The Making of Islamic Economic Thought

Interrogating the development and the conceptual framework of economic thought in the Islamic tradition as it pertains to ethical, philosophical, and theological ideas, this book provides a critique of modern Islamic economics as a hybrid economic system. From the outset, Sami Al-Daghistani is concerned with the polyvalent methodology of studying the phenomenon of Islamic economic thought as a human science in that it nurtures a complex plenitude of meanings and interpretations associated with the moral self. Studying legal scholars, theologians, and Sufis in the classical period, Al-Daghistani looks at economic thought in the context of Sharī‘a’s moral law. Alongside critiquing modern developments of Islamic economics, he puts forward the idea of a plural epistemology of Islam’s moral economy, which advocates for a multifaceted hermeneutical reading of the subject in light of a moral law, embedded in a particular cosmology of human relationality, metaphysical intelligibility, and economic subjectivity.

SAMI AL-DAGHISTANI is a postdoctoral fellow at the MF Norwegian School of Theology, Religion and Society in Oslo, an associate faculty member at the Brooklyn Institute for Social Research in New York, and a research scholar at the Middle East Institute at Columbia University. He is the author of Ethical Teachings of Abū Ḥāmid al-Ghazālī: Economics of Happiness (2021) and translator to Slovenian of Ibn Ṭūfayl’s Ḥay ibn Yaqẓān (2016) and Ibn Baṭṭūta’s Rihla (2017).
The Making of Islamic Economic Thought

Islamization, Law, and Moral Discourses

SAMi Al-Daghistani

MF Norwegian School of Theology, Religion and Society
Contents

List of Figures

page vii

Acknowledgments

viii

Introduction 1
The Premise 1
Western Philosophical Tradition and the Birth of Economic Science 6
The Genealogy of Modern Islamic Economics 26
Classical Scholarship and the Moral Self 31
Methodology and Theoretical Framework 34
Scholarly Relevance of Premodern Economic Teachings 42

1 The Force of Revivalism and Islamization: Their Impact on Knowledge, Politics, and Islamic Economics 43
1.1 The Socioeconomic Paradigm against the Backdrop of a Colonial Past 44
1.2 Contextualizing Muslim Reformists’ Understanding of Socialism, Capitalism, and Spirituality 48
1.3 Abū al-‘lā Mawdūdī and the Twentieth-Century Transition from Nation to Islamic State 64
1.4 Islam and the Economic System between the 1930s and the 1970s 73
1.5 Islamization of Knowledge Process and Contemporary Islamic Thought 81
1.6 Islamization of the Islamic Economy (1979–Present) 87
1.7 Concluding Remarks 95

2 The Present: Muslim Economists and the Constellation of Islamic Economics 97
2.1 Introductory Remarks 97
2.2 Theories and Definitions: Recent Developments and Contentions 102
2.3 Methodologies of Contemporary Islamic Economics 109
2.4 Islamic Economics and Forms of Conventional Knowledge 120
2.5 Islamic Jurisprudential Economics and Islamic Law 128
2.6 Contemporary Muslim Economists’ Views on Classical Muslim Scholars 139
2.7 Concluding Remarks 141

3 The Past Perfect: *Sharī’a* and the Intellectual History of Islamic Economic Teachings 145
3.1 Widening the Scope of Classical Economic and Legal Thought in Islam 145
3.2 *Sharī’a*’s Legal Supremacy versus Moral Cosmology 149
3.3 *Maqāsid, Ištihlās, Maṣlaḥa,* and Economic Preservation in *Sharī’a* 157
3.4 *Siyyaṣa sharī‘yya*: Between the Moral and Legal Realm 168
3.5 Metaphysics and the History of Islam’s Moral Economics 173
3.6 The Nature of Markets, Price Control, and the Notion of Fair Price 182
3.7 The Value of Wealth (*Māl*) and the Hereafter 187
3.8 Productivity, Value of Labor, and Cooperation 203
3.9 Islamic Authority (*Wilāya*) and the Principle of Moral Integrity 210
3.10 Concluding Remarks 219

4 The Appraisal: Contemporary Islamic Economics and the Entrenchment of Modernity 221
4.1 Introductory Remarks 221
4.2 Modern Divergence of *Sharī‘a*’s Moral Principles 224
4.3 Critiquing the Discipline of Islamic Economics 235
4.4 The Islamization of Economics 247
4.5 Concluding Remarks 252

5 Pluralistic Epistemology of Islam’s Moral Economics 256
5.1 Introductory Remarks 256
5.2 Moral Cosmology and Pluralistic Epistemology in Islamic Tradition 259
5.3 Economic Development in Light of Spiritual Prosperity 269

Conclusion: Moral over Legal, Pluralistic over Monolithic 274

*Appendix* 277
*Bibliography* 279
*Index* 310
### Figures

1. History and development of economic thought in Islamic tradition  
   page 277
2. *Kasb–zuhd* amalgam under the banner of *Tawakkul*  
   278
3. Categorization of the contingent fields of economy, society, and ecology within the cosmological order  
   278
4. Economic behavior and pluralistic epistemology of *Shari‘a*  
   278
Acknowledgments

I have been fortunate to be surrounded by scholars in Islamic Studies from whose scholarship I have benefited, immensely. They have helped me form and nuance my arguments, enthusiastically reading chapters of my thesis and offering key insights. I would like to thank my advisor at Leiden University, Maurits Berger, who persistently and diligently supervised every step of my PhD studies, and whose bi-weekly meetings, in order to discuss the thesis and its progress, contributed to its end product. At Leiden University, I am also grateful to professors, colleagues, and staff members, including the Leiden Center for the Study of Religion, Leiden Institute for Area Studies, Leiden University Center for the Study of Islam and Society, and Netherlands Interuniversity School for Islamic Studies, as well as to Leiden University Funds.

I would like to credit my co-advisor at WWU Münster, Marco Schöller, for his supervision, advice, and encouragement and Dr. Monika Springberg-Hinsen for her prompt assistance and support at the Institut für Arabistik und Islamwissenschaft. Likewise, I would like to sincerely thank Taner Yüksel and Murat Şahinarslan from DITIB Türkisch-Islamische Union der Anstalt für Religion e.V. in Cologne for their generous academic and financial support.

My utmost gratitude and appreciation for his time, knowledge, and mentorship goes to my advisor at Columbia University, Wael Hallaq, who not only read, commented, and discussed in detail Chapters 3, 4, and 5 of this book but who also helped shape my understanding of the nuances within Islamic intellectual and legal history. Professor Hallaq’s seminars and workshops on Islamic intellectual history, and numerous discussions with him in and outside of his office hours, remain some of my most cherished academic moments of my PhD research. At the Department of Middle Eastern, South Asian, and African Studies, (MESAAS) I am grateful to Timothy Mitchell for reading and providing comments for Chapter 1 and to Hossein Kamaly for his
Acknowledgments

invaluable commentaries and suggestions. Likewise, I would like to express my sincere thanks to Katherine Pratt Ewing, the former director, and to Walid Hammam, the associate director of the Institute for Religion, Culture, and Public Life (IRCPL) at Columbia University, for providing me with an academic platform, workspace, and wonderful colleagues; to Gil Anidjar at the Religion Department for his backing; as well as to Marnia Lazreg at Hunter College in New York for her insightful analysis and discussion. The time spent first as a visiting scholar at MESAAS and at the IRCPL between 2015 and 2017, and then as a research scholar at IRCPL between 2017 and 2019, deepened my critical orientation and provided me with numerous academic incentives, projects, and collaborations that stretched well beyond my PhD studies.

At McGill University, where I spent the winter term of 2014, I would like to extend thanks to Ahmad Ibrahim, whose courses on Islamic law prompted me to carry on ongoing research and teaching activities in this domain, as well to Adina Sigartau for her invaluable help at the institute and the fellow students I met during my studies in Montreal.

At Amsterdam University, I am indebted to Michael Kemper for his time and the commentary he provided for one of the very first drafts of the thesis.

At Oxford University, I would like to extend my gratitude to Paul Flather for supporting my presentations at the Sorbonne, Oxford University, and in Madrid, within the framework of the Europaeum.

Moreover, I am deeply grateful to Seyyed Hossein Nasr, Alexander Knysh, and Aamir Mufti for meeting me in person and for enriching my critical thinking on the processes within Sufi epistemology, ethics, and economic thought.

Likewise, I extend my appreciation to my friends and colleagues at the MF Norwegian School of Theology, Religion and Society in Oslo, the Middle East Institute at Columbia University, and the Brooklyn Institute for Social Research in New York for their conversations and intellectual input. The three institutions have been my academic home for the past several years. MF has been particularly welcoming to my academic orientation and also granted me generous institutional support.
Acknowledgments

At Cambridge University Press, I would sincerely like to thank the former commissioning editor Daniel Brown for believing in my project and for meeting me in 2019 at MESA’s annual meeting, the current acting commissioning editors Maria Marsh and Atifa Jiwa, the copy-editor Anny Mortada, the project manager Malini Soupramanian, the content Manager Thomas Haynes, and their team for their support, and the two reviewers for their valuable suggestions and comments, as well as to Zachary Hendrickson for helping out with the index.

Personally, in New York, I am thankful to my dear friend and a rising musician in the jazz scene, Jan Kus. Hours spent together in Harlem, Queens, the Bronx, and Brooklyn, in any weather and under any conditions, provided me friendship and smiles. To colleagues and friends at Columbia University – Rajbir Singh Judge, Fatima-Ezzahrae Touilila, Zachary Hendrickson, Kevin Witkow, Marianna Pecoraro, Mohamad Mezian, Ibrahim Bechrouri, and Ayah Dosougi, I will always appreciate the amity of our time and engaged intellectual discussions in my favorite city; in the Netherlands, I am grateful to Mahmood Kooriathodi and Efthchia Mylona for their friendship and immense help surrounding my PhD defense process, as well as to Chryssa Vergidou (Chrysulaki), Hayat Ahlili, Bart and Elenore Geuzebroek, Marcela Probert, Tijmen Baarda, Faryaneh Fadaei, Gulnaz Sibgatullina, Tamás Szenderák, Amin Ghodratzadeh, Samuela Eroffi, Arshad Muradin, Arnold Yasin Mol, Brigitte Van de Pas, Alain Corbeau, Haris Mexas, Saeko Kitame, as well as to the Leiden Hikma community, for their friendship and a wonderful time spent in Leiden and abroad; at the European University at St. Petersburg, to Alfrid Bustanov and Anna Matochnina, for their invitation and hospitality; in Slovenia, to Mirt Komel, a solid friend, philosopher, fellow co-editor, and intellectual companion, to Nastasja Škrlj-Grat and her family for her long-lasting and beautiful friendship, and to Matea Pregelj for her backing.

I am also thankful to my Slovenian, Iraqi, Iranian, American, Serbian, and Filipino family for their love, inspiration, and support. My love and gratitude go to my beloved parents, Marija and Nabil, whose affection and encouragement followed me to the four corners of the Earth. Despite the physical distance, their voice on the other side of the line always reassured me of their unconditional love. I would also
Acknowledgments

like to thank my wonderful wife and intellectual partner, Kristin Soraya Batmanghelichi, who persevered with me throughout the last two years of my PhD studies in New York and whose love, care, and motivation supplied me with much needed affection, understanding, and guidance. To our daughter who brings unsurmountable amount of joy to my life – Lina Jocelyn – I love you, immensely.