

### Music and Fantasy in the Age of Berlioz

The centrality of fantasy to French literary culture has long been accepted by critics, but the sonorous dimensions of the mode and its wider implications for musical production have gone largely unexplored. In this book, Francesca Brittan invites us to listen to fantasy, attending both to literary descriptions of sound in otherworldly narratives and to the wave of “fantastique” musical works published in France through the middle decades of the nineteenth century, including Berlioz’s 1830 *Symphonie fantastique* and pieces by Liszt, Adam, Meyerbeer, and others. Following the musico-literary aesthetics of E. T. A. Hoffmann, such works allowed waking and dreaming, reality and unreality to converge, yoking fairy sound to insect song, demonic noise to colonial “babbling,” and divine music to the strains of water and wind. Fantastic soundworlds disrupted France’s native tradition of marvelous illusion, replacing it with a new form of magical materialism inextricable from republican activism, theological heterodoxy, and the advent of “radical” romanticism.

**Francesca Brittan** is Assistant Professor of Music at Case Western Reserve University. Her work focuses on music of the long nineteenth century, and has been published in a range of scholarly journals including *19th-Century Music*, the *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, and the *Journal of Popular Music Studies*. She was the 2012 winner of the American Musicological Society’s Alfred Einstein Award.

## **New Perspectives in Music History and Criticism**

### **General editors**

Jeffrey Kallberg, Anthony Newcomb, and Ruth Solie

This series explores the conceptual frameworks that shape or have shaped the ways in which we understand music and its history, and aims to elaborate structures of explanation, interpretation, commentary, and criticism which make music intelligible and which provide a basis for argument about judgments of value. The intellectual scope of the series is broad. Some investigations will treat, for example, historiographical topics, others will apply cross-disciplinary methods to the criticism of music, and there will also be studies which consider music in its relation to society, culture, and politics. Overall, the series hopes to create a greater presence for music in the ongoing discourse among the human sciences.

### **Published titles**

Leslie C. Dunn and Nancy A. Jones (eds.), *Embodied Voices: Representing Female Vocality in Western Culture*

Downing A. Thomas, *Music and the Origins of Language: Theories from the French Enlightenment*

Thomas S. Grey, *Wagner's Musical Prose*

Daniel K. L. Chua, *Absolute Music and the Construction of Meaning*

Adam Krims, *Rap Music and the Poetics of Identity*

Annette Richards, *The Free Fantasia and the Musical Picturesque*

Richard Will, *The Characteristic Symphony in the Age of Haydn and Beethoven*

Christopher Morris, *Reading Opera between the Lines: Orchestral Interludes and Cultural Meaning from Wagner to Berg*

Emma Dillon, *Medieval Music-Making and the 'Roman de Fauvel'*

David Yearsley, *Bach and the Meanings of Counterpoint*

David Metzger, *Quotation and Cultural Meaning in the Twentieth Century*

Alexander Rehding, *Hugo Riemann and the Birth of Modern Musical Thought*

Dana Gooley, *The Virtuoso Liszt*

Bonnie Gordon, *Monteverdi's Unruly Women: The Power of Song in Early Modern Italy*

Gary Tomlinson, *The Singing of the New World: Indigenous Voice in the Era of European Contact*

Matthew Gelbart, *The Invention of Folk Music and Art Music: Emerging Categories from Ossian to Wagner*

Olivia A. Bloechl, *Native American Song at the Frontiers of Early Modern Music*

Giuseppe Gerbino, *Music and the Myth of Arcadia in Renaissance Italy*

Roger Freitas, *Portrait of a Castrato: Politics, Patronage, and Music in the Life of Atto Melani*

Gundula Kreuzer, *Verdi and the Germans: From Unification to the Third Reich*

Holly Watkins, *Metaphors of Depth in German Musical Thought: From E. T. A. Hoffmann to Arnold Schoenberg*

Davinia Caddy, *The Ballets Russes and Beyond: Music and Dance in Belle Époque Paris*

Brigid Cohen, *Stefan Wolpe and the Avant-Garde Diaspora*

Nicholas Mathew, *Political Beethoven*

Julie Brown, *Schoenberg and Redemption*

Phyllis Weliver, *Mary Gladstone and the Victorian Salon: Music, Literature, Liberalism*

Francesca Brittan, *Music and Fantasy in the Age of Berlioz*

# Music and Fantasy in the Age of Berlioz

Francesca Brittan  
*Case Western Reserve University*



Cambridge University Press  
978-1-316-50181-8 — Music and Fantasy in the Age of Berlioz  
Francesca Brittan  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

## CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom  
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA  
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia  
314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India  
79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

[www.cambridge.org](http://www.cambridge.org)

Information on this title: [www.cambridge.org/9781316501818](http://www.cambridge.org/9781316501818)

DOI: 10.1017/9781316479803

© Francesca Brittan 2017

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2017

First paperback edition 2020

*A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication data*

Names: Brittan, Francesca author.

Title: Music and fantasy in the age of Berlioz / Francesca Brittan.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2017. |

Series: New perspectives in music history and criticism | Includes bibliographical references.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017024708 | ISBN 9781107136328

Subjects: LCSH: Fantastic, The, in music – History – 19th century. | Music and

literature – History – 19th century. | Music – 19th century – History and criticism.

Classification: LCC ML3849 .B837 2017 | DDC 780.944/09034–dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017024708>

ISBN 978-1-107-13632-8 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-316-50181-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press  
978-1-316-50181-8 — Music and Fantasy in the Age of Berlioz  
Francesca Brittan  
Frontmatter  
[More Information](#)

---

*For Nicholas*

## Contents

List of Figures and Table	page x
List of Music Examples	xii
Acknowledgments	xiv
Note on Translations	xvi
List of Abbreviations	xvii
Introduction: Hearing Fantasy	1
1 The <i>Fantastique moderne</i>	14
<i>Épisode de la vie d'un artiste</i>	51
2 Melancholy, Monomania, and the <i>Monde fantastique</i>	53
3 <i>Le Retour à la vie</i> : Natural Magic and the Ideal Orchestra	89
4 Grammatical Imaginaries	136
Of Demons and Fairies	189
5 Listening in Hell	191
6 Fairyology, Entomology, and the <i>Scherzo fantastique</i>	268
Bibliography	326
Index	351

## Figures and Table

### Figures

- 2.1 Théodore Géricault, *Monomanie du vol (The Kleptomaniac)*, ca. 1820–24. Oil on canvas, 61.2 cm x 50.1 cm. Museum voor Schone Kunsten, Gent, Belgium. Photo: Scala / Art Resource, NY. *page 70*
- 4.1 Jacques Callot, *The Temptation of St. Anthony*, 1635. Etching; third state of five (Lieure). Sheet: 36.1 cm x 47 cm. The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Bequest of Edwin De T. Bechtel, 1957. [www.metmuseum.org](http://www.metmuseum.org). *162*
- 5.1 “Adoration of the Golden Calf.” From Gabriello Simeoni, *Figure de la Biblia, illustrate de stanze Tuscane*, Illustration XXXII (Lione: Appresso G. Rouillio, 1577), Woodcuts by Pierre Eskrich. © British Library Board, Shelfmark C.51.b.2. *247*
- 5.2 “Amusemens de l’empereur après son dîner.” From Antoine François Prévost, *Histoire générale des voyages, ou nouvelle collection de toutes les relations de voyages par mer et par terre*. Volume 12, Plate 14 (Paris: Didot, 1754). Harvard University, Baker Library. *248*
- 5.3 “The Culleemgee of the Negroes.” From Jean-Baptiste-Léonard Durand, *A Voyage to Senegal; or, Historical, philosophical, and political memoirs relative to the discoveries, establishments and commerce of Europeans in the Atlantic Ocean, from Cape Blanco to the river of Sierra Leone*. Plate facing p. 104. (London: Richard Phillip, 1806). Manuscripts, Archives and Rare Books Division, Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture, The New York Public Library, Astor, Lenox and Tilden Foundations. *249*
- 6.1 Sir Joseph Noel Paton, *The Quarrel of Oberon and Titania*, 1849. Oil on canvas, 99 cm x 152 cm. Reproduced by permission of the National Gallery of Scotland. *274*
- 6.2 “The classic Cicada, the grassy Grullus, and the deep-toned Dor.” From L. M. Budgen (Acheta Domestica), *Episodes of Insect Life* (London: Bell and Daldy, 1867), 237. *Episodes* was originally published by Reeve, Benham, and Reeve in three volumes, 1849–51. Reproduced by kind permission of the Syndics of Cambridge University Library. Classmark MA.14.33. *299*



**xi**      *List of Figures and Table*

- 6.3 Title page of Adolphe Le Carpentier, *La Ronde des farfadets, Danse fantastique* (Paris: Meissonier, ca. 1872). 317

**Table**

- 4.1 *Symphonie fantastique en 4 parties. – Épisode de la vie d'un grammairien*. Parodic symphonic program printed in *Le Ménestrel* (May 8, 1836). 180

## Music Examples

- 3.1 Berlioz, “Le Pêcheur” with *idée fixe* interpolation (1855), mm. 58–79  
*page 96*
- 3.2 Berlioz, “Chant de bonheur,” mm. 1–19 98
- 3.3 Berlioz, “La Harpe éolienne,” mm. 1–12 101
- 3.4 Berlioz, “Fantaisie sur la tempête de Shakespeare,” mm. 1–6 106
- 3.5 Berlioz, “Fantaisie sur la tempête de Shakespeare,” coda 109
- 4.1 Berlioz, *Symphonie fantastique* I, thematic emergence, mm. 232–41 168
- 4.2 Berlioz, “Chant de bonheur,” mm. 14–31 (strings omitted) 171
- 4.3 Berlioz, “Élégie en prose,” mm. 1–17 173
- 5.1a Berlioz, “Méditation,” *La Mort de Cléopâtre*, mm. 11–13 194
- 5.1b Berlioz, “Choeur d’ombres,” mm. 12–14 195
- 5.2 Berlioz, “Hymn des Francs-juges” with janissary strikes, mm. 46–48 210
- 5.3 Berlioz, *Les Francs-juges*, Overture, fortissimo clashes (in context), mm. 42–49 212
- 5.4 Berlioz, *La Damnation de Faust*, Méphistophélès’s first appearance, Part II, scene v 215
- 5.5 Berlioz, “Orgie des brigands,” *Harold en Italie* IV, *ombra* music with entry of trombones, mm. 211–16 219
- 5.6 Meyerbeer, “La Valse infernale (Choeur dans la caverne),” *Robert le diable*, Act III, scene ii (offstage orchestra only) 241
- 5.7 Meyerbeer, “Bacchanale des nonnes,” D-major section with line-end clashing, *Robert le diable*, Act III, scene vii 244
- 5.8 Adam, “Bacchanale des Wilis,” *Giselle ou les Wilis*, *ballet fantastique en deux actes*, Act II, scene xiv 253
- 5.9 Gounod, “Chant bachique,” *Faust*, Act V, scene i (“From this bewitching goblet / Let us drink everlasting oblivion!”) 255
- 5.10 Schindelmeisser, Bacchanale for Gounod’s *Faust*, mm. 1–5 256
- 5.11 Boito, Witches’ dance (“Ridda e fuga infernale”), *Mefistofele*, Act II, scene ii 257

- 5.12 Boito, Mefistofele revealed (“What a noise!”), *Mefistofele*, Act I, scene i 259
- 5.13 Liszt, *Faust* Symphony III (“Mephistopheles”), opening gesture with Berliozian clash, mm. 1–5 260
- 6.1 Mendelssohn, Octet, Op. 20, mm. 1–10 277
- 6.2 Mendelssohn’s “buzzing fly,” *Midsummer Night’s Dream* Overture, Op. 21, mm. 264–70 280
- 6.3 Berlioz, “La Reine Mab,” *Roméo et Juliette*, mm. 1–40 288
- 6.4 Berlioz, “La Reine Mab,” trills at the close of the scherzo leading into the opening of the trio, *Roméo et Juliette*, mm. 349–70 290
- 6.5 Adolphe Bazzini, *La Ronde des lutins*, *Scherzo fantastique pour violon avec accomp. de piano*, Op. 25 (Paris: Richault, 1852), mm. 64–79 309
- 6.6a Liszt, *Gnomensreigen* [*Danse des lutins*], mm. 1–4 309
- 6.6b Liszt, *Gnomensreigen* [*Danse des lutins*], beginning of round dance proper, mm. 21–26 310
- 6.7 J. Ascher, *Les Diablotins*, *Polka fantastique pour piano* (Paris: Lemoine, 1858), mm. 1–20 311
- 6.8a Mendelssohn, Octet, Op. 20, closing ascent, mm. 237–41 312
- 6.8b Berlioz, “La Reine Mab,” closing ascent (strings only), *Roméo et Juliette*, mm. 761–69 313
- 6.8c Liszt, *Gnomensreigen* [*Danse des lutins*], closing ascent, mm. 165–68 313
- 6.8d F. A. Kummer, *Ronde fantastique*, closing ascent (cello only), *Pièce fantastique pour le violoncelle avec acc. d’orchestre ou piano*, Op. 36 (Paris: Richault, 1846), mm. 243–56 313
- 6.8e Gennaro Perrelli, *Rondo fantastique pour piano*, Op. 35 (Paris: Flaxland, 1869), closing ascent, mm. 376–86 314
- 6.9 Richard Kleinmichel, *Fée Mab*, *Scherzo für piano*, Op. 27 (Mainz: B. Schott’s Söhne, 1876), mm. 1–17 316
- 6.10 Adolphe M. Blanc, *La Farfalla*, *Scherzetto fantastique pour alto-violon avec acc. de piano*, Op. 7 (Paris: Richault, 1853), mm. 1–13 318
- 6.11a J. Schiffmacher, *Les Abeilles*, *Scherzo*, Op. 68 (Paris: Michelet, 1868), mm. 22–27 319
- 6.11b Schiffmacher’s “buzzing bee,” *Les Abeilles*, *Scherzo*, Op. 68, mm 38–40 319

## Acknowledgments

There is a poem by Shel Silverstein that reads, “I’m writing these lines / From inside a lion / And it’s rather dark in here.” I’ve read this poem to my daughters many times over the past several years, always with a sense of eerie recognition. Good ideas come out of a ferociously dark space, and only because our friends reach in with candles, ropes, and words of encouragement. The first to do this for me were the members of my Cornell dissertation committee, who helped root this project and give it shape, and to whom I offer deep thanks: Neal Zaslaw, Annette Richards, James Webster, and Julian Rushton. The slow transformation from dissertation to book was aided by colleagues on both sides of the Atlantic, who listened, read, and illuminated what was murky. Roger Parker, David Rosen, Thomas Christensen, Annette Richards, Benjamin Walton, Jonathan Kregor, Ross Duffin, and Sarah Hibberd read individual chapters (sometimes more than once) and saved me from innumerable errors. Later, James Webster, Alan Rocke, Gary Mouldsdale, and Mark Evan Bonds looked at big swaths of the manuscript and offered keen insight. Others provided last-minute advice and general good cheer: Judith Peraino, Emily Green, Catherine Mayes, Davinia Caddy, Ralph Locke, Nick Mathew, James Davies, and Sherry Lee.

I extend my warm thanks to the members of the Network for Francophone Music Criticism for their practical support, fellowship, and good wine. And I salute the Berlioz community, especially Julian Rushton, Katherine Kolb, Peter Bloom, Hugh Macdonald, and Stephen Rodgers, who were unfailingly welcoming and knowledgeable. Annegret Fauser, in her capacity as editor of *JAMS*, honed the article version of Chapter 6 with an expert hand (“On Microscopic Hearing: Fairy Magic, Natural Science, and the *Scherzo fantastique*”), and James Hepokoski, as editor of *19th-Century Music*, shaped the first incarnation of Chapter 2 (“Berlioz and the Pathological Fantastic: Melancholy, Monomania, and Romantic Autobiography”). I extend my gratitude to both, and to the University of California Press for allowing me to republish portions of these earlier essays.

My musicological colleagues at Case Western Reserve University have been supportive in too many ways to count. For their patience and rigor (not to mention the dinners, coffee breaks, and Berlioz jokes) I thank Peter Bennett, Ross Duffin, Georgia Cowart, Daniel Goldmark, Susan McClary,

David Rothenberg, and Robert Walser. Jean Toombs of CIM's Robinson Music Library and Stephen Toombs of CWRU's Kulas Music Library offered bibliographic advice, found obscure documents, and forgave a mountain of library fines. Fabienne Bernard and Christine Cano leant me their expertise with French translation, offering clever and funny ideas. My research assistant Jarryn Ha set the music examples carefully and swiftly. And our graduate students, especially the members of my 2015 "Romantic Shapes" seminar, enriched and challenged me. The best parts of this book are a testimony to the critical acumen and altruism of these friends and colleagues; it goes without saying that all remaining weaknesses are mine alone.

Support for this project came in the form of a Junior Research Fellowship at Queens' College Cambridge, and then a series of generous awards from Case Western Reserve University, including a W. P. Jones Presidential Faculty Development Award, a Glennan Fellowship, and funding through the Baker-Nord Center for the Humanities. I would also like to thank the music departments at King's College London, the University of Cambridge, the University of Southampton, Cornell University, Princeton University, the University of British Columbia, Youngstown State University, Dalhousie University, and the University of Michigan for giving me a chance to develop my ideas in guest lectures and colloquia.

To the relatives and friends near and far who saw me not just through the writing of this book, but through the two difficult pregnancies and special exhaustions of early parenthood that accompanied that process, I am eternally grateful: Jackie Wille, Greg Wille, Carol Holley, Gary and Wendy Mouldsdale, Tsitsi Jaji, Meg Elliott, Wendy Fu, John Duncan, Kirsty Money, Peter Shulman, Jo Willmott, Sheila Harper, Dori and Irv Katz, Jen Meyers, Eric Dunn, Julie Andrijeski, Tracy Mortimer, Debra Nagy, Ana Boe, Vera Tobin, Steve Cook, and the other precious neighbors and chums who have made our lives possible. My oldest and most profound debt is to my three sisters, Alice, Jennifer, and Suzannah, and to my parents, Eric and Cora. This book could not have been written without you; indeed, its claims about the power of magic, make-believe, and spirit were fostered by your love and imagination. Finally, I thank my husband, Nicholas, to whom this book is dedicated, and who read the entire manuscript, offering me strength and affection when it mattered most. And I blow a kiss to our two small fairies, Rose and Lucy, who remind me daily that musicology is not, in the end, at the center of things. To you three, via Victor Hugo: "L'amour fait songer, vivre et croire. / Il a pour réchauffer le cœur, / Un rayon de plus que la gloire, / Et ce rayon c'est le bonheur!"

## Note on Translations

Translations are mine unless otherwise indicated. Original language is given in footnotes only when the source text is not readily available either via digital collections or modern editions. Thus, it appears in the case of individual journal reviews and serialized tales but not for Berlioz's own critical writing and correspondence, nor for the majority of French novels and scientific texts. The spelling of original texts has been left intact; thus, for instance, "atroupemens" rather than "atroupements."

## Abbreviations

- CG: Berlioz, *Correspondance générale*. General editor, Pierre Citron. 7 vols. and *supplément*. Paris: Flammarion, 1972–2003.
- CM: Berlioz, *Critique musicale*. General editor, Yves Gérard. 7 vols. Paris: Buchet/Chastel, 1996–present.
- NBE: *New Berlioz Edition (New Edition of the Complete Works)*. General editor, Hugh Macdonald. Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1967–2006.