#### Rethinking Liberty before Liberalism

Opening up new histories of freedom and republicanism, this book builds on Quentin Skinner's ground-breaking *Liberty before Liberalism* nearly twenty-five years after its initial publication. Leading historians and philosophers reveal the neo-Roman conception of liberty that Skinner unearthed as a normative and historical hermeneutic tool of enormous, ongoing power. The volume thinks with neo-Romanism to offer reinterpretations of individual thinkers, such as Montaigne, Grotius and Locke. It probes the role of neo-Roman liberty within hierarchies and structures beyond that of citizen and state – namely, gender, slavery and democracy. Finally, it reassesses the relationships between neo-Romanism and other languages in the history of political thought: liberalism, conservatism, socialism and the human rights tradition. The volume concludes with a major reappraisal by Skinner himself.

Hannah Dawson is Senior Lecturer in the History of Political Thought at King's College London. She is an expert on early modern thought and the history of feminism. Her previous publications include *Locke*, *Language and Early Modern Philosophy* (2007), *Life Lessons from Hobbes* (2013) and *The Penguin Book of Feminist Writing* (2021), as well as numerous scholarly articles. She is a regular contributor to radio, television and festivals.

Annelien de Dijn is Professor of Modern Political History at Utrecht University. She is the author of *French Political Thought from Montesquieu to Tocqueville* (2008) and *Freedom: An Unruly History* (2020) which was awarded the 2021 PROSE Prize in Philosophy by the American Association of Publishers.

# Rethinking Liberty before Liberalism

Edited by Hannah Dawson King's College London

Annelien de Dijn Utrecht University



Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-84456-7 — Rethinking Liberty before Liberalism Edited by Hannah Dawson , Annelien de Dijn Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

#### **CAMBRIDGE** UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05-06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108844567 DOI: 10.1017/9781108951722

© Cambridge University Press 2022

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

#### First published 2022

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Freedom: Liberalism, Republicanism and Beyond (Conference) (2017 : Amsterdam, Netherlands), author. | Dawson, Hannah, editor. | Dijn, Annelien de, 1977- editor.

Title: Rethinking Liberty before liberalism / edited by Hannah Dawson, Annelien de Dijn.

Description: Cambridge ; New York : Cambridge University Press, 2022. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2021024934 (print) | LCCN 2021024935 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108844567 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108948395 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108951722 (epub)

Subjects: LCSH: Skinner, Quentin. Liberty before liberalism–Congresses. | Liberty–Congresses. | Liberalism–Congresses. | Republicanism–Congresses.

Classification: LCC JC585 .F7417 2022 (print) | LCC JC585 (ebook) | DDC 320.01/1–dc23

LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021024934

LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2021024935

ISBN 978-1-108-84456-7 Hardback

ISBN 978-1-108-94839-5 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Cambridge University Press 978-1-108-84456-7 — Rethinking Liberty before Liberalism Edited by Hannah Dawson , Annelien de Dijn Frontmatter <u>More Information</u>

For Quentin

#### Contents

	List of Figures List of Contributors Acknowledgements	<i>page</i> ix x xii
	Introduction Hannah dawson and annelien de dijn	1
Pa	art I Authors	15
1	Freedom without Republicanism: The Case of Montaigne FELICITY GREEN	17
2	Hugo Grotius on Freedom of Will and Self-Government: Greek, Patristic, and Roman Legacies MARTIN VAN GELDEREN	38
3	Liberty before Licence in Locke HANNAH DAWSON	60
Part II Hierarchies		
4	Liberty and Hierarchy in Milton's Revolutionary Prose RACHEL FOXLEY	79
5	Democratic Republicanism in the Early Modern Period ANNELIEN DE DIJN	100
6	Gender, Liberty, Participation, and Virtue: What the Eighteenth Century Can Teach Us about Republicanism SANDRINE BERGÈS	117
7	Liberty, Death, and Slavery in the Age of Atlantic Revolutions, 1770s–1790s RENÉ KOEKKOEK	134

vii

viii	Contents	
Part III Traditions		155
8	Beyond the 'Wretched Subterfuge': Liberalism, Freedom, and Responsibility ERIC NELSON	157
9	'A Just and True Liberty': The Idea of (Neo-Roman) Freedom in Francophone Counter-Revolutionary Thought (c. 1780–1800) MATTHIJS LOK	178
10	Chains and Invisible Threads: Liberty and Domination in Marx's Account of Wage-Slavery BRUNO LEIPOLD	194
11	Neo-Roman Liberty in the Philosophy of Human Rights LENA HALLDENIUS	215
	Conclusion: On Neo-Roman Liberty: A Response and Reassessment QUENTIN SKINNER	233
	Bibliography Index	267 295

### Figures

- 2.1 The triumph of the freedom of conscience and religion over tyranny. The five female figures pulling the triumphal car represent the virtues of love, justice, fidelity, concord, and constancy. Drawing by Christoffel Pierson (1675). Photo courtesy of the Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam page 41
- 2.2 The Arminian shit-car, in a print from 1618, on the way to Rome. The hapless driver, seeking to steer the two horses representing discord, is Uytenbogaert (figure A). The sitters include Arminius as figure B, and, in the back of the car, Coornhert as figure H. Two Jesuits, marked as figures K, are their dodgy counselors and, right at the left side of the print, Oldenbarnevelt (marked as figure O) shows the way, holding a burning torch. The true Reformed Minister on the right side (figure M) refuses to get on board. Photo courtesy of the Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam
- 2.3 On Monday, 22 March 1621, Hugo Grotius hid himself in a chest. Instead of returning books, Grotius used the bookchest to escape from his prison. The designer of this image of the moment Grotius steps into the bookchest, assisted by his wife, who invented the plot, is Jacobus Buys. The printmaker is Reinier Vinkeles. The print is from the second half of the eighteenth century. Photo courtesy of the Rijksmuseum, Amsterdam

56

55

### Contributors

- SANDRINE BERGÈS is Associate Professor in Philosophy at Bilkent University in Ankara. Her publications include Sophie de Grouchy's Letters on Sympathy (with Eric Schliesser) (2019), The Wollstonecraftian Mind (with Eileen Hunt Botting and Alan Coffee) (2019), Women and Autonomy (with Alberto Siani) (2019), The Social and Political Philosophy of Mary Wollstonecraft (with Alan Coffee) (2017), A Feminist Perspective on Virtue Ethics (2015), and The Routledge Companion to Wollstonecraft's A Vindication of the Rights of Woman (2013).
- HANNAH DAWSON is Senior Lecturer in the History of Political Thought at King's College London. She is the author of Locke, Language, and Early-Modern Philosophy (Cambridge University Press, 2007) and Life Lessons from Hobbes (Pan Macmillan, 2013), as well as numerous scholarly articles. She is currently preparing her edition of Locke's Disputations on the Law of Nature for the Clarendon Edition of the Works of John Locke, and an anthology of feminist writing for Penguin Classics.
- ANNELIEN DE DIJN is the author of *Freedom: An Unruly History* (Harvard University Press, 2020) and *French Political Thought from Montesquieu to Tocqueville: Liberty in a Levelled Society* (Cambridge University Press, 2008). She is a professor of political and intellectual history at Utrecht University.
- RACHEL FOXLEY is Associate Professor of Early Modern History at the University of Reading. Her book, *The Levellers: Radical Political Thought in the English Revolution*, was published by Manchester University Press in 2013. Her current research is on the English republicans and the concept of democracy, and she has published widely on the English republicans of the 1650s.
- MARTIN VAN GELDEREN is Director of the Lichtenberg-Kolleg, the Göttingen Institute for Advanced Study in the Humanities and

X

List of Contributors

xi

Social Sciences, and Professor for European Intellectual History at the University of Göttingen, Germany.

- FELICITY GREEN is Senior Lecturer in History at the University of Edinburgh and the author of *Montaigne and the Life of Freedom* (Cambridge University Press, 2012).
- LENA HALLDENIUS is Professor of Human Rights Studies at Lund University. She works in political philosophy, feminism, and early modern political thought. Her publications include *Mary Wollstonecraft and Feminist Republicanism* (Pickering & Chatto, 2015).
- RENÉ KOEKKOEK is Assistant Professor of Political History at Utrecht University. He is author of *The Citizenship Experiment: Contesting the Limits of Civic Equality and Participation in the Age of Revolutions* (Brill, 2019) and the co-editor of *The Dutch Empire between Ideas and Practice*, 1600–2000 (Palgrave, 2019).
- BRUNO LEIPOLD is a Fellow in Political Theory at the London School of Economics and Political Science. He is currently writing a book, provisionally entitled *Citizen Marx: Republicanism, Communism and Capitalism*, which is under contract with Princeton University Press.
- MATTHIJS LOK is Senior Lecturer in Modern European History at the European Studies department at the University of Amsterdam. Recent publications include *The Politics of Moderation in Modern European History*, with Ido de Haan (Palgrave 2019), *Eurocentrism in European History and Memory*, with Marjet Brolsma and Robin de Bruin (Amsterdam University Press, 2019), and 'The Global Counter-Enlightenment' (*International Journal for History, Culture and Modernity*, special issue, 2019).
- ERIC NELSON is the Robert M. Beren Professor of Government at Harvard University. He is the author of several books, including *The Theology of Liberalism: Political Philosophy and the Justice of God* (Harvard/Belknap, 2019), *The Royalist Revolution: Monarchy and the American Founding* (Harvard/Belknap, 2014), and *The Hebrew Republic: Jewish Sources and the Transformation of European Political Thought* (Harvard/Belknap, 2010).
- QUENTIN SKINNER is the Barber Beaumont Professor of the Humanities at Queen Mary University of London. His most recent books are *Forensic Shakespeare* (Oxford University Press, 2014) and *From Humanism to Hobbes: Studies in Rhetoric and Politics* (Cambridge University Press, 2018).

#### Acknowledgements

The present volume has its origins in the conference 'Freedom: Liberalism, Republicanism and Beyond' organized in Amsterdam in May 2017 in honour of the twentieth anniversary of Quentin Skinner's Liberty before Liberalism. We thank everyone who came to that remarkable occasion - for dazzling papers, for brilliant questions, and for bringing such joy and mutuality beside the canals and underneath wooden eaves. We would like to express special thanks to Annabel Brett, who acted as a conference chair and whose own volume, Rethinking the Foundations of Modern Political Thought, co-edited with James Tully, provided inspiration for the present volume. We are indebted to Thijs Bogers and Rianne Haak, who helped with the practical organization of the workshop. We are grateful to the Vossius Center for the History of the Humanities and Sciences, and the Netherlands Institute for Advanced Study, which generously provided the funding that allowed us to organize this event in a city that has long prided itself on being a city of freedom.

This expansive and probing event raised so many new insights and questions that we felt an edited volume was in order, even if regrettably we were not able to include all the papers presented at the conference.

We are deeply grateful to Cambridge University Press, and especially to Liz Friend-Smith for supporting our project with such astuteness and compassion. For shepherding it through to publication, we thank Divya Arjunan, Elliot Beck, Ruth Boyes, Trent Hancock, Atifa Jiwa and Ian McIver. We benefitted hugely from the anonymous reports and take this opportunity to thank all reviewers in our beleaguered profession who give their time to this invaluable service. Heartfelt gratitude to Rhian Jones for her deft and thoughtful assistance in preparing the index and to her and Annefloor Robijn for their meticulous work collating the text. Deep thanks to King's College London, and to the Thijssen-Schoute Stichting, for providing us with the indispensable funds that enabled us to bring this idea to fruition in a pandemic.

#### Acknowledgements

xiii

And finally, we would like to thank each other. Collaborations in academia can go wrong, but much laughter and succour beamed between England and the Netherlands in the preparation of this book, tea at one end and beer at the other, and daughters all around.