

HUMAN AND NON-HUMAN TARGETS IN ARMED CONFLICTS

What norms apply to the determination of lawful targets? What persons and objects may be lawfully targeted in armed conflict? What are the reasons, both legal and extra-legal, of civilian losses? What principles must be observed when attacking military objectives? How can the protection of persons who are not participating in hostilities can be strengthened? Is it possible to develop a consistent approach to targeting in armed conflict regardless of the legal qualification of the armed conflict? This monograph answers these questions and many more. Taking into account both military objectives and civilian objects, it considers the extent of their protection in a range of contexts, providing an essential source of reference for scholars dealing with issues across international humanitarian law and armed conflict.

Patrycja Grzebyk is Associate Professor at the University of Warsaw. She is a member of the Editorial Board of the ESIL Reflections and of the Journal of International Humanitarian Action, and the Director of the Network on Humanitarian Action.





Human and Non-Human Targets in Armed Conflicts

PATRYCJA GRZEBYK

University of Warsaw

Translated by
ANNA KONIECZNA-PURCHAŁA





CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108845625 DOI: 10.1017/9781108980272

© Patrycja Grzebyk 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ısвn 978-1-108-84562-5 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



Contents

List	List of Abbreviations po				
	Introd	luction	1		
1	Sources, Scope, and Application of the Law on Legitimate Targets in Armed Conflicts				
	1.1	Fragmentation of International Law on Legitimate Targets in Armed Conflict 1.1.1 International Humanitarian Law 1.1.2 International Human Rights Law 1.1.3 International Criminal Law Scope of International Humanitarian Law 1.2.1 Material Scope 1.2.2 Geographical Scope 1.2.3 Temporal Scope 1.2.4 Personal Scope Philosophy of Creation and Application of IHL 1.3.1 Humanity versus Military Necessity 1.3.2 Between Prohibition and Authorization to Use Force	44 55 100 155 177 177 244 260 277 31 31 34		
	1.4	 1.3.3 Equality Target Elimination 1.4.1 Definition of an Attack 1.4.2 Permissible Degree of Force 1.4.3 Restrictions on the Means and Methods of Warfare Used against Legitimate Targets 	36 38 38 40		
2	Hum	an Targets	47		
	2.1	Members of Armed Forces	50		

V



vi Contents

		2.1.1	International Conflict	۲O
		2.1.1	Non-International Conflict	50
	2.2		abers of Armed Law Enforcement Agencies	74 76
	2.2	2.2.1	International Conflict	76
		2.2.2	Non-International Conflict	77
	2.3		abers of Non-State Armed Groups	
	2.5	2.3.1	International Conflict	79 79
		2.3.2	Non-International Conflict	80
	2.4	Civil		87
		2.4.1	International Conflict	87
		2.4.2	Non-International Conflict	108
	2.5		abers of Peacekeeping Missions	110
		2.5.1	International Conflict	110
		2.5.2	Non-International Conflict	112
3	Non	-Huma	an Targets	114
	3.1	Gene	eral Definition of a Military Objective	117
		3.1.1	Contribution to Military Action	118
		3.1.2	Military Advantage	129
		3.1.3	Impact of Other Branches of Law on the Definition	
			of a Military Objective: The Case of Infrastructure	
			Used to Commit International Crimes	132
	3.2	Enur	neration of Military Objectives	134
		3.2.1	Command, Control, and Communications Centres	135
		3.2.2	Installations, Buildings, Materiel	149
		3.2.3	Lines of Communication	152
		3.2.4	Industry and Other So-Called Economic Targets	154
		3.2.5	Media	157
	3.3	Enur	neration of Civilian Objects	159
		3.3.1	Hospitals, Medical Units, Medical Transports	160
		3.3.2	Works and Installations Containing Dangerous	
			Forces	163
		3.3.3	Cultural and Religious Objects	165
		3.3.4	Objects Indispensable to the Survival of the Civilian	
			Population	170
		3.3.5	Schools, Houses, Dwellings	171
		3.3.6	Humanitarian Aid	173
		3.3.7	Natural Environment	175
		3.3.8	Undefended Localities and Other Protected Zones	177



		Contents	vii	
4	Problems in Lawful Target Elimination			
	4.1	Legal Reasons Behind Civilian Deaths	183	
		4.1.1 The Principle of Proportionality	183	
		4.1.2 Required Precautionary Measures	191	
		4.1.3 Prohibition of Reprisals	196	
	4.2	Extra-Legal Reasons Behind Civilian Deaths	199	
		4.2.1 Changing Nature of Armed Conflict	199	
		4.2.2 Protection of Troops	201	
		4.2.3 Vulnerability as Grounds for Targeting	204	
		4.2.4 Gender and Age	205	
		4.2.5 The Myth of Precise Weapons	207	
		4.2.6 Inaccurate Information	208	
5	Indi	vidual Criminal Responsibility for Violations of the Law		
	of Ta	argeting	210	
	5.1	Responsibility for Attacks against Persons	216	
	5.2	Responsibility for Attacks against Objects	224	
	5.3	Responsibility for Participation in Hostilities	230	
	Final	Remarks: Towards a Unified Approach to Target Selection	233	
Bib	liogra _l	bhy	242	
	Index			
			275	



Abbreviations

ACHR American Convention on Human Rights

AFLR Air Force Law Review

AfrChH&PR African Charter on Human and

Peoples Rights

AJIL American Journal of International Law

AL Army Lawyer

Am. Univ. Int. Law Rev. American University International Law

Review

Am. Univ. J. Int. Law Policy American University Journal of

International Law and Policy

AP I Protocol Additional to the Geneva

Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of

International Armed Conflicts

AP II Protocol Additional to the Geneva

Conventions of 12 August 1949, and relating to the Protection of Victims of Non-International Armed Conflicts Additional Protocols to the Geneva

APs Additional Protocols to the Geneva

Conventions for the Protection of

Victims of War of 1949

APYIHL Asia-Pacific Yearbook of International

Humanitarian Law

ArChHR Arab Charter on Human Rights
ASM Acta Societatis Martensis

ASP Assembly of States Parties of the Rome

Statute

viii



List of Abbreviations

ix

BII&CL British Institute of International and

Comparative Law

BYIL British Yearbook of International Law
CanYIL Canadian Yearbook of International

Law

CCW Convention on Prohibitions or

Restrictions on the Use of Certain Conventional Weapons Which May Be Deemed to Be Excessively Injurious or to Have Indiscriminate

Effects

Chi. J. Int'l L Chicago Journal of International Law
ChJIL Chinese Journal of International Law

CIA Central Intelligence Agency

CICR Comité International de la Croix-

Rouge

CILSA Comparative and International Law

Journal of Southern Africa

DJC&IL Duke Journal of Comparative and

International Law

Duke L. J. Duke Law Journal

ECHR Convention for the Protection of

Human Rights and Fundamental

Freedoms

ECtHR European Court of Human Rights
EJIL European Journal of International Law
ENMOD Convention on the Prohibition of

Military or Any Other Hostile Use of Environmental Modification

Techniques

EUChFR Charter of Fundamental Rights of the

European Union

Fla. J. Int'l L. Florida Journal of International Law
Ga. J. Int'l & Comp. L. Georgia Journal of International and

Comparative Law

GC I Convention for the Amelioration of the

Condition of the Wounded and Sick in

Armed Forces in the Field

GC II Convention for the Amelioration of the

Condition of Wounded, Sick and



x

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-84562-5 — Human and Non-Human Targets in International Armed Conflicts Patrycja Grzebyk Frontmatter More Information

List of Abbreviations

Shipwrecked Members of Armed

Forces at Sea

GC III Convention Relative to the Treatment

of Prisoners of War

GC IV Convention Relative to the Protection

of Civilian Persons in Time of War

GCs Geneva Conventions for the Protection

of Victims of War

GLJ German Law Journal

Hamline J. Pub. L. & Pol'y Hamline Journal of Public Law and

Policy

HC Hague Convention

HNSJ Harvard National Security Journal

Houst. Law Rev. Houston Law Review

HR Regulations concerning the Laws and

Customs of War on Land annexed to Convention respecting the Laws and

Customs of War on Land

I&CLQ International and Comparative Law

Quarterly

IAC(s) international armed conflict(s)

IACHR Inter-American Commission on

Human Rights

IACtHR Inter-American Court of Human

Rights

ICC International Criminal Court

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and

Political Rights

ICESCR International Covenant on Economic,

Social and Cultural Rights

ICJ International Court of Justice ICL International Criminal Law

ICRC International Committee of the Red

Cross

ICTR International Criminal Tribunal for

Rwanda

ICTY International Criminal Tribunal for

the former Yugoslavia

IDFLR Israel Defense Forces Law Review IED improvised explosive device



IHL.

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-84562-5 — Human and Non-Human Targets in International Armed Conflicts Patrycja Grzebyk Frontmatter

More Information

List of Abbreviations

International Humanitarian Law

IHLS International Humanitarian Legal

Studies

IHRLInternational Human Rights LawIILInstitute of International Law

IJHR International Journal of Human Rights

IL&PolInternational Law and PoliticsILCInternational Law CommissionILMInternational Legal MaterialsILRInternational Law ReportsILSInternational Law Studies

ILSSUSNWC International Law Studies Series US

Naval War College

ILYInternational Law YearbookIMTInternational Military TribunalIRRCInternational Review of the Red CrossISIS/ISILIslamic State of Iraq and Sham/Islamic

State of Iraq and the Levant

IsrLR Israel Law Review

IsrYHR Israel Yearbook on Human Rights
J. East Asia Int. Law. Journal of East Asia and

International Law

J. Transnat'l L. & Pol'y Journal of Transnational Law and

Policy

JC&SL Journal of Conflict and Security Law
JICJ Journal of International Criminal

Iustice

JIHLS Journal of International Humanitarian

Legal Studies

JL&CW Journal of Law and Cyber Warfare
JLIS Journal of Law, Information and

Science

JNSLP Journal of National Security Law and

Policy

LJIL Leiden Journal of International Law

LN League of Nations

LNTS League of Nations Treaty Series

Loy. U. Chi. Int'l L. Rev. Loyola University of Chicago

International Law Review

хi



xii List of Abbreviations

Md. J. Int. Law Trade Maryland Journal of International Law

& Trade

MelbJIL Melbourne Journal of International

Law

MICT Mechanism for International Criminal

Tribunals

Minn. L. Rev. Minnesota Law Review

ML&LWR Military Law and Law of War Review

MLR Military Law Review

MON Ministerstwo Obrony Narodowej

(Polish Ministry of Defence)

MPEPIL Max Planck Encyclopedia of Public

International Law

NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organization

Naval L. Rev. Naval Law Review

NCJIL&CR North Carolina Journal of International

 $Law\ and\ Commercial\ Regulation$

New Crim. L. Rev. New Criminal Law Review

NIAC(s) non-international armed conflict(s)
NSAI Non-State Actors and International Law

NSLB National Security Law Brief

NYT New York Times

NYU JILP New York University Journal of

International Law and Politics

OPIL Oxford Public International Law
ORIL Oregon Review of International Law
PCIJ Permanent Court of International

Justice

PGM precision-guided munition

PMC/PSC private military (security) company
Regent J. L. & Pub. Pol'y Regent Journal of Law and Public Policy
RIAA Reports of International Arbitral Awards

SCSL Special Court for Sierra Leone

Sing JICL Singapore Journal of International and

Comparative Law

TJCIL Tulsa Journal of Comparative and

International Law

TexILJ Texas International Law Journal



List of Abbreviations

xiii

TNOiK Towarzystwo Naukowe Organizacji

i Kierownictwa "Dom Organizatora"

(Publishing House)

U. Miami Int'l & Comp. L. Rev. University of Miami International and

Comparative Law Review

U. Tol. L. Rev.

UAV/UCAV

UNIVERSITY of Toledo Law Review
unmanned (combat) aerial vehicle
U.C. Davis J. Int'l L. & Pol'y

University of California Davis Journal

of International Law and Policy

UCLA JILFA University of California Los Angeles

Journal of International Law &

Foreign Affairs

UMNS&ACLR University of Miami National Security

and Armed Conflict Law Review

UN United Nations

UN GA General Assembly of the United Nations
UN SC Security Council of the United Nations
UN SG Secretary-General of the United

Nations

UNTS United Nations Treaty Series

UNWCC United Nations War Crimes

Commission

UPaJIL University of Pennsylvania Journal of

International Law

USAFAJLS United States Air Force Academy

Journal of Legal Studies

VCLT Vienna Convention on Law of Treaties
VirJIL Virginia Journal of International Law
WYAJ Windsor Yearbook of Access to Justice
Yale J. Int. Law Yale Journal of International Law
YIHL Yearbook of International Humanitarian

Law

YILC Yearbook of International Law

Commission

