

The First Vietnam War

Shawn McHale explores why the communist-led Resistance in Vietnam won the anticolonial war against France (1945–54), *except* in the South. He shows how broad swaths of Vietnamese people were uneasily united in 1945 under the Viet Minh Resistance banner, all opposing the French attempt to reclaim control of the country. By 1947, Resistance unity had shattered and Khmer-Vietnamese ethnic violence had divided the Mekong Delta. From this point on, the war in the south turned into an overt civil war wrapped up in a war against France. Based on extensive archival research in four countries and in three languages, this is the first substantive English-language book focused on southern Vietnam's transition from colonialism to independence.

Shawn F. McHale is Associate Professor of History and International Affairs, George Washington University. His first book, *Print and Power: Confucianism, Communism, and Buddhism in the Making of Modern Vietnam* (University of Hawaii Press, 2004), was a finalist for the Benda Prize in Southeast Asian Studies.

The First Vietnam War

*Violence, Sovereignty, and the Fracture
of the South, 1945–1956*

Shawn F. McHale

George Washington University, Washington DC



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-94107-5 — The First Vietnam War
Shawn F. McHale
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108941075

DOI: 10.1017/9781108936002

© Shawn F. McHale 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2021

First paperback edition 2023

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

ISBN 978-1-108-83744-6 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-94107-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	page vii
<i>List of Tables</i>	viii
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	ix
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xi
Introduction: Sovereignty, Violence, and Institutional Collapse at the Edge of France's Empire	1
Part I: Fracture, 1945–1947	
1 A Plural Mekong Delta under Stress	21
2 The Southern General Uprising	37
3 Priming Upheavals in the Mekong Delta	65
4 The Double Fracture of the Mekong Delta	94
Part II: Disassemblage/Reassemblage, 1947–1953	
5 Empire, Racial Survival, and Race Hatred	131
6 Contesting State and Sovereignty	153
7 Forced Migrations and Suffering	180
8 French Pacification Meets the Vietnamese Resistance	195
9 Alternative Trajectories: Seeing like Parastates, Militias, and Strongmen	235

vi Contents

Part III: Endgame, 1953–1956

10	The Twilight of Empire and the Strange Birth of South Vietnam	261
	<i>Bibliography</i>	281
	<i>Index</i>	300

Figures

1.1 The Mekong Delta in the mid-twentieth century	<i>page</i> 22
1.2 Provinces of southern Vietnam, 1945	30
4.1 Sites of Khmer-Vietnamese violence, 1945–7	99
4.2 Việt Minh, Cao Đài, and Hòa Hảo in the Mekong Delta, 1947	111
4.3 Cao Đài leader Phạm Công Tắc, 1948	112
4.4 Hòa Hảo leader Huỳnh Phú Sổ, circa 1940	112
5.1 Propaganda leaflet on “cooking” people black, 1952	132
9.1 Hòa Hảo militia leader Trần Văn Soái, April 14, 1955	238
9.2 Complexities of control in Long Xuyên province, 1953	255
9.3 Intermingled posts, Long Xuyên/Châu Đốc provinces, 1952	256
9.4 Village origin of Ba Cut’s soldiers, 1953	257

Tables

3.1 National origin of French regular soldiers	<i>page 70</i>
6.1 Transfer of functions of the French colonial state to Vietnam	169
7.1 Population of Saigon-Cholon by ethnic group, 1943–1951	184
7.2 Population of Mekong Delta provinces, 1943 and 1951	191
7.3 Rice production and exports, 1943/1944 and 1947/1948	192
8.1 French-led military forces in southern Vietnam, September/ October 1948	202
9.1 Hòa Hảo forces as of June 1, 1951	247

Acknowledgments

This book has been long in the making, and I have concluded its writing in the shadow of a global pandemic. My debts to individuals and institutions in the United States and around the globe are many. I was introduced to the study of Vietnam by professors Trương Bửu Lâm and Nguyễn Đăng Liêm. I would also like to thank those individuals who modeled a life of intellectual curiosity and inquiry, beginning with my father, Thomas McHale, continuing to Swarthmore College, with professors like Don Swearer, the eminent scholar of Theravada Buddhism, and on to graduate school, where I would single out Keith Taylor at Cornell.

I am grateful to the institutions that funded or hosted my work. This book would not have been possible without a Fulbright-Hays research fellowship from the US Department of Education, repeated summer funding from the Sigur Center for Asian Studies at George Washington University, and a sabbatical from the same university. The Center for Vietnamese and Southeast Asian Studies at Vietnam National University – University of Social Sciences and Humanities in Ho Chi Minh City hosted my research stay. Particular thanks to its director, Professor Trần Đình Lâm, PhD. I would also like to thank archivists at the Service Historique de la Défense (Vincennes), particularly Mme. Bertrand; the Archives Nationales d’Outre-Mer (Aix); The Vietnam National Archives-II (Ho Chi Minh City); and the Cambodian National Archives (Phnom Penh).

The *Journal of Vietnamese Studies* and the *Journal of Asian Studies* have both allowed me to reuse parts of articles I wrote for those eminent publications.

A wide range of scholars have helped me on particular parts of this book or shaped the whole. Two graduate students, Ron Leonhart and Ithi Sophonpanich (now deceased), carried out research for me in Cambodia and the United States. My greatest debt is to Chris Goscha, whose work on the First Indochina War has deeply influenced my own. Chris has also provided key sources, commented on the work, and even once provided a place to stay in Vincennes, France when I was carrying

x Acknowledgments

out research. Stathis Kalyvas's work has sharpened my understanding of the logic of civil war violence. Two anonymous reviewers gave superb and critical feedback on the manuscript. If I resisted a few of their suggestions, I have spent much time trying to address their concerns. For comments over the years that have shaped this book, or help on particular issues, I would like to thank, in no particular order, Tuong Vu, Li Tana, David P. Chandler, Philip Taylor, Liam Kelley, Christina Firpo, Ben Wilkinson, Eckard Michels, J  r  my Jammes, Pascal Bourdeaux, Fran  ois Guillemot, Haydon Cherry, Alasdair Bowie, Olga Dror, Hue Tam Ho Tai, Nguyễn Di  n, Phạm Quỳnh Phương, David MacKenzie, Nhung Tuyet Tran, Ed McCord, Châu Huy Ng  c, Patrick Gubry, Mike Montesano, and Charles Keith. (Given the controversies sure to be elicited by this work, I will not provide the names of some Vietnamese interlocutors, whom I thank profusely.) The maps were made by Richard Hinton and Chris Robinson. Lucy Rhymer, Emily Sharp, and the rest of the editorial and production staff at Cambridge University Press have shepherded this book from acquisition through to completion.

My spouse, Diane McHale, and children, Vanessa and Kate, have often interrupted my thinking about destruction and war. My heartfelt thanks!

Abbreviations

ANOM	Archives Nationales d’Outre-Mer
CP	Conseiller Politique
DRV	Democratic Republic of Vietnam
ECPAD	L’Établissement de Communication et de Production Audiovisuelle de la Défense, Ministère de la Défense (Ivry- sur-Seine, France)
HCI	Haut-Commissariat en Indochine
ICP	Indochinese Communist Party
NAC	National Archives of Cambodia (Phnom Penh, Cambodia)
NARA	National Archives and Records Administration (College Park Maryland, USA)
PTHNV	Phủ Thủ Hiến Nam Việt
RSC	Résidence Supérieure au Cambodge
SHD	Service Historique de la Défense (Vincennes, France)
SPCE	Service de Protection du Corps Expéditionnaire
UMDC	Unités Mobiles de Défense de la Chrétienté
VNA-II	Vietnamese National Archives (Ho Chi Minh City, Vietnam)