

BRAZIL - CERTAIN MEASURES CONCERNING TAXATION AND CHARGES

Reports of the Panel

WT/DS472/R, Add.1 and Corr.1*, WT/DS497/R, Add.1 and Corr.1

*Adopted by the Dispute Settlement Body
 on 11 January 2019
 as Modified by the Appellate Body Report*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
1. INTRODUCTION	374
1.1 Complaints by the European Union and Japan	374
1.2 Panel Establishment and Composition	375
1.3 Panel Proceedings.....	376
1.3.1 General	376
1.3.2 Working procedures on Business Confidential Information (BCI).....	377
2. FACTUAL ASPECTS.....	377
2.1 General Description of Relevant Aspects of the Brazilian Tax System	377
2.2 The Measures at Issue	385
2.2.1 The Informatics programme	392
2.2.1.1 Introduction	392
2.2.1.2 Tax treatment.....	392
2.2.1.3 Product coverage	394
2.2.1.4 Eligible companies	394
2.2.1.5 Requirements for obtaining the tax treatment.....	395
2.2.1.6 Related memorandum.....	399
2.2.2 The PADIS programme.....	399
2.2.2.1 Introduction	399

* The corrections notified in WT/DS472/R/Corr/1 and WT/DS497/R/Corr.1 have been made in this report.

Reports of the Panel

	2.2.2.2	Tax treatment	400
	2.2.2.3	Product coverage.....	401
	2.2.2.4	Eligible companies.....	402
	2.2.2.5	Requirements for eligibility	403
	2.2.2.6	Related memorandum	405
2.2.3		The PATVD programme.....	406
	2.2.3.1	Introduction.....	406
	2.2.3.2	Tax treatment	406
	2.2.3.3	Product coverage.....	407
	2.2.3.4	Eligible companies.....	408
	2.2.3.5	Requirements for eligibility	408
	2.2.3.6	Related memorandum	410
2.2.4		The Digital Inclusion programme	410
	2.2.4.1	Introduction.....	410
	2.2.4.2	Tax treatment	410
	2.2.4.3	Product coverage.....	411
	2.2.4.4	Eligible companies.....	412
	2.2.4.5	Related memoranda.....	412
2.2.5		The INOVAR-AUTO programme.....	412
	2.2.5.1	Introduction.....	412
	2.2.5.2	Tax treatment	413
	2.2.5.3	Product coverage.....	416
	2.2.5.4	Beneficiaries	417
	2.2.5.5	Requirements for eligibility	418
	2.2.5.6	Monitoring system	430
	2.2.5.7	Related memorandum	431
2.2.6		The PEC programme.....	431
	2.2.6.1	Introduction.....	431
	2.2.6.2	Tax treatment	431
	2.2.6.3	Product coverage.....	432
	2.2.6.4	Eligible companies.....	432
	2.2.6.5	Requirements for eligibility	433
	2.2.6.6	Related memorandum	434
2.2.7		The RECAP programme	434
	2.2.7.1	Introduction.....	434
	2.2.7.2	Tax treatment	435
	2.2.7.3	Product coverage.....	435

		Brazil - Taxation
	2.2.7.4	Eligible companies 435
	2.2.7.5	Requirements for eligibility..... 436
	2.2.7.6	Related memorandum..... 437
3.		PARTIES' REQUESTS FOR FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS..... 438
4.		ARGUMENTS OF THE PARTIES 444
5.		ARGUMENTS OF THE THIRD PARTIES 444
6.		INTERIM REVIEW 444
	6.1	General Issues and Editorial Matters..... 444
	6.2	Provisions Pertaining to Developing Countries..... 446
	6.3	The Scope of the Parties' Requests for Review of the Interim Reports..... 446
	6.4	The "in-house" Argument..... 446
	6.5	Article 4.7 of the SCM Agreement..... 448
	6.6	Confidentiality of the Interim Reports..... 449
7.		FINDINGS 449
	7.1	Overview of the Measures and Claims, and the Panel's Order of Analysis 449
	7.1.1	The measures at issue 451
		7.1.1.1 The Panel's terms of reference..... 452
		7.1.1.2 The categories of products concerned by the various taxes at issue 455
	7.1.2	Overview of the relationship between the complaining parties' multiple claims 456
		7.1.2.1 Differences in scope between Articles III:2, III:4 and III:5 of the GATT 1994..... 457
		7.1.2.2 Differences in scope between Article III:4 of the GATT 1994, Article 2 of the TRIMs Agreement, and Article 3.1(b) of the SCM Agreement..... 459
	7.1.3	Order of analysis of the complaining parties' multiple claims 463
	7.2	Brazil's General Defences..... 464
	7.2.1	Whether the challenged programmes are outside the scope of Article III of the GATT 1994, Article 2.1 of the TRIMs Agreement, and Article 3.1(b) of the SCM Agreement, because they regulate production and not products..... 465

Reports of the Panel

7.2.2	Whether Article III:8(b) of the GATT 1994 exempts certain of the challenged measures from the disciplines of Article III of the GATT 1994 and related provisions	468
7.3	The ICT Programmes.....	475
7.3.1	Claims under Article III:2 of the GATT 1994	475
7.3.1.1	Introduction.....	475
7.3.1.2	Whether the products that are the subject of the challenged measures are "domestic products" in the sense of Article III of the GATT 1994, Article 2.1 of the TRIMs Agreement, and Article 3.1(b) of the SCM Agreement	479
7.3.1.3	Whether the imported and domestic products are "like products" within the meaning of Article III:2, first sentence	482
7.3.1.4	Whether imported products are "taxed in excess of" like domestic products, within the meaning of Article III:2, first sentence	490
7.3.1.5	Conclusion	499
7.3.1.6	Judicial economy with respect to Japan's claim under Article III:2, second sentence.....	500
7.3.2	Claims under Article III:4 of the GATT 1994	501
7.3.2.1	Claims with respect to the conditions for accreditation, certain calculations related to required R&D expenditures, and administrative burden under the ICT programmes.....	501
7.3.2.2	Claims with respect to the alleged imposition, under the terms of the PPBs, or similar requirements, of an obligation to use domestic inputs in the production of the incentivized products under the ICT programmes	519
7.3.2.3	Conclusion	539
7.3.3	Claims under Article III:5 of the GATT 1994	539
7.3.3.1	Introduction.....	539
7.3.3.2	The legal standard	540
7.3.3.3	Analysis by the Panel.....	541
7.3.3.4	Conclusion	545
7.3.4	Claims under Article 2.1 of the TRIMs Agreement.....	545

		Brazil - Taxation
	7.3.4.1	Introduction 545
	7.3.4.2	Whether the ICT programmes are trade-related investment measures within the meaning of the TRIMs Agreement..... 546
	7.3.4.3	Whether the ICT programmes are TRIMs that are inconsistent with Article III of the GATT 1994, and therefore inconsistent Article 2.1 of the TRIMs Agreement 549
	7.3.4.4	Conclusion..... 549
7.3.5		Claims under Article 3.1(b) of the SCM Agreement 550
	7.3.5.1	Introduction 550
	7.3.5.2	Whether the tax exemptions, reductions and suspensions granted under the ICT programmes are contingent upon the use of domestic over imported goods within the meaning of Article 3.1(b) of the SCM Agreement and thus prohibited 553
	7.3.5.3	Whether the tax exemptions, reductions and suspensions granted under the ICT programmes constitute subsidies within the meaning of the SCM Agreement 555
	7.3.5.4	Whether the subsidies granted under the ICT programmes are specific within the meaning of Article 2 of the SCM Agreement 595
	7.3.5.5	Conclusion..... 596
7.3.6		Brazil's invocation of Article XX(a) of the GATT 1994 to justify certain inconsistencies in respect of the PATVD programme 597
	7.3.6.1	Introduction 597
	7.3.6.2	Description of the legal test..... 599
	7.3.6.3	Whether the discriminatory aspects of the PATVD programme are provisionally justified under Article XX(a) 610
	7.3.6.4	Whether the discriminatory aspects of the PATVD programme satisfy the requirements of the chapeau of Article XX..... 634
	7.3.6.5	Conclusion..... 634
7.4		The INOVAR-AUTO Programme 635

 Reports of the Panel

7.4.1	Claims under Article III:2 of the GATT 1994	635
7.4.1.1	Introduction.....	635
7.4.1.2	Reduced IPI tax rates	637
7.4.1.3	Presumed IPI tax credits	639
7.4.1.4	Article III:2, second sentence, of the GATT 1994.....	652
7.4.2	Claims under Article III:4 of the GATT 1994	652
7.4.2.1	Introduction.....	652
7.4.2.2	Whether the measures at issue are laws, regulations, or requirements affecting the internal sale, offering for sale, purchase, transportation, distribution or use of domestic and imported products	654
7.4.2.3	Whether the relevant imported and domestic products are "like products".....	656
7.4.2.4	Whether imported products are accorded "treatment less favourable" than that accorded to like domestic products.....	659
7.4.2.5	Conclusion	674
7.4.3	Claims under Article III:5 of the GATT 1994	674
7.4.3.1	Introduction.....	674
7.4.3.2	The legal standard	675
7.4.3.3	Analysis by the Panel.....	675
7.4.3.4	Conclusion	677
7.4.4	Claims under Article 2.1 of the TRIMs Agreement.....	677
7.4.4.1	Introduction.....	677
7.4.4.2	Whether the INOVAR-AUTO programme is a trade-related investment measure within the meaning of the TRIMs Agreement	679
7.4.4.3	Whether the INOVAR-AUTO programme is a TRIM that is inconsistent with Article III of the GATT 1994, and therefore inconsistent Article 2.1 of the TRIMs Agreement	679
7.4.4.4	Conclusion	680
7.4.5	Claims under Article 3.1(b) of the SCM Agreement.....	680
7.4.5.1	Introduction.....	680

7.4.5.2	Whether the reductions through presumed tax credits granted under the INOVAR-AUTO programme are contingent upon the use of domestic over imported goods within the meaning of Article 3.1(b) of the SCM Agreement, and thus prohibited	682
7.4.5.3	Whether the reductions through presumed tax credits granted under the INOVAR-AUTO programme constitute subsidies within the meaning of the SCM Agreement	684
7.4.5.4	Whether the subsidies granted under the INOVAR-AUTO programme are specific within the meaning of Article 2 of the SCM Agreement.....	689
7.4.5.5	Conclusion.....	690
7.4.6	Brazil's invocation of Article XX of the GATT 1994 to justify certain inconsistencies in respect of the INOVAR-AUTO programme.....	690
7.4.6.1	Introduction.....	690
7.4.6.2	Whether the discriminatory aspects of the INOVAR-AUTO programme are justified under Article XX(b) of the GATT 1994	691
7.4.6.3	Whether the discriminatory aspects of the INOVAR-AUTO programme are justified under Article XX(g)	718
7.4.7	Claims under Article I:1 of the GATT 1994	731
7.4.7.1	Introduction.....	731
7.4.7.2	Whether the tax reductions under Articles 21 and 22(I) of Decree 7,819/2012 fall within the scope of Article I:1 of the GATT 1994	734
7.4.7.3	Whether the relevant products at issue are "like" products.....	735
7.4.7.4	Whether the tax reductions at issue confer an "advantage".....	738
7.4.7.5	Whether that advantage is not accorded "immediately" and "unconditionally" to other WTO Members	740
7.4.7.6	Conclusion.....	740
7.4.8	Brazil's justifications under the Enabling Clause	740
7.4.8.1	Introduction.....	740

Reports of the Panel

	7.4.8.2	The burden of invoking the Enabling Clause.....	744
	7.4.8.3	Brazil's affirmative defence under paragraph 2(b) of the Enabling Clause	749
	7.4.8.4	Brazil's affirmative defence under paragraph 2(c) of the Enabling Clause.....	759
	7.4.8.5	Separate opinion on Brazil's affirmative defence under paragraph 2(c) of the Enabling Clause	766
7.5		The PEC and RECAP programmes.....	767
	7.5.1	Claims under Article 3.1(a) of the SCM Agreement.....	767
	7.5.1.1	Overview.....	767
	7.5.1.2	Whether the tax suspensions granted under the PEC and RECAP programmes constitute subsidies within the meaning of the SCM Agreement	771
	7.5.1.3	Whether the subsidies granted under the PEC and RECAP programmes are specific within the meaning of Article 2 of the SCM Agreement	797
	7.5.1.4	Whether the tax suspensions granted under the PEC and RECAP programmes are contingent upon export performance within the meaning of Article 3.1(a) of the SCM Agreement and thus prohibited.....	797
	7.5.1.5	Conclusion	801
7.6		Final Comments	801
8.		CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	802
	8.1	Complaint by the European Union (DS472).....	802
	8.2	Complaint by Japan (DS497).....	805
9.		APPENDIX TO THE PANEL REPORT	808

LIST OF ANNEXES

ANNEX A

WORKING PROCEDURES OF THE PANEL

Contents		Page
Annex A-1	Working Procedures of the Panel	953
Annex A-2	Additional Working Procedures of the Panel Concerning Business Confidential Information	960
Annex A-3	Joint working procedures of the Panels	961
Annex A-4	Additional Joint Working Procedures of the Panels Concerning Business Confidential Information	968

ANNEX B

ARGUMENTS OF THE PARTIES EUROPEAN UNION

Contents		Page
Annex B-1	First part of the executive summary of the arguments of the European Union	970
Annex B-2	Second part of the executive summary of the arguments of the European Union	986

Reports of the Panel

JAPAN

Contents		Page
Annex B-3	First part of the executive summary of the arguments of Japan	1007
Annex B-4	Second part of the executive summary of the arguments of Japan	1023

BRAZIL

Contents		Page
Annex B-5	First part of the executive summary of the arguments of Brazil	1039
Annex B-6	Second part of the executive summary of the arguments of Brazil	1056

ANNEX C

ARGUMENTS OF THE THIRD PARTIES

Contents		Page
Annex C-1	Executive summary of the arguments of Argentina	1070
Annex C-2	Executive summary of the arguments of Australia	1082
Annex C-3	Executive summary of the arguments of Canada	1084
Annex C-4	Executive summary of the arguments of Korea	1086
Annex C-5	Executive summary of the arguments of Ukraine	1089
Annex C-6	Executive summary of the arguments of the United States	1091