

#### THE SECOND FOUNDING

In The Second Founding: An Introduction to the Fourteenth Amendment, Ilan Wurman provides an illuminating introduction to the original meaning of the Fourteenth Amendment's famous provisions "due process of law," "equal protection of the laws," and the "privileges or immunities" of citizenship. He begins by exploring the antebellum legal meanings of these concepts, from Magna Carta, the Statutes of Edward III, and the Petition of Right to William Blackstone and antebellum state court cases. The book then traces how these concepts solved historical problems confronting the framers of the Fourteenth Amendment, including the comity rights of free blacks, private violence and the denial of the protection of the laws, and the notorious abridgment of freedmen's rights in the Black Codes. Wurman makes a compelling case that if the modern originalist Supreme Court were to interpret the Amendment in "the language of the law," it would lead to surprising and desirable results today.

Ilan Wurman is Associate Professor of Law at the Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law at Arizona State University, where he teaches constitutional law. He is the author of *A Debt against the Living: An Introduction to Originalism* (Cambridge University Press, 2017), and he publishes on administrative law and constitutional law in the nation's leading law journals.





# The Second Founding

# AN INTRODUCTION TO THE FOURTEENTH AMENDMENT

# Ilan Wurman

Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law at Arizona State University





#### CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108843157

DOI: 10.1017/9781108914956

© Ilan Wurman 2020

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2020

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-108-84315-7 Hardback ISBN 978-1-108-82395-1 Paperback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.



To the members of the Thirty-Ninth Congress; may your work not be forgotten.





# **CONTENTS**

| Ac  | knowledgments                                       | viii |
|-----|---|------|
| No  | ote on the Cover                                    | . X  |
|     | Introduction  | 1    |
|     | PART I ANTEBELLUM LAW                               | 13   |
| 1   | Due Process of Law                                  | 15   |
| 2   | Protection of the Laws                              | 36   |
| 3   | The Privileges and Immunities of Citizenship        | 48   |
|     | PART II FROM ABRIDGMENT TO WAR AND RATIFICATION     | 69   |
| 4   | Abridgment of Rights before and after the Civil War | 71   |
| 5   | The Fourteenth Amendment                            | 93   |
| 6   | Privileges, Immunities, and Incorporation           | 104  |
|     | PART III THE MODERN ERA                             | 121  |
| 7   | The Past and Future of the Fourteenth Amendment     | 123  |
| No  | otes  | 145  |
| Ind | dev.  | 186  |

vii



#### **ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

This is my second book. I am extremely fortunate to have an editor at Cambridge University Press, Matt Gallaway, who has now taken a chance on a young scholar not once but twice. I could not be more grateful for his faith in this project and my work.

I also owe thanks to Earl Maltz, Julian Mortenson, David Upham, and William Wiecek, who read earlier versions of the entire manuscript and some of whom disagreed with much of what it says. Engaging in good spirit with the scholars with whom one disagrees is the most important part of our profession. David Bernstein and Andy Koppelman also provided valuable feedback. I owe a special thanks to Christopher Green, who may know more about the history and drafting of the Fourteenth Amendment than any other scholar. He read my manuscript with a fine-toothed comb, pointing out several errors and corresponding with me on issues large and small. Any errors that remain are, of course, my own. I am also indebted to four anonymous reviewers whose comments helped to improve the book tremendously.

Thanks also go to Ze'ev Wurman and Chase Kassel, two of the most important nonlawyers in my life, who also read the manuscript; the reader has them to thank for improvements to the readability and accessibility of this short volume. And thanks to Jessica Kemper and Emiley Pagrabs, both first in their respective classes at the Sandra Day O'Connor College of Law at Arizona State University, for truly tremendous research assistance. Finally, thanks to Kevin Wang, a precocious undergraduate at Washington University in St. Louis, for perceptive comments and questions on an earlier draft.

viii



# Acknowledgments

ix

But perhaps the most thanks go to the members of the Thirty-Ninth Congress, those framers of the Fourteenth Amendment: they gave us an improvement to the eternal firmament of the U.S. Constitution, without which the Constitution would have had to be abandoned long ago. We today are truly indebted to their achievement.



# NOTE ON THE COVER

The image, published in *Harper's Weekly* in 1867, illustrates the first time the newly freed men voted after the abolition of slavery. Although the Fourteenth Amendment did not guarantee their right to vote—only the Fifteenth Amendment, ratified in 1870, would so guarantee—these newly freed men were instrumental in electing and serving as delegates to new state constitutional conventions under the reconstruction governments in the South. The new state legislatures constituted under these new constitutions would supply the final votes needed for ratification of the Fourteenth Amendment.