

TRANSNATIONAL LAWMAKING COALITIONS FOR HUMAN RIGHTS

Transnational Lawmaking Coalitions is the first comprehensive analysis of the role and impact of informal collaborations in the UN human rights treaty bodies. Issues as central to international human rights as the right to water, abortion, torture, and hate speech are often only clarified through the instrument of treaty interpretations. This book dives beneath the surface of the formal access, procedures, and actors of the UN treaty body system to reveal how the experts and external collaborators play a key role in the development of human rights. Nina Reiners introduces the concept of “Transnational Lawmaking Coalitions” within a novel theoretical framework and draws on a number of detailed case studies and original data. This study makes a significant contribution to the scholarship on human rights, transnational actors, and international organizations, and contributes to broader debates in international relations and international law.

Nina Reiners is a postdoctoral researcher in International Relations at the University of Potsdam. She is associated with the Berlin-Potsdam research group “International Rule of Law,” and the Global Governance Centre at the Graduate Institute, Geneva.

Transnational Lawmaking Coalitions
for
Human Rights

NINA REINERS
University of Potsdam



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108969994

DOI: 10.1017/9781108976763

© Nina Reiners 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2022

First paperback edition 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

NAMES: Reiners, Nina, 1984– author.

TITLE: Transnational lawmaking coalitions for human rights / Nina Reiners, University of Potsdam.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom ; New York, NY : Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Based on author's thesis (doctoral – Universität Potsdam, 2017). | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021024120 (print) | LCCN 2021024121 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108845540 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108976763 (ebook)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: International law and human rights. | Treaty-making power.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC KZ1266 .R445 2021 (print) | LCC KZ1266 (ebook) |

DDC 341.4/8–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021024120>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2021024121>

ISBN 978-1-108-84554-0 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-96999-4 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

To Heinz Litgen

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> viii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	x
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xiii
1 Introduction	1
2 Human Rights Treaty Interpretation	18
3 Transnational Lawmaking Coalitions	37
4 How Water Became a Human Right	66
5 Interpretation across Treaty Bodies	94
6 Lawmaking without Governments?	116
7 Conclusion	131
<i>Appendix A Rules of Procedure</i>	146
<i>Appendix B Session Overview CESCR and General Comment No. 15</i>	152
<i>Appendix C Analytical Framework Process Analysis (Chapter 4)</i>	156
<i>Appendix D Interviews and Background Talks</i>	163
<i>Bibliography</i>	165
<i>Index</i>	196

Figures

2.1	Adoption of general comments over time (1972–2020)	<i>page</i> 23
2.2	General comments by function (1972–2020)	27
2.3	Professions of treaty body members (2008–2020)	30
3.1	Transnational lawmaking coalitions	45
4.1	“Water” in CESCR sessions (1993–2002)	74
C.1	Analytical framework	162

Tables

2.1	Rules for decision-making	<i>page</i> 22
2.2	Human rights treaty ratifications (2015–2019)	32
5.1	Treaty body typology	97
B.1	CESCR sessions General Comment No. 15	153

Acknowledgments

This book started as a PhD dissertation, developed into a two-year postdoctoral project, and was rigorously discussed and reflected upon in a variety of settings before it finally became this book. Despite all the changes made, new cases included, and theory expanded, and although multiple alternatives were pitched, the title of this book now brings this project back full circle, back to where it started – to the dissertation. “Transnational Lawmaking Coalitions for Human Rights” received support from many people and institutions. Some were crucial at an early stage, some provided decisive input without probably being aware of it, and others were a constant flow of support. I follow here with an essential, but by no means exhaustive, list of people and institutions I wish to recognize for their support.

Andrea Liese is my expert authority on international institutions and has been encouraging ever since I walked into her office in Potsdam. I will never take her truly exceptional mentorship for granted. I benefited immensely from the patience and advice of Harald Fuhr. My PhD time in Potsdam’s Karl-Marx-Strasse and on Campus Griebnitzsee was truly a team experience which I was lucky to share with other curious minds at the Faculty of Social Sciences and Economics. Rather than name all fellow PhD students, postdocs, students and research assistants, professors and colleagues in the university, and faculty administration who made this time so special for me, I would like to single out Per-Olof Busch, Marion Dräger, and Thomas Hickmann for their support.

Particularly formative for this book’s journey was my time at the University of San Diego in 2016. Hans Peter Schmitz, who generously shared his knowledge about international human rights and advocacy, asked the right questions and became an exceptional advisor and mentor. The research group (KFG) “International Rule of Law” proved to be an excellent environment in which I could sharpen my arguments and understand international law – and

lawyers – much better. Heike Krieger, in giving particularly discerning attention to my project, added valuable contributions to my thinking about human rights law. The Graduate Institute in Geneva became my second academic home during the book’s journey. I thank Nico Krisch for his enduring support and for the decisive time as a visiting scholar with his “PATHS of International Law” team. Stephanie Hofmann gave me a forum to discuss a first proposal of this book, and I thank her dearly for her encouragement. I also thank everyone who participated for their input.

I further extend my gratitude to the following people who read proposals and chapters of this book at various draft stages and provided helpful comments at conferences, workshops, or during the final writing stages: Hannah Birkenkötter, Thomas Dörfler, Benjamin Faude, Sassan Gholiagha, Heidi Haddad, Tine Hanrieder, Jana Herold, Anna Holzscheiter Andrew Hurrell, Anja Jetschke, Max Lesch, Lydia Malmedie, Anthea Roberts, Andrea Schapper, Andreas von Staden, Jonas Tallberg, Ezgi Yildiz, and Fuad Zarbiyev. I also thank the organizers and participants in colloquia and research seminars at the University of Stirling, the Graduate Institute Geneva, the ECPR Standing Group on Law and Courts, and the University of Stockholm for inviting me to discuss this book project. I hope you can see many of our discussions reflected in the final manuscript.

The following institutions were crucial for the success of this book project: I thank the Fritz Thyssen Foundation for the generous funding of a two-year postdoctoral grant and the opportunity to participate in the intellectually stimulating environment of their “Human Rights in the 20th Century” study group. I thank the Academic Council on the United Nations System (ACUNS) and the United Nations Association of Germany (DGVN) for providing opportunities to interact with UN scholars and practitioners. Furthermore, I thank the Potsdam Graduate School, the German Academic Exchange Service (DAAD), and the Office for Equal Opportunities in Potsdam for financial support that made many conferences and research stays possible.

Without the individuals in and around the UN in Geneva who gave me their time, provided access to their networks, sat down with me for a coffee or lunch, and helped me better understand their work, this book would indeed not have been possible. I particularly thank the staff of Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights and in the UN archives in Geneva, who reacted to all my requests despite their workload and would even notify me two years later about potentially relevant documents discovered. Claire Mahon and Ana Maria Suárez Franco deserve special recognition for helping me to navigate the Geneva human rights world.

At every stage of this project, Cambridge University Press has been supportive and encouraging. I am truly grateful for making my first book-publishing experience one I could get used to. Three reviewers generously provided helpful comments on my manuscript. I thank Alex M. Smith for his magical edits and for staying so excited about my not-too-exciting academic writing. I also thank Christina Schneider for thoroughly checking references and improving figures and tables.

Thanks to family, friends, and colleagues in Fischeln, Berlin, Frankfurt, Geneva, Madrid, London, Rome, Stockholm, Gothenburg, San Diego, Jakarta, and beyond and between, who allowed me to stay focused and distracted me when needed.

Abbreviations

AAAS	American Association for the Advancement of Science
APT	Association for the Prevention of Torture
CAT	Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment
CAT Committee	Committee against Torture
CCPR	Human Rights Committee
CED	Committee on Enforced Disappearances
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CEDAW Committee	Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women
CEDAW-OP	Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CERD	Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination
CESCR	Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
CICC	Coalition for the International Criminal Court
CMW	Committee on Migrant Workers
COHRE	Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
CRC Committee	Committee on the Rights of the Child
CRC-OPAC	Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict

CRC-OPIC	Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on a communications procedure
CRC-OPSC	Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
CRPD Committee	Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
CRPD-OP	Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FIAN	FoodFirst Informations and Action Network
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services
GC	general comment
GR	general recommendation
HRC	Human Rights Council
ICBL	International Campaign to Ban Landmines
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICCPR-OP ₁	First Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICCPR-OP ₂	Second Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICED	International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICESCR-OP	Optional Protocol to the Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Commission of Jurists
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICtJ	International Court of Justice
ILA	International Law Association
ILC	International Law Commission

List of Abbreviations

xv

ILO	International Labour Organization
IMF	International Monetary Fund
INGO	international non-governmental organization
IO	international organization
IPA	international public administration
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
IR	international relations
IRENA	International Renewable Energy Agency
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NGO	nongovernmental organization
NHRI	National Human Rights Institution
OEWG	open-ended working group
OHCHR	Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights
OMCT	World Organisation Against Torture
OP-CAT	Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture
PPP	public–private partnership
SPT	Subcommittee on Prevention of Torture
TAN	transnational advocacy network
TLC	transnational lawmaking coalition
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UPR	Universal Periodic Review
WHO	World Health Organization
WTO	World Trade Organization