CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-84284-6 — Ending Income Inequality
Matthew Dimick
Frontmatter
More Information

ENDING INCOME INEQUALITY

Income inequality in America has been on the rise for decades, but policy and legal thought has yet to catch up. Both parties in the United States have been hesitant to intervene in the market to address this problem, while the income tax system has been touted as a better and more efficient way to tackle income inequality. However, the tax system itself has failed to keep pace with the widening gaps in income. *Ending Income Inequality* challenges arguments made by legal scholars in the field of law and economics, who have supported the tax system over redistributive legal rules. By examining specific areas of the law such as minimum wage, collective bargaining, antitrust law, intellectual property, and housing regulation, the book argues that using legal rules, in addition to income taxes, is a promising path to reverse rising inequality.

Matthew Dimick is Professor of Law at the University at Buffalo School of Law and Director of the Baldy Center for Law & Social Policy.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-84284-6 — Ending Income Inequality
Matthew Dimick
Frontmatter
More Information

Ending Income Inequality

A CRITICAL APPROACH TO THE LAW AND ECONOMICS OF REDISTRIBUTION

MATTHEW DIMICK
University at Buffalo School of Law

CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-84284-6 — Ending Income Inequality
Matthew Dimick
Frontmatter
More Information

Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8EA, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

103 Penang Road, #05–06/07, Visioncrest Commercial, Singapore 238467

Cambridge University Press is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

We share the University's mission to contribute to society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org
Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108842846
DOI: 10.1017/9781108906418

© Matthew Dimick 2025

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press & Assessment.

When citing this work, please include a reference to the DOI 10.1017/9781108906418

First published 2025

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

A Cataloging-in-Publication data record for this book is available from the Library of Congress

ISBN 978-1-108-84284-6 Hardback
ISBN 978-1-108-82284-8 Paperback

Cambridge University Press & Assessment has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

For EU product safety concerns, contact us at Calle de José Abascal, 56, 1°, 28003 Madrid, Spain, or email eugpsr@cambridge.org

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-84284-6 — Ending Income Inequality
Matthew Dimick
Frontmatter
More Information

For Jan and David

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE

Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-84284-6 — Ending Income Inequality
Matthew Dimick
Frontmatter
More Information

Contents

List of Figures *page* xi
List of Tables xiii
Acknowledgments xv

PART I INTRODUCTION

1 **Orienting the Argument** 3
1.1 Some Clarifying Remarks 7
1.2 Outline and Argument of the Book 11

2 **Redistributing Income Efficiently** 14
2.1 Taxation, Legal Rules, and Redistribution 14
2.1.1 The Origins of the Debate 15
2.1.2 First Question: Should Economic Analysis of Law Consider Equity as well as Efficiency? 16
2.1.3 Second Question: Can Legal Rules Redistribute Income? 20
2.1.4 Third Question: Is the Income Tax Superior to Legal Rules in Redistributing Income? 21
2.1.5 The Double-Distortion Argument 22
2.2 Criticisms of the Double-Distortion Argument 25
2.3 A Sneak Peek of the Book's Arguments 28
2.3.1 Distributing through Legal Entitlements 30
2.3.2 Double, or Offsetting, Distortions? 31
2.3.3 Two, Three … Many Distortions 31
2.3.4 Imperfect Competition and Search Frictions 32
2.3.5 More Questions about Labor Supply 33
2.3.6 Uncertainty and Ex Post Inequality 34
2.4 Conclusion 35

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-84284-6 — Ending Income Inequality
Matthew Dimick
Frontmatter
More Information

PART II THE COMMON LAW

3 **Property** 39
3.1 The Coase Theorem 43
3.2 The Distributive Corollary to the Coase Theorem 46
3.3 Divided Entitlements and Legal Redistribution 49
3.3.1 Using Divided Entitlements to Facilitate Trade 49
3.3.2 Using Divided Entitlements to Redistribute Income 56
3.3.3 Including Labor-Supply Effects 58
3.3.4 Responses to Objections 62
3.4 Takings 64
3.5 Appendix 67
4 **Torts** 68
4.1 Torts in the Double-Distortion Argument 71
4.2 Using Torts to Redistribute Income Efficiently? 74
4.2.1 Heterogeneity 74
4.2.2 Zero-Distortion Legal Rules 75
4.3 Ex Ante versus Ex Post Social Welfare 79
4.3.1 Concave Social Welfare Functions 80
4.3.2 Social Welfare from an Ex Ante Perspective 81
4.3.3 Social Welfare from an Ex Post Perspective 82
4.4 Risk, Uncertainty, and Legal Redistribution 84
4.4.1 No Insurance: Ex Ante and Ex Post 84
4.4.2 Insurance Case 89
4.5 Appendix 93
4.5.1 Model 94
5 **Contracts** 100
5.1 Competitive Markets and "Passing On" the Costs of Legal Rules 103
5.1.1 "Passing On" the Costs of Legal Rules 103
5.1.2 Responses to the "Passing On" Argument 105
5.1.3 Legal Incidence as Tax Incidence? 106
5.2 Homogeneous versus Heterogeneous Consumers 107
5.3 Other Bases of Redistribution through Contract Law 113
5.3.1 Unconscionability and Price Discrimination 114
5.3.2 Damages and Default Rules 118
5.4 Appendix 124
5.4.1 Model 125
5.4.2 Equilibrium Conditions 127
5.4.3 Outside Options and Buyer Investments 128
5.4.4 Results 130
5.4.5 Frictionless Markets 133

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-84284-6 — Ending Income Inequality
Matthew Dimick
Frontmatter
More Information

PART III REGULATION AND FUNCTIONAL LAW

6 **Labor and Employment Law** 137
6.1 Background: The Efficient versus Redistributive Minimum Wage 141
6.2 Redistributive Minimum Wage 142
6.2.1 The Minimum Wage or Redistributive Taxation? 144
6.2.2 The Extensive Margin Strikes Back 148
6.2.3 The Minimum Wage and EITC as Policy Complements 150
6.3 The Optimal, Inefficient Minimum Wage 151
6.3.1 Concluding Considerations 157
6.4 Redistribution and Collective Bargaining 159
6.5 Appendix 165
6.5.1 Production 165
6.5.2 The Firm's Monitoring Choice 166
6.5.3 Minimum Wage versus Taxation 169

7 **Antitrust** 174
7.1 Monopoly: What's the Problem? 177
7.2 Bork and the "Consumer Welfare" Standard 179
7.3 Antitrust and Income Inequality 184
7.3.1 The Imprecision Objection to Redistributive Antitrust 184
7.3.2 The Double-Distortion Objection to Redistributive Antitrust 187
7.4 Efficient Redistribution through Antitrust 190
7.4.1 Using Antitrust to Redistribute Income 191
7.4.2 Evaluating Antitrust Policy with Distribution-Neutral Income Tax Adjustments 194
7.5 Appendix 205
7.5.1 Model 205
7.5.2 Merger Evaluation with Distribution-Neutral Income Tax Adjustments 207

8 **Intellectual Property** 209
8.1 Income Inequality in IP Scholarship 213
8.2 IP Law and the "Double Distortion" Argument 216
8.3 Efficiency and Equity in an Innovation Model with Monopolistic Competition 221
8.3.1 The Stages of the Innovation Model 221
8.3.2 Main Results 222
8.4 Appendix 226
8.4.1 Model 227
8.4.2 Equilibrium 228
8.4.3 Innovation 230

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-84284-6 — Ending Income Inequality
Matthew Dimick
Frontmatter
More Information

9 Housing Regulation 233
9.1 Rent Control 236
9.2 The First Debate over Efficiency and Equity in the Legal Literature 241
9.3 Filtering and the Dynamics of Habitability Standards 245
9.4 The Redistributive Efficiency of Habitability Standards 248
9.5 Rental Assistance and Rent Control 251
9.6 Appendix 255
9.6.1 Model and Implications 255
9.6.2 Efficient Allocations and Housing Warranties 256
9.6.3 The Redistributive Efficiency of Housing Standards 258

10 Conclusion 261
10.1 Summary of the Book's Argument 262
10.2 The External Critique of Welfare Economics 264
10.2.1 Efficiency 265
10.2.2 Social Welfare 269
10.2.3 Freedom and Welfare 274

Appendix A Primer on Welfare Economics 276
A.1 Efficiency 277
A.1.1 Pareto Efficiency 277
A.1.2 The Fundamental Theorems of Welfare Economics 280
A.1.3 Kaldor-Hicks Efficiency 282
A.2 Inequality 285
A.2.1 Lorenz Curves 285
A.2.2 The Gini Coefficient 288
A.2.3 Income Shares 289
A.2.4 Redistribution 291
A.3 Social Welfare 293
A.3.1 Social Welfare Functions 293
A.3.2 The Atkinson Index 297
A.4 Responding to Inequality 299
A.4.1 Optimal Tax Theory 299
A.4.2 Distribution-Neutral Income Tax Adjustments 310
A.5 The General Theory of the Second Best 321
A.6 Mathematical Appendix 323
A.6.1 Optimal Taxes in the Intensive Model 323

References 325
Index 341

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-84284-6 — Ending Income Inequality
Matthew Dimick
Frontmatter
More Information

Figures

3.1	The efficiency liability rules over property rules	*page* 55
3.2	Distribution effects of liability rules	57
3.3	Comparison of distribution and efficiency	58
4.1	Ex ante versus ex post social welfare functions	87
4.2	Social welfare with costly insurance	93
5.1	Homogeneous consumers: Inefficient warranty	108
5.2	Homogeneous consumers: Efficient warranty	109
5.3	Heterogeneous consumers: High-valuing marginal consumers	111
5.4	Heterogeneous consumers: Low-valuing marginal consumers	112
6.1	Trends in the minimum wage	138
6.2	Efficiency of the minimum wage	143
6.3	Standard and efficiency-wage models of the minimum wage	155
8.1	Innovation and inequality	212
9.1	Rent control	237
9.2	Rental assistance and rent control	253
A.1	Pareto efficiency and Pareto superiority	278
A.2	Kaldor-Hicks efficiency	285
A.3	Inequality and Lorenz dominance	287
A.4	Inequality and the Gini coefficient	289
A.5	Social welfare maximization	294
A.6	Inequality aversion and social welfare functions	297
A.7	Inequality and optimal redistributive taxation	301
A.8	Social welfare and optimal redistributive taxation	303
A.9	Distributive incidence of a public good	312
A.10	Financing a public good with tax adjustments	313

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-84284-6 — Ending Income Inequality
Matthew Dimick
Frontmatter
More Information

Tables

3.1	Efficiency of legal rule redistribution	*page* 61
4.1	Liability rules and social welfare	83
7.1	Kaplow's antitrust example	190
7.2	Efficiency-neutral but inequality-increasing merger	192
7.3	Efficiency- and inequality-increasing merger	193
7.4	Merger lowers consumer and producer surplus	196
7.5	DNITA evaluation of surplus-inefficient merger	198
7.6	Merger raises consumer and producer surplus	199
7.7	DNITA evaluation of a surplus-efficient merger	199
7.8	DNITA evaluation of a surplus-efficient merger with general labor supply	204
10.1	Allocating cleanliness credits	267
A.1	Interpreting distribution-neutral income tax adjustments	316

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org

CAMBRIDGE
Cambridge University Press & Assessment
978-1-108-84284-6 — Ending Income Inequality
Matthew Dimick
Frontmatter
More Information

Acknowledgments

First thanks are owed to my wonderfully supportive and smart colleagues at the University at Buffalo School of Law, past and present, who have shaped this book in more ways than they know: Heather Abraham, Dianne Avery, Mekonnen Ayano, Christine Bartholomew, Mark Bartholomew, Guyora Binder, Michael Boucai, Todd Brown, Luis Chiesa, Jorge Fabra Zamora, Lucinda Finley, Rebecca French, Jim Gardner, John Giammatteo, Paul Linden-Retek, Clayton Masterman, Lynn Mather, Martha McCluskey, Errol Meidinger, Athena Mutua, Tony O'Rourke, Jack Schlegel, Matt Steilen, Rob Steinfeld, Tico Taussig-Rubbo, Bert Westbrook, and Jim Wooten.

For their research assistance, I owe a debt of gratitude to Racquel Bozzelli, Michael Dolce, Jordan Einhorn, Simone Grande, Katherine Logan, and Jordan Mroczek.

For inspiration, encouragement, camaraderie, workshop comments, or all of the above, I wish to thank Matthew Adler, Kevin Banks, Pablo Beramendi, Catherine Fisk, Cindy Estlund, Nate Holdren, Mandy Hughett, Rob Hunter, Zachary Liscow, Guy Mundlak, Eric Posner, Brishen Rogers, César Rosado Marzán, David Rueda, Hila Shamir, Daniel Stegmueller, Dom Taylor, and Joshua Teitelbaum.

A big thanks goes to my editor, Jana Riess, and to my commissioning editor at Cambridge University Press, Matt Gallaway.

Most importantly, for their love, support, and patience, I wish to thank my companion in body, spirit, and mind, Kristen Howey Dimick; my children, Liam and Normandie; and my parents, to whom this book is dedicated, Jan and David Dimick.

© in this web service Cambridge University Press & Assessment www.cambridge.org