

More than a Massacre

More than a Massacre is a history of race, citizenship, statelessness, and genocide from the perspective of ethnic Haitians in Dominican border provinces. Sabine F. Cadeau traces a successively worsening campaign of explicitly racialized anti-Haitian repression that began in 1919 under the American Occupiers, accelerated in 1930 with the rise of Trujillo, and culminated in 1937 with the slaughter of an estimated twenty thousand civilians. Relatively unknown by contrast with contemporary events in Europe, the Haitian–Dominican experience has yet to feature in the broader literature on genocide and statelessness in the twentieth century. Bringing to light the massacre from the perspective of the ethnic Haitian victims themselves, Cadeau combines official documents with oral sources to demonstrate how ethnic Haitians interpreted their changing legal status at the border, as well as their interpretation of the massacre and its aftermath, including the ongoing killing and land conflict along the post-massacre border.

Sabine F. Cadeau is a research fellow for the Legacies of Enslavement project at the University of Cambridge. A historian of Latin America, the Caribbean, and the African diaspora, her research has been supported by the Andrew Mellon Foundation and the Woodrow Wilson Foundation.

Afro-Latin America

Series editors

George Reid Andrews, *University of Pittsburgh*
Alejandro de la Fuente, *Harvard University*

This series reflects the coming of age of the new, multidisciplinary field of Afro-Latin American Studies, which centers on the histories, cultures, and experiences of people of African descent in Latin America. The series aims to showcase scholarship produced by different disciplines, including history, political science, sociology, ethnomusicology, anthropology, religious studies, art, law, and cultural studies. It covers the full temporal span of the African Diaspora in Latin America, from the early colonial period to the present, and includes continental Latin America, the Caribbean, and other key areas in the region where Africans and their descendants have made a significant impact.

A full list of titles published in the series can be found at:
www.cambridge.org/afro-latin-america

More than a Massacre

Racial Violence and Citizenship in the Haitian–Dominican Borderlands

SABINE F. CADEAU

University of Cambridge



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-108-93152-6 — More than a Massacre
 Sabine F. Cadeau
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



CAMBRIDGE
 UNIVERSITY PRESS

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom
 One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
 314-321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India
 103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment,
 a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of
 education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108931526

DOI: 10.1017/9781108942508

© Sabine F. Cadeau 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions
 of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take
 place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

First published 2022

First paperback edition 2024

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication data

NAMES: Cadeau, Sabine F., 1980– author.

TITLE: More than a massacre : racial violence and citizenship in the Haitian-Dominican
 borderlands / Sabine F. Cadeau, University of Cambridge

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge ; New York : Cambridge University Press, 2022. |

SERIES: Afro-Latin America | Includes bibliographical references and index.

IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2021063052 (print) | LCCN 2021063053 (ebook) | ISBN

9781108837682 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108931526 (paperback) | ISBN

9781108942508 (epub)

SUBJECTS: LCSH: Haitians–Dominican Republic–History–20th century. | Dominican-
 Haitian Conflict, 1937. | Haiti–Relations–Dominican Republic. | Dominican
 Republic–Relations–Haiti. | Dominican Republic–Ethnic relations–History–20th century.
 | Political persecution–Dominican Republic–History–20th century. | Citizenship–Dominican
 Republic–History–20th century. | Haitians–Legal status, laws, etc.–Dominican Republic.
 | Trujillo Molina, Rafael Leónidas, 1891-1961. | Haiti–History–American occupation,
 1915-1934.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC F1938.5 .C337 2022 (print) | LCC F1938.5 (ebook) |

DDC 327.729407293–dc23/eng/20220126

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021063052>

LC ebook record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2021063053>

ISBN 978-1-108-83768-2 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-93152-6 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence
 or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this
 publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will
 remain, accurate or appropriate.

For my mother, Marie-Yvette Cantave-Cadeau

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>page</i> ix
<i>List of Maps</i>	xi
<i>List of Tables</i>	xiii
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xv
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	xix
Introduction	I
1 From Natives to Foreigners: Executive Order 372 and the Origins of Denationalization	59
2 The End of the Old Border: Ethnic Profiling, Discrimination, and Arrests in the Dominican Border Provinces, 1920–1936	88
3 Curses, Scuffles, and Public Disturbances: Eruptions of Popular Racism in the Premassacre Border Region	114
4 “They killed my entire family”: The 1937 Genocide	135
5 La campaña contra los Haitianos: Roundups, Concealment, and the Plan Behind the 1937 Genocide	164
6 The “Dominicanization” of the Border	187
7 Refugees and Land Conflict in the Postgenocide Haitian–Dominican Border Region	225
Epilogue: The Right to Have Rights: Migration, Race, and Citizenship in the Dominican Republic	255
<i>Appendix: Photographs</i>	271
<i>Bibliography</i>	275
<i>Index</i>	289

Figures

5.1 <i>Cédula</i> of Eliseo Alcantara, issued 1932, confiscated 1939	<i>page</i> 181
5.2 <i>Cédula</i> of Arturo Gonzalez, issued 1933, confiscated 1939	181
A.1 Public market at San Juan de la Maguana, 1925	271
A.2 Spanish immigrants, 1926	272
A.3 Wounded massacre survivor, 1937	273

Maps

o.1 Hispaniola	<i>page</i> xx
o.2 The colonial boundary	45
o.3 The national boundary, circa 1900	46
o.4 The contemporary boundary, circa 1936	52

Tables

2.1 Arrests at Dajabón and Restauración from 1921 to 1936 by charge and by ethnicity	<i>page 93</i>
--	----------------

Acknowledgements

I owe a major debt to the survivors of the 1937 Haitian Massacre and their descendants, whose emphasis on more killings in the aftermath helped me to rethink the chronology and transformed my understanding of the entire event.

I have the deepest gratitude for the historians and mentors who have encouraged me from the inception of this project. Julie Saville has guided my career as a historian through her exemplary scholarship and mentorship. I have benefited enormously over the years from her invaluable comments on the manuscript and productive conversations on comparative histories of racial violence. Her command of slavery and postemancipation historiography made me see connections that were often not obvious to me. Dain Borges read several drafts of the manuscript and provided astute comments that pushed me to think again and again about the complexities of the US role and my analytical approach to race. I am also thankful for his good research and career advice. Stephan Palmié has a deep love of the Caribbean, and his questions led me to better investigate and imagine the social worlds and worldviews of my historical subjects. Graduate seminars on race and racism with Thomas Holt and Leora Auslander proved extremely beneficial for this book and my study of race. My time at Duke University's Haiti lab afforded me the excellent support and mentorship of Laurent Dubois, whose work has greatly influenced me.

My time as an agrarian studies fellow at Yale University helped this book grow in ways that I could not imagine. James Scott's advice on interviews with survivors and descendants encouraged me to take journeys that have given me profound respect and appreciation for not only

oral history but also intergenerational memory and the need for its incorporation in historical writing. I am grateful for his useful comments on two chapters. I was fortunate to present a chapter to the agrarian studies colloquium. I could not have asked for a more broad and comparative audience. Comparative questions linking the 1937 Genocide, land conflict, and Haitian–Dominican borderlands with other events in Europe, Asia, and Latin America further encouraged me to see this event in relation to other twentieth-century histories of racial violence and genocide. Timothy Lorek’s questions warned against Haitian exceptionalism, and Ian M. Miller and Shivi Sivaramakrishnan motivated me to dig deeper into the pre-1937 era. Anthony Acciavatti encouraged me to try to explain the 1937 Massacre to a more generalist academic and nonacademic audience. I presented the last chapter at the Rutgers Center for Historical Analysis. I thank Judith Surkis and Seth Koven for their insightful comments and insistence on the significance of this history for genocide studies. I also want to thank Divya Cherian for helping me to think comparatively about Asia and for the memorable discussion on impunity and the ethical implications of a genocide that went unpunished and relatively well obscured by its perpetrators.

Other friends and colleagues have taken the time to give me feedback on my work. I am very thankful to Alexandra Cornelius, who encouraged me to think hard about the intergenerational impact of the massacre. I am also grateful to the anonymous reviewers for Cambridge University Press for their detailed comments and helpful suggestions.

Michele Levy, the undergraduate professor who first introduced me to the literature on genocide, read the book and shared her many insights on the Balkan situation. I feel lucky to know people who have taken time to read my work. Christopher P. Todd, Richard Del Rio and Toussaint Losier have been supportive friends and colleagues and I continue to learn a great deal from our conversations on the practice of history and the variety of archival and institutional challenges of researching and writing sensitive histories. Their passion for the truth is contagious.

This book was unquestionably shaped by the contemporary context. This book raised questions about the reproduction of sensitive historical documents. I thank Deborah Malizia for giving me legal advice and for offering her brilliant reading of the law in order for me to publish my work in the most ethical way that I could.

The research and writing of many scholars provided the foundation upon which this work was built. I am thankful to Jean-Price Mars, Suzy Castor, Bernardo Vega, Eric Roorda, Richard Turits, Robin Derby, and

Acknowledgements

xvii

Edward Paulino. Some of my influences were also novelists, including Jacques Roumain, Jacques-Stéphen Alexis, Edwidge Danticat, Louis-Philippe Dalembert, and René Philoctète.

Many Dominican and Dominicanist scholars and archivists have helped me in a range of ways. In Santo Domingo, Frank Moya Pons facilitated my research and study through his devoted service to the Dominican Historical Academy. At the Dominican National Archive, Oscar Féliz, Elsa Rivera, Maribel Leonardo, Ingrid Surriel, Viterbo DeOleo, and Marino Pulinario were among a host of very helpful and friendly staff members who facilitated the core of this research. Ruahaidy Lombert was a passionate supporter of this research and made possible my oral history work at Dajabón and Restauración. I want to thank Matías Bosch for inviting me to the public event in Santo Domingo that he helped to organize on the 80th anniversary of the massacre. I am very grateful to Joseph Gonzalez and Ralph Magnus for their hospitality and kindness in Santo Domingo. I also thank Fernando Beaubrun, a very good friend, for sharing his roughly eighty years of first-hand historical experience and for decoding innumerable details of the Haitian-Dominican question. I am grateful to the people on the Haitian side of the border who made my oral history research possible. Maismy-Mary Fleurant, a descendant of refugees who is working to build a monument to commemorate the victims, helped guide my research in Ouanaminthe. His activism in the area gives me hope that there will be monuments to remember those who died and that this story will not be forgotten. Stevenson Pierre was a very helpful guide and travelled with me throughout the northern region. In the central border area Wilder German Pie and his family were particularly helpful. I am especially grateful to Carl Richardson Lacosiere who encouraged me to visit more places and to search for as many survivors and descendants as possible.

I have been very influenced by the work of Michel-Rolph Trouillot, whom I never had the opportunity to meet but whose massive presence continues to inform my historical questions. In Haiti I benefited greatly from long conversations with historian Jean-Alix René. Ongoing conversations with the journalist, teacher-activist, and community leader Jean-Lesly René have imprinted his words in this book a great deal. I do not know of anyone with a more encyclopedic and nuanced understanding of Haitian history. I remain inspired by his undying commitment to a vision of revolution and social change in Haiti. I am also especially grateful to him for his insight on Kreyòl translation and transcription.

Along with Jean-Lesly René, I would also like to thank Lunine Pierre-Jerome, Marc Prou, Lionel Hogu, Joel Theodat, Jean Forest Petit-Frère,

and others from the Haitian Creole Institute at the University of Massachusetts Boston. Ongoing participation in their program and the wider creolist academic community that they have helped to build have shaped my writing and research.

Hank Gonzalez's influence is deep in this work and his compelling theorization of marronage is for me still useful for understanding twentieth-century Caribbean history. I know that he is glad to see me complete this.

Leela, my first daughter, has already asked me about this story. I hope that Leela will see that she was part of the voyage and that she will treasure the videos of her meeting the survivors. The birth of Solèy-Yolette gave me the greatest inspiration to complete this book. They have been my greatest source of joy. Finally, I thank my entire family for their support throughout my life so far. I cherish the many research trips to Haiti that my father has helped me conduct over the years and the Haiti history books he collected for me. I also thank my caring grandmother Theodora Cantave and my aunts Gladys Cantave, and Margarete Cantave. My loving siblings Cynthia Cadeau, Sophia Cadeau, and Cheryl Cadeau remain close to me even when I am far away.

I dedicate this book to my mother Marie-Yolette-Cantave Cadeau, whose life and teachings remain a powerful force in my life.

Abbreviations

AGN	Archivo General de la Nación, Santo Domingo, Dominican Republic
DGM	Dirección General de Migración
EN	Ejército Nacional
exp.	exponente (item)
leg.	legajo (file)
n.d.	no date

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
 978-1-108-93152-6 — More than a Massacre
 Sabine F. Cadeau
 Frontmatter
[More Information](#)



MAP 0.1 Hispaniola.
 Source: Map generated by author and redrawn courtesy of Joe LeMonnier, <https://mapartist.com/>

