87

and nature of harm, 93

offenses committed under, 8

paradoxical theories of, 90

"person of reasonable firmness in the actor's situation" standard, 83

as residual defense, 79

and self-defense, 78

and situational control, 44

threats, contrast between coercive and noncoercive, 93

Dworkin, Ronald, 14, 165, 242, 243, 248, 250, 256

egalitarianism

discrimination and, 321

Eidelson, Benjamin, 323, 326, 329, 332

Eisenhower, Dwight, 268

Ekins, Richard, 176, 177, 180, 181, 422

Ellsworth, Oliver, 141

employment contracts. *See* academic freedomenforcement. *See* punishment

England and Wales

academic freedom, 118

diminished responsibility defense, 54

freedom of expression, 121

interpretation, 176

judicial supremacy, 135

Montesquieu and English Constitution, 147

use of force, mistaken belief in legality of, 89

enlightenment

and freedom of expression, 122

enumeration of powers

judicial supremacy and, 143

equality

as discrete moral value, 14

and distributive justice, 16

See also discrimination

Eser, Albin, 91

estoppel

and lesser evils defense, 107, 414

ethics. *See* consequentialism; deontological ethics

evidence

conditional relevance, 5

excuses. *See* defenses; duressexpression. *See* freedom of expressionfailed attempts. *See* criminal attempts

Feldman, Richard, 297

Ferzan, Kimberly Kessler, 18, 333, 409, 411, 434

finality. *See* settlement

Finnis, John, 274

Fish, Stanley, 178

force

mistaken belief in legality of use, 89

Founding Fathers

and judicial supremacy, 138, 262, 425

freedom of expression

argument for, 127

"bad speech" and "good speech," 127

capitalism and, 124, 128

democracy and, 123

denial by benevolent colonial despotism, 121

enlightenment and, 122

free speech, 10

government speech, 11

- government's regulatory intention
 - importance of, 208
 - inquiry into, 207
 - language in relation, 220
 - LA's theory, 208
 - reason for enterprise as context for, 219
- harm and, 127
- ignorance and, 123
- knowledge and, 123
- LA's responses to contributors, 427
- and Marcuse, Herbert, 12, 120, 122, 124, 126, 128
- and Mill, John Stuart, 12, 119, 121, 125, 126
- reasons for protecting speech, 119
- regulation and suppression by private interests, 125, 128
- truth and, 122
- value of, 121
- See also* academic freedom
- Freud, Sigmund, 375
- Fuller, Lon, 159
- function of law
 - judicial supremacy and, 134
 - settlement as primary function, 15, 221, 223, 262
- Gardner, John, 90
- Garvey, Stephen, 91
- Gauthier, David, 292, 308
- Germany
 - academic freedom, 118
 - criminal responsibility, 54
 - freedom of expression, 128
 - judicial supremacy, 140
- gerrymanders
 - LA's theories, 10
- Goldsworthy, Jeffrey, 13, 170, 420
- Green, Leslie, 274
- Greenberg, Mark, 176
- Greene, Abner, 277
- guilt. *See* punishment
- Habermas, Jürgen, 134
- Harel, Alon, 13, 221, 426
- Harlan, John Marshall, 259
- harm
 - and academic freedom, 129, 133
 - duress and, 93
 - and freedom of expression, 127
 - Harm Principle (J.S. Mill), 121
 - means of preventing. *See* means principle
- Hart, H.L.A., 264, 265, 274, 277
- Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich, 126, 127
- Henry, Patrick, 142
- Holmes, Oliver Wendell, 206
- Holder, Jeremy, 89
- Horkheimer, Max, 126
- human dignity
 - punishment and, 30
- Huq, Aziz, 115
- Hurd, Heidi, 1, 284, 407
- Husak, Douglas, 23, 87, 408
- ignorance
 - and freedom of expression, 123
- immorality. *See* morality and law
- incarceration. *See* punishment
- incompetence
 - defense of, 42
- inegalitarianism
 - discrimination and, 321
- innocent persons, punishment of. *See* punishment
- insanity
 - defense of, 54
- intention
 - action and, 206
 - consequence and, 206
 - freedom of expression. *See* freedom of expression
 - legislative intention. *See* interpretation and means principle, 347
 - reason for enterprise as context for, 219
 - and rule following, 292, 300
- intentionalism
 - author and adopter intentions in relation, 164
 - authority and, 279
 - constitutionality of death penalty as example, 165
 - general objective intentionalism, 175, 177
 - group-produced texts, intended meaning of, 161, 280, 418
 - intended meaning and interpretive intentions in relation, 162
 - interpretation rules and norms, 170
 - legal objective intentionalism, 175, 179
 - meaning and message in relation, 158
- nonintentionalism
 - arguments against, 172
 - definition of, 170
- objective intentionalism
 - arguments against, 182
 - arguments for, 176

- intentionalism (*cont.*)
 - and authority of rules, 183
 - basic premises, 170
 - and confusion over different meanings, 184
 - LA's responses to contributors, 420
 - and mistaken meanings, 186
 - practical effects of, 188
 - and subjective intentionalism, 175, 182
- original intended meaning originalism
 - (intentionalism), 154, 191
- and principles/rules distinction, 245, 254
- problems with, 160, 166
- sentences
 - completion to avoid absurdity, 174
 - context of, 173
 - elliptical sentences, 174
 - implied meanings, 173
- subjective intentionalism, 170, 175, 184, 420
- as underdeveloped theory, 168
- interpretation
 - authority and, 15, 279, 428
 - constitutional law, 12
 - construction distinguished, 192
 - conventional meanings of words, definition of, 416
 - group-produced texts, intended meaning of, 161, 280, 418
- intention
 - importance of, 208
 - language in relation, 220
 - LA's theory, 213, 415
- LA's responses to contributors, 428
- of legal texts, 417
- rules and norms of, 170
- texts, definition of, 415
- See also* intentionalism; judicial supremacy; originalism
- intervention to prevent harm
 - permissibility of, 336
 - third-party intervention, 340
- intransitivity
 - rationality and, 312
- Jackson, Andrew, 261
- Jefferson, Thomas, 145, 261, 273
- Johnson, William Samuel, 139
- judgments
 - choices and values in, 16
- judicial review
 - LA's theory, 15
- judicial supremacy
 - argument for, 134
 - constitutional convention foundations of, 137, 142, 149, 152
 - and enumeration of powers, 143
 - and Federal/State division of powers, 138
 - Founding Fathers and, 142, 262, 425
 - and function of law, 134
 - and judicial lawmaking, 149
 - LA's defence of, 260
 - LA's responses to contributors, 425, 431
 - and legal status of Constitution, 264
 - originalism and, 265, 267
 - over constitutional authoritative settlement, 222, 223, 227, 231
 - positivism and, 264
 - power apportionment strategies, 142
 - and preconstitutional rule of constitutional authority, 264
 - respect for, 261
 - and separation of powers, 147
 - settlement as primary function of, 134, 262
 - and supremacy of Constitution, 260, 261, 269, 431
- juries
 - and punishment, 51
- jurisprudence
 - authority of law, 15
 - criminal. *See* criminal law
 - distributive justice, 16
 - equality, 14
 - judicial review, 15
 - LA's responses to contributors, 428
 - LA's theories, 14
 - law and morality in relation, 16
 - overview of present volume c ontributions, 14
 - precedent, 14
 - reasoning, 14
 - rule following, rationality of. *See* rules
 - See also* authority; judicial supremacy; morality and law; principles/rules distinction; rules justifications. *See* defenses; duress
- Kahan, Dan, 37
- Kant, Immanuel, 17, 122, 318, 371, 375, 376
- Katz, Leo, 16, 303, 430
- Kavka, Gregory, 306, 308
- Kay, Richard, 182, 183, 185, 187, 188
- Kelsen, Hans, 264
- Kierkegaard, Søren, 276
- Knapp, Steven, 184

- knowledge
 and freedom of expression, 123, 130
 of legal principles, 256
 Kramer, Larry, 142, 268
 Kress, Ken, 241, 243, 245, 248, 249, 257
- language and linguistics. *See* intentionalism;
 interpretation; originalism; principles/
 rules distinction
- Lawson, Gary, 249
- legal moralism. *See* morality and law
- legal principles and rules. *See* principles/rules
 distinction
- legal reasoning. *See* reasoning
- legal texts, interpretation of. *See* intentionalism;
 interpretation; judicial supremacy;
 originalism
- Leiter, Brian, 11, 113, 427
- lesser evils defense
 applicability of, 100
 availability of, 99
 “better” choice of criminal action
 non-permissibility of, 101
 permissibility of, 103
 duress and, 79, 411
 as excuse, 109
 as justification, 109
 LA’s theory, 8
 operation of, 98
 procedural estoppel defense, 107, 414
 rationale for, 99, 101
 states of world (Worst, Better, Best), 100
 three or more options available to
 defendant, 98
 use of, 98
- lex talionis* (law of retaliation). *See* punishment
- liability. *See* criminal responsibility
- liberalism
 punishment and, 73
- libertarianism
 means principle and, 355, 367
- liberty of expression. *See* freedom of expression
- Lincoln, Abraham, 261
- Lippert-Rasmussen, Kasper, 17, 317, 438
- Lukács, Georg, 126
- Lyons, David, 17
- Madison, James, 139, 141, 145
- Marcuse, Herbert, 12, 120, 122, 124, 126, 128, 129
- Marshall, John, 141, 142
- Marx, Karl, 126
- McMahan, Jeff, 336
- meaning
 law and, 281
- means principle
 absolutism of, 354
 choice of actions for harm preventer, 345
 complicating factors, 342
 consequentialism, 355
 and constraint principle, 356
 deontological ethics, 17
 double effect, doctrine of, 336, 347, 352, 388,
 392, 434
 double preventions of harm, 339
 ducking cases, 339, 340
 exceptions to, lack of, 354
 impermissible prevention of harm preventer, 342
 intention and, 347
 intervention to prevent harm, permissibility
 of, 336
 LA’s endorsement of, 434
 LA’s responses to contributors, 434
 LA’s theory, 17, 351, 370
 libertarianism, 355, 367
 permissions to intervene, distinction
 between, 346
 persons used as means, 363
 prevention of use, as means, 334
 third-party intervention to prevent harm, 340
 usefulness of, 348
- mental state. *See* criminal responsibility
- Michaels, Walter Benn, 184
- Mill, John Stuart, 12, 119, 121, 125, 126, 129
- mistakes of fact
 mistakes of law in relation, 7
- mistakes of law
 duress and, 89
 mistakes of fact in relation, 7
 use of force, mistaken belief in legality of, 89
- mitigation. *See* punishment
- M’Naghten rule
 criminal responsibility, 43
- Mogensen, Andreas, 334
- Montesquieu, 147
- Moore, Michael, 14, 17, 18, 71, 371, 392, 437
- morality and law
 consent and moral obligation, 16
 defensibility of legal moralism, 16
 equality as discrete moral value, 14
 judgments, choices and values in, 16
 LA’s responses to contributors, 434
 LA’s theories, 16

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51045-2 — Moral Puzzles and Legal Perplexities

Edited by Heidi M. Hurd

Index

[More Information](#)

460

Index

morality and law (*cont.*)

- “moral ledger” concept, 68
- moral limitations on choice of punishment, 29
- moral responsibility for others’ immoral actions, 16
- moral rights, settlement and, 229, 230, 231, 426
- moral weakness, duress and, 87
- overview of present volume contributions, 17
- paternalism, legitimacy of, 16
- rationality of rule following, 15, 310
- See also* deontological ethics; discrimination; lesser evils defense; means principle

negligence

- criminal responsibility, 9

Nelson, Caleb, 269

nonconsequentialism

- deontological ethics, 350

nonintentionalism. *See* intentionalism

norms. *See* principles/rules distinction

Nozick, Robert, 351, 390

nuclear deterrence paradox

- and rationality of rule following, 306, 308

obligation

- authority and, 274

offenders

- punishment as communicative engagement with, 73
- recidivism, risk of, 28

offenses

- crimes and criminal acts, definition of, 100

omissions

- liability for, 7

originalism

- author’s meaning, 198
- constraint principle, 190
- convergence of different versions, 191
- definition of, 154
- determinacy of text, 193
- distinction between construction and interpretation, 192
- ecumenical originalism, 192
- fixation thesis, 190
- framers’ understandings originalism, 191
- and judicial supremacy, 265, 267
- LA’s responses to contributors, 417
- as normative thesis, 157, 159, 166
- original intended meaning originalism (intentionalism), 154, 191
- original law originalism, 191
- original methods originalism, 191

original public meaning originalism (textualism)

- and authority of rules, 183
- arguments against, 182
- arguments for, 182
- authority and, 280
- author’s meaning and, 198
- and mistaken meanings, 187
- practical effects of, 188
- sentence meaning and, 198
- theory of, 154, 191

sectarian originalism, 192

as semantic thesis, 156

sentence meaning (conventional meaning), 154, 198, 419

simple-minded originalism

- authority and authorship in relation, 200
 - incompleteness of, 193
 - LA as simple-minded originalist, 153, 189, 258
 - LA’s responses to contributors, 423
 - and principles/rules distinction, 242, 257
 - propositions for, 189
 - role of author’s intentions in production of meaning, 194
 - second-order intentions, 203
 - type of originalism, 191, 193
 - within constitutional theory, 190
 - wrongness of, arguments for, 190, 205, 423
- speaker’s meaning (authorial or intended meaning), 154
- strengths of, 154
- text interpreted as rule or as standard, 167
- as thesis about nature of interpretation, 156, 158
- See also* intentionalism

Parfit, Derek, 309

partial responsibility. *See* criminal responsibility

paternalism

- legitimacy of, 16

Pinckney, Charles, 139

Plato, 126, 127

political authority. *See* authority

Popper, Karl, 126

positivism

- and academic freedom, 117
- and judicial supremacy, 264
- in LA’s legal thought, 15
- and principles/rules distinction, 245, 250
- and simple-minded originalism, 257

Posner, Eric, 10

Pound, Roscoe, 249, 258

Prakash, Saikrishna, 10

- precedent
 - LA's theories, 14
- principles/rules distinction
 - agreement as to existence of principles, 252
 - agreement as to weight of principles, 253
 - examples of principles, 246
 - general acceptance of, 241
 - general overview of, 243
 - importance of, 242
 - intentionalism and, 245, 254
 - knowledge of principles, 256
 - language and linguistics in relation, 432
 - LA's arguments against, 251, 432
 - LA's rejection of, 241, 243
 - LA's responses to contributors, 432
 - legality of principles, 249
 - metaphysical status of principles, 251
 - moral (Dworkinian) conception of, 242, 243, 248, 250, 256
 - positivist conception, 245, 250, 257
 - principles as supplementary to rules, 248
 - productions of rules by principles/facts
 - interactions, 248, 255
 - and simple-minded originalism, 242, 257
 - social ground of, 242, 253
 - weight of principles, 242, 248, 253, 432
- promises
 - and rule following, 289, 300
- proportionality
 - criminal responsibility, 39, 46
 - punishment, 26, 38, 41, 46
- provocation
 - defense of, 46
- proxy crimes
 - and threshold deontology, 389
- punishment
 - alternatives to, 36
 - as appropriate (fitting) response, 31, 41
 - collateral consequences of, 35
 - as communicative engagement with offender, 73
 - consequentialist approach, 8, 24, 25, 28, 31, 33, 38, 41
 - deferential view about kinds of punishment, 24, 27, 408
 - and deontological ethics, 19
 - deprivation element, 34, 37
 - desert-based theory of, 25, 26, 28, 32, 40
 - elements of theory of, 41
 - guilt and, 47
 - and human dignity, 30
 - incarceration, alternatives to, 37
 - incarceration, policy of, 26, 37
 - incommensurability of, 37
 - of innocent persons
 - double effect, doctrine of, 388, 392
 - means principle, 388, 392
 - retributive norm against punishing, 391, 400
 - threshold deontology, 388
 - introduction to, 23
 - juries, role of, 51
 - lack of scholarship on, 23
 - LA's responses to contributors, 408
 - LA's retributive theory of, 6
 - law of retaliation (*lex talionis*), 31
 - least-cost option, 31
 - in liberal states, 73
 - mitigation, 48
 - moral limitations on, 29
 - nature of, 33
 - nature of punishment, 33
 - non-desert-based factors, 41
 - overpunishment, 49, 56
 - philosophical concerns with, 25
 - proportionality, 26, 38, 41, 46
 - proxy crimes, 389
 - punitive effect of, 34
 - and rationality of rule-following, 308
 - recidivism, risk of, 28
 - retributive norm against punishment of
 - innocent
 - factual-error problem, 391
 - immoral-law problem, 392
 - plea bargaining and, 395
 - and threshold deontology, 400
 - retributivist approach, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 31, 32, 37, 38, 39, 40, 69, 408
 - sentencing, 24, 41, 48
 - stigmatizing effect of, 35, 37
 - success of, 36
 - success of punishment, prospect of, 36
 - suffering and, 70, 72, 409
 - and threshold deontology
 - deontological retributivism, 388
 - double effect, doctrine of, 388
 - "moral ballast" critique of, 395, 398
 - proxy crimes, 389
 - retributive norm against punishment of
 - innocent, 400
 - underpunishment, 49, 56
 - See also* offenders
- Quine, Willard van Orman, 256
- Quinn, Warren, 306

- Randolph, Edmund, 138
 Raz, Joseph, 223, 230, 274, 275, 291, 307
 reasoning
 LA's theories, 14
 recidivism
 risk of, 28
 recklessness
 and criminal attempts, 60, 68
 criminal responsibility, 9
 respect
 discrimination and, 317
 responsibility
 criminal. *See* criminal responsibility
 epistemic, 296
 retaliation. *See* punishment
 retribution. *See* punishment
 rights
 settlement and, 228, 230
 Rosati, Connie, 13, 153, 419
 rule of recognition
 constitutional authority and, 265
 rules
 benefits of, 287
 definition of rule, 286
 divergence of rule and purpose of rule ("doing law" or "doing justice"), 303
 exceptions to, proper exercise of, 287
 exclusionary effect of, 288, 307
 principles distinguished. *See* principles/rules distinction
 rationality of rule-following
 application of rules, 288
 avoidance of punishment, 308
 and contrived defenses, 311
 deceptive undermining of, 308
 divided perspectives of rule makers and rule followers ("the gap"), 15, 286, 288, 301, 303, 429
 epistemic rationality, 295, 300, 302
 epistemic responsibility, 296
 exclusionary reasons for, 307
 inability to close "the gap," 302, 307, 430
 intention and, 292, 300
 intransitivity and, 312
 irrationality and, 308
 LA's responses to contributors, 429
 mistakes over, 287
 morality and, 310
 and nuclear deterrence paradox, 306, 308
 practical rationality, 16, 292, 295, 300, 302
 presumptive rule following, 289
 priority to which rationality? (practical or epistemic?), 300
 promises and, 289, 300
 rationality and choice, problem of, 292
 "rule-sensitive particularism," 307
 and self-torturer paradox, 306
 and toxin puzzle, 309, 430
 standards distinguished, 167, 418
 Rutledge, John, 138
 Sachs, Stephen, 266
 sanctions. *See* punishment
 Sandroni, Alvaro, 16, 303, 430
 Sartre, Jean-Paul, 376
 Scalia, Antonin, 165, 180
 Scanlon, Thomas, 212
 Schauer, Frederick, 13, 14, 134, 136, 206, 221, 260, 265, 268, 303, 424, 427, 430
 scientific inquiry. *See* academic freedom
 Searle, John, 172–73
 Segev, Re'em, 336
 self-defense
 LA's theory, 8
 self-torturer paradox
 and rationality of rule following, 306
 sentences (utterances of)
 completion to avoid absurdity, 174
 context of, 173
 elliptical sentences, 174
 implied meanings, 173
 sentencing. *See* punishment
 separation of powers
 judicial supremacy and, 147
 settlement
 authoritative settlement, concept of, 221
 constitutional authoritative settlement
 democracy and, 234
 greater importance of, 228
 judicial supremacy over, 222, 223, 227, 231
 legal authoritative settlement distinguished, 237, 426
 as to moral rights, 229, 230, 231, 426
 purpose of, 222
 and supremacy of Constitution, 226, 231
 value of, 221, 222, 226, 228
 and created rights, 228, 230
 importance of, 134
 and judicial supremacy, 262
 legal authoritative settlement
 arguments against, 237
 constitutional authoritative settlement distinguished, 237, 426

Cambridge University Press
978-1-316-51045-2 — Moral Puzzles and Legal Perplexities

Edited by Heidi M. Hurd

Index

[More Information](#)

Index

463

- as to created rights, 230
- determinateness of, 226
- justness and rightness of, 225
- purpose of, 222
- reasons for superiority of, 224
- stability of, 225
- success of, 225
- value of, 221, 222, 224
- and moral rights, 229, 230, 231
- need for, 223
- as primary function of law, 15, 221, 223, 262
- Shapiro, Scott, 292, 417
- Sherman, Roger, 143
- Sherwin, Emily, 12, 16, 168, 277, 286, 303, 304, 310, 429
- Shiffrin, Seana Valentine, 290
- simple-minded originalism. *See* originalism
- Smith, Steven, 15, 260, 428
- Smith, William French, 38
- Solum, Lawrence, 13, 134, 137, 182, 189, 423
- speech. *See* freedom of expression
- standards
 - rules distinguished, 167, 418
- state action defense
 - LA's theory, 9
- stigmatization. *See* punishment
- suffering
 - punishment and, 70, 72, 409
- Supremacy Clause (Article VI of the Constitution)
 - judicial supremacy and, 261
- Supreme Court. *See* judicial supremacy
- Tadros, Victor, 337
- Taurek, John, 435
- texts
 - definition of, 415
- third-party intervention
 - prevention of harm, 340
- threats
 - duress and, 93
- threshold deontology. *See* deontological ethics
- Thucydides, 125
- Toh, Kevin, 255
- toxin puzzle
 - and rationality of rule following, 309
- trials, criminal. *See* punishment
- Tribe, Laurence, 10, 209
- truth
 - and freedom of expression, 122, 130
- unconstitutionality. *See* constitutional law
- United Kingdom. *See* England and Wales
- use of force. *See* force
- Van Alstyne, William, 114, 116, 117
- Vermeule, Adrian, 10
- von Humboldt, Wilhelm, 119, 131
- Westen, Peter, 8, 76, 411
- White, Michael, 276
- Williams, Bernard, 168
- Wilson, James, 138, 141, 145, 150
- Wittgenstein, Ludwig, 264
- Wolff, Robert Paul, 273
- words
 - conventional meanings, definition of, 416
- wrongdoing. *See* criminal responsibility
- wrongful discrimination. *See* discrimination
- Yaffe, Gideon, 8, 98, 414
- Yeats, W.B., 277