

Cambridge Elements =

Elements in the Philosophy of Mind edited by Keith Frankish The University of Sheffield

MENTAL ILLNESS

Tim Thornton
University of Central Lancashire





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA 477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia 314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108925020
DOI: 10.1017/9781108939836

© Tim Thornton 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-92502-0 Paperback ISSN 2633-9080 (online) ISSN 2633-9072 (print)

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Mental Illness

Elements in the Philosophy of Mind

DOI: 10.1017/9781108939836 First published online: May 2022

Tim Thornton
University of Central Lancashire

Author for correspondence: Tim Thornton, TThornton1@uclan.ac.uk

Abstract: The very idea of mental illness is contested. Given its differences with physical illnesses, is it right to count it, and particular mental illnesses, as genuinely medical as opposed to moral matters? One debate concerns its value-ladenness, which has been used by anti-psychiatrists to argue that it does not exist. Recent attempts to define mental illness divide both on the presence of values and on their consequences. Philosophers and psychiatrists have explored the nature of the general kinds that mental illnesses might comprise, influenced by psychiatric taxonomies such as the *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual* and the *International Classification of Diseases*, and the rise of a rival biological 'meta-taxonomy': the Research Domain Criteria (RDoC). The assumption that the concept of mental illness has a culturally invariant core has also been questioned. This Element serves as a guide to these contested debates.

Keywords: mental illness, classification, transcultural psychiatry, concept of disorder, looping kinds

© Tim Thornton 2022

ISBNs: 9781108925020 (PB), 9781108939836 (OC) ISSNs: 2633-9080 (online), 2633-9072 (print)



Contents

	Introduction	1
1	Mental Illness and Psychiatric Diagnosis	3
2	Philosophical Analyses of Mental Illness: Szasz, Kendell, and Boorse	12
3	Philosophical Analyses of Mental Illness: Wakefield, Fulford, and Pickering	20
4	Vindicating Kinds	30
5	Hacking on Looping or Interactive Kinds	43
6	Transcultural Psychiatry and Cultural Concepts of Distress	52
	Conclusions	65
	Further Reading	69
	References	71