

More Information

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-108-94967-5 — Systems Thinking Analyses for Health Policy and Systems Development Edited by Jo. M. Martins , Indra Pathmanathan , David T. Tan , Shiang Cheng Lim , Pascale Allotey Frontmatter

Systems Thinking Analyses for Health Policy and Systems Development

Health systems are fluid and their components are interdependent in complex ways. Policymakers, academics and students continually endeavour to understand how to manage health systems to improve the health of populations. However, previous scholarship has often failed to engage with the intersections and interactions of health with a multitude of other systems and determinants. This book ambitiously takes on the challenge of presenting health systems as a coherent whole, by applying a systems-thinking lens. It focuses on Malaysia as a case study to demonstrate the evolution of a health system from a low-income developing status to one of the most resilient health systems today. A rich collaboration of multidisciplinary academics working with policymakers who were at the coalface of decision-making and practitioners with decades of experience, provides a candid analysis of what worked and what did not. The result is an engaging, informative and thought-provoking intervention in the debate. This title is Open Access.

JO. M. MARTINS is Adjunct Professor at the International Medical University, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.

INDRA PATHMANATHAN is Principal Visiting Fellow in the International Institute of Global Health, United Nations University, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.

DAVID T. TAN is Head of Experimentation in the United Nations Development Programme.

SHIANG CHENG LIM is Country Technical Lead for Better Health Programme Malaysia at RTI International (Malaysia Office).

PASCALE ALLOTEY is Director of the International Institute for Global Health at United Nations University.



More Information

Systems Thinking Analyses for Health Policy and Systems Development

A Malaysian Case Study

Edited by

JO. M. MARTINS

International Medical University

INDRA PATHMANATHAN

United Nations University International Institute for Global Health

DAVID T. TAN

United Nations University International Institute for Global Health

SHIANG CHENG LIM

United Nations University International Institute for Global Health

PASCALE ALLOTEY

United Nations University International Institute for Global Health





978-1-108-94967-5 — Systems Thinking Analyses for Health Policy and Systems Development Edited by Jo. M. Martins, Indra Pathmanathan, David T. Tan,

Shiang Cheng Lim, Pascale Allotey

Frontmatter

More Information



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi - 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108949675

DOI: 10.1017/9781108954846

© United Nations University International Institute for Global Health 2021

This work is in copyright. It is subject to statutory exceptions and to the provisions of relevant licensing agreements; with the exception of the Creative Commons version the link for which is provided below, no reproduction of any part of this work may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment

An online version of this work is published at doi.org/10.1017/9781108954846 under a Creative Commons Open Access license CC-BY-NC-SA 4.0 which permits re-use, distribution and reproduction in any medium for non-commercial purposes providing appropriate credit to the original work is given, any changes made are indicated, and the new work is published under the same license terms. To view a copy of this license, visit https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0

All versions of this work may contain content reproduced under license from third parties. Permission to reproduce this third-party content must be obtained from these third-parties directly. When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781108954846

First published 2021

First paperback edition 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

Names: Martins, Jo. M., 1936- editor.

Title: Systems thinking analyses for health policy and systems development: a Malaysian case study / edited by Jo. M. Martins, Indra Pathmanathan, David T. Tan, Shiang Cheng Lim, Pascale Allotey. Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, N.Y.: Cambridge University Press, 2021. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2020053664 | ISBN 9781108845205 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108949675 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108954846 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Medical policy – Malaysia. | Integrated delivery of health care – Malaysia. | Medical care – Malaysia.

Classification: LCC RA395.M35 S97 2021 | DDC 362.109595-dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020053664

ISBN 978-1-108-84520-5 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-94967-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.LM





Contents

| Lıst | t of Figures | page viii |
|------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| List | of Tables | xiv |
| List | of Boxes | xviii |
| Bio | graphies of Editors and Contributors | xxi |
| For | eword by Dr Abdul Ghaffar | xxxi |
| For | eword by Dr Noor Hisham Abdullah | XXXV |
| Prej | face | xxxvii |
| Ack | nowledgements | xxxix |
| | of Abbreviations | xli |
| | Section I | |
| 1 | An Introduction to Health Systems DAVID MCCOY AND PASCALE ALLOTEY | 3 |
| 2 | Systems Thinking for Health System Improvement BARRY NEWELL, DAVID T. TAN AND KATRINA PROUST | 17 |
| | Section II | |
| 3 | Malaysia's Health and Socio-economic Transformation JO. M. MARTINS | 33 |
| 4 | Health Service Delivery: Primary Health Care SHIANG CHENG LIM, INDRA PATHMANATHAN AND SAFURAH JAAFAR | 65 |
| | Case Study 4.1 REAP-WISE: Malaysia's Experience in Integrated Primary Health Care Services SHIANG CHENG LIM, SAFURAH JAAFAR AND DAVID T. TAN | 98 |
| | | |

v



More Information

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-108-94967-5 — Systems Thinking Analyses for Health Policy and Systems Development Edited by Jo. M. Martins , Indra Pathmanathan , David T. Tan , Shiang Cheng Lim , Pascale Allotey Frontmatter

vi Contents

| | Case Study 4.2 Managed Care Organisations as Intermediaries in the Provision of Healthcare by GPs to Private Sector Employees KUAN JOO LIM, MILTON LUM, INDRA PATHMANATHAN AND DAVID T. TAN | 107 |
|---|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 5 | Health Service Delivery: Secondary and Tertiary Care INDRA PATHMANATHAN, MILTON LUM AND ANUAR ZAINI | 116 |
| | Case Study 5.1 Expanded Access to Dialysis Services through Public Funding of Private Delivery INDRA PATHMANATHAN, MILTON LUM, ANUAR ZAINI AND DAVID T. TAN | 164 |
| 6 | Health Service Delivery: Disease Prevention and Control SHIANG CHENG LIM | 172 |
| | Case Study 6.1 Adoption of Harm Reduction Strategies for Preventing HIV among Injecting Drug Users SHIANG CHENG LIM AND DAVID T. TAN | 209 |
| 7 | Health Service Delivery: Environmental Health Services MUKUNDAN SUGUNAN PILLAY AND DEBBIE SIRU | 221 |
| | Case Study 7.1 Rural Water Supply and Sanitation MUKUNDAN SUGUNAN PILLAY, DEBBIE SIRU AND DAVID T. TAN | 235 |
| | Case Study 7.2 Clinical Waste Management DEBBIE SIRU, MUKUNDAN SUGUNAN PILLAY AND DAVID T. TAN | 241 |
| 8 | Health Workforce INDRA PATHMANATHAN | 254 |
| | Case Study 8.1 Unexpected Influx of New Medical Graduates Threatens to Overwhelm the Health System INDRA PATHMANATHAN AND DAVID T. TAN | 293 |
| 9 | Financing Health Care CHIU-WAN NG | 306 |



| Con | itents | vii |
|-----|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| | Case Study 9.1 Development of a Case-Mix System for Improving Efficiency in Ministry of Health Hospitals CHIU-WAN NG, THARANI LOGANATHAN, KUAN-JOO LIM AND DAVID T. TAN | 331 |
| 10 | Health Information NURAIDAH M. MARZUKI, FAZILAH S. ALLAUDIN, SUPATHIRATHEAVY RASIAH AND JO. M. MARTINS | 337 |
| | Case Study 10.1 Challenges in Introducing Telehealth NURAIDAH M. MARZUKI AND DAVID T. TAN | 361 |
| 11 | Medical Products THOMAS PARAIDATHATHU AND CHEE HAN LIM | 367 |
| | Case Study 11.1 Challenges in Regulating Traditional Medical Products THOMAS PARAIDATHATHU, CHEE HAN LIM AND DAVID T. TAN | 395 |
| 12 | Leadership and Governance JO. M. MARTINS AND INDRA PATHMANATHAN | 402 |
| | Case Study 12.1 Leadership Enabled Affordable Treatment of Hepatitis C in Malaysia CHEE HAN LIM, FAIZUL NIZAM BIN ABU SALIM AND DAVID T. TAN | 431 |
| | Section III | |
| 13 | Lessons from a Health System in Evolution DAVID MCCOY, INDRA PATHMANATHAN, DAVID T. TAN, JO. M. MARTINS AND SHIANG CHENG LIM | 449 |
| 14 | Toward a Systems Thinking Theory for Health Systems DAVID T. TAN | 473 |
| Apţ | pendix I Systems Thinking Analysis of STC DAVID T. TAN AND INDRA PATHMANATHAN | 151 |
| Apt | pendix II Supplementary Tables | 155 |
| | pendix III Supplementary Tables | 202 |
| | pendix IV Detailed Acknowledgements | 494 |
| Ind | ρ_X | 499 |



Figures

| 2.1 | The susceptible–infected–recovered (SIR) system | page 21 |
|-----|----------------------------------------------------------|---------|
| 2.2 | A causal loop diagram (CLD) | 22 |
| 2.3 | Two types of feedback structure | 23 |
| 2.4 | An influence diagram (ID) | 24 |
| 4.1 | Pap smear slides taken and coverage in Malaysia, | |
| | 1994–2003 | 79 |
| 4.2 | Trends in the utilisation pattern of OPDs | 81 |
| 4.3 | Estimated outpatient visits to clinics per capita per | |
| | annum, Malaysia, 1930s-2000s | 87 |
| 4-A | Expansion of scope in PHC services | 98 |
| 4-B | Approaches to healthcare require supportive practices | S |
| | and systems, which in turn create an ecosystem that is | S |
| | aligned to and facilitates that approach | 100 |
| 4-C | Four changes to the PHC clinics' setting were critical t | O |
| | the ecosystem change: locus of financing and decision | |
| | making, scope and alignment of healthcare staff | |
| | responsibilities, professional development pathways, | |
| | and facilities and operations | 101 |
| 4-D | Reviewed approach of primary healthcare (REAP- | |
| | WISE) | 102 |
| 4-a | Employee expectations and unionisation determine the | ie |
| | effectiveness of their demands of employers for | |
| | healthcare benefits | 108 |
| 4-b | MCO-imposed caps on per-visit reimbursement | |
| | generates hidden costs through multiple visits (R1) or | |
| | inadequate provision of care (B2) | 110 |
| 4-c | Impact of MCOs on employer-employee-union | |
| | dynamics changing the prior system (Figure 4-a) in | |
| | ways that result in lower health benefits for the | |
| | workforce | 112 |

viii



More Information

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-108-94967-5 — Systems Thinking Analyses for Health Policy and Systems Development Edited by Jo. M. Martins , Indra Pathmanathan , David T. Tan , Shiang Cheng Lim , Pascale Allotey Frontmatter

List of Figures ix

| 4-d | Pathways toward government regulation of practices | |
|------------|--------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| | related to healthcare benefits are ineffectual due to | |
| | limited ability of the public and medical professionals to | |
| | organise (B4 loop) and lack of information on how | |
| | these practices affect the burden on the public | 442 |
| <i>5</i> 4 | healthcare system (B5 loop) | 113 |
| 5.1 | Evolving profile of types of hospitals, number of TB and | 420 |
| | leprosy beds, and childbirth in hospitals | 120 |
| 5.2 | Utilisation of Ministry of Health hospitals in Peninsular | 122 |
| | Malaysia, 1970 and 1996 | 122 |
| 5.3 | Dynamics of providing more sophisticated clinical | |
| | services | 126 |
| 5.4 | Rising demand for medical care outpaced public hospital | |
| | resources, creating a gap in public sector capacity | 129 |
| 5.5 | Dynamics of improving clinical outcomes and | |
| | establishing a quality culture at every level | 132 |
| 5.6 | Dynamics of improving resource utilisation and client | |
| | satisfaction | 133 |
| 5.7 | Bed occupancy rates in MoH hospitals | 137 |
| 5.8 | Harnessing technology to improve access to seamless, | |
| | integrated care | 141 |
| 5.9 | Composition of inpatient care utilisation in public and | |
| | private sector by socio-economic status | 142 |
| 5.10 | Interactions between the larger ecosystem and the | |
| | healthcare provider sub-system with its enabling or | |
| | constraining sub-systems | 147 |
| 5-a | The rising demand for more sophisticated STC stressed | |
| | the capacity of the public sector, thereby requiring | |
| | greater investment | 151 |
| 5-b | In the 1970s and 1980s, rising societal affluence further | |
| | increased the demand for sophisticated healthcare, | |
| | resulting in the growth of the private sector STC, drained | |
| | specialists from the public sector to the private sector and | |
| | counteracted efforts to increase public sector capacity | 152 |
| 5-c | Increased investment resulted in increased availability of | |
| | specialist services but was associated with the | |
| | unanticipated effect of increased compartmentalisation of | |
| | care | 153 |



x

6-E

7-A

7-B

7-C

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-108-94967-5 — Systems Thinking Analyses for Health Policy and Systems Development Edited by Jo. M. Martins , Indra Pathmanathan , David T. Tan , Shiang Cheng Lim , Pascale Allotey

Frontmatter
More Information

5-d Investment in public sector organisational structure improved the capacity to deal with compartmentalisation 154 5-A The gap between demand and supply 165 5-B A view of the wider system affecting dialysis demand and supply 166 5-C Changing the behaviour of the system through new 167 5-D Effect of the rapid expansion of services on the workforce 170 6.1 Incidence rate of communicable diseases per 100,000 population, Malaysia, 1975-1997 173 6-A A criminalisation approach emphasising criminal enforcement, education and rehabilitative efforts failed to reduce the number of new HIV cases from injecting 209 drugs use 6-B Stigmatisation and the paradigm of regarding the MoH as the main provider of outreach and services were barriers to a harm reduction programme 212 6-C Commitment to MDG goals and local advocacy were critical enabling factors that overcame barriers to the adoption of the harm reduction approach 213 6-D Success of the pilots created favourable conditions for institutional changes that persisted even after key enabling factors for the adoption of the harm reduction

approach (MDGs and local advocacy) receded

The PWD strategy for expanding the water and sanitation network was unable to respond to rural

incidence of sexual transmission of HIV

disease burdens in a timely manner

While harm reduction strategies have reduced HIV in IDUs, the gains are being threatened by the increasing

Inadequate rural infrastructure investment in sanitation undermined community trust in government actors, hindering educational efforts that attempted to address

The paradigm that the MoH mission is limited to healthcare delivery created internal and external barriers to its involvement in rural water and

sanitation

the sanitation issues

215

217

236

237

240

List of Figures



More Information

| List o | f Figures | xi |
|--------|-------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 7-a | Factors that led to poor clinical waste | |
| | management | 242 |
| 7-b | Inability of the government to allocate sufficient | |
| | resources for clinical waste management undercut | |
| | both the enforcement of standards that did exist | |
| | and the development of further standards necessary | |
| | for 'cradle-to-grave' management | 243 |
| 7-c | Outsourcing of clinical waste services enabled | |
| | necessary capital investment for clinical waste | |
| | management, enabling the B1, B2 and B3 loops to | |
| | function properly | 244 |
| 8.1 | Malaysian doctors in the public and private sectors, | |
| | 1955–2013 | 265 |
| 8.2 | Regional disparities in availability of doctors, | |
| | 1970–2010 | 266 |
| 8.3 | Utilisation of outpatient services in Malaysia | 270 |
| 8.4 | Distribution of selected specialist doctors in Malaysia, | |
| | 2013 | 282 |
| 8.5 | Reported satisfaction with public and private clinics, 2015 | 284 |
| 8.6 | Reported satisfaction with public and private hospitals, | _0. |
| 0.0 | 2015 | 284 |
| 8-A | New graduates entering the workforce as HOs | 293 |
| 8-B | Doctors' average career path in Malaysia | 295 |
| 8-C | Meeting the demand | 296 |
| 8-D | Lack of capacity planning | 297 |
| 8-E | Impact of the bottleneck on the HO experience | 298 |
| 8-F | The specialist bottleneck | 300 |
| 8-G | Systems responses to the crisis | 302 |
| 9.1 | Public and private health financing sources, Malaysia, | |
| | 1997–2017 | 310 |
| 9-A | Concerns over sustainable health care financing and | |
| | quality of care are creating an impetus to improve | |
| | hospital performance | 332 |
| 9-B | Institutional pressures keep generic accounting | |
| | approaches in place over the adoption of the case-mix | |
| | approach | 334 |



Frontmatter
More Information

xii List of Figures

| 10.1 | Reinforcing loop showing how compliance with data collection improves the quality of data, enabling positive impacts on health outcomes | 350 |
|------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 10-A | For telehealth functions that cut across health facilities, the more health facilities adopt and operate within a particular interoperable telehealth standard, the greater the benefit for other facilities to adopt that standard, | |
| 10-B | creating a reinforcing cycle (R1 loop) The push for the adoption of telehealth could increase the number of facilities adopting an interoperable telehealth standard or lead to the proliferation of | 362 |
| | incompatible standards | 363 |
| 10-C | The proliferation of incompatible telehealth standards actually increases the cost of adopting interoperable standards (R3 loop) due to health facility operations and structures coming to rely on incompatible | |
| | telehealth software | 364 |
| 10-D | The lack of a critical mass of health facilities operating on the same telehealth standard reduces benefits for | |
| | certain functions, such as health information exchange | 365 |
| 11.1 | Number of received reports of ADR | 378 |
| 11.2 | Number and ratio of pharmacists per 10,000 population | 381 |
| 11.3 | Number and ratio of assistant pharmacists per 10,000 | |
| | population | 382 |
| 11.4 | MoH medicine expenditure, 2008–2017 | 384 |
| 11.5 | Number of outpatient prescriptions received, | |
| | 2011–2017 | 385 |
| 11.6 | Export and import value of pharmaceutical products to Malaysia, 2013 and 2017 | 390 |
| 11-A | The registration and regulation of traditional medicines was in response to the adverse health impacts from the improper manufacture and use of traditional medicines and has successfully reduced poor practice and | |
| | consequent outcomes | 397 |
| 11-B | Regulation of traditional medicines creates costs to traditional medicine businesses, which some actors attempt to bypass (R1), creating a race to close | |
| | | |



| List of | Figures | xiii |
|---------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
| | regulation loopholes (B1) and enforce existing regulations (B2) | 398 |
| 11-C | Creating benefits for traditional medicine businesses for compliance with regulation can reward good actors and reduce attempts to bypass regulation | 400 |
| 12-A | The paradigm that affordable medical treatment should be a right has led to the creation of tools meant to limit the price of treatment (B1 loop). These tools have provided governments with important leverage to | 400 |
| 12-B | negotiate treatment prices with suppliers (B2 loop). Reliance on the private sector for developing treatment solutions creates a competing paradigm that distrusts interference with market mechanisms (R1 loop). This paradigm undermines the availability of price control | 434 |
| | tools (B3 loop). | 435 |
| 12-C | Advocates for market-driven development of medical products have pushed for trade agreements, IPR protection and the use of political pressure and sanctions that increase the risk of using price control tools to limit government actions to control treatment prices (B4 loop). For governments to successfully utilise these tools, they must take a variety of actions to | |
| | mitigate against these risks. | 435 |
| 13.1 | The WHO health system framework | 450 |
| 13.2 | Proposed revised layout of the WHO building blocks depicted in Figure 13.1 | 466 |
| 14.1 | The health systems in society model contains eight linkages that form the macro-level feedback loops that shape the health system and its component building | |
| | blocks | 482 |



Tables

| 2.1 | The bathtub metaphor | page | 21 |
|-----|-------------------------------------------------------|------|----|
| 3.1 | Human development, Malaysia, 1970–2015 | | 34 |
| 3.2 | Changes in poverty, urbanisation, safe deliveries and | d | |
| | infant mortality, Malaysia, 1960-1980 | | 39 |
| 3.3 | Epidemiological transition and causes of death, | | |
| | peninsular Malaysia, 1982-1990 | | 42 |
| 3.4 | Changes in poverty, urbanisation, safe deliveries and | d | |
| | infant mortality, Malaysia, 1980-2000 | | 44 |
| 3.5 | Infant mortality, poverty and rural living, Malaysia, | , | |
| | 2000 | | 45 |
| 3.6 | Changes in poverty, urbanisation, safe deliveries and | d | |
| | infant mortality, Malaysia, 2000-2016 | | 49 |
| 3.7 | Life expectancy by sex and years of age, Malaysia, | | |
| | 1999 and 2017 | | 51 |
| 3.8 | Burden of disease and injury, Malaysia, 2014 | | 52 |
| 3.A | Gross domestic product growth, Malaysia, 1960– | | |
| | 2017 | | 58 |
| 3.B | Gross domestic product by industry, Malaysia, 1961 | 1– | |
| | 2017 | | 58 |
| 3.C | Employment by industry, Malaysia, 1970–2017 | | 59 |
| 3.D | Poverty in Malaysia, 1970–2016 | | 59 |
| 3.E | Population growth, Malaysia, 1960–2017 | | 60 |
| 3.F | Population by ethnic group, Malaysia, 1957–2010 | | 60 |
| 3.G | Fertility and life expectancy, Malaysia, 1960–2017 | | 61 |
| 3.H | Age distribution of the population of Malaysia, 1957 | 7_ | |
| | 2017 | | 61 |
| 3.I | Dependency rates, Malaysia, 1957–2017 | | 62 |
| 3.J | Urban population, Malaysia, 1960–2017 | | 62 |
| 3.K | Number of people per doctor, Malaysia, 1964–2016 | 6 | 63 |
| 3.L | Number of people per nursing personnel, Malaysia, | | |
| | 1964–2016 | | 63 |

xiv



More Information

| List of T | ables | XV |
|------------|--------------------------------------------------------|------|
| 4.1 | Health indicators in Malaysia, 1957–1990 | 67 |
| 4.2 | Rural Health Services and notional staffing pattern | 69 |
| 4.3 | Number of rural health facilities in Peninsular | 07 |
| | Malaysia | 70 |
| 4.4 | Percentage of institutional deliveries and | , 0 |
| | immunisation coverage, 1970–1990 | 73 |
| 4.5 | Gaps and challenges and action taken in integrating | |
| | preventive and curative services | 83 |
| 4.6 | Quality monitoring and improvement: examples of | |
| | experiences in primary care | 86 |
| 4.7 | Top three reasons for encounters in public and private | |
| | clinics | 88 |
| 4.8 | Access to and satisfaction with primary care | 90 |
| 4.9 | Doctors reporting involvement in health promotion | |
| | during routine patient encounters | 90 |
| 4.10 | Referral experiences reported by doctors | 91 |
| 4.11 | Clinical outcomes for the management of diabetes and | |
| | hypertension | 91 |
| 4-a | Problems encountered by GPs who had contracts with | |
| | MCOs | 111 |
| 5.1 | Regional disparity in secondary care in different | |
| | regions of Malaysia, 1972 | 122 |
| 5.2 | Increased availability of specialist care in MoH | |
| | hospitals, 1970–1997 | 125 |
| 5.3 | Laboratory services increased in sophistication in | |
| | tandem with the availability of specialist clinicians | 125 |
| 5.4 | Rapid growth of private hospitals, 1980–1996 | 127 |
| 5.5 | Distribution of high-cost imaging technology in MoH | 4.00 |
| | and private hospitals, 1997 | 128 |
| 5.6 | Referral experiences reported by doctors in public | 420 |
| | sector health centres | 138 |
| 5.7 | Cataract surgery profiles, 2002 and 2015 | 140 |
| 5.8 | Expenditure on and utilisation of public and private | 4.40 |
| 5 0 | hospitals, 2012 and 2017 | 143 |
| 5.9 | Client satisfaction with hospital services | 144 |
| 5.10 | Selected medical technology in hospitals, 2011 | 144 |
| 5.11 | Sources of funds in the private sector, Malaysia, 2012 | 145 |
| | and 2017 | 145 |



Frontmatter
More Information

xvi List of Tables

| 5-a | Interaction of forces that shaped the evolution of STC | |
|-----|--------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| | during the 1960s and 1970s | 155 |
| 5-b | STC services: interaction of forces that shaped the | |
| | evolution during the 1980s and 1990s | 160 |
| 5-A | Haemodialysis in Malaysia: prevalence, 1990–2015 | 166 |
| 5-B | Dialysis: price pre-treatment | 169 |
| 5-C | Dialysis: financing by sector | 169 |
| 6.1 | Examples illustrating key features in the spectrum of | |
| | Malaysian vertical disease control approaches that | |
| | subsequently merged with mainstream health services | 177 |
| 6.2 | Percentage coverage of immunisation in Malaysia, | |
| | 1970–2017 | 184 |
| 6.3 | Infant and child mortality rates, 1957–2017 | 184 |
| 6.4 | Prevalence of selected NCD risk factors in Malaysia | |
| | for adults aged ≥18 years, 1996–2015 | 186 |
| 6.5 | Incidence rate of emerging and re-emerging | |
| | communicable diseases (per 100,000 population) | 187 |
| 6.6 | Illustrative examples of the rapid emergence of and | |
| | varied challenges posed by emerging diseases in | |
| | Malaysia | 188 |
| 6.a | Ten principal causes of admissions and deaths, 1960, | |
| | 1974 and 1996 | 202 |
| 6.b | Infant and child mortality rates, 1957–2017 | 203 |
| 6.c | National disease control programmes | 204 |
| 7-A | Comparison of scope of services before and after | |
| | privatization | 248 |
| 8.1 | Summary of interacting influences on the evolution of | |
| | the health workforce, 1960s and 1970s | 255 |
| 8.2 | Production of allied health personnel (selected | |
| | categories), 1956–1995 | 257 |
| 8.3 | Evolution of the composition of the health workforce | |
| | (selected categories) 1955–2015 | 258 |
| 8.4 | Selected health staff, utilisation rates and health | |
| | outcomes | 260 |
| 8.5 | Summary of interacting influences on the evolution of | |
| | the health workforce, 1980s and 1990s | 262 |
| 8.6 | Profile of health worker training programmes | 264 |
| 8.7 | Number of people per doctor and per nursing staff, | |
| | 1970–2000 | 267 |



More Information

Cambridge University Press & Assessment 978-1-108-94967-5 — Systems Thinking Analyses for Health Policy and Systems Development Edited by Jo. M. Martins , Indra Pathmanathan , David T. Tan , Shiang Cheng Lim , Pascale Allotey Frontmatter

| List of Tables | | xvii |
|----------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
| 8.8 | Access to health facility (with doctor, medical assistant or community nurse) | 269 |
| 8.9 | Summary of interacting influences and the evolution of | |
| | the health workforce, 2000s and 2010s | 272 |
| 8.10 | ± ± | |
| | governance mechanisms | 281 |
| 8-A | Rapid increase in medical schools and new medical | |
| | graduates | 296 |
| 9.1 | Total and per capita expenditure on health, Malaysia, 1997–2016 | 311 |
| 9.2 | Public and private health expenditure, Malaysia, | |
| | 1997–2017 | 314 |
| 9.3 | Licensed private health care facilities, Malaysia, | |
| | 2007–2017 | 320 |
| 11.1 | • • | 386 |
| 11.2 | | |
| | to Malaysia by product category, 2013–2017 | 391 |
| 12.1 | Differing imperatives influenced the system behaviour | |
| | in formulating health legislation | 412 |
| 12.2 | 1 0 7 | |
| | experience in introducing HPV immunisation | 418 |
| 12-A | | 437 |
| 12-B | 1 | 441 |
| 14.1 | Key linkages between building blocks in the case | |
| | studies | 477 |
| 14.2 | 1 | |
| | systems in the cultural adaptation template | 480 |
| 14.3 | Feedback loop types in the case studies | 486 |
| 14.4 | Feedback loop type frequencies in the case studies | 488 |



Boxes

| 2.1 | The Boyden criteria | page 19 |
|-----|------------------------------------------------------------|---------|
| 2.2 | Systems thinking principles for health system | |
| | improvement | 25 |
| 4.1 | Excerpts from the Declaration of the Alma Ata | |
| | International Conference on Primary Health Care, | |
| | September 1978 | 66 |
| 4.2 | Key strategies that advanced PHC in Malaysia | 70 |
| 4.3 | The role of NGOs in a health system dominated by the | |
| | public sector | 75 |
| 4.4 | Influence of other health system components on PHC: | |
| | summary of illustrative examples | 79 |
| 4.5 | The journey towards integration | 82 |
| 4.6 | Dimensions of quality that were monitored and improved | d 85 |
| 4.7 | What are GPs? | 87 |
| 4.8 | System observations: when systems outcomes diverge | |
| | from stated goals | 88 |
| 4.9 | System observations: overcoming limits to growth | 93 |
| 4-A | Reviewed approach of PHC: wellness, illness, support | |
| | services and emergency information (REAP-WISE) | 102 |
| 5.1 | Why were hospitals concentrated in the West Coast state | s |
| | during colonial days? | 117 |
| 5.2 | Secondary care–supported PHC | 120 |
| 5.3 | Illustrative examples: STC-supported public health | 121 |
| 5.4 | System observations: shifting the healthcare burden to the | e |
| | private sector | 129 |
| 5.5 | Key features of the QAP for secondary and tertiary | |
| | healthcare services in the public sector | 131 |
| 5.6 | Further initiatives strengthened STC support for PHC | 134 |
| 5-A | Key features in the rapid expansion of dialysis | 168 |
| 6.1 | The major communicable diseases of concern in Malaysia | a |
| | (1960s to mid-1980s) | 174 |

xviii



More Information

| List of Boxes | | xix |
|---------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 6.2 | The role of the IMR in vaccine production and diagnostic services | 183 |
| 6.3 | System observations: understanding feedback loops | |
| | through communicable diseases | 185 |
| 6.4 | National committee/task force/strategic plan/policy | 192 |
| 6.5 | Examples of integration of disease prevention and control activities (prevention, early detection, management and | |
| | treatment) in PHC clinics | 194 |
| 6.6 | Key milestones in the evolution of responses to emerging communicable diseases | 195 |
| 6.7 | System observations: considering feedback loops in | |
| | behavioural change | 196 |
| 6-A | Harm reduction principles and strategies | 211 |
| 6-B | Key involvement by the MAC in the government's | |
| | adoption of harm reduction strategies | 214 |
| 7.1 | System observations: cross-boundary problems | 224 |
| 7-A | Details of the BAKAS approach | 238 |
| 7-B | Leadership and commitment of state public health | |
| | engineers | 239 |
| 8.1 | Key features of the rapid production of allied health | |
| | personnel | 256 |
| 8.2 | System observations: stocks and flows of personnel | 261 |
| 8.3 | Examples of key initiatives to upgrade health staff | |
| | competencies during the 1980s and 1990s | 268 |
| 8.4 | Malaysian experiences on moving basic training of health | |
| | personnel from the health to the education sector | 274 |
| 8.5 | System observations: stocks and flows of personnel | 277 |
| 8.6 | Rapid and effective implementation of programmes | 277 |
| 8.7 | Governance structures (legislation, boards, registration and annual licensing) to ensure quality and safety of | |
| | practice of healthcare professionals | 279 |
| 8-A | The career pathway for doctors in Malaysia | 294 |
| 9.1 | Establishment of the MNHA | 308 |
| 9.2 | Sources of health care financing as captured in the | |
| | MNHA | 312 |
| 9.3 | Pre-payment and fund pooling features in health | |
| | financing sources | 316 |
| 9.4 | System observations: intuition and systems surprises | 317 |



More Information

| XX | | ist of Boxes |
|------|--------------------------------------------------------|--------------|
| 9.5 | Systems observations: interactions between modes o | f |
| | health financing and delivery | 325 |
| 10.1 | Health systems research provided information for | |
| | managerial decision-making | 345 |
| 10.2 | System observations: closing the feedback loop to | |
| | improve data collection | 350 |
| 10.3 | System observations: use of health information for sin | ngle- |
| | and double-loop learning | 351 |
| 11.1 | Legislation to safeguard the people vis-à-vis medical | |
| | products | 368 |
| 11.2 | Management of the flow of medicines in the MoH sys | stem |
| | to ensure uninterrupted supply at the front line | 370 |
| 11.3 | Landmarks in developing institutional capacity for | |
| | oversight of pharmacy and pharmaceutical trade | 371 |
| 11.4 | System observations: path dependency in dispensing | |
| | practices | 383 |
| 11.5 | • | |
| | international system for drug development and publ | |
| | good | 389 |
| 11-A | Usage and popularity of traditional and complement | • |
| | medicines (T&CM) | 396 |
| | Reflection on leadership in Malaysia's health sector | 415 |
| | System observations: attempts to bridge silos | 423 |
| | System observations: systems perspectives on leaders | - |
| | development | 424 |
| | Essential vocabulary regarding rules governing | |
| | international trade of medicines | 433 |
| 12-B | Relevant quotes | 440 |



Biographies of Editors and Contributors

The twenty-member editorial-cum-authors team that designed and produced this innovative and insightful view of health systems have an interesting mix of talents. They have professional backgrounds in public health, economics, social science, engineering, mathematics, systems thinking, medical sciences, and pharmaceuticals. Together, they combine insights gained during decades of personal experience of working in and managing national programmes in the Malaysian health system with a breadth of vision acquired through international public health work and the scientific rigour of academic publications. In delightful contrast to most publications in this field, the editors of this book guided active and iterative interaction between the authors, and between the authors and a wide range of Malaysian stakeholders. This process enriched and deepened the understanding of the workings of health systems.

The team consists of four categories, namely:

- Editorial team. The editorial team designed the parameters of the book, guided the chapter authors, reviewed the chapters, and derived key messages for all chapters. Most members of the team also authored one or more chapters.
- Lead authors for chapters.
- Lead authors for case studies.
- Co-authors for chapters or case studies.

Editorial Team cum Lead Authors for One or More Chapters

Jo. M. Martins

Professor (adjunct), International Medical University, Malaysia Jo. M. Martins was a senior finance officer in a large corporation before entering public service in Australia. His work has included the design and implementation of community health services and the rationalisation of hospital services in Australia. He has been an advisor and

xxi



978-1-108-94967-5 — Systems Thinking Analyses for Health Policy and Systems Development Edited by Jo. M. Martins , Indra Pathmanathan , David T. Tan ,

Shiang Cheng Lim, Pascale Allotey

Frontmatter

More Information

Biographies of Editors and Contributors

xxii

consultant to the World Health Organization. He was a task manager for health projects for the World Bank, including the first World Bank–funded health project in Malaysia. He has held professorial positions and continues his association with university teaching and research in Australia and at the International Medical University in Malaysia. He is an assistant editor of the *Asia Pacific Journal of Health Management* and the author/editor of books, book chapters, peer reviewed articles, and official reports.

Indra Pathmanathan

Principal Visiting Fellow, International Institute of Global Health, United Nations University, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

ORCID ID: 0000-0003-4781-2199

Indra Pathmanathan has fifty years' experience as a public health specialist. Working initially in Malaysia in academia, research, education of health personnel, and managing health programmes, she witnessed at first hand many of the key milestones cited in this book and took a lead role in establishing national programmes for health systems research and quality assurance. Her international experience includes consulting in health systems research for the World Health Organization, Geneva, to support programmes in several countries; serving in the World Bank, Washington, as team leader for reproductive health in the South Asia region; and evaluating health policies and programmes in Bangladesh, Ethiopia, and Sri Lanka. She has authored several books and peer-reviewed papers.

David Tat Ui Tan

United Nations Development Programme, Head of Experimentation ORCID ID: 0000–0003-4820–2878

David Tan uses systems thinking for transdisciplinary research, organisational learning and development, and co-creation of narratives. He is currently with United Nations Development Programme Accelerator Labs, bringing innovation, learning, and safe-to-fail experiments to the development process. Prior to this, he was a health policy researcher at the United Nations University International Institute for Global Health studying health systems and the health-urban development interface.

Shiang Cheng Lim

Strategic Programme Manager and Monitoring, Research and Evaluation Lead, RTI International (Malaysia Office)

Shiang Cheng Lim is an applied researcher with more than fifteen years of research and programme experience in solving practical



978-1-108-94967-5 — Systems Thinking Analyses for Health Policy and Systems Development Edited by Jo. M. Martins, Indra Pathmanathan, David T. Tan,

Shiang Cheng Lim, Pascale Allotey

Frontmatter

More Information

Biographies of Editors and Contributors

xxiii

interdisciplinary problems in the field of global health, especially in areas related to sexual and reproductive health (SRH), abortion, HIV, gender-based violence (GBV), ageing, cognitive function and impairment, non-communicable diseases (NCDs), and health systems. Her research largely focuses on how complex contextual factors influence people's health-related behaviour and decisions and how it can be improved through a multidimensional approach through health system strengthening, strategic partnership management, and participatory engagement.

Pascale Adukwei Allotey

Director, United Nations University, International Institute for Global Health (UNU-IIGH)

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-6942-5774

Pascale Allotey, as Director of UNU-IIGH, is interested in furthering the knowledge base in topics such as the application of systems thinking to improve understanding of health systems and increase the effectiveness of health policies globally. Her research over the last twenty-five years has focused on health equity, health and human rights, gender and social determinants of health, forced migration and marginalisation, sexual and reproductive health, infectious diseases, and non-communicable diseases. The engagement of communities in research and policy has been central to defining her areas of research. She has authored and edited several books and authored over 150 peer-reviewed articles.

Lead Authors for Other Chapters

David Christopher Ariam McCoy

Professor of Global Public Health and Director of the Centre for Global Public Health, Institute of Population Health Sciences, Queen Mary University of London

David McCoy is Professor of Global Public Health. He is Director of the Centre for Global Public Health in the Institute of Population Health Sciences at Queen Mary University of London. He qualified as a medical doctor from the University of Southampton and spent six years as a clinician in the UK and South Africa before entering a career in public health. Since returning to the UK, he has worked as a public health specialist in the NGO sector, academia, and the NHS.

Edward Barry Newell

Honorary Associate Professor, Fenner School of Environment and Society, the Australian National University, Canberra, Australia



978-1-108-94967-5 — Systems Thinking Analyses for Health Policy and Systems Development Edited by Jo. M. Martins , Indra Pathmanathan , David T. Tan ,

Shiang Cheng Lim, Pascale Allotey

Frontmatter

More Information

xxiv

Biographies of Editors and Contributors

Barry Newell is a physicist who focuses on the practical and theoretical aspects of policymaking in complex adaptive systems. He has a particular interest in the use of systems thinking to support effective cross-sector communication and adaptive policymaking in situations dominated by uncertainty. This work has led to the practical systems thinking and modelling approach called *Collaborative Conceptual Modelling* (CCM) that he has developed in collaboration with Katrina Proust. CCM is focused on putting systems thinking to work. He is co-author, with Robert Dyball, of the textbook *Understanding Human Ecology: A Systems Approach to Sustainability*.

Mukundan Sugunan Pillay

Managing Director, TSI Healthcare Sdn Bhd, Malaysia

Datuk Dr Mukundan Pillay is a civil engineer with additional qualifications (masters and doctorate) in public health. He was a pioneer public health engineer in the Ministry of Health, Malaysia, and had a key role in providing technical leadership for upgrading both rural and urban sanitation and water supply in the country. He became director of engineering services of the Ministry of Health Malaysia and then deputy director general of the ministry in charge of research and technical support. He was also a pioneer in contracting private sector entities to undertake functions previously confined to the public sector. He shared his experience internationally, serving as Senior Health Adviser with the WHO in Beijing and as Senior Health Specialist with the World Bank in Bahrain.

Chiu-Wan Ng

Professor of Public Health, University of Malaya, Malaysia ORCID: 0000–0002-7687–2310

Chiu-Wan Ng graduated in Medicine from the National University of Singapore and obtained her MPH in Health Systems Management and her PhD in Health Economics from the University of Malaya. Her main research interests include health systems, financing, and economics, in particular efforts to achieve universal health coverage in low- and middle-income countries in the Asia Pacific region. She is the Malaysian country investigator for the EQUITAP (Equity in Asia Pacific Health Systems) and GNHE (Global Network on Health Equity) research collaborations.

Thomas Paraidathathu

Executive Dean and Professor, Faculty of Health and Medical Sciences, Taylor's University, Malaysia



978-1-108-94967-5 — Systems Thinking Analyses for Health Policy and Systems Development Edited by Jo. M. Martins , Indra Pathmanathan , David T. Tan ,

Shiang Cheng Lim, Pascale Allotey

Frontmatter

More Information

Biographies of Editors and Contributors

XXV

ORCID: 0000-0002-8834-9623

Thomas Paraidathathu is a pharmacist with an MS and a PhD in Pharmacology/Toxicology. Serving in the Ministry of Health, Malaysia, Thomas worked initially as a hospital pharmacist and later in drug regulatory affairs, where he gained first-hand experience in building national capacity to improve the safety of medical and traditional products marketed in the country. Subsequently as an academic, he built human resource capacity and is currently an emeritus professor. He has been a member of the Pharmacy Board of Malaysia, council member and vice president of the Malaysian Pharmaceutical Society, and a founding member of the Malaysian Academy of Pharmacy.

Nuraidah binti Mohd Marzuki

Public Health Physician, Health Informatics Section, Planning Division, Ministry of Health Malaysia, Putrajaya, Malaysia

Nuraidah Marzuki is a public health physician with the Health Informatics Centre, Ministry of Health, Malaysia. She has more than fifteen years of experience in government-led e-health initiatives. She previously served at the e-Health Section, Planning Division as Project Manager for the Malaysia Health Information Exchange (MyHIX). She received her MBBS and graduated with a Doctorate in Public Health from the University of Malaya.

Lead Authors for Case Studies

Kuan Joo Lim

Retired public health officer

Kuan Joo Lim is a medical officer with a post-graduate qualification in public health, MPH (health planning). He served in the Ministry of Health for twenty-nine years and has experience in hospital management (public and private sectors), health planning, hospital planning, healthcare financing, health information including IT, quality assurance, training, research and disease control, and medical ethics. He served as a short-time consultant to the World Health Organization and the Islamic Development Bank.

Debbie Siru

Consultant

Debbie Siru has extensive experience in the field of environmental health, primarily in the areas of drinking water quality and medical waste management. She has personal experience in building national capacity in medical waste management in the public and private sectors



978-1-108-94967-5 — Systems Thinking Analyses for Health Policy and Systems Development Edited by Jo. M. Martins, Indra Pathmanathan, David T. Tan,

Shiang Cheng Lim, Pascale Allotey

Frontmatter

More Information

xxvi

Biographies of Editors and Contributors

in Malaysia. She has an MSc in Water and Environmental Management from the University of Warwick, UK, and was the first person outside the US to obtain a Certificate in Healthcare Environmental Management from ECRI, USA. She has also been engaged by the World Health Organization on four separate occasions to provide consultancy on various aspects of environmental health.

Chee Han Lim

Senior Researcher, Third World Network

Chee Han Lim is a founding member of the Agora Society Malaysia, a senior researcher at the Third World Network, and formerly a senior analyst at the Penang Institute. He holds a PhD in Infection Biology from Hannover Medical School, Germany, an MSc in Immunology, and a BSc in Biotechnology from Imperial College London. Health and socio-economic policies are his current concerns. He believes that a nation can advance significantly if policymaking and research are taken seriously.

Other Contributors

Katrina Margaret Proust

Honorary Senior Lecturer, Fenner School of Environment and Society, the Australian National University

Katrina Proust has a background in environmental and applied history and complex social-ecological systems. Her work focuses on the historical factors and the feedback dynamics that shape relationships between humans and their environment. She is particularly interested in the interconnected systems that comprise urban communities. With Barry Newell she has developed *Collaborative Conceptual Modelling*, an approach to complex social-ecological issues that provides a conceptual framework to help a group undertake a systems project.

Safurah Jaafar

Professor of Community Medicine, International Medical University, Malaysia

ORCID ID: 0000-0001-6834-7885

Safurah Jaafar currently holds the position of Head of Division Family and Population Health and also Programme Director of the MBA in Healthcare Management at the International Medical University. She was instrumental in reforming PHC delivery in Malaysia, with an interest in safeguarding the equitable