

FLODOARD OF RHEIMS AND THE WRITING OF HISTORY IN THE TENTH CENTURY

Flodoard of Rheims (893/4–966) is one of the tenth century's most intriguing but neglected historians. His works are essential sources for the emergence of the West Frankish and Ottonian kingdoms in the tumultuous decades following the collapse of the Carolingian empire in 888. Yet although Flodoard is a crucial narrative voice from this period, his works have seldom been considered in the context of the evolving circumstances of his turbulent career or his literary aims. This important new study is the first to analyse and synthesise Flodoard's entire output, suggesting that his writings about Rheims, contemporary politics and the Christian past have until now been taken at face value without regard for his own intentions or priorities, and therefore have been misunderstood. Edward Roberts' re-evaluation of the relationship between political participation, historical understanding and authorial individuality casts important new light on the political and cultural history of tenth-century Europe.

EDWARD ROBERTS is Lecturer in Early Medieval History at the University of Kent, where his research focuses on the political and cultural history of the Carolingian empire and its successor states. He has previously held positions as a postdoctoral researcher at King's College London and the Universidad del País Vasco, and as a Leverhulme Trust Early Career Fellow at the University of Liverpool. He is the author of articles in Early Medieval Europe, Journal of Medieval History, Cahiers de Civilisation Médiévale and Historical Research. His first article was awarded the Early Medieval Europe Essay Prize in 2015.



Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought Fourth Series

General Editor:

ROSAMOND MCKITTERICK

Emeritus Professor of Medieval History, University of Cambridge, and Fellow of Sidney Sussex College

Advisory Editors:

CHRISTOPHER BRIGGS

Lecturer in Medieval British Social and Economic History, University of Cambridge

ADAM J. KOSTO

Professor of History, Columbia University

ALICE RIO

Professor of Medieval History, King's College London

MAGNUS RYAN

University Lecturer in History, University of Cambridge, and Fellow of Peterhouse

The series Cambridge Studies in Medieval Life and Thought was inaugurated by G.G. Coulton in 1921; Professor Rosamond McKitterick now acts as General Editor of the Fourth Series, with Dr Christopher Briggs, Professor Adam J. Kosto, Professor Alice Rio and Dr Magnus Ryan as Advisory Editors. The series brings together outstanding work by medieval scholars over a wide range of human endeavour extending from political economy to the history of ideas.

This is book 113 in the series, and a full list of titles in the series can be found at: www.cambridge.org/medievallifeandthought



FLODOARD OF RHEIMS AND THE WRITING OF HISTORY IN THE TENTH CENTURY

EDWARD ROBERTS

University of Kent





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India 79 Anson Road, #06–04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781316510391
DOI: 10.1017/9781108226851

© Edward Roberts 2019

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2019

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow, Cornwall.

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data NAMES: Roberts, Edward, 1987- author.

TITLE: Flodoard of Rheims and the writing of history in the tenth century / Edward Roberts, University of Kent.

DESCRIPTION: New York : Cambridge University Press, 2019. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2019009538 | ISBN 9781316510391 (hardback : alk. paper) | ISBN 9781316649879 (pbk. : alk. paper)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Flodoard, of Reims, 894-966. | Historians–France–Biography. | France–History–To 987–Historiography. | Europe–History–10th century–Historiography. | Carolingians–Historiography.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC DC36.98.F56 R63 2019 | DDC 944/.01407202–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2019009538

ISBN 978-1-316-51039-1 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Marguerite





CONTENTS

List of Tables Acknowledgements List of Abbreviations					
				INTRODUCTION: FLODOARD OF RHEIMS AND HIS WORLD	I
				The Need for This Study	2
	The Career of Flodoard	4			
	Late Carolingian West Francia	9			
	Medieval Historians and Historical Writing	20			
I	FLODOARD, HIS ARCHBISHOPS AND THE STRUGGLE FOR				
	RHEIMS	29			
	The Canon and the Conflict	32			
	Archbishops Hugh and Artold	36			
	Flodoard and the Synods of 947-8	48			
	Episcopal Authority and Episcopal Historiography	57			
	Rheims in Ottonian Europe, c. 950	70			
2	NARRATIVE AND HISTORY IN THE ANNALS	75			
	Genre and Form	78			
	The Provenance of the Annals	83			
	Composition	88			
	Authorial Intention	92			
	Conclusion	IOI			
3	INSTITUTIONAL HISTORY AND ECCLESIASTICAL				
	PROPERTY	104			
	Property Management: Inventories, Histories and Gesta	105			
	Flodoard as Archivist	114			

vii



Contents

Constructing Claims	127
Personal Interests	135
Historical Horizons	142
HISTORY, POETRY AND INTELLECTUAL LIFE	145
The Triumphs of Christ	149
Composition and Sources	157
Lotharingian Intellectual Currents	173
West Frankish Intellectual Currents	181
Conclusion	186
FLODOARD'S AGE OF MIRACLES	188
Signs of the Supernatural in the Annals	190
The 'Visions of Flothilde'	197
Miracles and Authority in the History	204
Conclusion	215
CONCLUSION: HISTORY AND HISTORIOGRAPHY IN THE	
TENTH CENTURY	218
pliography	225
Index	
	Personal Interests Historical Horizons HISTORY, POETRY AND INTELLECTUAL LIFE The Triumphs of Christ Composition and Sources Lotharingian Intellectual Currents West Frankish Intellectual Currents Conclusion FLODOARD'S AGE OF MIRACLES Signs of the Supernatural in the Annals The 'Visions of Flothilde' Miracles and Authority in the History Conclusion CONCLUSION: HISTORY AND HISTORIOGRAPHY IN THE TENTH CENTURY

viii



TABLES

2.I	The contents of Montpellier Bibliothèque interuniversita	ire
	H 151, fols. 1–104	page 85
5.I	NOTA monograms in Montpellier Bibliothèque	
	interuniversitaire H 151	195
5.2	Summary of book IV, chs. 38-53 of Flodoard's History	211



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book has been a long time in the making, and it is a privilege finally to be able to thank those whose inspiration made it possible and whose advice and correction made it better. A debt of immense gratitude is owed to Simon MacLean, who supervised the doctoral thesis whence this book sprang. He has remained generous with his encouragement and help over the years, and I feel privileged to have studied with such an amiable mentor. Stuart Airlie and John Hudson examined my thesis, and the critical scrutiny they cast over my ideas has improved this book considerably. At the Institute for Mediaeval Studies in St Andrews, I benefitted from an exceptional research environment. Among the many friends I made there I should like to single out Fernando Arias Guillén, Roberta Cimino, Kate Hammond, Kimberley-Joy Knight, Neil McGuigan and Matthew McHaffie for their camaraderie and support over the years. Prior to arriving as a PhD student in St Andrews, I was extremely fortunate to study at the University of Manchester under Paul Fouracre, whose teaching kindled my interest in early medieval history. Paul introduced me to Flodoard while I was writing my undergraduate dissertation and asked me questions that fundamentally shaped this project. My postgraduate studies would not have been possible without the financial support of the UK Arts and Humanities Research Council, the University of Manchester and the University of St Andrews. Further assistance from the Society for the Study of French History enabled me to undertake manuscript research in France and Italy. Since leaving St Andrews, I have had the privilege to work alongside and learn from colleagues and students at King's College London, the Universidad del País Vasco, the University of Liverpool and, most recently, the University of Kent, where I am delighted to have found a congenial academic home. In particular, I wish to thank Alice Rio, Jinty Nelson, Francesca Tinti and Marios Costambeys for their sage advice and continued encouragement. I am very grateful to the Leverhulme Trust, whose



Acknowledgements

award of an Early Career Fellowship at the University of Liverpool enabled me to continue my tenth-century studies. I owe a great deal to Rosamond McKitterick, who as my editor read the entire manuscript and offered valuable criticisms and suggestions. Rob Gallagher, Kati Ihnat, Fraser McNair, Ingrid Rembold, Elizabeth Tyler, Graeme Ward and Jamie Wood all read portions of the book and provided important guidance and correction. I have also learned much from Shane Bobrycki, Marie-Céline Isaïa, Geoff Koziol, Rutger Kramer, Conrad Leyser, Levi Roach, Danica Summerlin, Charles West and many others. All those mentioned here have patiently listened to my problems and responded to my questions with wise counsel and good humour, for which I offer my sincere gratitude. On a more personal note, I want to thank my parents, without whose encouragement and support I would not have made it very far down this road, and, finally, Marguerite Regan, whose love and inspiration has sustained me throughout the writing of this book. For that and much else besides, I dedicate it to her.



ABBREVIATIONS

AASS	Acta Sanctorum quotquot toto orbe coluntur, ed. J. Bollandus
	et al. (Antwerp and Brussels, 1634–)
Annales	Flodoard of Rheims, Annales, ed. P. Lauer, Les Annales de
	Flodoard (Paris, 1905)
BHL	Bibliotheca hagiographica latina (Subsidia hagiographica 6)
	(Brussels, 1898–1901); Supplementum (Subsidia
	hagiographica 12) (Brussels, 1911); Novum supplementum
	(Subsidia hagiographica 70) (Brussels, 1986)
CCCM	Corpus Christianorum, continuatio medievalis (Turnhout,
	1966–)
CCSL	Corpus Christianorum, series latina (Turnhout, 1952–)
CSEL	Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum latinorum (Vienna, 1866–)
DA	Deutsches Archiv für Erforschung des Mittelalters
De	Flodoard of Rheims, De triumphis Christi, ed. JP. Migne,
triumphis	PL, CXXXV (Paris, 1853), cols. 491–886
Ant.	De triumphis Christi Antiochiae gestis, cols. 549–96
Ita.	De triumphis Christi apud Italiam, cols. 595–886
Pal.	De triumphis Christi sanctorumque Palaestinae, cols. 491–550
D(D)	Diploma(s) of
CB	Charles the Bald, Recueil des actes de Charles II le Chauve, roi
	de France, ed. A. Giry, M. Prou, F. Lot and G. Tessier, 3
	vols. (Paris, 1943–55)
CS	Charles the Simple, Recueil des actes de Charles III le Simple,
	roi de France, 893-923, ed. F. Lot and P. Lauer (Paris, 1949)
L	Lothar, Recueil des actes de Lothaire et de Louis V, rois de
	France, 954–987, ed. L. Halphen and F. Lot (Paris, 1908)
LIV	Louis IV, Recueil des actes de Louis IV, roi de France, 936-954,
	ed. P. Lauer (Paris, 1914)



List of Abbreviations

List of Abbreviations			
LP	Louis the Pious, <i>Die Urkunden Ludwigs des Frommen</i> , ed. T. Kölzer et al., <i>MGH Diplomata Karolinorum</i> , II, 3 vols. (Wiesbaden, 2016)		
OI	Otto I, Die Urkunden Konrad I., Heinrich I. und Otto I., ed.		
OI	T. Sickel, MGH Diplomatum regum et imperatorum Germaniae, I (Hanover, 1879–84)		
EHR	English Historical Review		
EME EME	Early Medieval Europe		
FMSt	Frühmittelalterliche Studien		
HRE	Flodoard of Rheims, Historia Remensis ecclesiae, ed.		
TIKL	M. Stratmann, MGH SS, XXXVI (Hanover, 1998)		
HZ	Historische Zeitschrift		
JEαH	Journal of Ecclesiastical History		
JMH	Journal of Medieval History		
MGH	Monumenta Germaniae Historica		
AA	Auctores antiquissimi, 15 vols. (Berlin, 1877–1919)		
Conc.	Concilia, Legum sectio III, 6 vols. (Hanover, 1893–2014)		
Epp.	Epistolae III–VIII (= Epistolae Merovingici et Karolini aevi)		
$\mathbf{L}pp.$	(Hanover, 1892–1939)		
SRG	Scriptores rerum Germanicarum in usum scholarum separatim editi		
SACC	(Hanover, 1871–)		
SRG NS	Scriptores rerum Germanicarum, nova series (Hanover, 1922–)		
SRM	Scriptores rerum Merovingicarum, ed. B. Krusch and		
	W. Levison, 7 vols. (Hanover, 1885–1920)		
SS	Scriptores in folio (Hanover, 1826–)		
NCMH II	R. McKitterick (ed.), The New Cambridge Medieval History,		
	vol. II: c. 700–c. 900 (Cambridge, 1995)		
NCMH III	T. Reuter (ed.), The New Cambridge Medieval History, vol.		
	III: c. 900-c. 1024 (Cambridge, 2000)		
PL	Patrologiae cursus completus, series Latina, ed. JP. Migne, 221		
	vols. (Paris, 1841–64)		
Settimane	Settimane di studio del Centro italiano di studi sull'alto medioevo		
	(Spoleto, 1953–)		
TRHS	Transactions of the Royal Historical Society		

