

BLOOD THEOLOGY

The unsettling language of blood has been invoked throughout the history of Christianity. But until now there has been no truly sustained treatment of how Christians use blood to think with. Eugene F. Rogers, Jr. discusses in his muchanticipated new book the sheer, surprising strangeness of Christian blood-talk, exploring the many and varied ways in which it offers a language where Christians cooperate, sacrifice, grow, and disagree. He asks too how it is that blood-talk dominates when other explanations would do, and how blood seeps into places where it seems hardly to belong. Reaching beyond academic disputes to consider how religious debates fuel civil ones, he shows that it is not only theologians or clergy who engage in blood-talk, but also lawmakers, judges, generals, doctors, and voters at large. Religious arguments have significant societal consequences, Rogers contends; and for that reason secular citizens must do their best to understand them.

Eugene F. Rogers, Jr. is Professor of Religious Studies and of Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies at the University of North Carolina at Greensboro. He is the author of six books, including *Aquinas and the Supreme Court* (2013) and *Sexuality and the Christian Body* (2003), which was named "essential reading" by *The Christian Century* among books published in the past 25 years. His next book is *Elements of Christian Thought* (2021). His next book is *Elements of Christian Thought* (2021).



"This book offers an exhilarating reflection on what it is to think about, with, and for the sake of blood; and to so think – as it has long been thought – within the Christian tradition, but not only the Christian. Eugene Rogers' theological reflections are at all times in fruitful dialogue with those of other faiths and of other disciplines, most notably Judaism and anthropology, from which he learns and deepens his thinking. Rogers does not present a systematic reflection on blood. Rather he repeats blood's contradictions through a series of fragments: chapters that address various sites of blood's use, its spilling into social thought, into different cultural domains. Rewarding its readers with ever-deepening insight, the book is a singular and powerful work of theology that will enthral and provoke."

Gerard Loughlin, Professor of Theology and Religion, Durham University, author of Alien Sex: The Body and Desire in Cinema and Theology and editor of Queer Theology: Rethinking the Christian Body

"This book is sure to be both popular and important. The author is a distinguished theologian and philosopher. The topic is both fundamental to, yet neglected by, Christian theology, although 'blood' studies are big elsewhere in the academy, such as in anthropology and sociology. There is no other extended study of the Christian symbolics of blood - or certainly not by someone who brings together at a high level theology (Patristic, medieval, and modern), social theory, post-modern philosophy, and biblical studies. 'Blood' (real and symbolic) is something which, as the author points out, seeps into almost all historical theological topics: death, sacrifice, Eucharist, childbirth, and creation. It is also to the fore in many contemporary concerns of the churches: debates over killing animals and eating meat, torture, and - controversially same-sex relations, racism, and (somewhat unexpectedly) creationism. A good book on the Christian symbolics of blood will be important to historians, social theorists, social scientists and the like, as well as to theologians and, indeed, church authorities as they struggle with some of the issues above. In sum, this is an original and important book by one of this generation's most innovative theologians."

Janet Soskice, William K. Warren Distinguished Research Professor of Catholic Theology, Duke University, and Professor of Philosophical Theology, University of Cambridge; author of The Kindness of God: Metaphor, Gender and Religious Language and of Sisters of Sinai: How Two Lady Adventurers Found the Hidden Gospels



BLOOD THEOLOGY

Seeing Red in Body- and God-Talk



EUGENE F. ROGERS, JR.

University of North Carolina at Greensboro





CAMBRIDGEUNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom
One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA
477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia
314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre,
New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108843287 DOI: 10.1017/9781108909983

© Eugene F. Rogers, Jr. 2021

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2021

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ Books Limited, Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

NAMES: Rogers, Eugene F., Jr. (Eugene Fernand), author.

TITLE: Blood theology: seeing red in body- and God-talk / Eugene F. Rogers, Jr., University of North Carolina, Greensboro.

DESCRIPTION: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University
Press, 2021. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

| IDENTIFIERS: LCCN 2020041191 (print) | LCCN 2020041192 (ebook) | ISBN 9781108843287 (hardback) | ISBN 9781108824187 (paperback) | ISBN 9781108909983 (ebook) | SUBJECTS: LCSH: Blood – Religious aspects – Christianity.

CLASSIFICATION: LCC BR115.B57 R64 2021 (print) | LCC BR115.B57 (ebook) | DDC 234–dc23 LC record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020041191 LC ebook record available at https://lccn.loc.gov/2020041192

ISBN 978-1-108-84328-7 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



For Carol, Michael, and Margarito





CONTENTS

Acknowledgments		page ix
	PART I WHY WE SEE RED	
I	How Blood Marks the Bounds of the Christian Body:	
	Overtures and Refrains	3
	PART II BLOOD SEEPS IN WHERE IT HARDLY SEEMS TO BELONG:	
	BLOOD UNNECESSARY AND INEXHAUSTIBLE	
2	Blood after Isaac:	
	And God Said "Na"	39
3	Blood after Leviticus:	
	Separation and Sacrifice	51
4	Blood after the Last Supper:	
	Jesus and the Gender of Blood	83
	PART III BLOOD MAKES A LANGUAGE IN WHICH TO	
	CONDUCT DISPUTES:	
	FAMILY, TRUTH, AND TRIBE	
5	Bridegrooms of Blood:	
	Same-Sex Desire and the Blood of Christ	117
6	Red in Tooth and Claw:	
	Creationism, Evolution, and the Blood of Christ	131
7	Blood Purity and Human Sacrifice:	
	Castilians Meet Aztecs in War	161



viii	Contents	
PART IV	THE BLOOD OF GOD AT THE HEART OF THINGS: CAUSALITY SACRAMENTAL AND COSMIC	
	he Eucharist "Causes" Salvation: hysiology of the Eucharist, or Virtue and Blood Chemistry	185
	ood of Christ and the Christology of Things: Things Became Human	201
Appendix - Review of Gil Anidjar's Blood: A Critique of Christianity		217
Sources Cited or Consulted		226
Scripture Index		237
Subject Index		240



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book has richly benefited from the support of several granting agencies: The Tantur Institute for Ecumenical Studies in Jerusalem, a foundation of Notre Dame University, lent me a beautiful office in an empty library from December 2009 to July 2010. The Center of Theological Inquiry, supported by the Templeton Foundation, invited me to join their team on Evolution and Human Nature in Princeton for the academic year 2012–13. The Human Distinctiveness Project, administered by Notre Dame and funded by the Templeton Foundation, invited me to what I called "Evolution Summer Camp" in the summer of 2015 and, together with the Lady Davis Fellowship Trust, supported me at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem for the academic year 2015–16, where the research team on Poetics and Christian Performance at the Israel Institute for Advanced Studies found me an office on their hall and a place at their table. Finally, the Department of Religious Studies at the University of Virginia hosted a daylong workshop with faculty and students who had read the entire manuscript.

Longer and shorter passages have benefited from the insights of editors and anonymous reviewers for the following publications which are used with permission:

- "Sociology and Theology of Creationist Objections to Evolution: How Blood Bounds the Christian Body," Zygon 49 (2014): 540–53.
- "The Binding of Isaac as a Trickster Narrative: And God Said 'Na,'" *Journal of Textual Reasoning* 8 (2014) at https://pages.shanti.virginia.edu/JTR/volume-8-number-1/ (ca. 11 printed pages).
- "The Genre of this Book," review essay on *Blood: A Critique of Christianity* by Gil Anidjar in *The Theology Syndicate* 2:1 (February 2015): 145–54.
- "Tanner's Non-Competitive Account and the Blood of Christ: Where Eucharistic Theology Meets the Evolution of Ritual," in Hilda



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

X

Koster and Rosemary Carbine, eds., *The Gift of Theology: The Contribution of Kathryn Tanner* (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2015), 139–57.

"The Fire in the Wine: How Can the Blood of Christ Carry the Holy Spirit," in Myk Habets, ed., *Third Article Theology* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 2016), 251–64.

"Blood," in Adam Johnson, ed., Companion to the Atonement (Edinburgh:

T. & T. Clark, an imprint of Bloomsbury Publishing PLC, 2017), 403–6. "The Blood of Christ and the Christology of Things, or Why Things

Became Human," in Stephen Wright, ed., *The Promise of Robert Jenson's Theology* (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress, 2017), 159–75.

It is a pleasant task to think back over the colleagues, students, and friends who have accompanied me on this project:

Ro Chan Hong, who first sent me to Borneo.

Colleagues on the Episcopal panel tasked to write a theology of same-sex relationships, where blood kept coming up, sometimes without my knowing at whose instigation, and sometimes in productive disagreement: Ellen Charry, John Goldingay, George Sumner, Daniel Westberg, Deirdre Good, Cynthia Kittredge, and especially (in very different ways) Grant LeMarquand and Willis Jenkins.

Father Michael McGarry, CSP, the rector who welcomed me at Tantur; later rectors Timothy Lowe and Russell McDougal; Issa Daboub who ran reception; the librarians, Carole Mickel Tabash, Sahar Hazboun, and Jacqueline Mazoyer, who welcomed me at a later time; the cook, Abed; the Vice-Rector, Sister Bridget Tighe, F.M.D.M.; and among the scholars who passed through, Ellen Cherry, David Burrell, and Eleonore Stump. Others from that time included Omar Othman, who began to teach me Palestinian Arabic; Avivah Zornberg; John Gager; Steven Kepnes; Adam Cohen and Linda Safran; Yonatan Livneh, who sometimes found me books even though he didn't have to; Hillel Newman, Aryeh Kofsky, and Lorenzo Perrone, whom we persuaded to eat dinner as often as we could and who wanted me to read all four volumes of the acts of *Sangue e antropologia nella liturgia* of the Pia Unione Preziosissimo Sangue.

Colleagues at Princeton and the Center for Theological Inquiry, including Will Storrar and Robin Lovin; Celia Deane-Drummond and Dominic Johnson, who led the group; Nicola Hoggard Creegan, Markus Muehling, Agustín Fuentes, Rich Sosis, Jan-Olav Henriksen, Aku Olavi Visala, Hillary Lenfesty, Jeffrey Schloss, and Robert Song. Others in the Princeton orbit: Jeffrey Stout, Eric Gregory, Martha Himmelfarb, Leora Batnitzky, Moulie



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

хi

Vidas, Cathy Kaveny, and especially Naphtali Meshel, who is not responsible for any of my mistakes. Members and attendees at the Duodecim Society, especially Nancy Duff, Peter Ochs, Vanessa Ochs, Susan Eastman, Joe Mangina, and Kendall Soulen; Robert and Blanche Jenson; Cleo Kearns; Ellen Charry again.

Colleagues in Jerusalem a second time: Brouria Bitton-Ashkelony, who got me a Lady Davis Fellowship, an office, meals, and excursions with her husband Ilon, and daily lunches at the Israel Institute of Advanced Study (even though I was a guest and a spouse and not a member); Virginia Burrus; Glenn Peers; Yitzhak and Raheli Hen; Yossi Maurey and Amir Fink; Warren Woodfin; Nina Glibetic and Gabriel Radle; Georgia Frank; Betsy Bolman; Noam Maeir, who got me lots of books; and Diana Lipton and Paula Fredriksen. I took Palestinian Arabic again from Omar Othman. I have counted up over twenty-five language teachers in my life, and he was in the top two (the other was Reginald Foster). Not that my Arabic got at all good. He told me I had to talk to strangers; but I rarely talk to strangers even in English.

In the orbit of Notre Dame's Human Distinctiveness Project, the leaders, Celia Deane-Drummond and Agustín Fuentes; the staff, especially Rebecca Artinian-Kaiser and Adam Willows; and colleagues Barbara Rossing, Nicola Hoggard Creegan, Oliver Davies, John Berkman, Todd Hanneken, Joel Hodge, Philip Rolnick, Timothy Sandoval, Arthur Walker-Jones, Rhodora Beaton, Simon Gaine, and Neil Arner.

Students and others in the Duke orbit who made the menstruation chapter less bad and are not responsible for any failures of fact or tone: Julie Morris, Deb Ebert, and, all together in an intervention, Christina Ananias, Emily Dubie, Sarah Jobe, and Aminah Bradford.

Gregory S. Williams, who read the whole manuscript, as well as Matt Elia, and the faculty who made the students available to me, especially Luke Bretherton, Jay Kameron Carter, Curtis Freeman, Laura Lieber, and Lauren Winner, the last reader of the manuscript, who made insightful additions.

At the University of Virginia, Chuck Mathewes organized the book workshop. Elizabeth Cable, Evan Sandsmark, and especially William Boyce offered formal reviews. Julie Morris, Brandy Daniels, Elizabeth Becker, Brandy Daniels, and especially Chuck, Willis Jenkins, and Paul Daffyd Jones offered constructive suggestions.

I wish to thank my dean, Timothy Johnston, for being the best dean I ever hope to have and making all these occasions possible, several times with Research Assignments providing half salary. The university also supported



xii

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

me in smaller ways, including Regular Faculty Grants, Faculty First Grants, and Kohler Grants for summer research or international travel. I thank Marc Bregman and Sarah Bregman for gifts of reading and objection, as well as other colleagues at the University of North Carolina at Greensboro during the decade I took to write the book, including Ellen Haskell, Alyssa Gabbay, Liz Bucar, Charlie Orzech, Bill Hart, Ben Ramsey, Ashlee Andrews, Greg Grieve, and Jen Feather; as well as students, especially Joseph Naron, Joe Duffield, Ian Courts, and Arthur Blankinship; and Interlibrary Loan, especially Gaylor Callahan, and Dallas Burkhardt.

In the Cambridge orbit, Sarah Coalkley, Janet Soskice, and Oliver Soskice. At Cambridge University Press, Alex Wright (also the editor, years ago, of *Sexuality and the Christian Body*). The copyeditor, Bret Workman. Anonymous readers for the press, as well as for grant agencies and journal publishers.

The scholar who had the most influence on this book was Bettina Bildhauer. When I cold-emailed her in 2011 to say she had written the best sentence I'd ever read about blood, she replied, "Good, it took me eight years to write that sentence."

From week to week I was sustained by two groups in Greensboro: the Porch Wine group of Vicki McCready, MacGregor Frank, Kay Lovelace, and Rick Bardolph; and the Italian Group: Charlie Headington, Debby Seabrooke, Maurice and Genie Schwartz, Jean Cornwell, Joanne Murphy, Tim Kircher, and Bill Ledford.

And Derek Krueger, my husband, who accompanied me in all these places and many of these thoughts.